CHALLENGING PARADIGMS

New Frontiers in Undergraduate Research
2006-2008 McNair Scholars Online Journal
The Ronald E. McNair Scholars Program at Portland State University (PSU) works with motivated and talented undergraduates who want to pursue PhDs. It introduces juniors and seniors who are first-generation and low-income, and/or members of under-represented groups to academic research and to effective strategies for getting into and graduating from PhD programs.

The McNair Scholars Program has academic-year activities and a full-time summer research internship. Scholars take academic and skills-building seminars and workshops during the year, and each scholar works closely with a faculty mentor on original research in the summer. Scholars present their research findings at the McNair Summer Symposium and at other conferences, and are encouraged to publish their papers in the McNair Journal and other scholarly publications.

The Ronald E. McNair Post-baccalaureate Achievement Program was established in 1986 by the U.S. Department of Education and named in honor of Challenger Space Shuttle astronaut Dr. Ronald E. McNair. The program, which is in its seventh year on campus, is funded by a $924,000 grant from the U.S. Department of Education and institutional cost-share funds.

The McNair Scholars Program’s student-centered approach relies heavily on faculty and university commitment. Activities and opportunities provided by the program focus on building a positive academic community for the scholars while they are undergraduates at PSU.
Ronald Erwin McNair was born October 21, 1950 in Lake City, South Carolina. While in junior high school, Dr. McNair was inspired to work hard and persevere in his studies by his family and by a teacher who recognized his scientific potential and believed in him. Dr. McNair graduated as valedictorian from Carver High School in 1967. In 1971, he graduated magna cum laude and received a bachelor of science degree in Physics from North Carolina A&T State University (Greensboro). Dr. McNair then enrolled in the prestigious Massachusetts Institute of Technology. In 1976, at the age of 26, he earned his Ph.D. in laser physics. His dissertation was titled, “Energy Absorption and Vibrational Heating in Molecules Following Intense Laser Excitation.” Dr. McNair was presented an honorary doctorate of Laws from North Carolina A&T State University in 1978, an honorary doctorate of Science from Morris College in 1980, and an honorary doctorate of science from the University of South Carolina in 1984.

While working as a staff physicist with Hughes Research Laboratory, Dr. McNair soon became a recognized expert in laser physics. His many distinctions include being a Presidential Scholar (1971-74), a Ford Foundation Fellow (1971-74), a National Fellowship Fund Fellow (1974-75), and a NATO Fellow (1975). He was also a sixth degree black belt in karate and an accomplished saxophonist. Because of his many accomplishments, he was selected by NASA for the space shuttle program in 1978. His first space shuttle mission launched successfully from Kennedy Space Center on February 3, 1984. Dr. Ronald E. McNair was the second African American to fly in space. Two years later he was selected to serve as mission specialist aboard the ill-fated U.S. Challenger space shuttle. He was killed instantly when the Challenger exploded one minute, thirteen seconds after it was launched. Dr. McNair was posthumously awarded the Congressional Space Medal of Honor. After his death in the Challenger Space Shuttle accident on January 28, 1986, members of Congress provided funding for the Ronald E. McNair Post-Baccalaureate Achievement Program. Their goal was to encourage low-income and first-generation college students, and students from historically underrepresented ethnic groups to expand their educational opportunities by enrolling in a Ph.D. program and ultimately pursue an academic career. This program is dedicated to the high standards of achievement inspired by Dr. McNair’s life.

Source: mcnairscholars.com
Table of Contents

Shawn Smallman, Principle Investigator

Portland State McNair Program Staff

Editorial Board

The 2006 Scholars

The 2007 Scholars

The 2008 Scholars

Nativism or Response to Globalization? Business Reaction to Immigration Reform
Tyanne Conner
Johanna Brenner, Faculty Mentor

Africans and African Americans: Conflicts, Stereotypes and Grudges
Foday Darboe
Kofi Agorsah, Faculty Mentor

The Representation of Women in Comic Books, Post WWII Through the Radical 60s
Maryjane Dunne
Robert Liebman, Faculty Mentor

Toward a Tool for Measuring Student Role Mastery
Collin Fellows
Peter Collier and David Morgan, Faculty Mentors

The Invisible Victims: Children of Incarcerated Mothers
Holly Hernandez
Patti Duncan and Carol Morgaine, Faculty Mentors

Searching the Silence: Finding Black Women’s Resistance to Slavery in Antebellum US History
Loucynda Jensen
Patricia Schechter, Faculty Mentor

Food Web Impacts of the Invasive New Zealand Mudsnail in an Estuarine System
Amanda Kelley
Valance Brenneis and Catherine E. de Rivera, Faculty Mentors

Inciting Social Change Through Film: Using Marcus Bank’s Definition of Ethnographic Film to Discuss the Films of Participant Productions
Marie Loeb
Janice Haaken, Faculty Mentor
Urbanism and North American Funerary Practices
Rebecca Marrall
Michele Gambaurd, Faculty Mentor

From Borrowed Legend to Divine Destiny: The Thirteenth-Century Mosaics of San Marco and the Shift in Venetian Self-Fashioning
Heather McCambly
Anne McCllanan, Faculty Mentor

Progress on a Photovoltaic Cell Design Consisting of Silicon Nanowires and Poly (3-hexylthiopenen)
Lori Noice
Rajendra Solaki, Faculty Mentor

The Use of Politeness Strategies in Email Discussions About Taboo Topics
Katrina Pariera
Susan Conrad, Faculty Mentor

Ethanol Induced Sign-tracking in Swiss Mice
Phoebe Smitasin
Christopher Cunningham, Faculty Mentor

Women and Resistance in the African Diaspora, with special focus on the Caribbean, Africa, and USA
Clare Washington
Kofi Agorsah, Faculty Mentor

Influential Factors of Parental Substance and Alcohol Abuse on Children’s Academic Achievement
Andrea Winters
Valerie Stewart, Faculty Mentor

Acknowledgements
The Vice Provost for Instruction and Dean of Undergraduate Education, Shawn Smallman oversees the nationally acclaimed University Studies program, University Honors, the military GOLD program, the Center for Academic Excellence, and is a professor of International Studies. He is the institutional accreditation liaison officer and has expertise in institutional assessment and learning outcomes.

He received his PhD. in history from Yale University. He has published numerous articles on military corruption and political terror in Latin America, as well as undergraduate education and energy security. His first book, *Fear and Memory in the Brazilian Army and Society, 1889-1954*, received many positive reviews. His second book, *A History of AIDS in Latin America*, was recently published by the University of North Carolina Press.

Vice Provost Smallman’s areas of interest are the global AIDS epidemic, human rights issues, modern Canada, modern Brazil, the Amazon Rainforest, U.S.-Latin American Relations, and indigenous language preservation. Vice Provost Smallman is a board member of the Security and Defense Studies Review.
Toeutu Faaleava
Director
Dr. Faaleava specializes in community mobilization and capacity building. His research interests are in reclaiming indigenous voices, spaces, scholarship and resistance. He teaches in University Studies and works with Pacific Islander communities in Portland. He holds a PhD in Ethnic Studies, JD, MA, and BA from the University of California, Berkeley, an MPA from Harvard University and a BS from Southern Illinois University.

Jolina Kwong
Program Coordinator
Jolina is a Doctor of Education student in the Educational Leadership Program at Portland State University. Her research interests include first generation college students' experiences at large metropolitan universities, as well as student development and leadership. Outside of the office and the classroom, she enjoys jogging around her Southeast Portland neighborhood with her dog, Hooligan.

Amrina Sugaipova
2006 Graduate Assistant
Amrina received her BA in Business and English from Lithuania College in Klaipeda, Lithuania. She is working on an MA in international Conflict Resolution at Portland State University. She enjoys studying languages and learning about other cultures.

Tyanne Conner
2008 Graduate Assistant
Tyanne Conner received her BS from PSU after a five-year break in her education. In 2006 she completed the McNair program and that experience convinced her graduate school was a possibility. Her thesis focuses on the experiences of former McNair scholars. She hopes to add to the body of knowledge in the area of student retention and to enhance programs that assist first-generation and under-represented students. In her free time she does photography, and likes to cross-country ski, hike in the mountains, knit hats and scarves for friends and family, and create original masterpieces in the kitchen.

Foday Darboe
2008 Graduate Assistant
Foday Darboe received his BA in Political Science and International Studies (Cum Laude) from Portland State University. He is currently a graduate student in MA in Conflict Resolution with emphasis on International Conflict Resolution. His research interests include contemporary African politics, the African Union (AU) and international relations and cooperation. He plans to
pursue a PhD in International Relations and Politics. He enjoys blogging, politics, current events, traveling and soccer.

Holly Hernandez  
2008 Graduate Assistant  

Holly Hernandez received her BS in Child and Family Studies from Portland State University. She is working on her Masters degree in Social Work at Portland State. Holly intends to pursue a PhD in social work. She plans on attending UC Berkeley or the University of Washington. Current research interests include the prison industrial complex, maternal incarceration, recidivism rates among mothers, reunification programs, and children with incarcerated parents. In her spare time she enjoys spending time with friends and family, reading, traveling and dancing.
EDITORIAL BOARD

Toeutu Faaleava, Director, McNair Scholars Program

Jolina Kwong, Program Coordinator

Tyanne Conner, Graduate Assistant

Foday Darboe, Graduate Assistant

Holly Hernandez, Graduate Assistant
Ivan Perez Carrasco
Project Title: Three Gorge Dam
Mentor: Manouchehr Gorji

Tyanne R. Conner
Project Title: Nativism or a Response to Globalization?
Mentor: Johanna Brenner

Janette Crume-Centeno
Project Title: History of the Mind: A Survey of Rock Art Creation Theory
Mentor: Tim Garrison

Rupert Dallas
Project Title: Land Use Metric Analysis
Mentor: Vivek Shandas

Bernardine Delaney
Project Title: The Increasing Incidence of Type 2 Diabetes among Mexican American Youth
Mentor: Roberto de Anda

Mary Fletcher
Project Title: The Imposter Phenomenon and First-Generation Female College Students
Mentor: Peter Collier

Cat Goughnour
Project Title: White Lies of Omission: Blacks and Education
Mentor: Ann Mussey

Donna Harris
Project Title: Did Fictive Kinships exist in the Kalaupapa Settlement from 1942-1945?
Mentor: Siobhan Maty
Holly Hernandez
Project Title: How Does Having an Incarcerated Mother Influence the Daily Lives of Children?
Mentors: Patti Duncan and Carol Morgaine

Loucynnda Jensen
Project Title: Searching the Silence: Finding Black Women’s Resistance to Slavery in Antebellum U.S. History
Mentor: Patricia Schechter

Melissa Lindsey
Project Title: Single-mother Households: Another face of poverty
Mentor: Karen Gibson

Marie Loeb
Project Title: Ethnographic Research through Film
Mentor: Janice Haaken

Favoure Miller
Project Title: Movement Mobilization and Immigrant Rights of the 21st century
Mentor: José Padín

Lori Noice
Project Title: Efficiency viability of photovoltaic cells made from silicon nanowires and poly (3-hexylthiophene)
Mentor: Rajendra Solanki

Katrina Pariera
Project Title: The usage of politeness strategies in email discussions about taboo topics
Mentor: Susan Conrad

David Potter
Project Title: NP and VP Coordination in the LTAG Syntactic/Semantic Interface
Mentor: Thomas Dieterich

Tamam Waritu
Project Title: Strategies for Increasing and Retaining African American students in Engineering and Science Fields
Mentor: E. Kofi Agorsah

Clare Washington
Project Title: Women Warriors: Female Leaders in Resistance, Revolts, and Rebellions
Mentor: E. Kofi Agorsah

Andrea Winters
Project Title: Influential Factors of Parental Substance and Alcohol Abuse on Children’s Academic Achievement
Mentor: Valerie T.D. Stewart
Carmen Anderson
Project Title: Domestic Violence: A Then and Now Perspective
Mentor: Benjamin Anderson-Nathe

Huy Bui
Project Title: The fitness consequences of genetic network organization: A test of the protein
dispensability hypothesis in C. elegans
Mentor: Suzanne Estes

Gloria Jean Coleman
Project Title: An Examination of Stereotypes of and Attitudes Towards Sexual Offenders and Sexual
Child Abuse
Mentor: Katherine McDonald

Foday Darboe
Project Title: Africans and African-Americans: Conflicts, Stereotypes and Grudges
Mentor: E. Kofi Agorsah

Maryjane Dunne
Project Title: The Roles of Women in Comic Books, Post WWII Through the Radical 60s
Mentor: Robert Liebman

Jessica Espinoza
Project Title: Las Desaparecidas: A Feminist Perspective of How Intersecting Factors Influence Violence
Towards Women in Mexico
Mentor: Shawn Smallman

Marchelle Foster
Project Title: Contemporary Columbia Plateau Indian Identity: the Columbia River Inter-Tribal Fishing
Commission as a Case Study
Mentor: Katrine Barber
LaTrece Gaither  
Project Title: Effects of Rape on Victims’ Siblings: Through the Eyes of the Non-victimized Sibling  
Mentor: Jana Meinhold

Jose Garcia  
Project Title: Post-revolutionary Reforms: Modernizing the Mexican Military  
Mentor: Friedrich Schuler

Mahad Hassan  
Project Title: The Cycle of Aid and Debt in Africa: Examining the Effect and Effectiveness of Multilateral Policies and Programs to Spur Development and Create Economic Growth in Africa  
Mentor: E. Kofi Agorsah

Britt Howard  
Project Title: A Study of the Behavior of Three Captive Orangutans Before and After Exhibit Remodel  
Mentor: Cameron Smith

Amanda Kelley  
Project Title: Food Web Impacts of The Invasive New Zealand Mudsnail In An Estuarine System  
Mentor: Catherine de Rivera

Jacqueline Marcotte  
Project Title: Submerged Cultural Resources and the Community: Working Together Toward Protection and Preservation  
Mentor: Doug Wilson

Rebecca Marrall  
Project Title: Urbanism and North American Funerary Practices  
Mentor: Michele Gamburd

Heather McCambly  
Project Title: Molding the History of a Maritime Empire: The role of the thirteenth-century mosaics of San Marco in reforming the Venetian past  
Mentor: Anne McClanan

Steven Nguyen  
Project Title: America Needs Physical Activities in Public Schools  
Mentor: Tom Seppalainen

Sheila Pete  
Project Title: Grant High School REAPing the Gap: A Case Study of Portland’s Attempt to Close the Education Divide between African-American and White Students  
Mentor: Karen Gibson

Phoebe Smitasin  
Project Title: Ethanol Induced Sign-tracking in Swiss Mice  
Mentor: Christopher Cunningham

Steve Van Eck  
Project Title: neocolonial photograph, neocolonial aid  
Mentors: Maude Hines and Richard White
Tami Wallis
Project Title: Campus Conversations and Democratic Dialogue
Mentors: Terry Rhodes and Richard White

Wendy Ann Wright
Project Title: Archaeological Resource Preservation: Developing a Model for the City of Portland
Mentor: Virginia L. Butler

Julie Yagoda
Project Title: Prevention of Child Sexual Abuse: Identifying Social Norms and Misperceptions in Parents
Mentor: Keith Kaufman
Mandy Barberree  
Project Title: Duality and the Importance of Humor in *A Complicated Kindness*  
Mentor: Marie Lo

Anna Marie Brown  
Project Title: Victor-Lévy Beaulieu and Québec’s Linguistic and Cultural Identity Struggle  
Mentor: Jennifer Perlmutter

Melissa Cannon  
Project Title: Portland’s Artisan Economy: The Arts and Crafts Sector  
Mentor: Charles Heying

Gloria Diaz  
Project Title: Exploring the Relationship between Acculturation and All-Cause Mortality among Mexican Americans Using National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (Nhanes Iii)  
Mentor: Carlos Crespo

Kristy Hauver  
Project Title: Shock Melting and Cooling History of the Wow Stone (Cml-0175): A Look At Textural Arrangements and Chemical Compositions  
Mentor: Alex Ruzicka

Kristian Hochreiter  
Project Title: Developing an Instrument to Measure Incoming Freshmen’s Understanding of ‘How The University Works’  
Mentor: Peter Collier
Lanel Jackson  
Project Title: Hiv/Aids Prevention: Examining the Behavioral Aspects of Infection and Transmission among Women in North and Northeast Portland: A Pilot Study in Multnomah County, Oregon  
Mentor: Lynette Feder

Marianna Lomanto  
Project Title: The Impact of Child Reunification on Female Offenders and Recidivism  
Mentor: Melissa Thompson

Kelly Marvin  
Project Title: Investigation of Cofactor Specificity in Biological Nitrile Reduction  
Mentor: Dirk Iwata-Reuyl

Jennifer Maynard  
Project Title: Trauma and Resiliency: The Issue Of Culturally Appropriate Measures From A Kaska Perspective  
Mentor: Lynette Feder

Julie Mertes  
Project Title: Phenomenological Interviews with Returning Women Students  
Mentor: Carol Morgaine

Julie Nakama  
Project Title: Time After Time: Investigating Identity in Wong Kar-Wai’s *Days of Being Wild, In the Mood for Love*, and *2046*  
Mentor: Mark Berrettini

Jazmin Ogle  
Project Title: Corn, Free Trade and the Mexican Quest For Development  
Mentor: Leopoldo Rodriguez

Yolanda Paris  
Project Title: Root Causes: The Role of Racism in Perpetuating Health Disparities among African American Communities---A Pilot Study In Multnomah County, Oregon  
Mentor: Debra Harris

Treasure Porth  
Project Title: Homosexual Anxiety and Portrayals of the Male Relationship on Popular Television  
Mentor: Michael Ward

Kristin Ragsdale  
Project Title: Presentation Format and Earnings Management through Available-For-Sale Securities: A Review Of the Literature  
Mentors: Elizabeth Almer and Kristi Yuthas

Roy Sharp  
Nonstandard Piecewise-Linear Embeddings in Co-dimension Two  
Mentor: M. Paul Latiolais
Amy Elizabeth Sherwood
Project Title: An Bó Bheannaithe: The Archaeological Origins Of Cattle Symbolism In Traditional Irish Folklore And Myth
Mentor: Cameron Smith

Robyn Stowers
Project Title: Oregon's Opinion on Prisoner Rehabilitation and Re-entry Policy
Mentor: Richard Clucas

Matthew Thomas
Project Title: The Theoretical Modeling of The Sink Depth Of Trolled Fishing Lines
Mentor: Graig Spolek

Christopher Torres
Project Title: Physical Activity, Body Weight and the Link to All-Cause Mortality: A View From National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (Nhanes IIi, 1988-1994)
Mentor: Carlos Crespo

Julie Vuong
Project Title: Exploring The Reactions Of Second Generation Vietnamese Americans Of High- and Low-Educational Attainment to The Model- Minority Stereotype
Mentors: Sharon Carstens and Veronica Dujon

Shannon White
Project Title: Inside Oregon Public Broadcasting
Mentor: Priya Kapoor

Julie Worley
Project Title: Oviposition Site Choice In A Neotropical Tree Frog, Dendropsophus Ebraccatus
Mentor: Priya Kapoor

Lee Ann Wyckoff
Project Title: The Under-Representation Of Minority Students In Post-Graduate Study: The Intersection of Race and Class in Rates of Enrollment
Mentor: Tom Chenoweth
Nativism or Response to Globalization?  
Business Reaction to Immigration Reform

TYANNE CONNER  
JOHANNA BRENNER, FACULTY MENTOR

Abstract  
Industries such as agriculture, service, health care, construction, and meat packing and processing have relied heavily on immigrant labor and have voiced opposition to the restrictive immigration reform passed recently by the House of Representatives which would provide no amnesty, no path to legalization, and which would reduce the number of worker visas.

Other industries and coalitions favor tighter border security and punitive action toward undocumented immigrants and those who hire them. I propose that the position these businesses take toward immigration reform is more a response to globalization than one of nativism.

Introduction  
Immigration is a hotly debated issue in the United States today and has been at certain points throughout history. Immigration reform, led by politicians seeking to please contradictory needs of constituents and businesses, has been a complicated mix of expansive and restrictive policy. The response to this issue by the business community is equally as complicated and at times, contradictory.

While many businesses and industries lobby for access to hard-working, easily exploitable immigrants, other businesses press for “no amnesty”, punitive based legislation. What may appear to be nativist response to increased numbers of immigrants is more likely a response to globalization. The complicated history of U.S. immigration policy has affected today’s debate.

Literature Review

Immigration has been widely researched and information on the topic includes concepts such as push and pull factors in the economies of Mexico and the U.S. respectively. Piore (1979) argues that there is an intense pull of workers from developing countries to
developed nations to fill a “chronic” need for unskilled workers. World systems theory highlights the effects of globalization. The movement of business and capital into pre-market societies changes the social fabric of those communities which in turn creates highly mobile labor pools. Systems of reciprocation are interrupted, consumers are created and capital becomes necessary. Corporations based in industrialized nations move into developing countries to exploit the raw materials and labor. This practice disturbs the balance, forces competition, and drives farmers from the land. Mechanization also serves to displace agricultural workers who then move to cities to find work. When cities become saturated with workers, laborers must move on to the next viable option, which can include migration to developing countries (Massey, Arango, Hugo, Kouaouci, Pellegrino and Taylor 1998; McMichael 2004). Philip L. Martin also illustrates how the “Benign Neglect” has created a pull of workers to the U.S. Massey, Durand and Malone (2002), add to that a push factor from Mexico. Historically, Mexico has had a dearth of capital, credit and insurance markets. Citizens who wish to purchase or build homes, or start businesses must look for other options when the Mexican state does not provide avenues to low-interest loans (Massey et al 2002).

It can be said that industrialized economies, driven by the imperative to make profit at any cost, are creating these conditions which make it necessary for workers to move to established countries to find work. The processes that link developing countries to industrialized countries create natural and obvious pathways for immigrants to follow. In other words, the U.S. has created a pull system that draws immigrants in, a system that cannot be stopped simply by building a taller border fence. The wheels of globalization are turning and cannot easily be reversed.
Massey, Piore, Calavita, Martin and others have documented the pull factors that lure workers from developing countries to industrialized nations. Massey et al (2002) have illustrated that the history of U.S. Immigration policy has been one that contains many contradictions. Historic caps on immigration designed to exclude immigrants from certain locales, particularly European countries and Asian countries, did not include Mexico or North America. These caps were implemented to alleviate citizen fears of an unassimilable population of immigrants flooding the workforce. Employers, limited by the caps, then actively recruited undocumented Mexican workers (Massey et al 2002). Indeed, this practice was legal until the immigration reforms of 1986. After the stock market crash of 1929 and the following depression, attitudes toward Mexican workers turned hostile. Massive deportations of Mexicans ensued (Jaffe, Cullen and Boswell 1980). The need for contract labor disappeared as U.S. workers rushed to fill the low wage jobs left open by the deportations. “Through the massive use of repressive force and police powers, the U.S. government sought to undo in the 1930’s what it had actively encouraged over the preceding two decades” (Massey et al 2002 ,pg 34).

The mobilization of American industry for war efforts created job shortages in agriculture. Those who were not drafted left the low wage and low status jobs to find higher wage work in the cities (Massey et al 2002). Agriculture turned to President Roosevelt for assistance. Roosevelt turned to Mexico. Pressure from the agriculture industry encouraged the government to instate the Bracero Program which operated from 1942-1964. This plan repatriated thousands of people, undocumented Mexicans and even Mexican American citizens. Workers were taken from their jobs, shipped to Mexico, given Bracero visas and returned to the same work sites from which they had been taken. U.S. citizens, unaware of
the visa part of the program, believed the government had responded to their fears of labor competition. This plan ensured the Agriculture industry access to immigrant labor.

Massey et al (2002) refer to this government strategy as “having its cake and eating it too”. The United States must respond to demands of citizens to provide jobs and to business and industry to provide streams of cheap labor. Responding to this seeming contradictory pressure, the U.S. has historically instated contradictory immigration policy. While appearing to appease citizens, policies have restricted immigration flows. At the same time, visa programs ensure that immigrants are able to fill the low-wage jobs required to keep business afloat. Business needs are fulfilled and citizens are content.

This strategy, however, does not provide long-term solutions for immigration problems. Factors other than fears of immigrants taking jobs often come into play. The recession following the Korean War in conjunction with the McCarthy era hysteria led citizens to pressure their government to control the borders. At the same time, growers pressured government for more workers. According to Kitty Calavita (1992), 1954’s “Operation Wetback” led to increased militarization of the border and a mass round-up of undocumented immigrants (over 1 million in 1954). To satisfy growers, INS doubled bracero visas. Again, undocumented workers were rounded up, shipped back to Mexico, given Bracero visas and sent back to the fields of U.S. growers. This operation satisfied citizens and business. The issue of immigration seemed to disappear. The socially constructed “problem” was “solved” in the eyes of the public, even as the same immigrant workers were filling the same jobs.

The climate of the 1960's turned the public attention to civil rights violations and to the exploitative Bracero program. Growers had become unsatisfied with the unfair allocation of Bracero visas and found it more cost effective to hire undocumented workers and so did not
put up a fight when the public pushed for the end of the bracero era (Massey et al. 2002).
The agriculture industry had continued access to fresh undocumented immigrants, as
employees encouraged friends and family to migrate to the U.S., with the promise of jobs.
The oil crisis of the 1970's and ensuing recession again turned the public focus toward
Mexican immigration. High inflation, rising unemployment and low wages created more
competition for low-wage jobs. Those filling the low-status and usually invisible jobs again
found themselves in the spotlight. Andreas (2000) also points out that as other employment
opportunities became available in urban areas, undocumented workers were now more
visible to the public and public tolerance began to deteriorate.

Response to this deteriorating tolerance came in the form of the 1986 Immigration Reform
and Control Act (IRCA) which was supposed to balance the interests of business,
immigrants, citizens and everyone involved in the immigration debate. It is difficult,
however, to please all sides of an issue. The Act increased the INS budget, which expanded
the Border Patrol and lead to an increased militarization of the border. An amnesty and
legalization program created a path to citizenship for undocumented workers already in the
country. The Act also made it illegal for employers to hire undocumented workers. These
changes were intended to decrease undocumented migration and reduce employer reliance
on undocumented workers.

Unintended consequences of the IRCA were addressed in the Immigration Act of 1990,
which worked to actually encourage more illegal immigration as undocumented family
members from Mexico came to join the residents who gained amnesty under the new law.
Legal migration had also increased as dependents and spouses now qualified for visas under
IRCA laws (Massey and Espinoza 1997). This Act added Border Patrol agents, tightened
employer sanctions, streamlined deportations, increased penalties for multiple immigration
violations and imposed limits on the total number of immigrants per year to “creatively” limited Mexican legal immigration (Massey et al 2002).

Successive reforms have sought to mitigate unintended consequences of previous reforms. The Clinton Administration’s Illegal Immigration Reform and Immigrant Responsibility Act of 1996: increased penalties for smugglers and undocumented immigrants, gave new money for military technology, added 1,000 new Border Patrol agents per year until 2001 which would bring the total number of agents to 10,000 (Andreas 2000), and made undocumented immigrants ineligible to get Social Security benefits even if they paid taxes. It also gave authority to states to limit public assistance, and increased income required to sponsor relatives to come to U.S. (Massey et al 2002).

The Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996: barred illegal migrants from most federal, state and local public benefits, determined that INS was to verify status before any federal benefits were given, prohibited food stamps, Supplemental Security Income (SSI) or means tested programs until 5 years after legal immigration, and gave states authority to exclude legal immigrants from federal and state programs (Massey et al 2002).

Each round of immigration reform becomes more restrictive, while the U.S. economy becomes more integrated with economies of other nations. Mexico’s signing of the North American Free Trade Agreement in 1993 ensured that the two economies would increasingly become intertwined.

Research Question

Currently, the House and Senate have drafted their own immigration reform bills and will soon meet to decide which road to take. The Bush Administration has acknowledged America’s need for immigrant workers, while it tries to appear tough on undocumented
migrants and those who hire them. A guest worker program has been proposed which, like visa programs of the past, will provide business with low-wage workers. President Bush also opposes amnesty for undocumented workers already in the U.S. This approach attempts to satisfy business interests and native wishes.

Immigration reform has, in the past, contained contradictory measures—intending to tighten border security, reduce legal and illegal migration, while providing visas and amnesty for workers. Which industries back certain provisions and why? Are businesses opposed to expansive immigration reform nativist or expressing anti-immigrant sentiments? Wikipedia, the on-line encyclopedia, defines nativism as: “the fear that certain new immigrants will inject alien political, economic or cultural values and behaviors that threaten the prevailing norms and values” (www.wikipedia.com). Does this definition apply to businesses in favor of H.R. 4437?

Methodology

Three strategies were used to identify business positions on immigration reform. First, peak organizations were identified which oppose H.R. 4437, typically, large coalitions of businesses and industries which use immigrant labor. Organizations which were in favor of H.R. 4437 were then identified using a simple internet search using key words, “business support for H.R. 4437”. Websites found in search results were used to find links to other organizations.

Second, based on literature review, researcher identified main business industries that rely on immigrant labor and have been involved in immigration policy in the past.

Third, public statements were researched through industry organizations and their publications, as well as newspaper articles. Congressional testimony was also used to
research position on immigration reform. Websites from specific industries and coalitions was accessed to determine whether the topic immigration was addressed.

**Findings**

Current bills in the House and Senate differ drastically on the approach to immigration and hence have drastically different groups supporting each side. HR. 4437, the Border Protection, Antiterrorism, and Illegal Immigration Control Act of 2005, calls for restrictive and punitive measures to stop undocumented immigration. Punitive measures, which place focus on individuals, have received mixed responses. Under H.R. 4437, undocumented presence in the U.S. would become a felony offense. Those who aid and assist those determined to be “illegal aliens” would face the same penalties as the “aliens” themselves.

H.R. 4437 not only targets undocumented immigrants, but those who employ them. Employers would be required to use a verification system to determine legal status of new hires and previously hired individuals. This bill would also increase the criminal penalties for companies shown to have repeated uses of undocumented workers (H.R. 4437, 2006).

Business already finds itself vulnerable to stiffer penalties and investigation by the Immigration and Customs Enforcement Agency. According to Julia Preston (2006) of The New York Times, employers are now receiving federal indictments as opposed to civil fines of the past. The article highlights contactors and perhaps these businesses were easy targets, as it is widely known that labor contractors often use immigrant labor. To avoid penalties themselves, many businesses contract out for labor, allowing contractors to assume the risks if they are found to have hired undocumented workers.

The description of the bill also includes allocation of massive amounts of resources to border security, and not incidentally, would increase contracts to companies such as Lockheed Martin, Boeing, Northrop Grumman, and Raytheon, to name just a few. The
Department of Homeland Security also backs this strategy of border militarization with plans through the Secure Border Initiative to increase the numbers of Border Patrol agents, increase detention facilities, build higher fences and vastly increase detection technology (Immigration & Borders nd).

Border security measures, as Massey and others have described, work not to deter clandestine border crossings, but instead, force migrants to choose less patrolled, more remote areas to cross (Massey et al 2002). The strategy, to throw money at the border, has been ineffective and will most likely continue to be ineffective in preventing undocumented immigration. It will, however, be lucrative to major corporations with government contracts.

KBR, a subsidiary of Halliburton, was awarded a government contract to build detention centers for undocumented immigrants (Swarms 2006). Halliburton, which recently lost its no-bid contracts in Iraq, has been widely criticized for its accounting practices (Witte 2006). Companies mentioned above have not made public statements regarding immigration reform. It is possible that these companies have refrained from public statements and hearings because they have other ways of getting their voices heard.

In Dollars and Votes: How Business Campaign Contributions Subvert Democracy, the authors reveal the process of access. Corporations which give large sums of money to political campaigns can, in effect, “buy time” with politicians. This does not lead to quid pro quo relationships exactly, but an organization which gives money to finance expensive campaigns is more likely to get face to face time with a politician to lobby for certain concessions (Clawson, Neustadtl and Weller 1998). A 2005 Washington Post article revealed use of corporate jets by members of Congress (Smith and Willis). The jets, owned by some of the largest corporations, were offered, “in the hope of currying favor with the leaders,
that lobbyists were typically onboard their flights, and that they used the opportunity to press the interests of the aircrafts’ owners”.

Corporations may not be able to directly buy votes, but politicians may be “persuaded to make behind-the-scenes compromises” (Clawson et al 1998; pg 9). This process may explain why certain corporations do not appear to have a strong position on immigration reform. This industry has a stake in immigration reform in that they are rewarded when policy is formed which focuses on the threat of terrorism and need for increased border security.

This bill seems to run contrary to the needs of most large businesses who many employ immigrants regardless of legal status. There are no provisions to expand worker visas or provide a way for workers to come to the U.S. legally. There are many types of visas available to students, and visitors, workers and their families. H1-B visas for skilled workers and H2-B visas for seasonal workers both have low caps. Many industries have been pushing for an increase in the caps, as well as other guest worker programs which would allow for legal immigration. The House appears to be responding only to a heightened fear of terrorism and nativist fears expressed in the media and by some politicians. The Senate has taken a different approach to immigration reform and seems to be responding to business pressure for continued and increased access to immigrant labor streams.

S. 2611, Comprehensive Immigration Reform Act of 2006, the Senate’s attempt at immigration reform was passed in May. This bill, unlike H.R. 4437, creates a guest worker program as well as multiple paths to citizenship. This bill addresses the needs of the economy and U.S. businesses, addresses humanitarian issues, while also including measures to protect the border (S. 2611, 2006). To address the fears of terrorism, this bill also increases the border militarization efforts, again, which will reward lucrative contracts to
many large corporations. Any new legislation must address the perceived threat of a terrorist attack which could occur at any moment.

While the Senate and House pursue different strategies to immigration reform, American businesses, trying to lobby in their interest, have weighed in on the issue. Many businesses have been categorically opposed to the repressive measures proposed in the House bill 4437 and have organized to lobby for more access to immigrant labor pools. Other groups have formed which back HR 4437 and have responded with what might be considered to be nativist views. What are the motivations driving businesses and organizations on each side of the immigration debate?

Powerful organizations such as the United States Chamber of Commerce, which represents more than three million businesses and organizations, have been outspoken in their opposition to H.R. 4437. Their website contains statements on immigration topics such as: Border Security and Prosperity, Essential Workers, Skilled Worker Visas, Seasonal Workers, Visa Issuance, and the Americans for Better Borders Coalition (Immigration Issues nd).

The Chamber, as its website exhibits, seeks to:

- Provide an earned pathway to legalization for undocumented workers already contributing to our economy, provided that they are law-abiding and prepared to embrace the obligations and values of our society.

- Create a carefully monitored guest worker program to fill the growing gaps in America’s workforce recognizing that in some cases, permanent immigrants will be needed to fill these gaps.

- Refrain from unduly burdening employers with worker verification systems that
are under-funded or unworkable.

- Ensure the continuity and expansion of H-1B and L-1 visas for professionals and highly valued workers.

A letter to members of the House of Representatives urges Congress to be practical in their plans for immigration reform. The Chamber was critical of House plans to implement a government-run verification system, stating that it “cannot realistically be implemented…” (Josten 2005, para 3).

While lobbying for increased access to immigrant labor, The Chamber is careful to address the fears of the public surrounding terrorism and border security. Addressing the horror of the attacks of September 11, 2001, the Chamber acknowledges a need for sensible border security while pointing to the fact that the vast majority of traffic across borders is related to commerce and not terrorism. A sensible plan, according to the Chamber, would identify real threats while allowing continued flows of imports, exports, labor and tourism (Border Security and Prosperity, nd).

Regarding essential workers, the Chamber references Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) which projects a diminishing supply of native workers to fill increasing positions in the growing industries such as construction, service, landscaping and healthcare. Essential workers are those which are purported to do the jobs that Americans are unwilling to do. Testimony by Ronald Bird, Chief Economist with the U.S. Department of Labor, at the Senate Committee on the Judiciary Field Hearing, “Comprehensive Immigration Reform: Examining the Need for a Guest Worker Program” on July 5, 2006 also states that job growth is continuing while the native labor force is declining. According to Bird, immigrant workers are essential to the health of the economy, “Immigrants are a significant and
growing component of the U.S. labor force” (Bird 2006: para 10). This testimony is in-line with Chamber position on the necessity of guest worker programs and paths to citizenship.

The Chamber of Commerce is also a member of a coalition of corporations, universities, research institutes and trade associations called Compete America- The Alliance for a Competitive Workforce. This Coalition has been instrumental in pushing for an increase in the H1-B and H2-B visas. In his testimony before the U.S. Senate, Thomas J. Donohue (2005) stressed the need for more pathways to legal immigration, which would satisfy business needs. Representing many industries, this testimony and others’ must have had a powerful impact on the Senate decision to include expanded visas and a guest worker program.

The Business Roundtable, also a member of Compete America, is another large coalition of businesses with powerful influence. According to the website, “Member companies comprise nearly a third of the total value of the U.S. stock market and represent nearly a third of all corporate income taxes paid to the federal government” (About Business Roundtable, nd). With such a stake in the future of the U.S. economy, one would assume that the Business Roundtable would have a distinct position on the immigration debate. Indeed, a press release dated May 25, 2006 Roundtable President John J. Castellani applauded the Senate for increasing the numbers of H-1B visas for highly educated temporary workers.

The Senate should be commended for recognizing that many U.S. companies rely on highly educated foreign nationals, and that current policy governing this situation is in dire need of reform… The Senate Legislation includes provisions that will raise the cap on H1-B visas for highly educated temporary workers to 115,000 per fiscal year… (Castellani 2006).
Reminding the Senate that business concerns must be addressed in any new legislation, the press release went on to urge members of Congress to, “keep this critical issue in mind as broader discussions on immigration continue,” (Castellani 2006; para 5).

Other coalitions have also been highly active in the push for expanded H-1B visas. The Essential Worker Immigrant Coalition (EWIC) represents such members as: U.S. Chamber of Commerce, American Hotel & Lodging Association, American Meat Institute, American Health Care Association and the American Nursery & Landscape Association, among dozens of others. This coalition makes clear on their website homepage that the coalition has, “…been intimately involved with the legislative process and has been working closely with key Congressional members to shape and draft practical immigration reform legislation,” (para 1).

A cross reference of Business Roundtable members with Chamber of Commerce websites for different states does show that many members of the Business Roundtable are also members of the Chamber of Commerce. Some of the companies with dual memberships are: CitiMortgage, Allstate Insurance, Liberty Mutual Insurance, New York Life Insurance, Office Depot, Verizon, Coca-Cola, Ford Motor Company, Pfizer, Daimler Chrysler, BNSF Railway, Boeing and Tyson Foods.

The meat packing and processing industry has been one of many purported to prefer immigrant workers. The American Meat Institute “represents the interests of packers and processors of beef, pork, lamb, veal and turkey products and their suppliers throughout North America” (Boyle 2002; para 6). Active for years on the topic of immigration reform, this organization supports an expanded visa program, a path to citizenship and legalization for workers and assistance with compliance of any employee verification system.
implemented. Richard Bond, of Tyson Foods inc. is on the Board of Directors of the American Meat Institute (American Meat Institute Board of Directors, nd).

A search on Tyson foods, a processor of chicken beef and pork, and member of both the Chamber of Commerce and the Business Roundtable showed information which links the industry to immigrant workers. On May 1, 2006, immigrants, advocates and supporters of humanitarian immigration reform marched in cities throughout the United States. Some businesses shut down operation to express solidarity and to support immigrant workers. Tyson Foods, which closed some of its meat processing plants on that day, issued a press release, available on its website. In an April 28, 2006 Press Release available on its website, Tyson vowed that it has no tolerance for employment of undocumented workers and encouraged workers not to take unscheduled time off to participate in the rallies (Press Releases, 2006).

A 2001 article in the New York Times details an indictment of Tyson Foods on charges that it smuggled undocumented immigrants into the country to work in the plants (Barboza 2001). This practice will no longer stand with new legislation from both the House and the Senate, as bills from both which would increasingly hold employers responsible for hiring undocumented workers. If the Senate and House agree on a more business friendly plan that will increase the numbers of work visas, companies such as Tyson Foods will not have to risk hiring undocumented workers.

A search through the Senate bill 2611 reveals obvious concessions to businesses. The American Hospital Association (AHA), a national organization of hospitals and health care networks has been active on the topic of immigration in recent years and has expressed strong opposition to H.R. 4437. A letter to the Senate from AHA Executive Vice President Rick Pollack and President of the National Association of Public Hospitals and Health
Larry Gage lobbied for reform which would not hold businesses responsible for unknowingly hiring undocumented workers. AHA has also lobbied for increased numbers of visas for nurses. A *New York Times* article highlights the AHA plan to continue to recruit nurses from developing countries, regardless of effects (Dugger 2006).

The American Health Care Association (AHCA) has also lobbied for increased numbers of visas for skilled workers. Testimony by Hal Daub, President and CEO of AHCA at a Senate Hearing on “Comprehensive Immigration Reform” stresses the expected shortfall of nurses in the coming years and the need for foreign-born workers. Daub urges the Senate to consider the healthcare industry when drafting immigration reform (Daub 2005).

Previous President and CEO of AHCA, Charles H. Roadman II, also testified at a Senate Hearing on Immigration, stating:

America’s health care system, in particular, is strained from a shortage of the key caregivers necessary to help care for a rapidly aging population. From the standpoint of long term care, Mr. Chairman, we are ready, willing and able to offer tens of thousands of good-paying jobs that, if filled, can help boost the quality of seniors’ care in nursing homes across America…. If an American employer is offering a job that American citizens are not willing to take, we ought to welcome into our country a person who will fill that job- especially a job that has the capacity to improve the health and well being of a vulnerable senior, or person with disabilities (Roadman, 2004).

Pressure from powerful and large coalitions has influenced the Senate. Evidence of this can be found in Sec. 505 (d) of S. 2611, which increases visas for shortage occupations including nurses, but which also intends to increase the domestic supply of healthcare workers (S. 2611 Sec. 505, 2006).
Agriculture, service, construction, healthcare, hospitality, meat packing, and maintenance, among other industries employ large numbers of immigrant workers. Businesses which rely on immigrant labor, whether low-skilled or highly skilled, have a great stake in immigration reform. Large corporations, which belong to multitudes of coalitions, have been successful thus far in persuading the Senate to consider their needs. These industries have been vocal in opposing harsh employer sanctions and restrictive immigration policy. They advocate for increased amounts of worker visas, an expanded guest worker program, and lighter penalties for undocumented workers. Increased border security measures are supported as long as they do not restrict trade and negatively impact business.

Although coalitions such as the Chamber of Commerce and the Business Roundtable represent many business interests and portray solidarity within the business community regarding immigration reform, there are smaller coalitions which oppose expansive immigration measures. An internet search of business support of H.R. 4437 revealed the United States Business and Industry Council (USBIC) website, which purports to “champion the interests of America’s domestic family-owned and closely-held firms—our nation’s ‘main street’ businesses…” (About USBIC, nd). This organization claims to have 1,000 member companies, although no member list is available on the website. The Board of Directors include representatives from many American-owned businesses including; Walker Die Casting, Inc., Cummins-American Corp., Eagle Manufacturing Company, and American Felt & Filter.

Launched by USBIC, the website American Economic Alert is devoted to “fighting for American Manufacturers and for American jobs.” A letter to Congress on its website highlights support for the bills’ tough stance on immigration and for “no amnesty” provisions. This letter asserts that undocumented immigrants drive down wages and “are a
national security threat” (Letter To Congress, 2006). More than a half dozen opinion articles written by William R. Hawkins are posted on the website and argue that immigrants are a threat to security, are uneducated and are taking jobs away from Americans. This rhetoric sounds familiar and is used often by the politicians and the right. Jose A. Padin and Shelley Smith conducted a study of Conservative Talk Radio (CTR) which seems to have an implicit curriculum that strives for “gut reaction” to emotional subjects such as immigration without regard to accuracy of the information presented. Their analysis of some of the top CTR shows showed a clear and consistent message that immigrants were regarded as an economic drain and as terrorists (pg 304). Constant bombardment with these images of immigrants can begin to take its toll on the public imagination.

Barry Glassner (2004) has called this strategy “fear mongering”. Media and politicians capitalize of the fears of the American public. Scare tactics are used by politicians to appear to constituents as though “problems” are being addressed. Unfortunately, some politicians have used these tactics in this way to address concerns of immigration. Republican Congressman James F. Sensenbrenner, who introduced the Border Security, Anti-Terrorism and Illegal Immigration Control Act (HR 4437), used this tactic when naming the bill by choosing to link terrorism to undocumented immigration. Colorado Congressman Tom Tancredo has also chosen to use scare tactics to appear as if he is addressing the socially constructed problem of undocumented immigration. His website links immigration to negative impacts on the culture, environment, health, labor and national security. He even goes so far as to list emotional stories of murders and rapes allegedly committed by immigrants (Immigration Impacts on Crime, nd). This blatant attempt to use the topic of immigration to rally support can be classified as fear mongering and follows the immigration and race curriculum. It is easier by far, to turn attention toward vulnerable immigrants than
to multi-national corporations which contribute to economic strains. A politician may have more success at tackling issues of undocumented immigration than at restructuring business practices of multi-national corporations.

Taken together, the American Economic Alert website, the Conservative Talk Radio curriculum, fear mongering and links made by politicians’ of terrorism and crime to immigrants, a nativist picture emerges. Are those businesses which have supported HR 4437 nativist as well?

Linked to the American Economic Alert website are those of many manufacturing businesses and industries such as American Iron and Steel Institute (AISI), which “serves as the voice of the North American Steel industry in the public policy arena” (AISI: Our Members, nd). AISI represents more than twenty producer members in the United States. A search on their website using keywords: “immigration”, “immigrants”, “illegal immigration”, “illegal immigrants” and “H.R. 4437” revealed no matches. A search using “globalization” revealed four hits and a search using, “foreign competition” revealed 52 hits. These findings suggest that although linked to U.S. Business and Industry Council and to American Economic Alert websites, which have strong views on immigration reform, of more concern to AISI are foreign competition and effects of globalization. A paper by Peter Morici (2004) on the website reveals the struggle to maintain profits in the face of competition from China. China, whose currency is undervalued, is able to better compete in the U.S. economy than small American companies.

Another link found on the American Economic Alert website represents members of the engineering industry. According to the website, the non-profit, American Engineering Association (AEA) has members from throughout the engineering community. It is evident that this organization is also responding to pressures of globalization. The home page
illustrates the frustration by members of the practice for, “corporations to jump on the bandwagon to hire cheap foreign workers,” (Tax [nd] para 2). The section labeled, “Immigration” highlights articles responding more to corporate profit-driven motive than to immigrants themselves (Immigration, nd). This organization points to corporations which wish only to maximize profits and may prefer to hire immigrants with H1-B visas who may be willing to work for lower wages than American workers. Reaction from the engineers seems to be directed more toward corporate practices than toward sealing off America’s borders to immigrants.

Rescue American Jobs is another organization linked to the American Economic Alert website. They advertise themselves as a national organization formed to save the American middle class. A search on their site using keywords, “immigration reform” led directly to a praising review of Tom Tancredo’s Political Action Committee (PAC) “Team America” and its motto: “The defense of a nation begins at its borders” (American Jobs Journal, 2006). This PAC makes no apologies for its blatant anti-immigrant sentiment. But is the organization, Rescue American Jobs anti-immigrant because they associate with this PAC? A thorough search of the Rescue American Jobs website reveals again, that this seeming anti-immigrant sentiment is more a response to globalization. A petition on the website pleads with President Bush and Congress to help blue collar workers. “America’s manufacturing base has been devastated by unfair trade deals and now big corporations are shipping white-collar jobs out of the country too” (Rescue American Jobs Petition, nd).

At times, frustration with an unfettered market economy is directed toward the most vulnerable in society. It is easier by far, to direct anger, fear or frustration toward those with few protections than to tackle the process of globalization.
Another group, not tied to the previous organizations but worth mentioning, has made headlines recently, with concerns about immigration. The organization Choose Black America is comprised of business professionals who support restrictive immigration reform. Their homepage describes the feelings of this group:

Mass illegal immigration has been the single greatest impediment to black advancement in this country over the past 25 years. Blacks, in particular, have lost economic opportunities…and felt the socio-economic damage of illegal immigration more acutely than any other group (Choose Black America, nd).

Choose Black America is outspoken in its support for the enforcement only bill HR 4437. On its “Press Room” page, the group purports to express the views of most of the African American community and states that amnesty for “illegal aliens” would be extremely damaging (Black Americans Oppose, nd).

This issue of African Americans being adversely affected by immigration policy has also been addressed by others. In an article in The Review of Black Political Economy, Vernon M. Briggs (2003) suggests that African Americans are not considered when immigration policy is formed and blacks have historically been in direct competition with immigrants. This seems to be more a response to institutionalized racism than to nativism. All Americans, though, are affected by globalization, some more than others.

This seeming anti-immigrant or nativist sentiment is not an irrational response, but an attempt to have some impact on legislation. Businesses which must compete in a global marketplace must consider immigration reform. Large, powerful companies who hire immigrants may have a competitive edge in business. Small companies face different pressures and may see immigration as a threat.
Using this definition, I have found no compelling evidence to suggest that the businesses and organizations which support HR 4437, have nativist ideals. Instead, the apparent anti-immigrant sentiment appears to be a somewhat rational response to the pressures of globalization. Unfortunately, immigrants themselves can become targets.

Ideally, free-market economics should work to benefit the majority of citizens. In reality, capitalism can drive down wages, force unfair competition, widen the gap between rich and poor as well as manifest other negative effects. These undesirable effects put pressure on the weakest members of society and can create tensions between the least powerful groups.

Small businesses face different pressures in the market than do large multi-national corporations. Unlike multi-national corporations, small American-owned businesses cannot move their companies to other countries to take advantage of low wages and thus are less competitive in the market. Small businesses also face different pressures regarding competition with foreign companies and other countries. These factors, taken together must be considered when analyzing business response to immigration reform.

What may look to be anti-immigrant sentiment is more likely unease with an economy without restraints. Workers such as those in the high-tech sector, who compete with H1-B visa immigrants have a stake in keeping visas for high-skilled workers to a minimum.

**Conclusion**

Politicians, seeking to please constituents and the business community, have responded to the immigration issue in different ways. These contradictory needs are addressed in legislation which thus ends up with contradictory results. Businesses, industries, and concerned groups must choose sometimes, the lesser of two evils in terms of legislation from the House or from the Senate. Regardless, neither side of the issue will be fully satisfied as the complex needs of the market economy clash with the needs of citizens.
What is certain is that the economy of the U.S. is more intertwined with economies of other countries than in any other time in history. The outcome of the immigration debate is less certain.

The relationship between U.S. business and immigration reform is not as straightforward as first thought. Expecting a majority of business opposition to H.R. 4437, this is what the researcher found. Large corporations and industries which rely on immigrant labor have lobbied for continued access to immigrants through expanded visa programs and guest worker programs, while addressing rhetoric of border security linked with terrorism. These findings were not surprising. Business, to stay competitive in a market-driven economy, must lobby in its interest and has done so regarding the topic of immigration.

However, there are coalitions of businesses and business professionals which align themselves with the restrictive immigration stance of the U.S. House of Representatives. Coalitions which represent mostly American owned companies in the manufacturing sector do not appear to rely heavily on immigrant labor, and so may have reason to lobby against expansive immigration reform. Small companies which find themselves in direct competition with multi-national corporations, struggle to maintain and make a profit. The appearance of anti-immigrant sentiment seems to be more a response to the pressures of globalization than to nativist leanings.

Although the jury is still out on whether immigrants drive down wages for native workers, these companies fear that corporate use of immigrant labor may put small business at a disadvantage. The issue of immigration reform is complex and responses by businesses on either side of the debate are equally as complex.
References


American Meat Institute Board of Directors (nd). Retrieved August 10, 2006 from
http://www.meatami.com/Content/NavigationMenu/
AMIMemberServices/WhoWeAre/BoardofDirectors/Board_of_Directors.htm

Human_Resources/Immigration1/AMI_Press_Statement_on_Immigration_Reform_ (April_15, 2002).htm


http://www.rescueamericanjobs.org/petition/


Witte, Griff. “Army to End Expansive, Exclusive Halliburton Deal: Logistics Contract to be Open for Bidding.” Washington Post Retrieved July 12, 2006 from
Africans and African Americans: Conflicts, Stereotypes and Grudges

Foday Darboe
E. Kofi Agorshah, Faculty Mentor

Abstract

This research focuses critically on the relationship between African immigrants and African Americans in the United States. It examines stereotypes, conflicts and grudges between the two groups and how they impact their co-existence and adaptation to each other.

Most African Americans are descendants of enslaved Africans that were transported to the US during the trans-Atlantic slave trade. Since African Americans and Africans are descended from the same root African cultures, it is reasonable to expect that they would adapt and co-exist in harmony; however, there is tension between the two groups.

My objectives are to probe the issues between these two groups and analyze inter-group effects of conflicts, stereotypes, and grudges. I will explore cultural differences and cross-cultural interactions between the two groups. What issues are real, and what are imagined? Can both sides adopt mutual understanding? These are some of the questions that this research addresses.

Acknowledgements

My greatest thanks go to the Portland State McNair Scholars program director Dr. Toeutu Faaleava and Jolina Kwong program coordinator for their advice, support and inspiration. I am highly indebted to Dr. E. Kofi Agorsah for being my professor, advisor and mentor for the last two years. Your continuous encouragement and guidance is priceless.

Secondly, I am especially grateful to my friend and former classmate Clare Washington, former Portland State McNair Scholar. Her enduring support and willingness to convince me to apply for this prestigious program is highly accepted. A list of others who helped would be long if they could all be identified. However, many of those who consented to interviews and surveys have asked to remain anonymous. Without the cooperation and support of all these people, this research would not have seen the light of day. One love!

Introduction and background
What is the relationship between African immigrants and African Americans?

Perhaps the answer to this intriguing question is best described by scholars such as John Arthur, Philippe Wamba and Josephine Moraa Moikobu. In his book, *Invisible sojourners: African immigrant Diaspora in the United States*, John Arthur argues that the “cultural, political, and economic affinity between African immigrants and their black American counterparts is not as strong as it should be considering the historical cord that ties them together.”

Arthur concludes that “the cultural barriers and the social and economic differences separating the Africans and the African-Americans is sometimes the cause of a simmering hostility and misunderstanding between them. Sharing the common physical characteristics of skin color has not ensured cultural and economic unity between African immigrants and American-born blacks.” For his part, Philippe Wamba, explains that, “the twin histories of African and African American peoples are brimming with both triumph and tears; similarly, the story of the interaction between them has not always been positive…their associations, and the collision of their true false ideas about one another, have sometimes been problematic.”

Jennifer Cunningham, for example, described that “some of the more than 4,400 Africans living in Central Harlem have been routinely targeted and singled out for discrimination and abuse, both verbal and physical, according to Africans living in the area. The recent acts have highlighted longstanding tensions between African immigrants and African American residents.” A similar view is echoed by Kery Murakami and Mary Andom, they established that “leaders in the African American and African immigrant communities say long-simmering tensions between the two groups were reflected in a

---

2. Ibid, p. 77-78
shooting July 12 in which an African American woman is suspected of killing an East African immigrant.”

In some of the interviews conducted in this study both African immigrants and Africans Americans acknowledged that there is indeed a strained relationship between these two groups. An African American participant who is well informed about African and African American history had the following to say: “At the present state, the relationship is not good, worst than the 1950s and 1960s.” He concludes that, “the friction is instigated by outside sources.” Not surprisingly, the interviewee pointed fingers at whites, whom he believed are in the middle of the problem. Josephine Moraa Moikobu’s book, Blood and flesh: Black American and African identification points out that:

The fact that these strain-causing elements do not come from Africans or their black American counterparts but are perceived as coming from somewhere outside these two groups; they come from white who are said to have deliberately spawned myths and stereotypes to demean black peoples and keep them deliberately separated and isolated so they can be dominated.

An African immigrant also interviewed expressed his views on the relationship between African immigrants and African Americans by saying that “our relationship is based on suspicions. They blamed Africans for slavery.” He said, “For those who are conscious about history...they want to move on, and their interactions with Africans are fine.” It is quite evident that there is a strained relationship, myths, grudges, ignorance, and stereotypes that keep these two groups apart.

It is widely argued that Africans and African Americans, besides their skin pigmentation and common origin, have little in common. Josephine Moraa Moikobu takes a

---

5 Andom, M & Murakami, K, Shooting puts light on ethnic divide African Americans, Immigrants seek to ease tensions. (The Seattle Post Intelligencer, 2006) p.1
closer look at the social identifications between these two groups. Moikobu argues that, “the Eurocentric view maintains that black Americans and Africans have little in common with one another except their ancestry and color.” Rob Carson reporting on the growing conflict between African immigrants and African Americans in Tacoma, Washington tells us that an African Immigrant draws a conclusion by saying, “we have the same skin color with African Americans, but nothing else together.” Moikobu in studying this difference among African immigrants and African Americans noted that “most African respondents see that the common bonds that unite them to black Americans are based upon ancestry and color.”

Clarence E. Walker tells us that scholars such as Molefi Kete Asante stresses that “there are some people…who argue that Africans and African Americans have nothing in common but the color of their skin. This is not merely an error, it is nonsense. There exists an emotional, cultural, psychological connection between this people.”

From a historical point of view, around 1800s to the late 1960s Africans and African Americans worked hand in hand despite of geographical barriers and some social conditions respectively. Tunde Adeleke eloquently asserts that “advocates of Black Nationalism and Pan-Africanism built their ideology and movement, that is, their appeal for black unity across Atlantic space, largely on African considerations shared culture, history, and experience.” From Booker T. Washington, W. E. B. Du Bois to Kwame Nkrumah, these leaders spearheaded Black Nationalism and Pan-Africanism. Adeleke posits that “Pan-African ethos

---

7 Ibid, p. 15
8 Rob Carson, African immigrants, black Americans poles apart. (The Columbian, 2003), p.5
10 Clarence E. Walker, We can’t go home again (Oxford University Press, 2001), p. 61
urges Black Americans and Africans to revive the old strength-in-unity philosophy that once shaped their mutual struggle, in consequence of shared historical and cultural experiences.”

Rayford W. Logan, for instance, insisted that “no American Negro had so eloquently and so steadfastly proclaimed self-government and independence for Black Africa as had Du Bois. In 1945 he was probably the only American Negro delegate to the Fourth Pan-African Congress in Manchester, England, where he and Kwame Nkrumah drafted the resolutions.” Not only did these organizations and individuals embark on self-determination for Africans and fundamental human rights for African Americans, but they also exchanged mutual expression of ideas which was intended to increased the overall social, political, and economic issues faced by blacks. As Pearl T. Robinson has observed, “Historically, the pan-African movement was both a symbol and a strategy for consolidating greater unity among black people. Its goals included national independence for colonial subjects and equal citizenship rights for Afro-Americans.”

Elliott P. Skinner in African Americans and U.S. policy toward Africa, 1850-1924: in defense of Black nationality, gives a detailed account of Booker T. Washington arguments:

There is…a tie which few white men can understand, which binds the American Negro to the African Negro; which unites the black man of Brazil and the black of Liberia; which is constantly drawing into closer relations all the scattered African peoples whether they are in the old world or the new. There is not only the tie of race, which is strong in any case, but there is the bond of [colour], which is [specially] important in the case of the black man. It is this common badge of [colour], for instance, which is responsible for the fact that whatever contributes, in any degree to the progress of the American Negro, contributes to the progress of the African Negro, and to the Negro in South America and the West Indies. When African Negro succeeds, it helps the American Negro. When the African Negro fails, it hurts the reputation and the standing of the Negro in every part of the world.

---

14 Pearl T. Robinson, Key issues and changing dynamics of the African/ Afro-American connection: (A summary interpretation of Boston University planning workshop, 1987) p. 3
15 Elliott P. Skinner, African Americans and U.S. policy toward Africa, 1850-1924: in
On much lighter note opponents of these views, particularly Malcolm X, underscore the assumption that black Americans work together with their black counterparts in Africa. Malcolm X argues, “The single greatest mistake of the American black organization and their leaders is that they have failed to establish direct brotherhood lines of communication between the independent nations of Africa and the American black people.” To be on the neutral side of this argument, the point of this essay rather is to suggest the connection that Africans and African Americans have a long history of social and political relationship. This is apparent from historians and present scholars that Africans and African Americans worked collectively despite of some setbacks.

However, in contemporary African and African-American-relationship, a lot has been said about these two groups in the United States. It is expected that since both are descendants from the same root culture, they would adapt and co-exist in harmony. However, doubts have been raised on this co-existence and adaptation. The growing stereotypes, misconceptions, ignorance, grudges, and cultural differences are largely responsible for some of these strained relationships. Can anything explain this reality other than these elements? The fundamental question is will this new generation of African immigrants and Africans Americans form social, political, and economic alliances? The present situation poses a challenge in the African Diaspora.

**The African Diaspora in the United States**


Martin Delany, Paul Hopkins, W.E.B. Du Bois, Marcus Garvey, to Tiemako Garan Kouyaté, these intellectuals have engaged and devoted a high purpose for the term and its importance in the study and understanding of Africans, African Americans, Afro-Caribbean blacks, and blacks elsewhere. According to Brent Hayes Edward, the term “African Diaspora” is often use to “express the links and commonalities among groups of African descent through out the world.”

The African Diasporas in the Americas started in the Seventeenth century during the trans-Atlantic slave trade. After the end of the infamous trans-Atlantic slave trade, some freed slaves repatriated to Africa. Many stayed and endured social, political and economic marginalization. Those freed slaves who stayed were given labels from Negro to Black to African American. It is widely believed that African Americans are also part of the African diaspora. As Copeland-Carson noted, “Pan-Africanist scholars as early as Du Bois attempted to define the diaspora as a model for African and African American cultural dynamics. These earlier conception of the African diaspora conceived of it as the cultural aggregate of individuals of African descent.”

Accordingly, Kwadwo Konadu-Agyemang and Baffour K. Takyi gave a considerable historical explanation to the African diaspora by stressing that “the immigration of African to the North American continent is not a new phenomenon. Indeed, the African presence in this region goes back further, and may predate the era of the infamous slave trade when significant numbers of West African slaves were brought to the colonies of the New

---

17 Brent Hayes Edward, African Diasporas in the new and old worlds, ed. Genevieve Fabre, Klaus Benesch (Rodopi, 2006), p. 3
World.” Ronald W. Walters joined Kwadwo Konadu-Agyemang and Baffour K. Takyi to buttress the notion that the diaspora was “created by slavery and slave trade and by the factors within the system of imperialism and colonialism that forced Africans to leave their continent.” Arthur has observed that “the new African immigrant diaspora in North America is very dynamic both in form and content. The African who constitute this diaspora are coming to North America from every geographic region of the continent—from Francophone, Anglophone, Spanish and Portuguese Africa.”

With all this mounting evidence of the African diaspora, what we know according to these scholars is that the numbers of Africans in the diaspora are increasing, particularly, in the United States. In a study conducted by Kofi K. Apraku, in regards to African migration to the United States, his finding revealed that “overwhelming majority (66 percent) indicated that economic situation in their home country was either somewhat important or very important in their decision to emigrate.” Baffour K. Takyi, explains that “there is no single explanation as to why Africans have been leaving the continent in large numbers in recent years. However, economic, political, historical processes, educational opportunities, and changes in immigration policies in the United States have been alluded to as providing the impetus for these population movements.” Joseph Takougang also argues that, “Africa’s rather desperate economic and political future have been important factors for recent large-scale migration to the United States, it could be argued that the apparent relaxation of the

United States' immigration policy has also been very helpful."24 This view is coherent with Diana Baird N’Diaye’s. She implies that:

Since the 1960s, several complex circumstances have contributed to attracting increased immigration and transnational activity of Africans to the United States. Some of these factors, both political and economic, including the decline of European colonization and economic influence in Africa, the concurrent growth of United States participation in Africa affairs, changes in U.S. immigration laws, and the existence of an established African American population.25

A similar point is also noted by April Gordon, for instance, she proposes that there are “five major factors that account for the patterns in African migration currently observable. They are: “(1) Globalization and integration of the world economy (2) Economic and political development failures in Africa (3) Immigration and refugee policies in Europe and the United States (4) Anglophone background (5) Historic ties of sending countries to the United States.” 26

According to the U.S. Census on black population, census 2000 showed that the United States population on “April 1, 2000 was 281.4 million. Of the total, 36.4 million or 12.9 percent reported Black or African American. This number includes 34.7 million people or 12.3 percent, who reported only black in addition to 1.8 million people, or 0.6 percent, who reported black as well as other races.” 27 John Arthur proposes that, “Between 1820 and 1993, the United States admitted a total of 418,425 Africans as permanent residents. An analysis of the INS data for the period 1980 to 1993 reveals that a total of 249,759 Africans

---

27 U.S Census Bureau, Black population 2000, p.1
immigrants were lawfully admitted to the United States.”\textsuperscript{28} Rob Carson also provides us with figures of African immigrants living in some parts of Washington. According to Carson, “in Tacoma, the number of people who identified themselves as sub-Saharan Africans increased nearly 800 percent, rising from 202 to 1,802. Seattle’s African populations climbed from about 2,500 to 10,000 during the 1990s.”\textsuperscript{29} By far the number of African immigrants in the United States is growing compared to previous decades and years. Table 1 and 2 explains the influx of African immigrants to the United States for social, political and economic reasons. These numbers only indicate African immigrants who sought legal residency and asylum. There is no precise number of African immigrants living in the United States but Gerald Lenoir and Nunu Kidane has observed that, “there are approximately 1.8 million people in the United States that claim their birth in Africa, nearly 60 percent of whom arrived in the one decade between 1990 and 2000. This low figure is highly disputed by organizations that work with and represent these communities. Many of them put the figure at four to five million.”\textsuperscript{30}

**Table 1**

Legal Permanent Resident Flow: Fiscal Years 2004 to 2006

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Region</td>
<td>Numbers</td>
<td>Numbers</td>
<td>Numbers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>117,430</td>
<td>85,102</td>
<td>66,422</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: U.S. Immigration and Naturalization

**Table 2**


\textsuperscript{29} African immigrants, black Americans poles apart. (The Columbian, 2003), p.5

\textsuperscript{30} Gerald Lenoir & Nunu Kidane, African Americans and Immigrants: Shall We Hang Together or Hang Separately? (Black Scholar, Vol. 37 Issue 1, 2007), P.1
Individuals Granted Asylum Defensively by Region: Fiscal Years: 1997 to 2006

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Africa</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1997</td>
<td>1,872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>1,743</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>1,803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>1,842</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>1,957</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2002</td>
<td>1,908</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>2,264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>2,412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>2,270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>2,802</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: U.S. Immigration and Naturalization

The point here is to emphasize that with the number of blacks increasing in the United States, whether they are Africans, African Americans, or Afro-Caribbean blacks, their relationship is often strained and outweighed by misconceptions and stereotypes. One would imagine that their common physical characteristics of skin color would constitute a powerful bond between them. But many of them did not hold this belief. For example, Haki R. Madhubuti elaborates more on this uncertainty:

There are over 100 million people of African descent in Western hemisphere, and we all face similar problems. Whether one is in Canada, the United States, or Brazil, the fight for self-determination and self-reliance is like using a shovel to dig a hole in steel enforced concrete. There are over 69 million people of African descent in Brazil who attempt to speak Portuguese, there are 35 million people of African descent in the U.S. who attempts to speak English, and we African don’t talk to each
other…over one hundred million Africans moving and working for the same goals in the same hemisphere is a threat to anyone’s rule. Our clothes, names, street address, employment, and articulations in their languages have changes, but the basic relationship has remained the same.31

If social, political, and economic cooperation is receptive among all blacks whether in Africa, United States or elsewhere, they could easily form perpetual relationship and contend injustices directed towards all blacks. In fact, one of the interviewee in this study cited the Jews in America and around the world as an example. He said, “Blacks around the world should form powerful lobbying forces around the world to influence policies just like the Jews.” This idea is both logical and reasonable, but one should be pessimistic about mutual cooperation among African leaders, let alone blacks all over the world. Looking closely at the evidence from the earliest phases of this paper, the present relationship between African immigrants and African Americans is overshadowed by misconception, stereotypes and ignorance.

Misconceptions, stereotypes and Ignorance

One burning issue that seems to pull apart African immigrants and African Americans is ignorance about each others culture and past. Misconceptions, stereotypes and ignorance have overshadowed the strained relationship between these two groups. This issue has been around for decades. Skinner point out, “Like Booker T. Washington, Du Bois was also exposed to the negative images of Africa held by almost all contemporary whites and most blacks in America.”32 Some of the known misconceptions and stereotypes that exist between these two groups are nothing but negative and it affects their overall relationship.

Both groups have entrusted themselves with stereotypical views that are usual and common among African immigrants and African Americans. Rosemary Lukens Traore, studying this trend of strain relationship and stereotypes at an inner-city high school went on to say “despite their possessing a common ancestry, it is regrettably an all-too-common fact of life in today’s American schools that African and African American students remain separated by a wide gulf that is sustained by myths, misperceptions, and negative stereotypes.”

Copeland-Carson also made a mark from a specific case in a Minneapolis public school, where she finds that, “both groups seemed to have adopted certain mainstream, stereotypic notions of each other. African students were somehow less civilized and African American students were somehow of lower social status.”

As Rob Carson noted, “Africans tend to think of black Americans as unpredictable and violent, and blacks tend to think of Africans as ignorant and primitive.”

Traore went into details describing the stereotypes that exist between these two groups. She writes:

Images predominated in the minds of the African American students of Tarzan, wild animals, and the “Dark Continent”, which have made the “African” in African American something to be avoided or reviled. For the African students, the bewildering images of African Americans living on welfare, being violent toward others, and uncommonly rude to their own people, have also contributed to negative reactions to being identified as “African American”. It may seem ironic to the casual observer but, for the most part, the African students wondered why their fellow African American brothers and sisters treated them as second-class citizens, while the African Americans wondered why the African students seem to feel or act so superior to them. From the alternate perspective, neither group seemed to be justified in their unfounded beliefs about the other.

---

35 African immigrants, black Americans poles apart. (The Columbian, 2003), p.5
Traore was not alone in addressing these stereotypical views among both groups. John Arthur directly quoting the words of Mary Waters and Kasinitz establishes that:

Black immigrants, see black Americans as lazy, disorganized, and obsessed with racial images, and having a laissez-faire attitude toward family life and child raising. On their part, native-born American blacks view black immigrants as arrogant and oblivious to the racial tensions between blacks and whites.\(^{37}\)

Moikobu also illustrates the nature of these stereotypes by borrowing Rayford Logan’s study of forty African American students from Howard University to render their general concept about Africa. Some of the stereotypes the students came up with were, “the Dark Continent, mysterious continent, Africa was hot; it had no civilization of its own; it was inhabited by cannibals, heathens, and ferocious animals living in impenetrable jungles.”\(^{38}\)

Oscar Johnson also adds that, “Africans come here and they are under a lot of misconception that African Americans are losers and don’t take advantage of opportunities.”\(^{39}\)

Additionally, another key issue that seems to divide African immigrants and African Americans is the question of cultural affinity. The question here is to what extent do Africans and African Americans share cultures? People often assumed that black people have similar cultural background. Pinpointing the cultural heritage among black people as a whole, would be like “finding a needle in a haystack.” Arthur argues about the cultural impediments that seem to cause misunderstanding between African immigrants and African Americans. He asserted that “the patterns of socialization and cultural identification are

\(^{39}\) Oscar Johnson, Chilly Coexistence: Africans and African Americans in the Bronx. P. 2
different. Sometimes, the cultural gap and differences in value and orientation becomes sites of conflict and tension between the two groups.”

Expressing similar view about cultural differences, Moikobu affirms that “cultural differences were mentioned by both black Americans and Africans as a strain-causing element in the relationships.”

Let me give you an example of how difficult it would be to determine the cultural links among Africans. With its Fifty-four countries, thousands of languages and ethnic groups, Africans themselves have different cultural practices and beliefs. To validate my assertion, E. Kofi Agorsah, points out, “the identification of the origin of the people and culture of the African diaspora continues to be an increasingly complicated and elusive problem. One difficulty is in identifying the geographical boundaries and the specific origins of groups’ people and their cultural transfer.”

The data from this study tends to buttress the question of shared culture that black people perceive as having in common is represented among the respondents. African immigrants and African Americans were asked do Africans and African Americans share the same culture? For instance, 82 percent of African immigrants and 66 percent of African Americans in this study stated that they have no similar cultures. Only 10 percent of African immigrants and 20 percent of African Americans said they have similar cultures. 8 percent on the African immigrants’ part and 14 percent of African Americans said they are not sure whether Africans and Africans have the same cultures. (See Table 3)

Table 3

Respondents’ asked do Africans and African Americans share the same culture?

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Africans</th>
<th></th>
<th>African Americans</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>50</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>50</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As long as there’s a cultural barrier it’s going to breed ignorance. In order to bridge this cultural gap, both groups need to disconnect themselves from the existing stereotypes that seem to divide them.

As I gather information about the stereotypes that exist between African immigrants and African Americans, through surveys and interviews, participants in the interviews were asked to identify stereotypes and participants in the surveys were asked whether they held stereotypes against each other. An African immigrant interviewed said “African American women are drama…I don’t associate with them a lot. Is just their behavior and they always withdraw from us” He went on to say, “They are any other person, some are good some are bad, some understand us some don’t. They pretend like white folks. He concludes that “higher percentage of African Americans wants to be rapper or athletes and small percentage want to go to school.” Additionally, an African American women interviewed had these stereotypes about African men, “I always heard people saying that don’t date any Africans because they are violent, bossy and demanding…and they will jump on you.” Obviously from the evidence above, it is absolutely clear that the groups do sense the reasons for their strained relationship.
In analyzing and interpreting some of this study data, the responses from the participants surveyed are crucial as they shed light upon the nature and extend of the stereotypes that exist between Africans and African Americans. (See Table 4)

**Table 4**
Respondents’ asked; have you ever held false stereotypes against Africans/ Americans

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Africans</th>
<th></th>
<th>African Americans</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results indicated that 48 percent of African immigrants said they held stereotypes against African Americans and 62 percent of African Americans said they also held stereotypes against Africans. Only 36 percent of African immigrants and 26 percent of African Americans said they never held stereotypes against each other. 16 percent of Africans and 12 percent of African Americans said they are not sure whether they held stereotypes against each other.

One could argue that the misconceptions, stereotypes and ignorance between African immigrants and Africans Americans emanates from the lack of historical information communicated from societies. On the one hand, Moikobu states that, “another divergent perception concerning both groups was that black Africans overwhelmingly felt that their relationships with black Americans were marred because of black Americans ignorance concerning Africans and Africa.”43 On the other hand, Arthur points out, “Native-born black react to African immigrants’ allegations mainly by highlighting the...

---

immigrants’ lack of knowledge of the historical conditions (discrimination, exclusion, and violence) associated with being black in America.”

Arthur reinforces this view by mentioning that:

With the exception of the African immigrants from South Africa who suffered from an apartheid system of racial exclusion until a few years ago, Africans in the United States came from countries where blacks are in the majority and have responsibility for shaping their social, cultural, political, economic destinies. As a result, the majority of Africans come to the United States with little or no understanding of the dynamics of discrimination against blacks and people of color in general.

Moikobu reiterated this view of how Africans in their respective countries constitute majority of their populations. Moikobu states, “black Africans come from backgrounds where a traditional African way of life predominates and where Africans were and are in the majority for the most part. On the whole, most black Africans, except in places like South Africa, have been less affected by racial discrimination than black Americans.”

Many African immigrants lack of knowledge on the African Americans historical past could be attributed to this notion. For example, Robinson blamed the colonial period. He argues that, “In colonial times, African’s access to information about Afro-Americans was circumscribed.”

In quest for education, both Africans and African Americans have had their curriculum altered with Eurocentric perspective. In her conclusion, Rosemary Lukens Traore argues:

---

45 Ibid, p. 73
47 Key issues and changing dynamics of the African/ Afro-American connection: (A summary interpretation of Boston University planning workshop, 1987) p. 4
Schools in America for the most part are not designed to educate Africans or Africans Americans about Africa, their historical and cultural heritage. Schools in Africa, originally set up by the colonial masters, have not been educating the African students about their heritage either. These systems were designed with the same enculturation focus, to civilize the savages by bringing them European history and culture.\textsuperscript{48}

I take a number of issues with Eurocentric perspectives, which according to Moikobu, “is predominantly white and European.”\textsuperscript{49} And “Eurocentric perspective provides a biased, distorted, mythical, and stereotyped image of blacks.”\textsuperscript{50} Charles Jackson, a critic of Eurocentric puts it, “the content of the public school curriculum are teaching and perpetuation of the stereotypes regarding the true nature of Africa and its place in the development of world civilization.”\textsuperscript{51} For example, Asante has attacked Eurocentric bias by saying, “Eurocentric consciousness…excludes the historical and cultural perspective of Africa.”\textsuperscript{52} Adeleke, make reference to Charles Jackson’s study of “the pedagogical front of the African American struggle. Education, he contends, was and remains an effective arm of the black struggle. This struggle is now waged largely in the domain of Black studies, a discipline born of the struggle for elevation. He highlights the Eurocentric underpinnings of scholarship, demonstrating how stereotypes were developed to denigrate Africans and blacks in Diaspora.”\textsuperscript{53} James H. Meriwether also shares this view. He writes, “With negative stereotypes of Africans permeating the broader culture, not surprising such images reached

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{49} Blood and flesh: Black American and African identification (Westport, Conn: Greenwood Press, 1981), p. 15
\item \textsuperscript{50} Ibid, P. 198
\item \textsuperscript{51} Charles C. Jackson, Africa, African Americans and Eurocentric Diffusion (Critical perspectives on historical and contemporary issues about Africa and Black America. (Lewiston, N.Y: Edwin Mellen Press, 2004), p. 80
\item \textsuperscript{52} Molefi Kete Asante, the Afrocentric Idea. (Temple University Press: Philadelphia 1998), p. 5
\item \textsuperscript{53} Tunde Adeleke, Critical perspectives on historical and contemporary issues about Africa and Black America. (Lewiston, N.Y: Edwin Mellen Press, 2004), p. 7
\end{itemize}
into the nation’s classrooms. Educational experiences taught children from an early age about the primitiveness of Africans, with textbooks for schoolchildren buttressing ideas of African inferiority.”

Traore reiterated this point by asserting that scholars such as: Akbar (1998), Asante (1991), Dei (1994), Hilliard (1998), Madhubuti and Madhubuti (1994), Shujaa (1994), Tedla (1995) have all argued strongly for the importance of the Afrocentric perspective in studying the schooling of children of African descent, because this perspective derives from communal values, shared myths, and a sense of community that differs significantly from the Eurocentric view.

It is not surprising that many scholars conclude as do Carter G. Woodson. In the *Mis-Education of the Negro*, Woodson argues that, “the educated negroes have attitude of contempt toward their own people because in their own as well as in their mixed schools Negroes are taught to admire the Hebrew, the Greek, the Latin and the Teuton and to despise the African.” This position is consistent with one of the participants interviewed in this study. She stresses that “in school people often say Asians and whites are smart but never for Africans.” It is imperative to note that Africans are taught about slavery, African history and their culture. But African Americans are rarely taught about their past. Bernard Makhosezwe Magubane adds, “The African past is not clear and easily accessible to the American black without extensive learning; it is not part of his daily folklore. The black child only comes in contact with the negative aspect of it in school.” This is largely due to the dominant Eurocentric perspective in American curriculum. An Afrocentric perspective

---

56 Carter G. Woodson, the mis-education of the Negro; (Chicago, Ill 2000), p. 1
should also be considered in United States institutional pedagogy in order to get a more
balance learning environment. Adeleke has extended this argument by proposing that:

The objective is to instill in black Americans as awareness of their African
identity and culture as a defensive weapon against a pervasive and domineering
Eurocentric world view. Afrocentricity is projected as a process of re-education
and re-socialization designed to rid Black American consciousness of the tragic
conception of their history, culture and heritage, imbibed from Eurocentrism.  

Role of the media

Before we can grapple satisfactory with the misconceptions, stereotypes and
ignorance that exist between African immigrants and African Americans, it is indeed
important to ask what role does the mainstream media plays in the stereotypes and
misconceptions that exist between the two groups. It is clear that the media plays an
important role in our day-to-day activities and it helps us in shaping some of our decisions.
Misconception and negative images of Africa and Africans are common in mainstream
media. It is utmost important and necessary for mainstream media to inform their viewers
about the positive side of Africa and Africans and not only to concentrate on negative
aspects. John Arthur argues that, “Stereotypical media representations of the peoples and
cultures of Africa have not helped advance the cause of Africa and Africans in the United
States.” Fola Adeshina gave a detailed account of his encounter with an African American
women who revealed that she had a “bad feeling about Africans as a whole because the
television tell me that they are very uncivilized and nothing but savage living in the jungle,
and so on; and how would I challenge myself with a bunch of savage.” The mainstream

58 Black Americans, Africa and History: A Reassessment of the
media can be outright bias on what they want people to see. In most cases the media is at the forefront as it always does of showing images of African civil wars, diseases, malnourished children, naked children and people living in absolute poor conditions. Virtually all the participants interviewed in this study partially blamed the media for reinforcing some of the stereotypes and misconceptions of Africa and Africans as, “primitive people, Dark continent, bush people, wars, naked babies, and AIDS.” Like the participants interview in this study, Traore also provides us with a data about some of the stereotypes that students in her study pointed out where they get information about the other group. (See Table 5)

**Table 5**

Responses from the students regarding where they got their information about the other group.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Home</th>
<th>Media</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stereotypes</td>
<td>Neighbors</td>
<td>Amistad Languages/accents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>Roots</td>
<td>Shaka Zulu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Stereotypes</td>
<td>Discovery channel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fights</td>
<td>Prior education experience</td>
<td>National Geographic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School behavior</td>
<td></td>
<td>Commercials of starving babies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group work</td>
<td></td>
<td>AIDS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crowded hallways</td>
<td></td>
<td>American TV shows and Movies/Tarzan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude towards education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jealousy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Rosemary Lukens Traore

It is quite apparent that the mainstream media portrays Africans and Africa in a very negative way and this has increased the stereotypical views on the African Americans part. For African Americans to have positive views about Africa and Africans, it solely depends
on their ability to learn more about the continent and its people without information from the mainstream media.

To boost the image of Africa and Africans in abroad, Gilbert da Costa asserts that Adrianne Diouf the spokesperson for the Economic Community of West African States at a media summit in Nigeria argues that:

The ultimate objective is to draw attention to happenings on the continent that hardly gets a mention elsewhere. Our prime responsibility as African citizens is to do as much as we can to show the best of our world. It does not mean we should forget about the negative things, no. Reporting is reporting, the truth must be said. If there are wars, if there is famine, if there is corruption, it must be told and people must know it, so that the people, who have to address it, take measures to address it. But on the other hand, we have positive stories, we have success stories.”61

Conflicts and grudges

Much of the preceding discussion in this study carries the implicit issues that divide African immigrants and African Americans. However, another significant impediment that seems to separate and leave a mark between their relationship is the growing grudges and conflicts which appear to be on the rise. But does the grudges and conflict necessarily explains or contributes to the fragile relationships? In the view of Josephine Moraa Moikobu, John Arthur, and Rob Carson, all expressed similar perspectives on the growing conflict and grudges. On his part, Carson argues that the conflict and grudges “dates back to the days of slavery.”62 On the issue of slavery, some African Americans have blamed Africans for slavery. Joseph Takougang, in his article, Diaspora: African Immigrants in USA Contemporary African Immigrants to the United States argues that “another problem faced by African immigrants is the lack of acceptance by some of their African American

---

counterparts. African immigrants are perceived by some African Americans as responsible for the fact that their ancestors were sold into slavery."^{63} Clarence Walker went on to say: Tribalism did not prevent Africans from selling members of their own tribes in order to satisfy the demand for slaves in the Americas."^{64} John Arthur also has emphasize that “the form of statements, allegedly made to African blacks by black American youths, that the African did nothing to stop the slave trade and that the Africans are partly blame for selling the African Americans’ ancestors to the white man hundreds of years ago.”^{65} Rosemary Lukens Traoré in her article, *Voices of African Students in America: “We’re Not From the Jungle”* shed light on the issue of slavery. She interviewed an African American studies teacher who told her that “he doesn’t cover the subjects of Africa or Africans much in his classes because they sold us into slavery.”^{66} African immigrants and African Americans in this study were asked similar question: Are Africans to be blamed for Slavery? (See Table 6)

**Table 6**

Respondents’ asked Are Africans to be blamed for Slavery?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Africans</th>
<th>African Americans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

64 Clarence E. Walker, We can’t go home again (Oxford University Press, 2001), p. 61
66 Rosemary Lukens Traore, Voices of African Students in America: “We’re Not From the Jungle”. (Multicultural perspective Vol. 8, No. 2, 2006)
Overwhelming majority of African immigrants disagree on the issue of slavery. Here 88 percent of African immigrants said Africans should not be blamed for slavery and 6 percent said Africans should be blamed. On the African American part, 60 percent answered no and 32 percent said Africans should be blamed for slavery, while 8 percent said they are not sure. The data from this study indicated that majority in both groups did not hold the belief that Africans sold their decedents to slavery. To borrow the words of one African immigrant interviewee again who puts it: “They blamed Africans for slavery.” He said, “For those who are conscious about history...they want to move on, and their interactions with Africans are fine.” From this study, it seems like a number of African Americans still dwelled on the notion that Africans sold their decedents to slavery.

Another issue that attests to the conflict and grudges between African immigrants and African Americans is that African immigrants interacts more with whites than African Americans. This view was also brought up in one of the interviews conducted. The interviewee claims that “Africans are for white people. They associate with whites than African Americans.” Moikobu, probing the social interactions of blacks in general found out that African Americans accused Africans for socializing more with whites people. Moikobu asserted that several African Americans said this about Africans: “They, Africans, don’t want to bother with us. Or, if the whites are around, for instance, or if the African somehow has been brainwashed. A third remarked: “because I see what they do and not what they say.” A fourth indicated: “they socialize with whites.” Mohammed Naseehu Ali also has similar view on this issue. He writes, “I was reminded once again how prejudiced Blacks can be toward one another. It all started when an African-American schoolmate vehemently reproached me for having too many White friends and accused me of selling out to the

Man.” Surprisingly, African Americans in South Africa faced similar sentiments from black South Africans. Judith Matloff tells us that “Nokwanda Sithole, deputy editor of Enterprise, a Johannesburg-based black business magazine says many readers of the magazine say they sense that black Americans arrive acting as if local talent is inferior. Some, they claim, prefer to deal with whites rather than with them.”

Moreover, education and economic competition among African immigrants and African Americans also creates grudges and conflicts. That is African immigrants are believed to acquire higher education and have higher earnings than African Americans. To authenticate this point, Dodoo, F. Nii-Amoo argues that:

African, Caribbean, and native-born blacks present a descending hierarchy also observed with hours worked. African immigrants have considerably higher levels of education compared to the others. This is best exemplified in the distribution of respondents who have college degrees; while 13.1% and 14.6% of African Americans and Caribbean immigrants, respectively, have obtained college degrees a substantial 58 percent of Africans are thus endowed.

In a study conducted by Augustine J. Kposowa on earning gap between African immigrants and African Americans, Kposowa argues that “by 1990, African immigrants had achieved earnings parity with their native-born Black counterparts, and even appear to have surpassed the latter.” He went further asserting that “according to the result, at the same level of education, Africans made slightly more than native born Blacks.”

---

68 Mohammed Naseehu Ali, Blacks can be racist, too. (Essence, Vol. 25, Issue 1, 1994,) P. 1
70 Dodoo, F. Nii-Amoo, Assimilation Differences among Africans in America. (Social Forces; Vol. 76 Issue 2. 1997), p.4
72 Ibid, p.179
Furthermore, John Arthur adds that an “Ethiopian immigrant, reflecting on his experiences with American blacks, said they [African-Americans] tell us [African] that we come to their country and take their jobs.” 73 This view is consistent with one of the participant interviewed in this study. She said, “I often hear that they Africans come here and get the jobs” Judith Matloff tells us again that Nokwanda Sithole deputy editor of Enterprise, a Johannesburg-based black business magazine argues that black South Africans “fear the African-Americans are coming to take jobs from local professionals. That is a widespread view” 74 Indeed, for some, the so-called grudges and conflicts are clearly not a matter of African immigrants or African American taking jobs away from each other as some had asserted. In reality, it is rather, a dedication to hard work and qualifications based on merits. If all these theories are right, the grudges and conflicts that exist between them had implanted the seeds of misunderstandings between African immigrants and African Americans.

Analysis and interpretation of data

The data presented in this study are obtained from three different sources: interviews, surveys and extensive library research. My own experiences with both African immigrants and African Americans are not included in any of the data or information presented. A total of hundred participants were surveyed and eight were interviewed. Fifty African immigrants were surveyed and four were interviewed. Fifty African Americans were surveyed and four were interviewed. Participants in this study mainly constitutes male. (See Table 7)

Table 7

Gender distribution for both African immigrants and African Americans surveyed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Participants came from Portland State University, and the African immigrants and African American communities in Metro-Portland areas in Portland, Oregon. African Immigrants who took part in the surveys and interviews came from eleven Sub-Saharan African countries. They are: Chad, the Gambia, Ghana, Kenya, Liberia, Nigeria, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Somalia, Sudan, and Zimbabwe. They range from ages 18-to-75. (See Table 8)

Age distribution for both African immigrants and African Americans surveyed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Africans</th>
<th>African Americans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-35</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-50</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-65</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66-75</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion
The theme of this research was to probe and analyze the relationships between African immigrants and African Americans and whether or not both groups can adapt to each other despite of mounting stereotypes, ignorance, misconceptions and grudges that exist between them. This study has provided a more balanced look at the overall relationship between the two groups. That is by thoroughly examining both the positive and negative aspect of their strained relationship and emphasizing on the issues that seems to keep them apart even though they share common origin and skin color.

Specifically, the stereotypes, ignorance, misconceptions and grudges have overshadowed the strained relationship between these two groups. Whatever beliefs both group hold against each other, come from the larger American society, predominantly the mainstream media, and United States educational institution, which is dominated by Eurocentric perspective. On the part of the mainstream media, it has not helped in bridging the gap between these two camps. Instead, it is at the forefront of the commotion by bombarding Americans, particularly African Americans with negative images of Africa and Africans, which many African Americans don’t want to associate with. The United States institutional pedagogy is mainly dominated by Eurocentric perspective, which fails to include or acknowledge the cultural and historical perspective of Africa. African Americans are rarely taught about African history, culture and the contribution Africa and Africans has given to the New World, especially to the United States.

Also cultural differences have to be accounted in the strained relationship between these two groups. As I mentioned earlier in this study, as long as there is cultural barriers it’s going to breed ignorance. African Americans have to take it to themselves to learn about the African continent, its people and their respective cultures. Likewise, African immigrants also have to learn about the African American past—discrimination and exclusion from the
social, political, economic and arena. Both groups should refrain from judging one another without direct or actual experience of the problem that seems to divide them.

In order to achieve an amicable relationship and understanding between African immigrants and African Americans, both groups need to reject negative stereotypes and develop communication style. Given the quality of evidence in this study, both African immigrants and African Americans who were interviewed and surveyed accept the fact that there are indeed reasonable suspicions between these two groups, but both groups acknowledged that cooperation is attainable, citing the exemplary role of the pan-African movement and Black Nationalism and their leaders in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

And last but not least, it is hoped that this research will provoke interest in the social interaction of blacks all over the world and rekindle their historical connection that existed in earlier centuries.
Bibliography


Andom, M & Murakami, K. Shooting puts light on ethnic divide African Americans, Immigrants seek to ease tensions. The Seattle Post Intelligencer, 2006


Dodoo F. Assimilation Differences among Africans in America. Social Forces; Vol. 76 Issue 2, 1997


Lenoir, G & Kidane, N, African Americans and Immigrants: Shall We Hang Together or Hang Separately? Black Scholar; Vol. 37 Issue 1, 2007


Takyi, B. K. The Making of the Second Diaspora: On the Recent African
Immigrant Community in the United States. Western Journal of Black Studies; Vol. 26 Issue 1, 2002


Walker, C.E. We can’t go home again. An argument about Afrocentrism. Oxford University Press, 2001


Woodson, C. G. The mis-education of the Negro; Chicago, Ill: African-American Images, 2000
The Representation of Women in Comic Books, Post WWII Through the Radical 60’s.

MARYJANE DUNNE
DR. ROBERT LIEBMAN, FACULTY MENTOR

“We women have served all these centuries as looking glasses possessing the power of reflecting the figure of man at twice its natural size.” Virginia Woolf

The American comic book as long served as an alternative form of entertainment for a diverse demographic. Alongside jazz and Hollywood movies, the comic book is considered an indigenous American art form (Conroy). While the first comic book didn’t originate in America, the comic book superhero and comic books as they are known today are credited as originating in America.

Comic books are not only a source of pleasure, but they also serve as a unique reflection of American culture. Comic book characters are usually depicted in visual and contextual extremes. These extremes are representations of how common stereotypes are turned into archetypes and can help us learn about contemporary American social structure. This is especially clear in studying gender roles, the focus of my research on female superheroes.

From the debut of the first female superhero, Wonder Woman, the representation of women was always within the frame of gender bias. The ascribed and acquired roles that women typically held post-WWII through the sixties, such as wife, mother and secretary, are nearly duplicated in comic books. The Rosie the Riveter era gave us women who could handle, “men’s work.” The fifties served as a rollback to the forties with limited roles, and the sixties proved to be the richest decade for women up to that point. This research follows
the roles given to five female superheroes and helps to explain the social importance of this influential American art form.

**Social-Role Theory**

A role is usually defined as a set of expectations about the way individuals with certain social identifications will most likely act in certain situations. It is said that when human beings are engaged in almost any set of behaviors they are conveying information about themselves that tells others that they are playing a role (Birenbaum). Roles can be ascribed or acquired. An ascribed role is a role that we are given and did not earn. An example of an ascribed role could be daughter, mother or girlfriend. An acquired role is the opposite of an ascribed role. Acquired roles are roles that we’ve earned such as doctor or nurse.

Roles are important because the typical comic book superhero almost always has an alter ego, meaning they usually carry-on normal lives outside of their superhero persona. For male characters in the 1940s-60s, these roles are diverse and typically prestigious. In contrast, female characters were usually given very few roles with limited upward mobility. Because of the civil rights movement, second wave feminism and the sexual revolution, the late 1960’s changed this landscape for women and their comic book counterparts.

**Wonder Woman – Diana Prince**

Introduced in 1941 in All Star Comics #8, Wonder Woman was the first female superhero. Created by William Moulton Marston, Wonder Woman debuted in the midst of WWII, at the same time of the Rosie the Riveter movement of women taking over typical male occupied positions. In her non-superhero form, Wonder Woman lives as army nurse, Diana Prince. Wonder Woman is a unique example of a female character that was specifically modeled as a feminist. Marston, a psychologist who invented the lie detector and feminist when feminism wasn’t a household word, concluded that women were more honest, more
reliable and could work faster and more reliable than men (Conroy). He created Wonder Woman to counter to what he perceived as an overly masculine-dominated world. In a 1943 issue of The American Scholar, Marston wrote,

> Not even girls want to be girls so long as our feminine archetype lacks force, strength and power. Women’s strong qualities have become despised because of their weakness. The obvious remedy is to create a feminine character with all the strength of Superman plus the allure of a good and beautiful woman.

Good intentions aside, Marston passed away in 1947, leaving the characters of Diana Prince and Wonder Woman to DC Comics. New artists and writers took over and Wonder Woman went through a subtle standardization process that more closely mimicked typical female roles of the forties, fifties and sixties.

In the 1940s, Diana Prince had very few professional roles outside of her nursing job with the army. In her debut issue, Wonder Woman moonlights as a stage actress, but normally sticks to fighting crime (Moulton). In 1947, the year Marston died, Wonder Woman was part of the Justice Society of America, yet because of the limited roles available to women, she initially served only as the team’s secretary, taking phone calls and dispatching help.

Regardless of Wonder Woman’s feminist beginnings, the 1950s saw her lead a life similar to the more traditional superheroines. In 1954 saw the invention of the Comics Code Authority, which was created to regulate the content of comic books. While the Comics Code Authority had no legal authority over publishers, many distributors refused to carry comics unless they came with the Comics Code seal of approval. After the invention of the
Comics Code Authority, Wonder Woman comics no longer contained strong feminist story lines.

In 1968, Wonder Woman went through yet another transformation. She was stripped of all her powers and learned martial arts. In 1973 her powers and traditional costume were restored, influenced by none other than Gloria Steinem, who featured her on the cover of Ms. Magazine in 1972.

Wonder Woman is an example of a character that has endured the test of time and remains the most well known and beloved of all female comic book characters. Regardless of her early start as a strong non-stereotypical female character, the transitions between decades and writers have altered her physical image, the story lines and the professional roles available to her.

**Catwoman – Selina Kyle**

Whether viewed as a superhero, a villain or simply the love-interest of Batman, Catwoman has endured many character transformations and is still holding strong today. Introduced in 1940 as a sexy and seductive jewel-thief, Selina Kyle, Catwoman’s alter ego, has typically worked low-end, non-prestigious jobs. In 1951, Selina Kyle is revealed to be an air stewardess with amnesia, in 1954 she is seen running a pet-store, and in 1969 she’s the owner of a beauty salon. Throughout all of her professional jobs, she is seen wavering back and forth between villain and superhero, but the creators never really decide on either. One can also see the obvious sexual-tension between Catwoman and Batman with Catwoman as the usual instigator. In 1967 Catwoman can be seen starting a jealousy war with Batgirl over the love of Batman.
With such transformations, Catwoman remains a complex character. But because of the limited social roles available to women, Catwoman’s complexity was relegated to her dark personality and not her life outside of crime.

**The Invisible Girl/Woman – Sue Storm**

Perhaps it’s just a coincidence that the only female member of Marvel’s, the Fantastic Four was invisible, but Sue Storm, once a weak character always in need of rescuing, has grown into what is considered to be the strongest and most powerful character of the group (Conroy). It wasn’t until 1964 when the Invisible Girl really learned the extent of her powers and was able to be a real asset to the team.

Sue Storm is different than both Wonder Woman and Catwoman because she never really holds any jobs outside of her ascribed role of girlfriend and in 1965, wife. Once married, the Invisible Girl becomes the Invisible Woman and gives birth to a son, earning her the role of mother. Above all else, Sue Storm is a gentle and passive character with no real life outside of her family and team.

**The Wasp – Jan Van Dyne**

The most stereotypical female character of the five, Jan Van Dyne, The Wasp, was the only female character of the Avengers. A wealthy heiress, Jan typically appears as shallow and self-centered and constantly comments on the attractiveness of the other members of her team. The Wasp has the ability to make herself larger and smaller. While large, her strength increases, and while small she has the ability to grow wings and fly. Interestingly enough, the Wasp is usually drawn as diminutively and never at her large size unless in extreme danger.
Debuting in 1963, The Wasp, similar to the Invisible Girl, never really holds a professional job outside of her role as an heiress. Jane van Dyne has either played the girlfriend or in 1968, the wife to Henry Pym, one of her teammates.

The Wasp may be the most interesting of characters to study closely because of her stereotypical behavior and hyper-femininity and her lack of acquired roles.

**Batgirl – Barbara Gordon**

Probably the most intelligent and refined of all the studied female characters, Batgirl is the poster-child for women's liberation. Debuting in 1966, Barbara Gordon is the daughter of the Police Commissioner, James Gordon, and a librarian by day. She’s honest, hard working and book-smart. As a female version of Batman, Batgirl rides a motorcycle and is as fearless as Batman, and as curious as Robin.

Taking her cue from the women’s liberation movement of the sixties and seventies, Barbara Gordon makes a steady transition from young librarian to capable congresswoman in less than six years. She loses the mousy and shy bookworm persona, as well as her hair-bun and glasses and turns into a confident modern woman with a flair for politics.

**Similarities and Differences in Characters**

While all of these female characters overlap in some way, it’s important to point out some key similarities and differences.

Probably the most striking similarity in characters is seen in the Invisible Girl and the Wasp. Both characters debuted around the same time, and both characters lacked professional roles outside of self-proclaimed vigilante. Both the Wasp and the Invisible Girl went from love interest, to girlfriend to wife within a matter of four to five years. In addition, both characters went from being weak characters to strong influential characters.
around the same time. These similarities could exist because both the Avengers and the Fantastic Four share the same writers and artists and are published both by Marvel comics.

The most striking difference is shrouded in the Wonder Woman mystery. One could assume that Wonder Woman set an example as a strong feminist and other characters followed that lead. But the opposite had happened. Wonder Woman remained a popular character through the three decades mentioned, but after the death of William Moulton Marston, she went through the same transformation process that other female characters went through - she was turned into a secretary. Because of this reverse influence in comics, Wonder Woman, or Marston, never had the opportunity to set a positive example for other artists and writers who struggled to give female characters life. These creators were simply taking cues from their social-environment about the roles women were allowed to play and reflecting their socialization in their art.

Another important comparison can be made about female characters modeled after established male characters. Most of the characters researched were not modeled after male characters, but many female characters that existed around the same time were modeled after their male counterparts. Batgirl is the only character that was specifically modeled after a male character. However, it’s important to point out that all of these characters did not debut in their own comics. The Invisible Girl and the Wasp debuted as team characters, but were never created as the leaders. And Catwoman and Batgirl both debuted in an issue of Batman. Wonder Woman is the only female character studied who did not debut as a supporting character, but she was able to get her own comic title a little over a year later (Conroy).

Last but not least, the most important similarity between characters is the lack of professional roles available to all of them until the late sixties. As laid out above, Wonder
Woman went through a “feminization” process in the fifties and then was restored to her original appearance in the late sixties. The Invisible Girl was never given a job except as wife and mother, and the Wasp was an heiress as well as a wife. In contrast, both the Invisible Girl and the Wasp married men who hold prestigious jobs outside of vigilantism, such as an aerospace engineer and scientist. Catwoman, usually portrayed as a thief and a villain, only appears to hold-down low-end jobs such as flight stewardess and shopkeeper. Because of Batgirl’s late debut, she is given the most complex and prestigious professional role out of all the female characters studied. Because there was such a contrast between the events of the early sixties and late sixties, the transformation from demure librarian to successful congresswoman in only six years doesn’t seem like such a surprising leap.

Limitations of the Research

While the evidence is fairly straightforward, a content analysis of any sort can come with flaws. The first difficulty encountered in the research was that there are no reliable comic book databases for easy access to archived materials. This made it extremely difficult to review all comics containing these characters and consequently allowed for gaps in the character timelines.

The last weakness in the research is that the hypothesis cannot be fully supported based on different artists and writers taking over characters through the decades. For instance, William Moulton Marston intended to create a strong female character unlike any other representation of women in comics. But after his death in 1947, the Wonder Woman character was handed over to other artists and writers with their own biases. While most of these characters studied typically follow the stereotypical roles available to women in the forties, fifties and sixties, a writer and artist may come along to change this representation of women. A creator-continuity was not done for this research.
Conclusion and Future Research

As stated above, comic books have the ability to both shape and reflect the changes in society. Comics mirror the fact that women were essentially “invisible,” in both comic books and American society in the 1950s and extremely active in the 1960s. This shows the important association between comics and real-life. But because comic book characters push the envelope and imitate gross stereotypes, they can serve as an almost conclusive analysis of the roles available to women and other minorities at the time.

Future research can look at visual representations of women in comic books and compare them to the images of men. Sociologist, Erving Goffman studied gender bias in advertisements and came up with a systematic approach to analyze ads. He looked at specific codes present in ads and considered what they said about society and social relationships. A similar analysis could be done for the visual representation of women as well as the social themes within the content.

Overall, this analysis has shown that comics have the ability to both reflect and shape society. Lowbrow or highfalutin, art imitates life and in some cases, life imitates art - especially in pop-culture.
Bibliography


Towards a Tool for Measuring Student Role Mastery

Collin Fellows  
Dr. Peter Collier, Faculty Mentor  
Dr. David Morgan, Faculty Mentor

Abstract  
The role of “college student” is an uncertain one for all freshmen, but some students come into the education system not sharing the common understanding of how to best enact that role. This study will look at new ways of measuring expertise in, and mastery of the role of college student. I will explore the possibility of using Cultural Consensus as a measuring rod of how well entering students understand this role. Finding such a tool can be of use both in predicting success and in developing specific interventions for those who might otherwise drop out of school.

Introduction  
Do all students begin the college experience with the same level of understanding of how to what it takes to be a successful student? Are there groups of students who are less able to make the transition from high school to college smoothly? These questions are the driving force behind this study. Pierre (1973, 1977, 1984) uses the idea of cultural capital to describe how culture reproduces itself and transmits its dominant values from one generation to the next. Much of his work has focused on the application of cultural capital to the system of education. A person’s level of access to cultural capital determines their ability to access and make practical use of the common knowledge of a culture. The goal of this study is to find a reasonable tool that can measure the level of access to this “common knowledge” and begin to enable intervention programs designed to help at-risk students.

As a group, college students present a wide array of diversity. What they all have in common is some level of desire to attain a college degree. Many, however, do not finish their program and often not even their first year. At both public and
private colleges and universities across the nation, attrition rates have been increasing (Postsecondary Education Opportunity, 2002), with students most likely to drop out during the 1st year (Consortium for Student Retention Data Exchange, 1999; American College Testing, 2001). A National Center for Education Statistics report noted that even after controlling for socioeconomic status, institution types, and attendance rates, first-generation students (those with at least one parent who completed a four-year degree) demonstrated lower retention rates (73%) than traditional students (90%). Overall, 16 percent of those who began their postsecondary education in a 4-year institution in 1989–90 left before their second year—that is, they either dropped out for at least 4 months during their first year or failed to return for their second year “First generation students were about twice as likely as those whose parents had bachelor’s degrees to do so (23 versus 10 percent). (U.S. Department of Education, 2001) With these alarming numbers it is vital that any and all possible explanations be explored. Existing studies have credited the lower levels of success for some students to lack of familial economic and emotional support (London, 1989), or lack of ambition and doubts as to their academic abilities (Mitchell, 1997). We believe that none of these studies has yet satisfactorily answered the deeper question of kinds of differences exist in the students understanding of themselves as a student at the onset of the higher education experience between those who do succeed and those who drop out early.

Tinto, (1975, 1993) in one of the most familiar studies of college retention has suggested that there are a number of “tools” with which every student enters into the educational system. The level of access to which that individual has usable access to those tools might turn out to be one of the largest determinants of success.
Again, what is lacking is a way of measuring an individual student’s pre-enrollment level of expertise of the role of college student.

**Background**

“Students today are different from their counterparts of three or four decades ago. Women have outnumbered men for more than 15 years, and the participation rates for members of historically underrepresented groups have made impressive gains. Many of these “new” students are the first in their families to attend college.” (Pike & Kuh, 2005) This changing face of higher education brings with it the added challenge of making sure that everyone who has the desire to succeed has access to the tools necessary for success.

National interventions, such as the TRIO family of programs, as well as school specific programs have begun to help these “new” students. Specific programs for students of color, transfer students, first-generation students, students with disabilities, and low income students, to name a few are beginning to understand that with a little additional guidance, success rates of at-risk students can be improved. While not always acknowledging the theoretical foundation of their programs, most put a primary focus on teaching the student how to best enact the role of “college student.”

A “role” is the collection of expected behaviors, attitudes and actions to which an individual is expected to adhere. But, as described in the “Differentiated Model of Identity” (Collier, 2000, 2001) there are multiple, alternative conceptions of the student role and each individual will differ in his/her ability to both recognize and act on these different versions of the student role. Students coming from rural or agricultural communities might see the role of college student differently than
those coming from urban settings, first-generation students will have a different idea of what it means to “do” student than those who grew up in an environment where multiple interactional strategies were passed on from parents with higher levels of education themselves. While this research will not specifically address all of the possible variations that exist in pre-entrance role perceptions the idea that understanding how to become an expert student is not equally distributed is the foundation of this work.

**Role Mastery/Expertise**

Mastery of the student role (i.e. “Shared Cultural Knowledge” about successfully enacting the college student role) increases the student’s ability to successfully navigate the educational system. There are many pre-college factors that can have an impact on this level of expertise at the onset of a college career. Many times, parents who are college educated will be able to share this cultural knowledge with their children. This transfer of role related knowledge is consistent with research showing that differences in the levels of parental education are a major indicator of first year college student academic success. Tinto (1998) also suggests that included in the “package” of pre-enrollment attributes that would indicate a higher chance of success are factors such as previous schooling and family support. This study explores the creation of a measurement tool which can be used to determine the level of access to “common” knowledge as a predictor of first year success.

One key to student success has to do with the degree to which individuals enact the role of college student “appropriately”, which requires students to understand their part in the academic world. Collier and Morgan (2002) have described one role that students are
required to navigate, as the “Fit Between Faculty and Student Expectations” (figure 1) for students' skills and behavior, in a conceptual model with three distinct elements:

**Figure One**

They show how students' skills and behaviors mediate the relationship between students' academic skills and their academic performances. In a pilot study (Collier and Morgan, 2002) demonstrated that, controlling for academic skill levels, students who have a better understanding of these faculty expectations for student roles (class-related skills and behaviors such as understanding the syllabus, identifying course-related secondary skills, and amount of time spent on coursework) get better grades. It was found that first-generation students' academic performances were most affected by these expectation variables.

The degree to which students understand and respond appropriately to professors’ expectations that fall outside the academic content of the course can be thought of as their respective levels of college student role mastery.

The measure that this study is looking to create will be used to assess students’ relative knowledge of specific versions of the student role.

**Role Mastery as Cultural Capital**

Pierre Bourdieu describes three types of capital with which we all purchase our place in our communities. Economic capital: the real access to economic resources. Social capital:
those things available to us as a result of belonging to specific groups which give individuals access to networks of support. And the less tangible, cultural capital: forms of knowledge, education, ability or any advantage a person has which would give them a higher status in society (Bourdieu, 1984). He further breaks down cultural capital into three forms.

Embodied: long-lasting dispositions of mind and body, character and way of thinking.
Objectified: cultural goods (pictures, books, dictionaries, instruments, machines, etc.)
Institutionalized: things such as college degree, whose trade value can be best measured by their relationship to the labor market

Parents provide children with cultural capital, the attitudes and knowledge that makes the educational system a comfortable place in which they can succeed easily, or one where they feel isolated and out of place. This in addition to the accumulation of their life experiences; family educational background, employment, primary and secondary education, and many other variables contribute to a wide array of pre-enrollment understandings (and misunderstandings) of the role of college student. Seen this way, mastery of the role of college student is one manifestation of embodied cultural capital.

Cultural Consensus

Up to this time there has been no valid way to show how much of a group’s shared cultural knowledge that any one individual student has usable access to, but the Cultural Consensus model may provide not only an understanding of the “common knowledge” of those in the role of “student”, but also a way of measuring each individual student’s level of participation within that cultural role.

In this study we have drawn upon a measure from Anthropology – Romney et al.’s (1986) “Cultural Consensus Model.” The approach measures sets of beliefs and practices to determine the extent to which a group shares a common understanding of those topics.
When the group does exhibit such consensus, the technique then examines the extent to which each group member shares this common understanding. In particular, it assigns each group member a score on “expertise,” which assesses the extent to which that person’s responses match the overall group consensus.

Methods

The basic research design uses measurements from 292 incoming Portland State University freshmen prior to the start of the 2004-2005 school year.

Setting

Data was collected from entering freshmen at the Portland State University (PSU) new student orientation in July of 2005. PSU is an urban college in Portland, Oregon with 24,222 enrolled during the 2004-2005 school year.

Questionnaire Development

Previous research collected information on the perceived differences between college and high school in the form of free-write lists. Each informant was asked what they felt were going to be the biggest differences between high school and college. The resulting statements were aggregated to get 16 common perceived differences. This study asked the students to rank order the 16 items during summer orientation, prior to starting their first year of college.

Informant Selection

In order to get a baseline understanding of the pre-enrollment levels of expertise, the survey was administered to students during the orientation session prior to their first year of college. Participation was voluntary and uncompensated. Of the students attending this orientation session for entering freshmen for the 2004-2005 school year 292 students chose to complete the survey.
**Data Analysis**

To see if there was any specific “shared knowledge” among these informants, these results were analyzed with consensus analysis. As Romney et al. (1986) point out, there are a number of things that this procedure accomplishes. First, it helps to determine the level of homogeneity within the group as a whole. This approach is similar to factor analysis, in which “items” in a questionnaire are grouped on the basis of some underlying structure. In consensus analysis, instead of grouping by items, the analysis transposes the data and creates groups based on individuals. The consensus model may only be useful when the initial factoring indicates that there is a high probability that there exists only one (or one primary) factor linking all of the respondents.

Second, the consensus model measures each individual’s level of cultural knowledge. For measuring students’ level of role mastery, this will produce a competency score that should indicate the degree to which one particular student is able to enact the role of student, as compared to the other students in the study. These competency scores will then be compared against the results of the first year of college of each individual to determine whether this measure can adequately predict success. First term GPA, first year GPA and cumulative credits taken are used for this analysis.

In addition to cultural consensus, our analysis will look for additional contributing demographic factors that may influence academic success. One of the areas of the analysis of student retention that has received much attention is that of first-generation students, students for whom neither parent had achieved a college degree by the time they were 18 years old. We also compare the groups of traditional and first generation students to examine whether role mastery, in the form
of shared cultural knowledge has more effect on the success of one group or the other.

**Results**

Because our primary concern was in the level of consensus between informants versus the questions themselves, a factor analysis was run using the informants as unique cases. In order to conduct later comparisons, only informants for whom we had GPA, and cumulative credits taken were used (n=151). Principal components analysis constructs a small set of variables (factors) from the additive combinations of existing similarities among variables. Each resulting factor identifies the existence of some unknown variable which lies at the intersection of the observed similarities among the variables measured. The size of that intersection tells us how important that factor is. Factor loadings measure the size of the intersection. The first factor identifies the largest shared intersection among the variables.

**Total Variance Explained**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Initial Eigenvalues</th>
<th>% of Variance</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>48.270</td>
<td>31.967</td>
<td>31.967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>14.723</td>
<td>9.750</td>
<td>41.718</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>11.717</td>
<td>7.759</td>
<td>49.477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>11.158</td>
<td>7.389</td>
<td>56.866</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Components 16-151 represented less that one percent of cumulative variance

Extraction Method: Principal Component Analysis.

**Table 1. Principal Component Analysis**

The second factor shows the largest intersection of the variables that remain after accounting for the first factor. Informants rank order of the 16 questions of differences between high school and college were coded 1-4 with “4” representing the quadrant perceived to have the greatest difference.

Figure 1 shows the scree plot from a principal components analysis of the resulting 151*151 informant matrix. The first factor’s eigenvalue (the sum of squared loadings) was 48.27, a little more than three times than that of the second factor.

The three times rule is the minimum difference if a single valid factor can be said to exist to explain a set of data. Table 1 shows the eigenvalues for the first 16 factors.
While the principal components analysis suggests that there is likely one factor that explains most of the differences between the answers of the respondents, it is not immediately clear what that difference is. Each informant is given a loading score of the first factor based on how strongly the individual's knowledge is, compared to the composite knowledge of the entire group. The average informant competence was \(0.527\) with a range of \(0.026\) to \(0.891\).

Having met the minimum requirements to suggest that there is some shared understanding of the role of student, we tested our prediction that first-generation students would have lower levels of consensus on the loadings on factor one.
Correlations, First-Generation and Factor 1 Loading

| loading | Pearson | Correlation | Sig. (2-tailed) | N |
|████████ | □□□□□ | □□□□□ | □□□□□ | □□□□□ |
| loading | FSTGEN1 | Pearson | .051 | 1 |
| □□□□□ | □□□□□ | □□□□□ | □□□□□ | □□□□□ |

The other variable we would have expected to reflect in the consensus scores was level of success during this first year. However, grades were not found to be strongly impacted by the consensus value. Correlations of FallGPA and factor loading showed a weak negative (r= -0.022) relationship.

Correlations, Fall GPA/Factor 1 Loading

| loading | Pearson | Fall04GP |
|████████ | □□□□□ | □□□□□ |
| loading | □□□□□ | □□□□□ |
| □□□□□ | 1 | □□□□□ | □□□□□ | □□□□□ |

-0.022
### Correlation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlation</th>
<th>Sig. (2-tailed)</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fall04GPA Pearson</td>
<td>-0.022</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>0.785</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>0.785</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Correlations of Cumulative GPA for the year and factor loading again showed a weak relationship ($r = 0.009$).

### Correlations, Cumulative GPA/Factor 1 Loading

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>loading</th>
<th>Pearson Correlation</th>
<th>Cum GPA loading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CumGPA</td>
<td>0.091</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>loading</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>Cum GPA loading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CumGPA</td>
<td>0.909</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>loading</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.091</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>Cum GPA loading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CumGPA</td>
<td>0.909</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>loading</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.091</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Additional correlations showed no significant relationship between the factor loading and any of the other variables that were gathered in this survey.

**Discussion**

While it would have been nice to have found the “holy grail”, which would have evened out the playing field for all at-risk students on the first attempt, this research does bring us closer to developing a reasonable tool for use in predicting future success.

In assessing this project in terms of its future applicability and usefulness in leveling the playing field for students potentially at risk of falling through the cracks, careful reevaluation of all aspects of the research is important.

The research question itself is still one that deserves the close attention of empirical research. Data, both governmental and research driven, show clearly that there are students for whom the assumptions about how to “do” student are not clear. By creating a measurement tool that can predict the incoming level of role mastery, interventions can be put in place at both the high school level and the college level to create equal opportunities for success.

The theoretical foundations of the project appear to be sound as well. Combining the ideas of cultural capital as resource, with role mastery/expertise draws the focus away from individual deficits and concentrates, instead, on the commonalities that exist for this group of students.

The methodology is the most problematic aspect of this research. The Cultural Consensus model has been used with much success in the field of anthropology for almost two decades. It’s ability to draw out answers from a
population when the answers are not known ahead of time has provided rich results in many applications and it has been adapted for use in other fields such as political science, and psychology. However, some of its basic assumptions make it a challenge to apply to this research. Namely, that the group that is being studied are all members of a cohesive culture. It will be important in future iterations of this study that the surveys are broad enough to find one distinguishing groups of students who lack usable access to some set of cultural tools. Once a general survey has been validated other sub-studies will be able to use this as a starting point to explore additional needs of specific groups (i.e. Immigrant, first-generation, community college transfer, adult returning).

When the research question, theoretical foundations and methodological framework all appear to be sound, all that remains to question is the data itself. There are two primary concerns with this data set. First, does it measure what we intended it to? The fact that there was one primary factor found that explained the majority of the variance among the respondents suggests that while this study did find something, the demographic data gathered missed some crucial variable.

Secondly, does the population adequately represent the pool of students? It needs to be acknowledged that the students that participated in this study may well have not been a good cross-section of the entering student body. Not all students choose to go through the orientation; those that do might be exhibiting a stronger understanding of the role of student. Of those students that did attend the orientation, not all chose to participate in the study. Again, it is possible that recognizing the value of participation and taking the initiative to actually complete
the survey would show a higher level of expertise than those who passed up the
opportunity to participate.

Efforts are already under way for both fine-tuning the survey tool and
broadening the sample to be more representative of the entering student body.
Future measures will include additional demographic variables that I feel might make
the study more robust might include; rigor of high school, work history, ethnic and
immigrant status, age

In all, this preliminary exploration into the possibility of finding a way of
assessing the level of which an individual has access to the shared cultural knowledge
regarding how to enact the role of student has shown that such a tool can be created.
Once found, this measure will have practical use in informing educational
administrators in their attempts to create environments where every student has a
chance at completing their education. Interventions could then be created along

Once an acceptable measure is created that accurately describes the incoming
level of an individuals level of expertise, longitudinal application of this measure will
help us understand better the process of how some students are able to assimilate
into the college culture and show us what areas are the most difficult to understand.
Specific interventions can then be put in place to address those areas in order to
improve retention rates among at-risk populations.

Current programs have already identified, communicating with professors,
understanding the syllabus, classroom behavior, and time management and areas
where first-generation students will benefit from early intervention. Tailor fitting a
program to the unique needs specific groups of learners can be greatly enhanced
with the use of a measure such as explored in this study.
References Cited


Collier & Morgan, 2004 instrument developed for Collier, Morgan & Cress, 2004 research in progress; initially approved HSR April 2004; extended October 2004


development," Research in Higher Education 37(1) 1996
York-Anderson & Bowman, 1991


Appendix 1 – Instrument

Questions to be rank-ordered 1-4 with four in each category as related to;

“Most important differences between high school and college in regards to earning good grades.” (Collier, Morgan & Cress 2004)

1. College requires students to take more responsibility for getting their work done
2. In college, students get less individual attention from teachers
3. College requires more writing and papers
4. In college, there is more emphasis on group work
5. In college, it is up to students to get help if they are having problems
6. College requires taking good notes
7. In college, courses move at a faster pace
8. College requires more work outside class
9. In college, grades depend more on tests
10. In college, teachers take class time more seriously
11. In college, there is less opportunity for extra credit
12. College requires more reading
13. College requires students to organize their time more effectively
14. In college, you choose whether to attend class
15. In college, there is more emphasis on critical thinking
16. College requires students to do more work independently
The Invisible Victims: Children of Incarcerated Mothers

HOLLY HERNANDEZ
PATTI DUNCAN, FACULTY MENTOR
CAROL MORGAIN, FACULTY MENTOR

Abstract

During the last several years the number of incarcerated mothers has steadily increased. Subsequently the number of children involved is also increasing. While substantial research has been done on the topic of children with incarcerated mothers, the voices of the children on the matter are often invisible from research. When a child's mother is incarcerated they are often placed into a relatives home, or into foster care. Children become vulnerable and many times do not know how to deal with these issues, and do not know how to express how they feel. Many times children are left to make sense of the situation on their own. The negative influences on children in regards to maternal incarceration are endless. The stories of how children of incarcerated mothers are affected by the matter need to be heard. Doing so may provide insight into how children deal with the issue of maternal incarceration, and what helps them, if anything, to overcome their struggles and address their feelings towards their incarcerated mother. Familiarizing ourselves of the struggles of children with incarcerated mothers may help in the development of more support programs that will ultimately make life for these children a bit easier to deal with.

Introduction

Currently, there are approximately 105,000 women in state and federal prisons (The sentencing project, 2004). Approximately 75-80 percent of these women are mothers (Beatty, 1997; Kirk & Okazawa-Rey 2001) to about 200,000 children under the age of 18 (Ascione & Dixson, 2002). This population is steadily increasing. Sadly, children who have an incarcerated parent are four to five times more likely to be incarcerated themselves (The Circle is round). The negative effects on children can be very detrimental. It is important that the influences on children be noted, and that support to these children continues to improve. Children are victims to their parents’ incarceration, yet too often their voices are left out of the data. To date, very little has been done from the specific perspective of the children. Because it is imperative to listen to the point of views of children of incarcerated
mothers themselves, the purpose of this study is to get the perspectives of children on the matter of their mothers’ incarceration. In doing this, my hope is to contribute to the existing research to better serve the needs of the children affected by maternal incarceration.

**Literature review**

This literature review will focus on three main areas:

1. Prison demographics.
2. Issues concerning children and their incarcerated mothers.
3. Effects of maternal incarceration on children.

Before looking at the ways children are affected by maternal incarceration, attention must first be focused on the demographics of prison systems within the U.S. It has long been known that our prison system has certain biases. It is important for this study to acknowledge those biases, as they are related to the incarceration of women. We can do this by looking at who is in prison, the duration of the sentence, and the crimes involved. Knowing who the mothers are will help us to see which children are being affected by this era of mass incarceration.

*Prison Demographics*

Many researchers, including Davis, 2003; Herivel & Wright, 2003; Reiman, 1990; and Bhattacharjee, 2002, have conducted research on the inequalities within the U.S. criminal justice and prison systems. They argue that there are great flaws in the way people are arrested, sentenced, and incarcerated. Also, studies indicate that our prison system works to further marginalize women, people of color, and people of low socio-economic backgrounds. (Davis, 2003; Herivel & Wright, 2003; Reiman, 1990; Bhattacharjee, 2002).
Although many people attempt to deny these biases, such biases cannot be denied when looking at data collected by the Sentencing Project in 2004, which documents that people of color are highly over-represented within our prison system. Nationally, the rate of incarceration by race is 6.04; meaning one white person is incarcerated to approximately six African-American people (The Sentencing Project, 2004). Such disparity is extremely alarming since African Americans make up only 12.3 percent of the U.S. population (Census Data, 2000). The U.S. has the highest incarceration rate in the world (Kirk & Okazawa-Rey, 2001). It holds five percent of the world’s population but 25 percent of all the prisoners in the world (Bhattacharjee, 2002).

As Reiman (1990) discusses, there are numerous explanations for why people of color and people of a lower socio-economic background are over-represented within the prison system. His argument lies within the idea that the majority of people of color are disproportionately poor, and therefore put in positions that differ highly from their middle-upper class counterparts. For example, a teenager may be more prone to getting into trouble based on their geographical location, as officers tend to patrol low income neighborhoods much more often than suburban neighborhoods. It can also be noted that the majority of incarcerated men and women live below the poverty level before incarceration. (Beatty, 1997; Kirk & Okazawa-Rey, 2001; Bhattacharjee, 2002; Schlosser, 1998). Thus, with officers placed more often in lower income neighborhoods, people from lower socio-economic backgrounds are over-represented within the prison system.

Although the percentage of women incarcerated is relatively low, this population is growing at a faster rate than the entire prison population (Bhattacharjee, 2002). The number of women incarcerated increased threefold between 1985 and 1996 (Bhattacharjee, 2002). Women of color are also incarcerated at a much higher rate than white women. African
American women make up 48 percent in state prisons and 35 percent in federal prisons; Latinas make up 15 percent in state prisons and 35 percent in federal prisons; White women make up 33 percent in state prisons and 29 percent in federal prisons (Kirk & Okazawa-Rey, 2001). In the general population, African Americans (men and women) make up 12.3 percent of the U.S. population, people who are either Hispanic or Latino make up 12.5 percent of the U.S. population, and White people make up 75.1 percent of the population (Census data, 2000). Bhattacharjee (2002) writes: “The two fastest growing incarcerated populations are women of color and immigrants of color.” (6). While women of color are highly over represented within the prison system, their children--children of color--are suffering. Also important to note is that mothers and fathers are incarcerated for different crimes; fathers are more likely serving time for violent crimes while mothers are more likely to be serving time for a drug-related crimes (Parke & Clarke-Stewart, 2003). The majority of women are serving a prison sentence because of a drug conviction or another nonviolent crime (Beatty, 1997; Bhattacharjee, 2002; Davis, 2003; Kirk & Okazawa-Rey, 2001). Drug convictions top the list of crimes women are imprisoned for, but strikingly, treatment program availability for incarcerated male and females has dropped by more than 50% since 1993 (Schlosser, 1998). With less treatment programs available, women, as well as men, are more likely to end up back in prison because of addiction, and away from their children (Schlosser, 1998).

The percentage of people incarcerated who are parents is an overwhelmingly high number. An exact number of how many people incarcerated are parents cannot be noted because there is no formal way to record this, instead estimates are available. Estimates say that about 75-80 percent of incarcerated women are mothers, and about 55 percent of incarcerated men are fathers (Beatty, 1997; Kirk & Okazawa-Rey, 2001). The extreme
difference that should be noted is that about 84.7 percent of mothers who are incarcerated had custody of their children prior to incarceration compared to about 46.6 percent of fathers (Kirk & Okazawa-Rey, 2001). The majority of people incarcerated are men, and therefore incarcerated parents are mainly fathers, but the number of mothers in prison has increased by 87 percent from 1991 to 2000, compared with a 60 percent increase for fathers (Parke & Clarke-Stewart, 2003).

Issues concerning children and their incarcerated mother

An overwhelming number of children are being affected by parental incarceration. From the above statistics we know children of color are more likely to have an incarcerated parent; it is said children of incarcerated parents are more likely to be African-American (43%) than any other race (Wright & Seymour, 2000). Children of incarcerated parents were more likely to live with their mothers before incarceration than fathers, and most of their mothers (70%) were single mothers living in poverty (Kirk & Okazawa-Rey, 2001). As mentioned earlier, exact numbers of how many children are affected by parental incarceration cannot be known because there is no formal recording system, but the U.S does rely on estimates. Estimates of how many children are affected by maternal incarceration are soaring at about 200,000 (Ascione & Dixson, 2002). The number of children with an incarcerated mother or father reached two million in 1997 (Census Data, 2000). Cunningham & Baker (2003) tell us that: “In the United States, 2 of every 100 American children has one or both parents in prison in any given year, a number which has tripled in a decade.” (2). It is estimated that 42-46 percent of children who have a parent incarcerated are between 7-12 (Wright & Seymour, 2000). As the population of women in prison increases the number of children influenced will also increase.
When a parent is arrested the law does not require police officers to allow parents to make arrangements for a child. They may allow it, but it is not required (Resource Guide for Parents Incarcerated in Oregon, 2003). There are no social welfare policies for how to deal with children of incarcerated mothers when they are arrested (Johnson & Waldfogel, 2002). Most often children of incarcerated mothers are placed with grandparents (Porterfield & Dressel & Barnhill, 2000; Parke & Clarke-Stewart, 2003). Children in these situations, who live with grandparents or another relative during their parents’ incarceration, face additional financial hardships, especially when prior to incarceration, the parent had a steady income (Travis & Waul, 2003). Being placed with relatives as a permanent placement is desirable for many, but it does sometimes come with conflict. As Parke & Clarke-Stewart (2003) mention, additional financial difficulties occur when relatives make the effort to keep the incarcerated parent involved with the family. Costs such as legal fees, transportation for prison visits, personal items for incarcerated parent, and costs for the basic care of the children all have the potential to cause financial problems for the relatives caring for the children of the incarcerated parent. When children are not placed with a grandparent or other relative they become part of the foster care system. In Oregon, incarceration or passage of time are not reasons enough to terminate parental rights, even if the child is in foster care. If the parent does not make an effort to find a permanent placement, or does not remain in contact with the child, rights then can be terminated (Resource Guide for Parents Incarcerated in Oregon, 2003). In the U.S. the Adoption and Safe Families Act of 1997 pushes states to file a petition to terminate parental rights if a child has been in state care for 15 of the last 22 months (Johnson & Waldfogel, 2002). This would be a traumatic experience for children of all ages. Children are often blind to the wrongdoings of their
parents. It is difficult for children to understand why they will not be allowed to live with their parents even after their parents are released.

Although there is much research on children of incarcerated parents, little has been done specifically from a child’s point of view (Johnson & Waldfogel, 2002). Typically, studies that have been conducted are done in an attempt to find the impact of paternal incarceration on children. Interviewing the incarcerated parent on how they feel their incarceration has influenced their child is what the studies have typically focused on. Few studies focus on the perceptions of children. It is important to focus on children because often they have very different perspectives on how their parent’s incarceration has affected them. With so many children influenced, their voices should be central to the discussion.

**Effects of Maternal Incarceration on Children**

Many researchers have noted the long list of negative effects on children with incarcerated mothers, effects that can last a lifetime. Parental incarceration has been said to negatively affect emotional, social, physical, behavioral, psychological and cognitive development (Bloom, 1993; Johnson & Waldfogel, 2002; Parke & Clarke-Stewart, 2003; Porterfield et al, 2000). As Parke & Clarke-Stewart (2003) mention there are certain things that should be looked at when determining how parental incarceration will influence a child. First, it is important to recognize the different relationships the child has with other family members including extended family. The stronger the relationships, the better off the child will be. Second, the child’s developmental stage or age at the time of parental incarceration must be noted, as this plays a large role in how child will react. Third, it matters whether or not it is the mother or father being incarcerated, as it has been noted that separation from a mother has different effects on a child than separation from a father. Lastly, we must look at
the support networks available to the child, and to the family that is caring for the child while their parent is incarcerated. Every child will have a very different experience based on the things noted above with age, race, socio-economic status, and family support all being the determining factors to how a child copes with their mother’s incarceration.

As I mentioned above, Parke & Clarke-Stewart (2003) suggest that children with positive family and community support are much better off as far as coping with the negative effects of parental incarceration than those who do not have the support. Parke & Clarke-Stewart (2003) also note that developmental stage is crucial when predicting what outcome parental incarceration will have on the child. Porterfield et al. (2000) suggest children under two years often face problems with emotional and intellectual development especially if it affects their bonding and attachment to a parent; children aged two to six often become confused as they cannot fully process the situation, they may have feelings of abandonment. Children between seven to ten often have trouble articulating their feelings and have trouble getting along with peers in the face of their parents’ incarceration; early adolescents age 11-14 usually begin to internalize the issue, and may reject rules and authority. Finally, children in their late youth into early adulthood may have negative attitudes towards law enforcement, and may even begin to get involved with criminal activities themselves (Porterfield et al. 2000).

As mentioned before, the majority of children live with grandparents or other relatives during their parent’s incarceration. While this may be desirable, many children still face negative consequences due to their parents’ incarceration. Starting with the arrest, approximately one in five children witness their mothers’ arrest. Of these children half are under age 7 (Parke & Clarke-Stewart, 2003). When children were interviewed after witnessing this traumatic event they reported having nightmares and flashbacks of the arrest
of their mother. Children are often left with little or no idea of what will happen to them or their parents (Parke & Clarke-Stewart, 2003; Porterfield et al, 2000). Some long-term effects on children due to parental incarceration are: familial instability, poverty, child abuse/neglect, poor parenting, marital conflict, and parental absence (Parke & Clarke-Stewart, 2003).

Children are often left out of the discussion of why their mother is in prison and how long she will be there. Many children never visit their mothers, usually because of the location of the prison (Bloom, 1993). This can create even more resentment towards their mothers. Bloom (1993) also mentions that many children face a feeling of abandonment, especially when they are unable to visit. It is estimated about 23 percent of women have no contact with their children for the entirety of their incarceration (Johnston & Carlin, 2001).

**Methodology**

This section will discuss the methods used to collect data. It will also discuss the obstacles faced while conducting research.

This study uses a qualitative approach to gather children’s perspectives of how their mothers’ incarceration has influenced their lives. I will use the children’s stories of lived experience for the basis of my research. Initially I planned on interviewing both mothers and children in hopes of finding out exactly how children of incarcerated mothers are influenced. However, I realized the perspective of incarcerated mothers on how their children are impacted by their incarceration may be somewhat distorted because they are not getting the entire picture of how their children are being impacted. For this reason, and because of time constraints I chose not to interview incarcerated mothers, instead I interviewed 5 children who have incarcerated mothers. I assume these interviews, and the
writing of this paper will help give a voice to a population that has had only minimal exposure.

Participants

A local program I volunteer with, Girl Scouts Beyond Bars, that takes girls 5-17 into correctional facilities to spend a couple hours every other Saturday of activity time with their mothers provided me with an entry into the lives of many children who have mothers in prison. The director of this program assisted me with choosing the girls I would ask to interview, the boy I asked was a sibling to one of the girls in the program. I feel the perspectives of these children are important because they need a voice in all of this, and two, because perceptions are beneficial in finding any underlying problems. I interviewed four girls, one boy, and a staff member who has worked with children of incarcerated parents for years. The children all have had very different experiences; age, race, socio-economic background, and living arrangements of the children all vary.

Setting

With the exception of the staff member, my interviews took place at the homes of the children. I found that to be easiest both for the children and myself. I was required to get consent from parents/guardians, so visiting them at their homes permitted me to get consent from their guardians in a much more convenient setting.

Difficulties faced throughout study

One thing that caused a bit of a problem from the beginning was getting the consent forms filled out by the incarcerated moms who still had legal custody over their children. To
satisfy the human subject requirements, I needed consent from them (the incarcerated mothers holding legal custody), as well as their temporary guardians. This meant I needed to get the forms into the correctional facility, a task that took some time to gain approval from the correctional facility.

Initially when I brought it up to the girls, and the moms, some of the incarcerated mothers were concerned that I was trying to pin point the flaws of their decisions that landed them in prison. I assured them that my intentions were only to get the voices of their children out so that the affects of maternal incarceration could be better known, and so that better support could be targeted toward their child’s needs. Most of the mothers understood and thanked me for my efforts.

Getting a hold of the girls is a typical problem we have with the program I volunteer with, so I was expecting it would not be the easiest thing to get in touch with these children. As the children move around, it does get pretty difficult to stay connected from week to week. I had some difficulty, but was able to get current numbers for all of the children.

Throughout my research I have had conflicting thoughts and emotions. As a volunteer for this program, working with these girls, they want us to be there for the girls, for the moms, but then when the day is over we are to leave it at that. For me, it wasn't that easy. Especially after really getting to know these children. I found it extremely difficult to just leave my feelings at the volunteer site, or at the place of my interview. While listening to these children, I wanted to cry and laugh at the same time. I went from excited for these children to outright irritated at what these children had been forced to go through. I was amazed at the resiliency of all of them. I have celebrated with these children, and have been sad with them. I can’t keep myself from thinking about these children once I go home; I guess that may be something that has come up as somewhat of a difficulty for me. It is hard
for me to limit my research to a page number, there is so much to be said, so much to learn.
This is a personal difficulty I will have to overcome.

**Tools for collecting data**

Interviews, and observations will all be used in collecting data.
Like mentioned earlier, interviews are mostly taking place at the participant’s home. The interview with the adult that directly works with children of incarcerated parents took place at Portland State University. The questions asked are listed below.

**The child interview questions:**

1. How has your life changed since your mother went to prison?
2. How do your friends react? Does that influence how you feel about the situation?
3. What have been your major challenges?
4. If you could do anything with your mother today, what would it be?
5. Do you have any suggestions that may help someone in a similar situation?

**The adult interview questions:**

1. In your experience, what are the different ways that the everyday lives of children 4-17 are being influenced by having an incarcerated mother?
2. What are some of the deepest concerns, from your perspective, of children with incarcerated mothers?
3. Assuming that having an incarcerated mother deeply influences the daily lives of children, what are some resiliency factors?
4. How often are children resentful towards their mothers? How does age play into this?
5. How are children treated by their peers when peers have knowledge of a child’s incarcerated mother?

6. What are some of the main problems children face socially? Emotionally? Physically? Academically?

7. How does living arrangement (foster care vs. relative) play into the child’s general attitude towards their incarcerated mother?

8. What programs are available to these children? Are they helping? In what way? Do you have any suggestions for the betterment of support programs?

**Observations**

In my situation I feel observations are extremely beneficial. While working with this group of girls in the program I volunteer with I have experienced numerous situations in which I was able to observe the relationships of the girls and their incarcerated mothers. Through the interviews with the boy and girls, and while working with the girls in the context of the program I volunteer with I feel I’ve been let into a population of children many know little about. Observing while I volunteer allows me the opportunity to watch these mother/daughter interactions as an insider. The mothers and daughters know me, so they are not nervous, nor do they look at me as an outsider. With this I have been able to see a truth in their lives, I can see the real interactions between these women and their daughters, because I am there as a mentor and as a friend, not just a researcher.

**Profiles of participants**

Due to the high degree of sensitivity of this population ages, names, specific situations/experiences, and specific living arrangement have all been slightly altered to
prevent identification of the families interviewed. Common problems and general issues faced by children with incarcerated mothers will be outlined in my results. Suggestions the children had/have will also be included.

I was able to interview four girls and one boy. The four girls, whom will remain nameless, range in age from 11-15, the boy is 10. Two of the girls are African American, one is bi-racial (African-American/White). The last girl is Mexican. The boy is also bi-racial. Two of the girls live with their fathers, and two live with relatives. The boy lives with relatives. All but one of the children lived with their mother prior to her incarceration.

I also interviewed a woman who is part of the staff with the local program I volunteer for, Girl Scouts Beyond Bars. Interviewing her gave me the perspective of an adult that these children know and trust.

Results

The staff member I interviewed has worked with children with incarcerated mothers for several years now, and has worked in the context of this program for two years. She feels that children in situations where their parents are incarcerated need support programs so that they can heal; also she feels it to be very beneficial when children are able to maintain the relationship with their incarcerated mother. The interview that I conducted with the staff member provided me with the basis for my interviews with the children. The issues she was able to outline assisted me with creating questions that would best reflect what I wanted to find out. Her input also helped me to come up with the major themes for this section.

As I conducted my interviews, there were many similarities with the answers the children gave. Many of the children I interviewed are facing similar issues so I will base my results on the following four themes:
1. Social Influences at School, and with Friends.

2. Living Situation.

3. Missing Mom

4. Nobody to Listen

Social Influences at School, and with Friends

Parke & Clarke-Stewart (2003) have said that children go through getting teased and ostracized by peers at school because of their parents’ incarceration. My findings were similar. All of the children had stories to tell about being teased, or losing friends. When asked how their friends reacted, one girl replied: “My friends were like: I saw your mom on the news, what did she do?” Another girl replied: “They were like oh! Some of them didn’t care, but some of them wouldn’t or couldn’t talk to me, because their parents wouldn’t let them.” Like this girl, other children also said that there were times when their friend’s parents restricted their friends from hanging out with them. The boy I interviewed told me that he went from being liked by everyone to having only one friend. He stated: “I went to school after my mom went to jail and everyone knew about it, they didn’t want to talk to me anymore, they thought because she messed up that I was bad too.” Most shocking to me was that many teachers did nothing to conceal the fact that a student had an incarcerated mother, and would in some instances speak openly about it with the student inside the occupied classroom. One girl told me that her teacher repeatedly would tell her to do her homework and mind so that she did not end up like her mother. One girl stated when referring to her teachers: “They think I’m a bad kid because of what my mom did”.

Many would agree that a huge part of growing up is social interactions, peer-to-peer relationships. These children are often judged for their mothers’ mistake. For these
children social life became very negative with their mothers’ incarceration. As one girl put it: “My best friend since elementary started telling everyone, my best friend let me down, she was the only one I could count on, now I don’t really have anyone, besides my family.”

Living Situation

Children with incarcerated mothers tend to face a larger disruption in living situation than do children with an incarcerated father because children are more likely to live with their mothers (80-85%) prior to incarceration, than their fathers (5 in 10 children live with fathers prior to incarceration) (Wright & Seymour, 2000). Not to say that children with incarcerated fathers suffer less, just that when it comes to living arrangements, the disruption is greater when it comes to incarcerated mothers.

Luckily for the children I interviewed all of them were able to live with a relatives rather than go into foster care. The girls residing with their fathers expressed a couple main challenges with their situations. Both girls did not live with their fathers prior to their mothers’ incarceration, but were put into their fathers care when their mothers were arrested. Both girls expressed to me that the biggest difficulty for them is that there is no women around to talk to about girl issues. One girl said: “She’s not around to teach girlie things, she can’t help with homework, my dad doesn’t know that kinda thing, and I can’t just call her whenever either. Also my dad doesn’t cook, so we eat out too much.” Both girls are not very comfortable discussing issues such as menstruation, and boys with their dads. Another girl said: “I barely know my dad, I’m just getting to know him, but talking to him about girl things would be like talking about it with a stranger, I don’t want to do that, my mom should be here for these kinda things.” Overall both girls did say that it was better living with their dads than having to go to a complete stranger.
The other three children I interviewed all lived with relatives. One of the girls expressed how hard it was living with so many other people. She stated: “One of the biggest challenges for me has been moving into my auntie’s house. All my little cousins are always around, I feel like I don’t even have the space to think, it’s a lot different from living with just my mom and my brothers”. The boy also was concerned with no longer having his own space: “It’s hard now because I don’t even have my own room, when I get angry I have no where to go let it out.” One girl I interviewed has lived with her grandparents since birth, she feels comfortable in her home, and with her relationship with her grandparents. She stated: “I’ve lived with them (her grandparents) for as long as I can remember, they’re my parents, my real mom is my parent too, but in a different way, I’m glad I could live with my grandparents, some kids aren’t so lucky.” These children have had disruptions with their living arrangements but they mostly consider themselves lucky, as many of them know someone in a harsh foster care environment. They are all glad that they are with family, that they are loved, and that their caretakers let them visit with their mothers.

Missing Mom

Like mentioned previously, it is a challenge for the girls to not have their mothers around to discuss girl issues, One girl stated: “ I know she’ll be out when I get married, so that makes it not so challenging, but not having her around when I need her now is really hard.” The boy I interviewed expressed a deep sense of loss when talking about his mother’s absence. He stated: “Everyone thinks boys are tough, my sister gets to go see my mom all the time with Girl Scouts, I never get to do that, I’d really like to do those activities with my mom too, just to see her you know.” Parke & Clarke-Stewart (2003) have said that the effects of incarceration are dependent on gender, in a way that boys tend to externalize
their feelings, while girls tend to internalize them. I did see a bit of this, as the boy I interviewed did tell me that he often got so mad that he wanted to hit things, and the girls I interviewed seemed to be depressed or anxious more than anything. Although true in some instances, one of the girls did tell me that she often gets in physical fights at school, and the boy I interviewed voiced his feeling of depression at times, so the generalization is not true in all instances. In whichever way the children chose to demonstrate the stress of the separation from their mothers they with no doubt missed their mothers, all for different reasons, and all demonstrated those feelings in different ways. One girl stated: “I miss my mom so much sometimes that I just want to go to sleep so that I might dream about her” another girl said: “I hate waiting, constantly for my mom to call, but I always wait because I miss her so much, and I only see her a couple times a month”.

All of the children, when asked what the biggest challenge was, expressed that not having their mom around was by far one of the biggest challenges. Many of the children expressed that they missed their moms so much and said that if they were given a day with her, they’d just want to talk to her, hug her, and love her. When asked what she would do with her mother one girl said: “Just hang out, I miss her so much that’s all I’d wanna do, maybe watch movies too, but most of all just talk about things I could never talk about over the phone because the calls are all recorded, and I don’t want to reveal my personal stuff to the world.” Another girl said: “I’d go to the beach with her, rent a sweet, ride horses and talk, talk all day, cuz there is so much to talk about..” The boy I interviewed stated: “I’d just want to go eat with her or something, so I could talk to her again by myself, and get to know her again.” It is apparent that these children miss their mothers very much. They may miss them in different ways, but it is clear that they feel the pain of separation from their mothers.
Nobody to Listen

My intentions for this study were to make sure that the voices of children were clearly heard. It is my understanding that although there may be a substantial amount of research on children with incarcerated parents, few have interviewed children on their perspectives of the matter. Some of the children I have interviewed told me that no one listens to them, that they were not asked if they wanted to attend support groups, or counseling, they were just put into those situations. I feel children are valuable people in our society, as they will be the adults of tomorrow. I feel it is never too early to let children speak for themselves, permitted they have positive guidance. I am dedicating this section to the children I interviewed, and to children who other people took the time to listen to.

One of the questions I asked the children was to provide some sort of advice to others in a similar situation to their own. They were all very excited about this question, as they are rarely asked to give advice, as the experts. This is what they said: “That it is hard people are going to make fun of you and wont be able to talk to you but you will get threw it.” another said “My advice is to go see her (your mother) every second you get, because time is precious. Love her; pray for her till she gets out. Stand by her, and be strong.” Some one else said: “I would say just to stay strong, and talk to somebody if you can, if you can’t writing really helps.” Another child said: “Just to realize it is not your fault, your mother does love you, and just to keep living your life, don’t put it on hold.” The last child stated: “Don’t forget her, she may have made a mistake, but she wouldn’t forget about you if you made a mistake, treat her the same because I know that moms really love their kids.”

When asked what the ideal support program would look like for children of incarcerated mothers, one child replied: “It would be a bunch of people in similar situations, who are able to talk openly about their problems. It would be a place where everyone can be
comfortable and not feel stupid or bad for what their moms did. It would be people that you get to know in a loving setting.” Another child replied: “Um...It would be a bonding time and you could do things together with your mom and just be able to spend time with other kids in the same situation and have time to talk with your mom and the other kids, and just to spend time with your mom.”

The following is a poem from the anthology I Touch Your Face In MY Dreams (2004) done by an eight-year-old girl:

“When I visit my mom I feel very happy. When I heard my mom was in prison I was crying. It took 1 year until I could see my mom because I can’t see her because she had drugs in her purse when we got in a bad car accident and me and my brother were hurt badly. I’m going to visit every two weeks. It’s been really hard for me. Sometime I get angry. When I started visiting my mom I meet other girls like me and it made it easier for me and it changed my life.”

**Future Research Ideas**

I feel like this study gave me the opportunity to get a taste of what it is like to do research. Through out this study many questions have come up that would be good for future research. For my study I wanted the voices of the children, this though, made it difficult to see how their behavior may have changed as a result of their mother's incarceration. For future research it would be beneficial to interview teachers, and guardians that knew the children prior to and after their mothers’ incarceration to see what changes took place behaviorally. I would also like to find out some evidence of why children are affected differently dependent on their gender. I read into this briefly but for the future it would be something worth looking at deeper. For future research I feel it would also be
extremely beneficial to conduct a study with a much larger pool or participants, including interviews with children, incarcerated mothers, and caretaker families.

Conclusion

When a child’s mother is incarcerated, the child is left as the invisible victim. The children have long been invisible to research. To make it so children are getting the support they need their voices need to be heard. I hope that this study provided a bit of insight into the perspectives of children influenced by maternal incarceration. In this era of mass incarceration, more and more children are going to continue to fall victim to this system. The more that is known makes for stronger support systems for these children, and therefore makes for stronger children. These children are tomorrow’s leaders. For them to succeed, someone must understand their situation, take their hands, and walk with them to success. Prevention is the key. More support to these children will make for a better society for all.
Sources


The Circle is Round. (2005).


Searching the Silence: Finding Black Women’s Resistance to Slavery in Antebellum U.S. History

LOUCYNGDA JENSEN
PATRICIA SCHECHTER, FACULTY MENTOR

Slave women were everywhere, yet nowhere.

Deborah Gray White (1985)¹

When Deborah Gray White wrote that “Slave women were everywhere, yet nowhere,” she meant that they were ever present in the physical world of antebellum slavery, yet their lives are nearly impossible to find in writing from the time.² Written over twenty years ago, White’s concerns remain quite accurate, and our understanding of black female slaves’ history has suffered the consequences; remaining partial and incomplete. Adding to the problematic situation of sources, slave women’s particular experiences are easily overshadowed by the overwhelming amount of literature on male experience. Nowhere is this clearer than in the realm of resistance to slavery, when masculinist and political modes of rebellion, like flight, revolts, and physical confrontations with masters and overseers fill numerous volumes.³ My reading of these literatures suggests that my search for women’s resistance to slavery means grappling with silences and gaps, and with attention to gender in the shaping of slave resistance in the antebellum period. Reproductive choices must be analyzed as valid sources of slave rebellion.

---

² Ibid.
This paper will explore the topic of black female resistance to slavery in the antebellum United States with a focus on how female slaves’ reproductive decisions, namely abortion and infanticide, can be analyzed as resistance against slaveholders’ methods of slave breeding, and therefore against the system of slavery and oppression itself. Within my paper I will appraise how a nuanced definition of resistance can be applied to these gendered methods of opposition, and how other historians before me have chosen to use this term in these instances. I will also investigate how other historians and writers have decided what, or how much, of such information proves that these incidents occurred, and how generalizations about female slaves’ reproductive choices have been made. Finally, I will reflect on the varied and slippery nature of the primary evidence that I have found, which includes medical publications, abolitionist journals, WPA slave narratives, newspaper articles, and a plantation journal.

Research and publications searching for an in-depth understanding of the slave experience did not become popular until the 1970s, and even then women were largely absent from the discussion. Thanks to an upsurge in black feminist scholarship on slavery in roughly the past twenty years, research on slaves’ experiences began to look at women as an important group to study separately, and once this door was opened generalizations about women’s experiences in slavery followed. Before this time it would be safe to say that they were ignored as individuals with their own pasts. Although it would seem that historians of the past twenty years are primarily in agreement on the centrality of female slaves in the antebellum slave system, precise standpoints and methodologies varied among black feminist practitioners in the early years.

***

Deborah Gray White’s work represents an important turning point for the study of slavery, pushed forth by a myriad of black feminist scholars in the academy and outside. Like White, Angela
Davis published *Women, Race, and Class* in 1981 and became one of the first authors to focus specifically on the experiences of women. Catching the spirit of this moment in black feminist scholarship, she says that, while scholarly debate on slavery showed signs of “renewed vigor” from the 1970s on, what was “conspicuously absent” was a book dedicated specifically to truth in the lives of slave women.⁴

Davis focuses keenly on the gendered aspects of resistance, pointing out that “women resisted and advocated challenges to slavery at every turn,” and their resistance was “often more subtle than revolts, escapes, and sabotage.”⁵ On the subject of reproductive choices, Davis seems to tip a Marxist hand in the sense that she is inclined to value women’s agency as heroic, highly conscious, and directed at the mode of production. Davis stresses that the system of slavery relied upon “natural reproduction,” and she highlights how this practice undermined slaves’ roles as mothers, demeaning them to the label of breeders.⁶ This form of oppression, specific to slave women, would create the opportunity for their unique methods of resistance to this reproductive system.

Davis generalizes about female slaves’ use of abortion, for example, when she says that “black women have been aborting themselves since the beginning of slavery” due to their refusal “to bring children into a world of interminable forced labor, where chains and floggings and sexual abuse for women were the everyday conditions of life.”⁷ I was struck by the nature and amount of evidence on which Davis bases her conclusions; in fact she sites only one oft quoted piece of medical evidence when discussing abortion among slave women; a Doctor Pendleton who published

---

⁵ Ibid., 21-22.
⁶ Ibid., 6-7.
⁷ Ibid., 204.
his medical opinions on the matter in 1860. Similarly, when discussing infanticide she utilizes the story of Margaret Garner who was once a runaway slave, and a mother who was sent to trial for killing her young daughter instead of allowing her to be taken back to slavery. Due to the availability of sources on this particular case, it is the most oft quoted account from primary evidence. Davis leaves Margaret Garner to be her reader’s emblem and symbol of infanticide, concluding her discussion of infanticide declaring that some women, like Margaret Garner, “were driven to defend their children by their passionate abhorrence of slavery.” Davis’ purpose seems to be provocation; to shock her reader out of their assumptions about black women’s passivity and silent victimization as slaves. For this reason she uses some powerful rhetorical questions, like: “why were self-imposed abortions and reluctant acts of infanticide such common occurrences during slavery?” She answers by saying that they were “acts of desperation, motivated… by the oppressive conditions of slavery.”

Sharing in Davis’ revisionist goals, Deborah Gray White’s 1985 book titled Ar’n’t I a Woman is more thoroughly strengthened by its social history perspective and practical archival research methods. White is more cautious about generalizations than Davis, and she flags the dangers of relying on what little primary evidence can be found due to the inability for most black women from the antebellum time period to tell their own stories. White takes materialist concerns seriously, but she is also aware of the literary and psychological complexities of her evidence; for example, she is aware that, “in short, it is very difficult, if not impossible, to be precise about the effect of any single variable on female slaves,” including reproductive choices. White does seem to

---

8 Davis, Women, Race, and Class, 21; See also Steven Weisenburger, Modern Medea: a Family Story of Slavery and Child-Murder from the Old South (New York: Hill and Wang, 1998).
9 Davis, Women, Race, & Class, 21 &29.
10 Ibid., 205.
11 White, Ar’n’t I a Woman?, 23-24.
12 Ibid., 23.
provide a parallel argument about the ways that female slaves were used as breeders in a system of
domestic reproduction prevalent during the time period, and she links this to how slave men and
women did not experience slavery in the same way, and therefore sometimes resisted in distinctive
ways.\footnote{Ibid., 62.}

White’s methodological caution and lack of a rigid Marxist standpoint results in a divergent
conclusion from Davis about how common acts of infanticide and abortion really were. She notes
that observers at the time believed that slaves were using abortion to keep from producing viable
children for the system, and she provides reasons why slaves would wish to prevent bringing
children into such a cruel world; like the desire to deny their white masters “the satisfaction of
realizing a profit on the birth of their children”\footnote{Ibid., 84-86.} Yet, she further admits that “it is almost
impossible to determine whether slave women practiced birth control and abortion. These matters
were virtually exclusive to the female world of the quarters, and when they arose they were attended
to in secret and were intended to remain secret.”\footnote{Ibid., 84.}

Correspondingly, White suggests that infanticide was so uncommon of an act among
female slaves that she doubts it had any real impact on the rates of slaves’ reproductive capabilities
for the system of slavery. Acts of infanticide, according to White, represent “atypical behaviors on
the part of slave mothers” and she suggests that many accusations of infanticide were actually
“smothering” deaths that we might now recognize as Sudden Infant Death Syndrome (SIDS).\footnote{Ibid., 87-89; For more information on the theory that Sudden Infant Death Syndrome (SIDS) was responsible for a majority of “rolling over” or “smothering” deaths wrongfully accused on slave mothers during the history of slavery see Michael P. Johnson, “Smothered Slave Infants: Were Slave Mothers at Fault?,” The Journal of Southern History (1981), 493-520; see also Richard H. Steckel, “Women, Work, and Health under Plantation Slavery in the United States,” in More Than Chattel, ed. David Barry Gaspar and Darlene Clark Hine (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1996), 43-60; see also Wilma King, “Suffer with Them Till Death: Slave Women and Their Children in Nineteenth-Century America,” in More Than Chattel, 147-168.} Given White’s carefully construed conclusions about acts of infanticide and abortion as highly
utilized forms of resistance and slave women, I was struck by her extensive use of examples. She not only includes more accounts of either act than Davis, but is also more thorough than any of the other available authors on the topic. She lists 4 cases of infanticide committed by slave mothers where SIDS could not be the cause of death, and two of these cases reflect the fact that the mothers killed their children to save them from suffering the life of a slave.\footnote{Ibid., 88.}

In 1942, long before many historians were paying attention to slave women in their research, Alice and Raymond Bauer published the article “Day to Day Resistance to Slavery.” Although they have some masculinist ideas about what constitutes resistance and who a slave is (male), I am struck by their inclusion of infanticide in their discussion of everyday resistance. The Bauers are not quite certain what to make of infanticide as resistance and a debate on how to interpret these acts does not appear. However, the authors were keenly aware at this early year that this was a valid pattern of resistance that should be studied further, as they claim that “occasionally one runs across a reference to a slave mother killing her child, but statements are almost invariably incomplete” when researching these acts.\footnote{Raymond A. Bauer and Alice H. Bauer, “Day to Day Resistance to Slavery,” The Journal of Negro History (1942), 388-419.}

A comparison of these sources leads me to ask my own questions. As researchers, how are we to understand the motives and realities behind these kinds of acts? How much evidence is enough to assume high commonality of these acts? Either due to the unavailability of cases, or due to the difficulty in interpreting them, many scholars who have discussed resistance have left infanticide and abortion alone.

Stephanie Camp’s 2004 book *Closer to Freedom* is one example of a source that has contributed a great deal to my understanding of female slave resistance, especially through methods which utilize the physical body. For example, she says that “enslaved people’s everyday battles for
“regaining” a measure of “control” took place on very “personal” terrain; their bodies.”\footnote{Stephanie M. H. Camp, \textit{Closer to Freedom: Enslaved Women and Everyday Resistance in the Plantation South} (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2004), 62.} Though she is not concerned with reproductive matters, Camp offers some rich theories about the concept of “everyday resistance,” which I feel could help frame the methods of resistance that I am interested in (especially abortion). She shows us how theories of everyday resistance could provide us with a new way of understanding these acts. For example, by studying the “geography of containment” experienced by slaves, Camp illuminates women’s methods of resistance because “for bondswomen, even more than for enslaved men, intimate entities, such as the body and the home, were instruments of both domination and resistance.”\footnote{Ibid., 3 & 6.} Theories such as this point to methods of resistance that would seem to corroborate with my evolving sense of female slave resistance through abortion and infanticide.

In 1996 \textit{More Than Chattel: Black Women and Slavery in the Americas} was published.\footnote{David Barry Gaspar & Darlene Clark Hine, eds., \textit{More Than Chattel: Black Women and Slavery in the Americas} (Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 1996).} Editors David Barry Gaspar and Darlene Clark Hine constructed this compilation of scholarly articles in order to produce a book that would speak to the histories of many different continents of black women. Strikingly, articles on black women in the United States remain speculative about reproductive matters, while those on black women in the Caribbean and Latin America contained explicit information about infanticide and abortion as resistance. Articles including concepts associated with female slave abortion and infanticide cited evidence from doctors, planters, religious leaders, and slave midwives to support their claims. It seems that the amount and breadth of types of evidence for acts of reproductive resistance in these geographical locations is much greater than ours. Two articles in the book deal with black women in the context of childbearing and rearing in the United States. The first, “Women, Work, and Health Under Plantation Slavery in the United
States,” by Richard Steckel, approaches the topic of child-death, but his theme of health leads him only to discuss the “smothering” or “rolling over” deaths of infants that were often wrongfully blamed on carelessness of slave mothers by slaveowners and overseers. All pieces of evidence used to support this section of his article are secondary literature sources in agreement on the subject of infant death in the antebellum south. Steckel does not choose to talk about other kinds of infanticide, or abortion at all for that matter.22

Another article in the book, “Suffer With Them Till Death: Slave Women and Their Children in Nineteenth Century America,” by Wilma King, does devote some pages to the breeding of slaves and the possibility of infanticide and abortion among those populations, but she falls far short from taking a side on how important these acts could have been if considered as resistance to the system of slavery. Her arguments about breeding and acts of infanticide are understandably ambivalent. For example, in regards to breeding, she says that “American slaveholders viewed motherhood as an asset, and they encouraged reproduction for pecuniary reasons alone.”23 King insists that slave women and their children were considered chattel instead of persons, and that slave women were, therefore, “unable to control their fertility or to make necessary decisions about their own bodies.”24 Lest the reader think King overly stresses female victimization or lack of power, she also claims that “some women took more drastic steps to undermine reproduction by refusing to conceive children or by aborting them.”25 Her ambivalence points to an on-going dilemma and contradiction in scholarship on this subject: If slave women chose to undermine reproduction through abortion then how are they otherwise unable to control their fertility of make decisions

24 Ibid., 148.
25 Ibid., 159-160.
about their bodies? In other words, how do we perceive and evaluate choices in an environment of official non-choice, like slavery.

King only appears to flag smothering deaths and their probability to actually have been cases of SIDS, and she discusses these as instances when mothers were accused of infanticide. However, in the end she supposes that it was simply easier for whites to accuse slave women of infanticide than it would have been to understand why the infant mortality rates were so high, and she clarifies that she does not want to deny the documented reports of infanticide that do exist.26

In 1999 another important piece of slavery literature was published titled *Soul by Soul*. In this provocative historical discussion of the largest slave trade in antebellum America, the slave markets of New Orleans, Walter Johnson seems to be challenging his readers to understand the dualistic nature of slave trading. In essence we could say that some saw property for sale and others felt their humanity degraded and sold. While this is an invaluable piece of literature for the history of slavery, Johnson’s focus is not solely on reproductive choices. What he does offer to a discussion on reproduction are meticulously researched, countless instances when women’s reproductive abilities were on center stage in the markets and auction houses. Descriptions of how slaveholders sometimes made their choices of slave purchase based on the hope of returning a profit from a black slave woman’s childbearing abilities.27 As Johnson describes the market he says that buyers compared women physically; “they palpated breasts and abdomens, searching for hernias and prolapsed organs and trying to massage bodies into revealing their reproductive history.”28 Johnson argues that one could assume that “buyers were concerned that their female slaves be “breeders.”” 29

***

26 Ibid., 160.
28 Ibid., 143-4.
29 Ibid., 144.
In affirming that slave women’s reproductive choices should be defined as resistance an explanation of their place within the system of slavery is advantageous. Black slave women in the antebellum United States were very highly valued for their reproductive abilities. White purports that “once slaveholders realized that the reproductive function of the female slave could yield a profit, the manipulation of procreative sexual relations became an integral part of the sexual exploitation of female slaves.”\(^{30}\) In other words, their purpose was largely to accommodate masters by continuing to contribute to the very system that oppressed them.

In Charles Parsons’s journal published in 1855 as *Inside View of Slavery; or, A Tour Among the Planters*, Parsons frankly writes, “The term slave has a definite meaning. It signifies, not a person, but a thing, a chattel…”\(^{31}\) For everyone involved in the system of slavery this meant that “a slave child was property; its birth added to a slaveholder’s coffers regardless of the conditions under which it was conceived.”\(^{32}\) Due to the desire to continue reproduction of their chattel, masters often aimed to breed their slaves as often as possible, therefore, yielding the most profit (or capitol) as was possible over time.

It is well documented that slave women for sale often went listed with important information regarding their breeding or reproductive quality. Many times slaves were even explicitly listed as breeders if they were young and able to bear many children.\(^{33}\) Furthermore, much public attention was given to black slave women’s reproductive abilities. For example, White says that “major periodicals carried articles detailing optimal conditions under which bonded women were

\(^{30}\) White, *Ar’n’t I a Woman?*, 68.

\(^{31}\) Charles Parsons, *An Inside View of Slavery: or A Tour Among the Planters* (Boston: John P. Jewett and Co., 1855), 54.

\(^{32}\) King, “Suffer with Them Till Death,” 159.

\(^{33}\) Erlene Stetson, “Studying Slavery: Some Literary and Pedagogical Considerations on the Black Female Slave,” in *All the Women Are White, All the Blacks are Men, But Some of Us Are Brave*, eds. Gloria T. Hull, Patricia Bell Scott, and Barbara Smith (New York: The Feminist Press, 1982), 74.
known to reproduce, and the merits of a particular “breeder” were often the topic of parlor or dinner table conversations.”

One ex-slave named Hannah Jones who contributed to the WPA narratives specifically remembered how the system of breeding looked where she grew up a slave. She described how “the niggers had three or four wifes before de war, as many as dey could bear chillun by.” She continues this theme of reproduction as key when she says that the doctor told her grandmother’s master that “she’s stone blind, but she can have chillun right on,” and her master “kept her for dat and she bore twelve more head of chillun after dat.” Jones also states that “when dey want to raise certain kind a breed of chillun or certain color, dey just mixed us up to suit dat taste, and tell de nigger dis is your wide of dis is your husband and dey take each other… and raise big families to de white folks liking.” This situation would clearly suggest that a breeding system was in place on this plantation.

Another remembrance of breeding practices is illuminated in the 1969 compilation of pieces of WPA slave narratives titled *Lay My Burden Down*, and it has circulated through many literatures since then. Ex-slave Rose Williams explains how she was purchased under the description of a “portly, strong wench,” who would “make the good breeder.” On the new plantation she was sent at age sixteen to live with a slave man named Rufus who she did not like. When she asked her mistress why she was to live with him she was told, “you am the portly gal, and Rufus am the portly man. The massa wants you-uns for to bring forth portly children.” After continuing refusal of the situation, her master told Williams, “woman, I’s pay big money for you, and I’s done that for the cause I wants you to raise me childrens. I's put you with Rufus for that purpose. Now, if you doesn’t

---

34 White, *Ar’n’t I a Woman*, 31.
want whipping at the stake, you do what I wants.”39 In the end Williams did oblige her master and reproduce with Rufus because she understood it to be her job without choice.

It has been commonly agreed upon in slavery literature that slaves were indeed viewed as chattel, and that breeding was a fairly common method of increasing or maintaining a slaveholder’s capital. The fact that black slave women were labeled as breeders makes their reproductive choices highly political and important. As Davis argued; “Since slave women were classified as “breeders” as opposed to “mothers,” their infant children could be sold away from them like calves from cows.”40 The continuation of a degrading breeding system within the already cruel and oppressive system of slavery came with repercussions. As Camp has emphasized, “those who encounter oppression through the body, the body becomes an important site not only of suffering but also … resistance.”41 Black women living as southern slaves have encountered great oppression, exploitation, and violence on their bodies. Upon reviewing this material, it seems to me important to consider how these slave women sometimes chose abortion, which is an obvious act of resistance acted out in their physical bodies, to challenge the demands made on them by the patriarchal white society, and system of slavery, that they were forced to live in. Acts of infanticide involved the bodies of their children, who were in the same dangerous positions as they had often been, and in this way applies to the same theory. As Camp affirms: “For bondswomen, even more than for enslaves men, intimate entities, such as the body and the home [and the family], were instruments of both domination and resistance.”42

40 Davis, Women, Race, & Class, 7.
41 Camp, Enslaved Women and Everyday Resistance in the Plantation South, 62.
42 Camp, Enslaved Women and Everyday Resistance in the Plantation South, 4.
Due to slave women’s roles as reproducers of property and capital in the system of slavery, any successful efforts that they made to curb reproduction meant a loss of capital for their master, and a loss of population for the system itself. In this most basic sense, any reproductive choices that slave women made could affect their system of oppression and, therefore, should rightly be deemed as resistance to slavery. Both abortion and infanticide were defiant acts given what we know about the procreative expectations placed on slave women in the antebellum U.S. south. Whether or not this reproductive resistance to slavery affected the system on a massive scale is not relevant in the considerations of qualifying it as resistance. Defense of their children’s lives through claiming and then ending that life is a valid act of resistance.

Camp validates everyday resistance in her research and claims that these everyday acts of resistance should not be devalued or seen as trivial acts. She defines everyday forms of resistance as “hidden or indirect expressions of dissent, quiet ways of reclaiming a measure of control over goods, time, or parts of one’s life,” and asserts that they could indeed affect the system of slavery. If acts that could be seen as everyday can be qualified as resistance, who is qualified to deem insubordinate acts of reproductive choice unfitting for this designation?

***

Historian Herbert Aptheker seemed to take on this task when he published an article titled “American Negro Slave Revolts” in 1937. Aptheker argues that “the persistent and desperate struggles of the American Negro against slavery took eight forms, none of which have received anything like the treatment they deserve: (1) The purchase of freedom; (2) strikes; (3) sabotage; (4) suicide and self-mutilation; (5) flight…; (6) enlistment in federal forces…; (7) anti-slavery

---

agitation…; (8) revolts.” These acts are not only masculinist in nature, but the listing of them as the eight forms of resistance completely ignores methods of female resistance to slavery; namely resistance through reproductive choice. While I was not surprised that literature from 1937 would have ignored women’s struggles to resist, I found that this list could still be useful in my own creation of a definition of resistance. Aptheker has given us a model of what male centered resistance looks like, and we can utilize this in our understanding of what constitutes female centered resistance.

While some would argue that infanticide and abortion could be valued as expressions of oppression; in other words, that these acts were carried out only in response to the oppressive living conditions of the system of slavery itself; I disagree. If slave mothers made a reproductive choice based on their own motives and experiences, and unintentionally, negatively affected the reproductive system of breeding meant to continue the oppressive system, then I judge this still resistance. A comparison can easily be taken from one of Aptheker’s modes of resistance. The first method that is listed is purchase of freedom. Attempting to empathize with a slave’s position as a piece of property within the system of slavery, would obtaining their freedom through purchase be a goal set to intentionally destruct the system? Or is it much more likely that a slave would choose to purchase their freedom explicitly for the betterment of their own lives? I would argue that it would be the latter motivation. Further, if a slave is purchasing their freedom, as opposed to becoming a fugitive in the hopes of stealing it, is this not also in a sense complicit with the rules that the system has mandated? This same model can be used to argue that infanticide and abortion were indeed valid forms of resistance to the oppressive system of slavery under which black slave women survived. If we are to argue that slave women’s reproductive choices, here discussed through abortion and infanticide, were not resistance, than we would be forced to re-evaluate all accepted methods of resistance to slavery.
Assuming that infanticide or abortion must be placed in the sphere of resistance should not mean a dismissal of slave women’s great maternal love for their children. Acts of infanticide and abortion, or any other reproductive choices, do not necessitate a demeaning of slave women’s humanity in terms of their children and families. The truism that creates a space where slave women existed as breeders, mothers, and sometimes destroyers, is that we can not use either/or questions when defining slaves’ experiences. These women were not simply mothers or destroyers, just as they were not breeders or mothers. Camp persuasively argues that “enslaved people were many things at once,” so the attempted use of dichotomous choices when summing up their existence is irrelevant. “For instance,” Camp adds “the ways in which they were both agents and subjects, persons and property, and people who resisted and who accommodated- sometimes in one and the same act.”44 It is too large of a simplification then to say that slave women who committed acts of infanticide had no effect on the system just because “the cases represent atypical behavior on the part of slave mothers,” as White has said.45

While “American slaveholders viewed motherhood as an asset, and they encouraged reproduction for pecuniary reasons alone,” slave mothers were not unaffectionate with their offspring.46 They loved their children and attempted to shield them from the cruelty of the system of slavery however they thought possible. White’s description of slave mother’s acts of infanticide as atypical was related to the ingrained love that they actually had for their children.47 The removal of their child (or children) from the violent and oppressive life that they lived must sometimes have

45 White, *Ar’n’t I a Woman?*, 87-8.
47 White, *Ar’n’t I a Woman?*, 88.
seemed the only way to protect them. Also, Wilma King pointed out that “many slaves came to believe that their distress would end, if not in their present life, then certainly in the afterlife.”

Many slave mothers may have supposed that they were not only defending their children from the cruel world of slavery, but that they were in essence sending them to a harmonious afterlife.

***

The question of commonality of acts of infanticide and abortion is a slippery one. Reviewing the secondary source literature, I initially assumed that primary sources containing information on specific acts of this form of resistance would be very minimal. After all, White had provided the most samples in her study from 1985, and she listed only four non-smothering deaths in cases of infanticide. For the purpose of my study I immediately dismissed acts of infanticide that could be even remotely linked to the modern assumptions regarding Sudden Infant Death Syndrome (SIDS). Cases of abortion in White’s book were even fewer, with one actual account of abortion and two doctor’s reports stating that they believed it did occur among slave women. The other pieces of information that she provided were focused on the probability that some kind of contraceptive or abortive was utilized by slave women to keep them from reproducing when forcibly paired with partners who they did not like under the system of breeding that slaveholders used. Also, I was most interested in those pieces of evidence that I could locate and analyze myself, and some of the acts that she notes were out of my reach. Furthermore, many of the other secondary sources that provided information on these forms of black female slave resistance highlighted the same one account of infanticide repeatedly, making it seem the only piece of evidence for infanticide that I

---

49 White, Ar’n’t I a Woman?, 84-89.
would be able to track down; the case of Margaret Garner, previously mentioned. Cases of abortion were all but invisible.

However bleak this evidentiary situation may have initially looked, I soon realized that current historians are at a great advantage in their ability to locate primary sources in a new way; online. After following the faint trails that previous researchers had left for me, I was able to locate at least twelve separate acts of infanticide that have been noted, and six of those were acts that I could analyze myself in primary source materials. It is noteworthy that five of the six accounts that I was able to read in primary source material specifically say that the mother admitted to killing their children in order to save them from the brutality of slavery. In other words, they committed acts of infanticide, as I had believed, out of love and hope for defense of their children.

I was also able to locate seven pieces of evidence regarding the use of abortion among female slaves. Although these are more ambiguous in relation to cause, I would have expected this considering the complex realities that birthing in the nineteenth century encompassed. Therefore, I will not be attempting to claim that abortion was an act of defense for their unborn children, although I personally subscribe to this theory. I would speculate that more often than not these women too were interested in defending their offspring from a life that they found nearly unbearable. Of the seven cases that I located in regards to abortion, four of these are primary source materials, and three of those appear to be strong evidence for the existence of abortion among female slave populations (one of these three being a medical source record listing a plantation doctor’s opinion on the matter). It would seem that in order to draw conclusions from the evidence that I located a detailed account of each piece would be advantageous. I will begin with acts of infanticide that I was able to corroborate through primary sources.
By far the most utilized story of female slave infanticide is that of Margaret Garner.\textsuperscript{50} Although the high frequency of retelling of this story does result in some minor variations in the details, the account remains provable through myriad primary sources from the time. The story of this one slave mother and her rebellious act of infanticide seems to have become national news, as newspaper articles from New York, Kentucky, and Cincinnati (at least) can be located for reporting of it. In the book \textit{Reminiscences of Levi Coffin}, which was originally published in 1876, the author admits that he himself was to be involved in the safe conduction of Garner’s escape party to a connection in the Underground Railroad where they were to be led north to freedom.\textsuperscript{51} Coffin claims, “Perhaps no case that came under my notice, while engaged in aiding fugitive slaves, attracted more attention and aroused deeper interest and sympathy than the case of Margaret Garner, the slave mother, who killed her child rather than see it taken back to slavery.”\textsuperscript{52}

From the astounding amount of evidence available on the Margaret Garner case, her story can be accounted with some accuracy. She was a young plantation slave woman who, in January 1856, attempted escape. An atypically large group of runaway slaves were involved and banded together to leave their plantations in border counties of Kentucky in hopes of connecting with the Underground Railroad and finding freedom in the North. Among the group were Margaret Garner, her husband Simon, Jr., their four children (two boys and two small girls), Simon Jr.’s parents Simon and Mary Garner, and nine other slaves from neighboring plantations. Once the slaves had crossed the frozen Ohio River they made their way to Cincinnati. There the groups separated and the

\textsuperscript{50} For the Margaret Garner story many secondary, and some primary sources can be utilized. See Levi Coffin, \textit{Reminiscences of Levi Coffin} (Cincinnati: The Robert Clarke Co., 1898) [orig. published 1876], 557-567; see also Julius Yanuck, “The Garner Fugitive Slave Case,” \textit{The Mississippi Valley Historical Review} (June 1953), 47-66; see also Weisenburger, \textit{Modern Medea}; see also Davis, \textit{Women, Race, and Class}, 21-29; see also Bauer, “Day to Day Resistance to Slavery,” 416; see also J. Winston Coleman, Jr., \textit{Slavery Times in Kentucky} (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1940), 208-9.

\textsuperscript{51} Coffin, \textit{Reminiscences}, 559.

\textsuperscript{52} \textit{Ibid.}, 557.
Garners sought temporary refuge in the home of Elijah Kite, who was to aid them in their escape with direction from Levi Coffin. Unfortunately, the Garner family had been spotted and soon the slaveowners themselves arrived with marshals in tow, prepared to capture the fugitives. Sensing that hope of freedom was lost, Margaret Garner resolved not to allow her children to be captured alive. She found a large knife and cut the throat of her three-year-old daughter Mary. She also attempted to kill her other children, stabbing both of the boys, and once the knife was taken away, hitting her youngest baby, Priscilla, in the face with a shovel. Her attempts to kill all of her children were not successful, and all but Mary survived. The entire family was arrested and a court proceeding followed, in which she was accused of murder, but not tried before her return to her owner.53

Margaret Garner’s motivations for killing her children appeared obvious to news reporters who recaptured the dramatic events in detail for their readers in the days that followed. The first published news regarding the event ran on January 29, 1856 in the *Cincinnati Gazette*, and was subtitled “A Slave Mother Murders her Child rather than see it Returned to Slavery.”54 This same day a similar article would run in the *Cincinnati Enquirer* with many of the same details made available in the *Gazette*. Later, during the inquest that ensued, Margaret’s mother-in-law Mary Garner would testify that Margaret had told her, “Mother, I will kill my children before they shall be taken back, every one of them.”55 Mary Kite, resident of the house and witness to the act of infanticide,

53 This account of details regarding the Margaret Garner act is summarized from multiple secondary and primary sources. See Coffin, *Reminiscences*, 557-567; see also Yanuck, “The Garner Fugitive Slave Case,” 47-66; see also Weisenburger, *Modern Medea*; see also Davis, *Women, Race, and Class*, 21-29; see also Bauers, “Day to Day Resistance to Slavery,” 416; see also Coleman, Jr., *Slavery Times in Kentucky*, 208-9.
corroborates this motive by testifying that Margaret also told her that “she would rather kill them all than have them taken back over the river.”

Her sensationalist story has continued to emanate throughout the last century and a half as the example of female slave infanticide. She continues to play the role of emblem and symbol in this space in history. Due to the striking detail that has been accounted in news sources from the time this story has remained in the minds of historians and writers who seek a graphic story of infanticide for myriad purposes. Garner’s story has been memorialized in books like Toni Morrison’s *Beloved* published in 1987 (and later turned into a movie) and Steven Weisenburger’s 1998 publication titled *Modern Medea: a Family Story of Slavery and Child-Murder from the Old South*. It has also been reproduced in multiple plays and research papers. When writing his book *Modern Medea*, Weisenburger raises questions about how we should interpret Garner’s actions. He rhetorically asks if her actions were rebellious, and answers that they certainly were, and should be recognized as such because “as for infanticide, what had Margaret Garner done? Destroyed her mater’s property…” In 1867 Garner’s story also inspired a painting done by Thomas Satterwhite Noble called “Modern Medea.”

Although Margaret Garner’s story is the most sensationalized, her continued role as our modern symbol of female slave infanticide should not overshadow those stories of other women who used this same method of resistance. Records of their resistance are less extensive, and therefore, details surrounding their acts are less understood. After all, we can only recreate history from the evidence that we have.

---

59 McWhirter, Cameron, *Cincinnati Enquirer*, “A Remnant of Slavery’s Horror.”
The second piece of evidence of infanticide related to my study comes from a WPA narrative of ex-slave Lou Smith. In her narrative Smith tells us of a woman who was owned by a cruel neighboring plantation master, and who ultimately found that the only way that she could resist the impending placement of her baby in the slave market was to take its life. Smith says that this “woman was the mother of several chillun and when her babies would get about a year or two of age he’d [master] sell them and it would break her heart. She never got to keep them. When her fourth baby was born and was about two months old she just studied all the time about how she would have to give it up and one day she said, “I just decided I’m not going to let old Master sell this baby; he just ain’t going to do it.” She got up and give it something out of a bottle and purty soon it was dead. ‘Course didn’t nobody tell on her or he’d of beat her nearly to death.”60 The mother in this case seems to have known that she acted defiantly by making her own decision about the fate of her baby. Smith evidently knew it was rebellious and resistant since she adds that it was understood by the other slaves that telling on her would result in severe punishment for her act.

In 1846 ex-slave Lewis Garrard Clarke published his own narrative in the lengthy form of a book called Narratives of the Sufferings of Lewis and Milton Clarke. When relating his answer to the question, “Have you ever known a slave mother to kill her own children?” Clarke gives us two accounts of infanticide that he was aware of. The first is described as follows: “There was a slave mother near where I lived, who took her child into the cellar and killed it. She did it to prevent being separated from her child.” He follows this infanticide account with a second: “Another slave mother too her three children and threw them into a well, and then jumped in with them, and they were all

drowned.” Not only does Clarke provide us with two accounts of infanticide committed by slave mothers, but he points out that the first mother had done so to keep from being separated from her child. It is likely that, similar to the preceding story provided by Lou Smith, this mother was afraid of the separation of her child and the deliverance of it into the slave market, where any number of fates could befall it. Infanticide was her answer to the question of, how to choose her child’s fate herself, and how to defend her offspring. Clarke also comments on the acts of infanticide himself. He says, “Other instances I have frequently heard of,” and “At the death of many and many a slave child I have seen the two feelings struggling in the bosom of a mother--joy that it was beyond the reach of the slave monsters, and the natural grief of a mother over her child. In the presence of the master, grief seems to predominate; when away from them, they rejoice that there is one whom the slave-driver will never torment.” What Clarke is pointing to is key. As I have previously mentioned, these mothers did not kill their children due to lack of maternal love, but instead they did it so that their child could be “one whom the slave-drive will never torment.” They chose to live with grief rather than allow their children to live with misery.

The next piece of evidence comes from Frederick Law Olmsted’s published journal *A Journey in the Seaboard Slave States*, from 1856. As Olmsted traveled through Alabama he stated that, “A negress was hung this year in Alabama, for the murder of her child. At her trial, she confessed her guilt. She said her owner was the father of the child, and that her mistress knew it, and treated it

---

61 Lewis Garrard Clarke, *Narratives of the Sufferings of Lewis and Milton Clarke, Sons of a Soldier of the Revolution, During a Captivity of More Than Twenty Years Among the Slaveholders of Kentucky, One of the So Called Christian States of North America*, Documenting the American South (University Library: The University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, 1999 [Originally published in 1846], http://docsouth.unc.edu/clarke/clarke.html, 76; For the first account See also Johnson, *Soul By Soul*, 34.

62 Clarke, *Narratives of the Sufferings of Lewis and Milton Clarke*, 76; for the first account See also Johnson, *Soul By Soul*, 34.
so cruelly in consequence, that she had killed it to save it from further suffering.”\textsuperscript{63} Like the mother discussed by Clarke, this mother chose her own grief over her child’s, as slave women were often choosing from among a range of sufferings; a spectrum of griefs.

The sixth, and final, piece of evidence that I was able to corroborate through location of primary source materials is the story of a slave named Sylva, who is said to have taken the lives of, not one, but all thirteen of her children. I was struck by the substantial number of children listed, but this was a normal number of pregnancies for a healthy rural woman in antebellum America, and many female slaves were expected to reproduce many children (as previously noted), so she could have just been resolute to terminate each of her children’s lives as she claimed. In Parsons’s 1855 publication of \textit{An Inside View of Slavery}, he relates a story told to him by the mistress of the plantation on which Sylva lives. He was told that “Sylva says… that she has been the mother of thirteen children, every one of whom she destroyed with her own hands, in their infancy, rather than have them suffer in slavery!”\textsuperscript{64} While Parsons does not elaborate on this story, or his own thoughts of it, we do learn of the acts of infanticide while hearing about the abuses that Sylva has suffered at the hands of her master. This left me to ponder whether Parsons does not discuss the infanticide because he understands the mother’s motivation, to save her children from such cruel treatment, or if the author leaves this story with an exclamation point due to the anti-slavery context/audience of his time, letting the episode speak for itself.\textsuperscript{65}

Though I have six other cited acts of infanticide, they are completely based on secondary source evidence, and therefore the causes of the acts are widely unknown. For this reason I will conclude sorting of evidence regarding acts of infanticide here and move on to those 2 acts of

\textsuperscript{63} Olmsted, Frederick Law, a \textit{Journey in the Seaboard Slave States: With Remarks on Their Economy}, Documenting the American South (University Library: The University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, 2001 [Originally published in 1856], \url{http://docsouth.unc.edu/olmsted/olmstead.html}, 601-2; See also White, \textit{Ar’n’t I a Woman?}, 88.
\textsuperscript{64} Parson, \textit{An Inside View of Slavery}, 212; See also Bauer, “Day to Day Resistance to Slavery,”417.
\textsuperscript{65} Parson, \textit{An Inside View of Slavery}, 212.
abortion, and 1 piece of medical evidence, all from primary source materials, which can provide some evidence on the use of such a method of resistance by slave women.

The first of these pieces of evidence comes from a plantation journal, which would have likely been updated by overseers and masters to keep records on slaves’ condition, work, whereabouts, and issues. Although the *Ferry Hill Plantation Journal* was written between January 4, 1838 and January 15, 1839 by John Blackford, it was not published until 1961 with editing by Fletcher M. Green. In the journal we read that, “Daph miscarried two children this morning. sent for Mrs. Fry who came, she is quite ill. the two children which Daph miscarried she is supposed to have gone with 4 months Both female. It was an hour or upwards between their birth. It is thought she took medicine to produce their destruction.”

The second piece of evidence comes in the form of a medical journal article from the antebellum South. In 1860 Dr. John H. Morgan not only published his article “An Essay on the Causes of the Production of Abortion among our Negro Population” in the *Nashville Journal of Medicine and Surgery*, but he also read it to the Rutherford County Medical Society that same year. Within this piece of evidence we can not only locate a professional medical opinion that abortion was indeed being utilized by slave women, but Morgan also notes two actual acts of abortion that seem authentic. We will start by analyzing his expert opinion on the matter, and then move on to the abortive acts.

Dr. Morgan is writing on abortion among slaves, but he first admits that he believes the most common causes of sterility and abortion to be hard labor and mistreatment put on slave women while pregnant. He adds that sometimes slave women are “willing and even anxious to avail

---


themselves of an opportunity to effect an abortion or to derange menstruation.”68 He continues by adding that “the remedies mostly used by the negroes to procure abortion are the infusion or decoction of tansy, rue, roots and seed of the cotton plant, pennyroyal, cedar berries and camphor, either in gum or spirits,” and some of these items are readily available to them in local gardens.69 Morgan also declares that he has been questioned by blacks if camphor would make a woman miscarry, and he attributes the length of the list of abortives being attempted to the ambiguity revolving around which medicines are the most effective.70

Although Morgan writes that his medical opinion is that “it is a very rare thing for negroes to resort to mechanical means to effect an abortion,” he relates, in his essay, a contradictory and graphic act to this.71 Morgan writes that another doctor had informed him of one specific case where a black slave woman was examined and was found to have deliberately procured an abortion by using mechanical means, and she was successful.72

The other case that Morgan includes in his essay is of most interest to me because confession was attained from the slaves that were thought to be using abortives. Dr. Morgan was informed by a Dr. Smith that there was a family of slave women who were suspected of inducing abortions for a multi-generational time span. Even when the master had sold the suspect slaves and replaced them with women “who were in the habit of having children every eighteen months or two years,” he noticed that “every conception was aborted by the fourth month. The negroes finally confessed that they did take medicine for this purpose, and showed their master the weed which was their favorite remedy.”73

---

69 Ibid., 117-8.
70 Ibid., 119.
71 Ibid., 120.
72 Ibid.
73 Ibid., 122.
While Dr. Morgan does support the theory that slave women were known to be using abortion as a reproductive choice, he does not conclude with any opinions on the motivations or on this as a method of resistance as his essay is intended for a medical audience only.

Analyzing this evidence, both in volume and in credibility, I would conclude three things. First, sources are out there, and they are becoming more available. It is time for someone to research these acts further in an endeavor to accurately recreate this part of female slaves’ history as much as is possible. Second, abortion and infanticide did occur in the antebellum slave south and it can, therefore, be validly claimed as female resistance to slavery due to the agency that was required from black slave women to commit these acts, and the rebellious nature at the heart of them. Third, assumptions of commonality regarding infanticide and abortion will have to wait for future study. There is simply not enough evidence to label these acts common. Besides, one must wonder; common compared to what? Also, it is not necessary to deem infanticide and abortion common in order to validate these methods of resistance among slave women. Previous scholars have possibly used the ambiguous evidence to prove a point when it was necessary for women’s history that it be done. They understandably desired to create a space where slave women would be valued as contributors to resistance of the system of slavery.

Female slaves’ reproductive decisions, namely abortion and infanticide, are just one space where these women contributed to resistance against the system that oppressed them. They challenged this system in myriad other ways that have not been explored in enough detail. Female slave history has suffered from the lack of sources that are available to tell their story; to share their voices; but in searching the silences and gaps I hope that their stories are not lost. Our modern understanding of resistance includes things like everyday resistance and, therefore, it should become more inclusive to female resistance to slavery as well. If we are to accept masculinist methods of resistance as resistance, then we must be prepared to welcome other gendered forms of resistance
utilized by female slaves. Women undoubtedly found their own methods of resistance where it seemed there may have been none. They were not silent, as it seems in a majority of the sources, and as this becomes more apparent, there are many of us who demand to find their voices.
Food Web Impacts Of The Invasive New Zealand Mudsnail In An Estuarine System

AMANDA L. KELLEY
VALANCE BRENNEIS, FACULTY MENTOR
CATHERINE E. DE RIVERA, FACULTY MENTOR

Abstract

Non-indigenous species (hereafter NIS) have long been recognized as adversely affecting habitats they invade. While many of their documented ecological impacts have been to specific species, namely prey, they may impact whole food webs. Both vertebrate and invertebrate NIS have been present in the Columbia River since the mid 1800’s. The New Zealand mudsnail, \( Potamopyrgus antipodarum \), hereafter NZMS) was first reported in the Columbia River Estuary in 1995. This typically freshwater NIS invaded Youngs Bay, a shallow embayment within the Columbia River estuary system, and has proliferated within this benthic community. To date, there have been no inquiries into the impact of NZMS on the food web in a brackish water estuary within the United States. To identify community-level impacts by the invasive NZMS, an ecological census of the benthic communities of Youngs and Cathlamet Bays (reference site) was conducted, including comprehensive sampling of vertebrates and benthic invertebrates from these two brackish water systems. Stable isotope analysis (SIA) from these two systems is being utilized to identify trophic level food web relationships. 50% of one common estuarine fish, the Pacific staghorn sculpin (\( Leptocottus armatus \)) were found to contain NZMS in their guts. Furthermore, I have found densities reaching 15,711 snails/m² sampled. These results indicate NZMS in Youngs Bay may affect higher trophic levels.

Introduction

The New Zealand mudsnail, \( Potamopyrgus antipodarum \), hereafter NZMS) is a freshwater snail that has invaded several parts of the globe, including the United States. Although males and female snails exist in their native New Zealand, in the Western US, this species is entirely female and parthenogenic in nature(Dybdahl and Kane 2005). Adult snails can reach 6 mm in length(Dybdahl and Kane 2005), and have the ability to tolerate a wide range of physical conditions. This is accomplished by having a hard shell with an operculum that can be sealed to protect against desiccation, digestion, and other stresses, including a wide-range of pH and salinity variation (Jacobsen and Forbes 1997; Alonso and Camargo 2004). In fact, despite the lack of genetic variation, they thrive in a diversity of habitats (Dybdahl and Kane, 2005). In general, NIS arrive in their new environment
without their natural predator, which often leaves these populations unchecked and able to experience dynamic population growth. For example, NZMS have the capability of reaching extremely high densities, up to 800,000 per m² in Lake Maarsseveen, in the Netherlands (Dorgelo 1987). In addition, they are able to dominate the benthic community; in one study NZMS constituted 65–92% of total invertebrate productivity (Hall, Dybdahl et al. 2006).

The NZMS was first identified in the United States in the middle section of the Snake River in central Idaho in 1985 (Langenstein and Bowler 1990). Currently, the NZMS has been identified in all of the western states. The NZMS was first reported in the Columbia River Estuary in 1995 (Sytsma et al., 2004, Wonham and Carlton, 2005). This population is believed to have been transported via human vectors from other river systems in the Western U.S. In fact, the Lower Columbia River population of NZMS is monogenic, being comprised of the same clone that is found in all the riverine populations in the Western US. The Columbia Estuary population comprised the first NZMS sighting in a brackish water system in the United States, although they are now known to exist in other estuaries such as Coos Bay, OR. High densities (up to 200,000 individuals/m²) (Litton 2000), have been found at sites in Youngs Bay, a brackish bay in the Columbia River Estuary. At high densities, NZMS are capable of consuming large volumes of algae and detritus, potentially reducing the production of native benthic estuarine inhabitants (Hall, Dybdahl et al. 2006).

A greater understanding of the impact of this invasive species in an estuarine system requires knowledge about its effects on native benthic invertebrates, their prey, and predators. It is important to understand whether the high densities of NZMS, such as those in Youngs Bay, alter the food web in this sensitive estuarine system. These shifts in food web relationships may have lateral impacts on native species that occupy roughly the same
trophic level as the NZMS, such as amphipods and isopods, due to their use of scarce resources (e.g., food or physical space). These native epibenthic invertebrates are an important food source for many predators. This bottom up effect of an invasive secondary trophic level species may also impact higher trophic level predators such as Three-Spine Stickleback (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*) and Pacific Staghorn Sculpin (*Leptocottus armatus*). These species may inadvertently feed on the NZMS, which are nutritionally inferior to the native benthic invertebrates that are present (McCarter 1986; Sagar and Glova 1995; Bruce and Moffitt 2005; Vinson, Dinger et al. 2006). New Zealand mudsnails have been documented in the digestive system of juvenile Chinook sampled from the Lower Columbia Estuary (Bersine et al., in prep), demonstrating that they may have become incorporated into the diet of this endangered species.

NZMS primarily feed on algae, which predominantly occurs in the photic zone. Therefore, we expected that higher NZMS densities would be found in the shallowest sampling depth, five feet. Also we expected to find a relationship between lower salinity values and an increase in mudsnail density, bearing in mind that this NIS primarily lives in freshwater river systems.

**Materials and Methods**

**Site description**

*Columbia River*

The Columbia River Basin is the largest freshwater river system in the Pacific Northwest, and is the second largest river system in the U.S. with reference to volume discharged. Its drainage basin covers 671,000 km² in seven states and one Canadian province. From the mouth to Skamokawa, WA (~river km 56) the lower Columbia River is a coastal plain estuary (Simenstadt et al., 1990). Both vertebrate and invertebrate invasive species have
been present in the Columbia River since the mid 1800's. Domestic and international shipping are thought to be the primary vectors for the introduction of NIS on the Columbia River. The two study sites, Youngs and Cathlamet Bays, are shallow embayments within the Columbia River Estuary (Holton, 1984).

Youngs Bay

Youngs Bay is a shallow embayment on the south shore of the Columbia River. Youngs River flows into Youngs Bay, which stretches approximately three and a half miles from the confluence of the Walooski River to the mouth of Youngs bay on the Columbia River Estuary. Youngs Bay is roughly a mile and a half across at the widest point. Its bathometry can be described as a wide, gentle demersal slope, which generally is no deeper than 15 feet on average. The middle of the bay has been dredged repeatedly to allow larger ship traffic, but is only 35 feet deep at its deepest point. Seasonal water temperature varies from nine to 20 °C, and salinity measurements generally were below 10 parts per thousand (hereafter ppt), but occasionally exceeded 25 ppt (Higley 1974).

Fig. 1. Youngs Bay Sample Sites
Cathlamet Bay

Cathlamet Bay is also a shallow embayment on the south shore of the Columbia River, upstream of Youngs Bay. At the mouth of the John Day River, the bay reaches its deepest point, roughly 30 feet. Temperature ranges between 2.4 and 23.9 °C, and salinity values ranging from 0 to 23.7 ppt (Database 2001-2007). However, primary production in Cathlamet bay is considerably lower than Youngs Bay at 22.63 g C m³/yr compared to 71.19 g C m³/yr⁻² yr¹ respectively (McIntire 1984).

Field Sampling

Fish and benthic invertebrates were sampled to characterize the estuarine food webs in Youngs and Cathlamet Bays and to determine the potential impacts of mudsnails on these food webs. Biological and physical samples were collected at three depths (5, 10 and 20 ft) along four transect perpendicular to the shore, for a total of twelve samples per bay.
Youngs Bay was sampled from the 5th of July 2007 through 22nd of July 2007, and Cathlamet Bay was sampled from the 30th of July 2007, through the 2nd of August, 2007.

Fish were collected with baited (canned cat food) Wildco collapsible mesh minnow traps deployed at the five foot depth of each transect for 24 hours. Fish were identified to species, counted, and then randomly chosen for gut content analysis. To analyze the gut contents, we opened the digestive tract and noted the presence or absence of NZMS (only Youngs Bay fish samples) as well as presence of other invertebrates. Fish muscle tissue samples were collected from these fish and placed in a 1.5ml tube and frozen for later analysis.

A petite ponar grab was employed to sample benthic invertebrates. Two grabs (totaling 0.045 m²) were taken per sample site with the resulting sediment being sieved through a 1mm mesh. The remaining invertebrates were then stored in a 500 ml Nalgene sample bottle and suspended in 70% ethanol solution. Invertebrate tissue samples were taken randomly for later analysis. Plankton net with an 80 µm cod end was towed through the water to full length of the retrieving rope, 15 ft. The sample (phytoplankton and water) was then taken up by a 50 ml syringe, retained on filter paper, stored in a 1.5 ml tube, and frozen for future analysis.

Abiotic characteristics were measured at each site to describe the physical parameters. An Eagle Cuda Fish finder was used to determine water depth. The petite ponar grab was used to retrieve water samples directly adjacent to the benthic sediment at each sample depth (5, 10, 20 ft). The resulting water was then subject to a series of measurements: temperature, salinity, conductivity, pH, and TDS using an Extech II Extik pH/conductivity EC 500. Sampling was done between 9 am and 6 pm, and no special consideration was
taken in regards to the tidal influence. A Magellan Explorist 100 was used to record geographic coordinates at each sample site.

Animal tissue (1 mg) and phytoplankton (on precombusted Whatman GF/C filters) samples were dried for 48 hours at 60°C and weighed into tin capsules (Costech) for stable isotope analysis. Stable isotope analysis will be performed by the Stable Isotope Facility at the University of California, Davis using a Europa Hydra 20/20 continuous flow isotope ratio mass spectrometer. This data will be coupled with previous stable isotope data to construct a food web for the system.

**Statistical Analyses**

Analysis of variance (ANOVA) was used to determine whether there were any correlations between NZMS density and the varying sampling depths in Youngs Bay. The assumptions of ANOVA were met (normality of residuals, homogeneity of variance).

**Results**

**Fish Gut Content Analysis:**

The most striking result of the gut content analysis was that 57% of Pacific Staghorn Sculpin with full stomachs contained NZMS. However, statistical analysis of fish species versus NZMS predation did not yield any statistically significant data because of the small sample size of fish collected. Power was low (0.4) but it is likely that a larger samples size would show significant effects. Also, the assumptions of ANOVA were not met because the data gathered was not normally distributed (Table 1, Figure 2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fish Species</th>
<th>Total n</th>
<th>Non-empty</th>
<th>% empty</th>
<th># w/NZMS</th>
<th>% w/NZMS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3-spine stickleback</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pacific staghorn sculpin</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prickly sculpin</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Density and Depth Correlation in Youngs Bay:

There was no significant correlation between NZMS density and the different sampling sites (Table 2, 3 and Figure 3).

Table 2. Analysis of Variance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>1.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Total</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6.47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3. Effect Tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Nparm</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>F Ratio</th>
<th>Prob &gt; F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transect name</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.8826182</td>
<td>2.0652</td>
<td>0.1934</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Log Ref Depth (ft)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.3349124</td>
<td>0.7198</td>
<td>0.4243</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 3. NZMS density by depth and transect Regression Plot
Multivariate correlation between NZMS density and abiotic parameters:

The multivariate analysis of NZMS density and various abiotic parameters yielded no significant correlation between snail density and the spectrum of abiotic characteristics that were measured in Youngs Bay. Not surprisingly, several abiotic parameters were highly correlated with one another (Table 4).

Table 4: Pairwise Correlations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable by Variable</th>
<th>Correlation</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Temp F NZMS #/m²</td>
<td>0.4493</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.1428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salinity ppt NZMS #/m²</td>
<td>-0.3530</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.2604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salinity ppt Temp F</td>
<td>-0.9380</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductivity ms NZMS #/m²</td>
<td>-0.3496</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.2652</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductivity ms Temp F</td>
<td>-0.9309</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductivity ms Salinity ppt</td>
<td>0.9990</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pH NZMS #/m²</td>
<td>-0.3022</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0.3664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pH Temp F</td>
<td>-0.7922</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0.0036</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Variable by Variable | Correlation | Count | p-value
--- | --- | --- | ---
pH Salinity ppt | 0.8797 | 11 | 0.0004
pH Conductivity ms | 0.8739 | 11 | 0.0004
TDS ppt NZMS #/m² | -0.3494 | 12 | 0.2655
TDS ppt Temp F | -0.9277 | 12 | 0.0000
TDS ppt Salinity ppt | 0.9992 | 12 | 0.0000
TDS ppt Conductivity ms | 0.9997 | 12 | 0.0000
TDS ppt pH | 0.8736 | 11 | 0.0004
Actual depth (ft) NZMS #/m² | 0.3228 | 12 | 0.3062
Actual depth (ft) Temp F | 0.0046 | 12 | 0.9886
Actual depth (ft) Salinity ppt | 0.1220 | 12 | 0.7056
Actual depth (ft) Conductivity ms | 0.1202 | 12 | 0.7098
Actual depth (ft) pH | 0.0920 | 11 | 0.7878
Actual depth (ft) TDS ppt | 0.1293 | 12 | 0.6889

Discussion

Although the fish gut content analysis did not produce any statistically significant data due to the small sample size, we can still glean useful information from it. The mudsnail was found in the digestive track of two fish species, Pacific staghorn sculpin (*Leptocottus armatus*), and three-spine stickleback (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*). Of fish with non-empty stomachs, the Pacific staghorn sculpin had a high frequency of ingested NZMS, 57% of this species (4 out of 7) sampled had NZMS in their gut. The three-spine stickleback had a lower frequency of NZMS ingestion, with 14.3% of fish (1 out of 7) sampled having mudsnail in their stomachs. We can compare this data with a NOAA report that was executed in 2002 through 2005 where the diet of juvenile Chinook was examined for the presence of NZMS. They found no snails present in 2002 or 2003, but in 2004 two out of 370 salmon had NZMS in their gut, which is only about a 0.5% frequency. In 2005, 64
Chinook were sampled, and only one was found to have NZMS in its stomach. This rate of occurrence is only 1.5% for 2005 (Bersine, Brenneis et al. in prep.). The rate of NZMS ingestion occurrence we found in Youngs Bay was drastically higher than what the NOAA report concluded. This is likely due to feeding differences, with a higher NZMS occurrence expected in benthic feeders such as sculpin.

Contrary to our predictions, depth did not appear to limit NZMS distribution in Youngs Bay. There was no correlation between NZMS density and depth (from 0 to 20 ft) or transect site. In fact, the highest NZMS density, 15,711 snails/m² was collected at the 20 foot depth. The lack of correlation with depth indicates that NZMS populations are consuming benthic detritus in addition to algae. The observation that NZMS are not limited to the shallow inter-tidal increases the potential impact of this invasive species on the benthic food web.

Individually, pH, salinity, temperature, conductivity, and TDS had virtually no influence on NZMS densities. We can also view this information from the perspective that the NZMS is so well suited for a wide range of physical environments that they can proliferate unhindered across a wide range of environments. That is to say that the density of NZMS in Youngs Bay does not appear to be limited by the range of the abiotic parameters we measured.

We can conclude from this investigation that the mudsnail has indeed been incorporated into the food web of the benthic community in Youngs Bay. Clearly, sample depth or transect site had no influence on NZMS density. Also, we found that all the abiotic parameters measured had absolutely no effect on mudsnail density. Further study will include constructing a food web of this community using stable isotope analysis and comparing the results with that of our reference site, Cathlamet Bay. SIA laboratory
analysis includes the carbon and nitrogen isotope values of these samples will be used in conjunction with gut content data and previously collected invertebrate and primary producer data to compile an integrated description of food web structure (Peterson and Fry 1987; Ilken, Brey et al. 2001). Armed with this information, we will be able to better describe the effect of the invasive New Zealand mudsnail on this estuarine food web.

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank Dr. Cathrine deRivera, Valance Brenneis, Dr. Brad Buckley, Dr. Debbie Duffield for all of your advice and support. Also, thanks to Lee Cain at Astoria High School for the use of the laboratory, as well as all of the information he employed us with.

Grants

This project was funded by the Ronald McNair Scholarship program at Portland State University. This scholarship allows first generation college graduates and underrepresented minority students the opportunity to conduct original research, as well as preparing students for the rigors of graduate school, and succeed in completing a doctoral program.
References


Bersine, K., V. Brenneis, et al. (in prep.). Distribution of the invasive New Zealand mudsnail (Potamopyrgus antipodarum) in the Columbia River Estuary and its first recorded occurrence in the diet of juvenile Chinook salmon (Oncorhynchus tshawytscha). Pt. Adams, OR, NOAA, PSU.


Inciting Social Change Through Film: Using Marcus Banks’s Definition of Ethnographic Film to Discuss the Films of Participant Productions

MARIE LOEB  
JANICE HAAKEN, FACULTY MENTOR

Abstract  
This article examines films produced by Participant Productions: Murderball, Good Night, and Good Luck, North Country, Syriana, and An Inconvenient Truth, using the three aspects—Intention, Event, and Reaction as outlined by Marcus Banks (1992) to define an ethnographic film.

Introduction  
Ethnographic films cannot be said to constitute a genre, nor is ethnographic filmmaking a discipline with unified origins and an established methodology. (MacDougall, 1978, p. 405)

While ethnographic films lack established methodology or markers of genre there are several assumed characteristics of an ethnographic film. The general understanding of an ethnographic film is that it is a non-fictional portrayal of a group of people for the understanding of society at large. Marcus Banks suggests that an ethnographic film should be defined using three aspects, “an intention – to make a film – results in an event – the filming process – which leads to a reaction – the response of the audience to the physical manifestation of the even (film)” (1992, p. 117). Banks examines not only the film itself, but also the filmmakers’ intentions in creating the film and the audiences’ reaction to the film.

“Intention” refers to the filmmakers’ desire to capture “reality’ directly on the film strip” rather than allowing cinematography or a formulaic narrative to overtake the production (p. 119). A strict adherence to “reality” implies that the film cannot favor certain
individuals more than others or highlighting the more interesting ones, nor edit happenings out of sequences to create drama or relevance. This approach to filmmaking is extremely relevant to research projects, but would not fair well in the commercial film market that relies on captivating a paying audience.

The term “event” denotes the filming or taping of the happening studied; this includes the crew, researchers, director, et al that have infiltrated the naturally occurring happening (p. 120). Banks offers “core beliefs” in the creation of an ethnographic film; “the filmmakers should follow the action, rather than provoking it” all the while not be delusional in thinking they are not altering the “action” by their presence; shoot a “vast amount of film” rather than “highlights” and then edit it “to preserve whole sequences in their entirety”; and that the “less obvious the ‘subject’ a film has, the better; famous people or historic events should be avoided” (p. 123). These “core beliefs” may be appropriate for research focused ethnographic films, but commercial documentaries must rely on commercial success, which may be lackluster with a slow pace due to “whole sequences in their entirety.”

Understanding your audience—who they are, what is the desired action of the viewers, and will this be used for educational or commercial purposes, is Banks’s third and final defining term for ethnographic films—“reaction” (p. 124-125). It is with this definition that one can attribute and discuss the elicited response from the audience and how is coincides or diverges with the aims of the filmmaker.

This article will apply Bank’s defining aspects of “intention”, “event”, and “reaction” to films outside the standard academic documentary genre, broadening the scope of the defining characteristics to aid as a lens in defining and discussing social action filmmaking, and specifically how it applies to the films released by Participant Productions.
Participant Productions

“The movie is just the beginning.” (Participant Productions, 2006).

Participant Productions is “a media company that focuses its support on “socially relevant, commercially viable” films” created by Jeff Skoll in January 2004 (Mlynek, 2004). Skoll began the company with $100 million of his estimated $5 billion in personal assets he earned as the writer of the business plan for eBay as its first employee. Producing award winning films such as: Murderball, Good Night, and Good Luck, North Country, and Syriana Participant Productions also has a predetermined social cause for each film helping inspired audiences to act.

Murderball: “A [documentary] film about tough, highly competitive [Paralympics] rugby players. Quadriplegic rugby players” is not only an award winning film, but also a tool for social action (Participant Productions, 2006). Participant Production’s website features an invitation to “take action” on the front page of their website which links the visitor to a cause for every film they release. For Murderball, Participant Productions offers the visitor to host a screening of the film and includes a guide to “Disability Etiquette” by the United Spinal Association and a “Murderball Discussion Guide” giving the host basic information on living with a disability and offers discussion questions including, “What can be done to change attitudes and stereotypes about people with disabilities in your community?” and “How can we turn the momentum from this screening and discussion into effective action?” (Participant Productions, 2006).

Good Night, and Good Luck is a standard narrative film that “chronicles […] television news man Edward R. Murrow” as he and the members of the CBS newsroom “defy corporate and sponsorship pressures to examine the lies and scaremongering tactics perpetrated by McCarthy during his communist ‘witch-hunts’” (Participant Productions,
2006). The corresponding campaign encourages the visitor to the website to “take action to help restore faith in the media’s fundamental mission” explaining the “television and print news organizations have drifted away from hard news and toward entertainment designed to turn a profit with little accountability” (Participant Productions, 2005). Interested participants can join the community of citizen news watchdogs and report their own news on Participant’s site, Participate.net/reportitnow.

“A campaign to end Sexual Harassment and Domestic Violence” is the activism arm of the film North Country; a narrative film about “the nation’s first-ever class action lawsuit for sexual harassment” (Participant Productions, 2005). The website for the campaign offers a myriad of materials for a diverse group of site visitors. Available materials include a brochure with advice for parents to help them provide the tools to their sons to not be abusers, a fact sheet on domestic violence, and a “school sexual harassment policy checklist” (Participant Productions, 2006).

The narrative film, Syriana depicts the United States’ dependence on foreign oil and the crisis at hand in regards to “our environment, economy, and national security” (Participant Productions, 2006). The campaign’s website offers many options for activism including an invitation for interested parties to “join the virtual march to stop global warming,” donate to renewable energy alternatives, and write letters to the oil distribution companies asking for public disclosure of payments and contracts with “oil producing companies” (Participant Productions, 2005).

Global warming is the subject of the documentary, An Inconvenient Truth, which shows scientific evidence to illustrate that “we have just ten years to avert a major catastrophe that could send our entire planet’s climate system into a tail-spin off epic destruction” (Participant Productions, 2006). The “take action” portion of the website links
to climatecrisis.net, a site that, among other things, calculates the visitor’s output of carbon
dioxide and gives many suggestions to reduce that output. The website also invites the
visitor to become an activist in the campaign with “some simple things you can do to spread
the word” (Gore, 2006).

Discussion

A key difference between ethnographic film and fictional narratives is a desired social
reaction of social change rather than mere box office dollars. Participant Production
combines both of these goals—box office success and positive social change, thus becoming
the perfect company set the precedent for activism through film. One can make an inspiring
film to illuminate a societal cause, but if no one sees it, limited change can precipitate.

Banks’s defining characteristics for ethnographic film is an appropriate lens to
examine Participant Productions, because in both cases the films are cause oriented.
“Intention” as described previously could not possibly apply to a film company struggling to
make a profit. By strictly adhering to “reality” there would be limited box office appeal and
the cause behind the film would get little recognition. However, Participant Productions
does release documentary films and although dramatized with slow motion, music, and other
cinematic effects the filmmakers never create a new reality based on the footage. The
filmmakers work closely with the participants in the documentary to create a reality as they
see it.

In the case of fictional narrative films Participant Productions sets out to construct a
reality that could exist, either based upon historical happenings or the future implications of
our current political climate. While Banks referred to an intention to capture reality as it
exists at the time of filming, Participant Productions, chooses to construct a reality with
actors and sets. When a documentary filmmaker whittles down hundreds of hours of
footage into a feature length film of roughly 80 minutes the filmmaker has to make hard choices as to what select images best convey the message of the film in the time allotted. Ultimately, a documentary filmmaker creates their own version of reality and thus minimizes the difference between reality and fantasy. Given an inevitable influence of perception in filmmaking, the fictionalized reality the production crew creates on the set is only marginally more fanciful that the final edited output of a documentary production.

Banks refers to the intended social reaction of ethnographic films as educational tools to increase understanding and empathy towards the group being depicted (pp. 124-126). However, past the general awareness of the group Banks gives no tangible social action to strive for in the creation of an ethnographic film. In applying Banks’s term, “reaction” more broadly to encompass all styles of filmmaking, the films of Participant Productions meet the initial requirements of Banks to educate, and then take it a step further to create social action campaigns for each of the films.

These campaigns are designed to give a voice to issues that resonate in the films. We partner with social sector organizations, non-profits and corporations who are committed to creating an open forum for discussion, educations and who can, in partnership with Participant, offer specific ways for audience members to get involved and to take action. (Participant Productions, 2006)

Jeff Skoll had, in an interview in Esquire, said that, “Books are good, yes, but how do people actually get most of their stories nowadays? Film and TV” (as cited in Sager, 2005).

Conclusion

Participant Productions is not the only film company producing social action films for the enjoyment of a mainstream audience, however, they are the only company succeeding as a business while still producing film intended to elicit a reaction of activism.
In comparing the films produced by Participant Products and other social action films
Bank’s defining characteristics for ethnographic film offers a sturdy lens to discuss the
Intention, Event, and Reaction of the production companies, the filmmakers, and the film
itself.


Urbanism and North American Funerary Practices

REBECCA MARRALL
MICHELE GAMBAURD, FACULTY MENTOR

Abstract

Urbanism is a way of life for those who reside in a densely inhabited area with a heterogeneous human population. The diversity of cultures, worldviews and practices found in urban areas combine in a form of cultural mixing. The urban amalgamation of cultures raises the question of how urban dwellers process their dead. Indeed, does urbanism influence regional death rituals and funerary practices? Other elements such as urban zoning laws, funerary technology or land scarcity add further dimensions to the original question. In short, do urban funerary practices and death rituals differ precisely because they are urban?

My research examines how urbanism affects the rituals and ceremonies that surround death in a North American urban setting, and specifically in Portland, OR. I further contrast the funerary practices in urban settings to those in rural ones, and analyze the influences or pressures urbanization poses on funeral practices. My research explores emerging trends in funeral practices and sheds important light on the changing rituals and symbols that surround death. The conclusions cover the upcoming issue of space scarcity in cemeteries and the new funerary applications of existing technology. Investigating interment practices in an urban setting reveals how an increasingly urban society interacts with death.

Introduction

In the cemeteries of New Orleans, most of the city and the surrounding area is below sea level. Both historical and contemporary citizens have built their tombs and cemeteries above ground to prevent a later reappearance of deceased family members during annual floods. Placing tombs above ground distinctly changes how people respond to death (Keister 1999). Witnessing these memorial monuments myself raised questions of how residents interact with tangible, daily reminders of death. Neither having the time nor the means to pursue that line of questioning in New Orleans, I limited the McNair project to Portland, OR. While the regional and historical context is vastly different, the research does explain funerary service patterns.

In short, I decided to examine how the environment of Portland (and by extension, other urban communities) influenced its citizens interaction with death. As my studies and research evolved, I found myself questioning the difference between urban and rural contemporary funeral
practices in Oregon, the Northwest, the West Coast, and the United States. For the purposes of this paper, I limited my quantitative data to Oregon and used the results to infer information about large scale trends in the U.S. With a background in anthropology, it makes sense for me to draw upon its literature to support my thesis. One such source is James Deetz. James Deetz is the godfather of funerary anthropology. His work on mortuary seriation is considered canon in the field of historical archaeology, and demonstrates how change over time is manifested in human funerary artifacts. Operating on Francis Ford’s pioneering work on seriation, Deetz’s work *In Small Things Forgotten* demonstrates how the change of gravestone markers coincided with the change of religious beliefs in Anglo-Americans in New England. The orthodox Puritan church, the earliest period discussed, used the harsh symbolism of a death’s-head and stentorian epitaphs. In contrast, the succeeding period that signified the religious era called The Great Awakening saw a rise of cherubs and poetic statements about the soul on gravestones. Finally, the increasing secularization that rose during the post-Awakening era manifested in urn-and-willow grave markers, which contained simple memorials of the deceased individuals (Deetz 1996). Deetz concludes that human funerary artifacts and practices mirror the changing human worldview.

To understand the purpose of my research, I must define death as a sociological phenomenon. It might seem obvious, but it is crucial to realize the underlying ramifications of death. Death is not merely the absence of a deceased individual, but rather a disruption in the community structure (Kubler-Ross 1969). To process the loss of an individual, humans create and enact rituals that re-integrate the community after the disruption (Turner 1971). Over the last 150 years the traditional funeral, complete with a cemetery plot and burial within a grave, has been a North American ritual to assuage the emotionally painful interruption of death and reform the social
structure (Habenstein and Lamers 2001). My research suggests that in contemporary urban settings, as the physical and social structure of human settlements change, so do funerary rituals.

**Risks and Benefits**

My research focused on the impact of urbanism on death rituals and funerary practices. The subject naturally lent itself to reducing any personal or professional risks for the participants. I did not interview individuals currently going through the grief process but rather licensed professional funeral directors who are very comfortable within their fields. My target audience is literate, with some collegiate training. Since the interviewees were professionals, the emotional or psychological risk was minimal. Nor did any of the information I collected pose a risk to the interviewees or their profession. The topic is not controversial, and I felt safe in providing a letter of intent that explained my research along with my contact information.

My research will provide indirect benefits for the interview participants by providing an in-depth review of how urbanism affects funerary practices and death rituals. If urbanism is affecting death rituals, we need to know in what way – adversely, beneficially, or perhaps neutrally. If funeral practices are evolving because of their urban or rural status, the conclusions derived from the research could assist funeral directors in evaluating what funeral services they provide. With this information, funeral directors can better serve the general populace through the grief process. The research also sheds light on expected future trends. Further research could precisely name the emotional/psychological impact of death in an urban setting.

**Social Framework**

The impact of urbanization upon funeral rituals cannot be overemphasized. Urbanism is more than a sum of many people in one location, but rather a combination of factors that produces a distinct phenomenon (Gmeleh and Zenner 2001). My research is based on urban anthropological literature and is framed most notably on the work of Louis Wirth. Using urbanism as a research
framework has the benefit of including additional perspectives to create a cross-discipline perspective. In his seminal essay “Urbanism as a Way of Life,” Wirth presents a detailed picture of what urban life consists of and how the city influences its residents. Wirth proposes that density, a large population, and diversity (or heterogeneity) are components of urbanism (Gmelch and Zenner 2001). A further examination of these three elements can elucidate why urbanism is important for understanding contemporary funerary practices.

Louis Wirth’s first requirement for urbanism was size of population. Large amounts of people in one location meant there were more variations of cultures and religions present (Gmelch and Zenner 2001). By reason of sheer numbers, more racial and ethnic diversity is present in urban areas (Fulton 1967). Furthermore, Wirth argues that because there are so many urban individuals (contrary to those residing in a rural settlement), one person cannot know everyone. The sheer number of people present in urban settlements prevents deep interpersonal investment and results in what Wirth deemed as “superficial” relationships (Gmelch and Zenner 2001).

The resulting lack of closeness in urban areas creates a social distance. For Wirth, the social distance is exacerbated by impersonal communication modes. According to Wirth, the society in urban areas uses impersonal mediums to connect with the populace: television, newspapers, Internet. While these forms of communication are making a form of connection between parties, they retain a social and physical distance between human beings (Gmelch and Zenner 2001). One final aspect of the urban experience is the lack of vocational interdependence. People no longer have to rely on one another for their livelihood, as they did in rural historical times. Wirth concluded that less interdependence results in less personal investment in relationships and increases social distances yet again. Wirth feels that social distance is a characteristic of urbanism, created by an inability to be vocationally and personally interdependent upon one another (Gmelch and Zenner 2001).
Density is another crucial element of urbanism. When the population increases, but the area held remains the same, there exists a juxtaposition of many different cultures and practices in a small space (Fulton 1967). Wirth maintains that the resulting situation leads to an attitude of relativistic tolerance for heterogeneous neighbors and initiates or reinforces the trend toward secularization (Gmelch and Zenner 2001). Another byproduct of density in the urban equation is specialization. When many people occupy the same area, not all can do the same function or job. Indeed, many doing the same job would be redundant; therefore, people specialize their goods and services. Both of the trends have important ramifications for funerary practices in urban settings.

Heterogeneity is the final component in Louis Wirth’s essay. The sheer numbers found in urban areas guarantee a larger presence of diversity. Different types of families or individuals are present in an urban area: childless adults, small nuclear families removed from their extended relatives, etc. The different cultures and religious and/or ethnic groups present add a feeling of social distance, while high levels of mobility lend a feeling of transience and reinforce the social distance inherent in urban settlements (Gmelch and Zenner 2001). Wirth, and subsequent scholars who have operated off his theoretical framework, believed that urbanism was a sociological phenomenon and not a mere sum of size, density and heterogeneity. Therefore, examining funeral practices influenced by the urban experience is a legitimate inquiry that expands on the U.S. worldview.

**Literature Review**

A qualitative element of my research is a relevant literature review. Composed of many disciplines such as urban anthropology, psychology of death, and U.S. funerary history, the literature review served as a foundation to base my research upon and to pursue the right questions. The cross-paradigm approach – a common tool in anthropology – provided a unique viewpoint that led to my conclusions.
During the mid-nineteenth century, interactions with death were quite different from contemporary practices. Then, people died at home and family members witnessed the biological effects upon the corpse of the deceased (Canine 1996). Preparing the body usually fell to the family, and when someone did die, everybody knew about it. Death in the mid-1800s was a stark reality (Canine 1996). However, a sociological trend occurred that had long-term effects for the funeral industry: the rise of Romanticism. The Romantic Era was a reactionary swing away from the logic and rationality associated with the Enlightenment, the previous sociological era. Instead of logic and science, Romanticism espoused emotion and sentiment. For funeral customs, Romanticism moved away from the stark reality of death, and found ways to beautify death and add sentimental meaning (Irion 1966). The Romantic Era saw elaborate decorative urns, coffins, mourning jewelry and other trends. Death became a transcendent experience rather than an earthy occurrence. In short, Romanticism created new perceptions about death (Kastenbaum 2000).

The subsequent Industrial Revolution provided the technology and the production means for standardizing the funeral regalia. Furthermore, the introduction of the funeral “experts” who came to prepare the corpse for the final transition and allowed families to grieve unhindered created even more distance between survivors and the reality of death. From then, survivors felt an ephemeral sense of loss rather than the concrete knowledge of the deceased’s absence (Kastenbaum 2000).

Today, the trend continues. People die in hospitals, with impersonal technology measuring life left. Death diagnosis and prevention is removed from humans and left for impersonal machinery and experts to decide. My interviewee for Mt. Scott states that people are taking a more active role in funerary choices these days, but we still have a legacy of death denial, which was born in the Romantic Era and specifically in the United States (Hanson 2007). Death denial manifests in
ways like euphemistic language – such as “passing on” or “going to a better place” – relegating funerary tasks to the funeral director (Canine 1996; Laderman 2003).

Examining the North American funerary lineage naturally leads to the question “What next?” The combination of qualitative and quantitative data has yielded information about intriguing trends in urbanism and funerary practices. The interview results show several influences unique to the urban experience. One, urban settlements, because of their large and heterogeneous cultural mixture, have different funerary needs. Two, space scarcity is already a problem in crowded places like Europe. It will become an increasing problem for the U.S. as our population density increases. Three, cremation increases because of the high levels of secularization in urban areas. And finally, new applications of existing technology affect the U.S. contemporary funeral practices.

Methodology

My research site is the Portland metropolitan area, and specifically contemporary funeral homes and crematoriums. The Oregon Historical Society and the Oregon Mortuary and Funerary Board have been invaluable venues of information for cemetery statistics. My methods consisted primarily of personal interviews and relevant literature reviews, which have provided insight into the historical and present patterns of funerary service in Oregon. I further attempted to conclude whether alternative funerary practices (i.e., cremation, green burials) are associated with urban centers.

Quantitative Research

My quantitative component for my research consisted examining all the settlements in Oregon and then assigning them into an urban or rural designation. After the initial assessment, I looked for any significant spatial patterns in funeral services: what funerary services were occurring where? On an aside, I realize that a binary dichotomy of rural-urban is simplistic and potentially inaccurate. But given the short time allowed for research and the preliminary status of this project, I
felt a basic dichotomy would illuminate or expose any spatially significant patterns. Further research could expand and refine the original findings on a later and more detailed project. Because the research was a preliminary inquiry of funeral practice patterns, I limited my quantative data to Oregon funerary services. My goal was to obtain a microcosm of regional funerary patterns that could potentially be extrapolated into further insights on a national scale. Of course, in my future research I will have to examine the political, ethnic and cultural context of Oregon for other sociological factors that could explain the patterns. In short, the regional context might be responsible for some of the findings rather than the rural-urban dichotomy.

My quantative data is from the 2005 Directory of the Oregon Funerary and Mortuary Board. The Directory is a complete list of operating and historical cemeteries, funeral homes and crematoriums. I assessed the census data on the cities that contained a funeral service: funeral home, cemetery, mausoleum and/or a crematorium. I noted any connections between the type of human settlement (urban vs. rural) and the type of funerary option available in that town. I relied on the Oregon state census information from 2005. In determining whether a settlement was urban or rural, I followed the Oregon Census definition: any human settlement with over 2500 residents is considered urban. After attaining a list of funerary businesses in the state of Oregon and classifying them as urban or rural, I determined what percentage of each type of funerary service corresponded with what type of human settlement.

**Quantative Findings**

My quantative findings demonstrated a spatially important pattern. Oregon has 239 settlements. Ninety of the 239 Oregon settlements had funeral homes. Sixteen of those homes are considered rural by the Oregon Census. Funeral homes are found everywhere on the rural-urban spectrum. But of the thirty-six towns that had crematoriums, all of these settlements are urban. If the crematoriums were equally distributed and followed no significant trend, one would expect that
at least a few crematoriums would reside in rural areas. However, all crematoriums in Oregon are located in urban areas, suggesting that the demand for funerary services is influenced by environment, possibly on a rural-urban spectrum.

Additional information showed that diversity in the rural towns was low, with a percentage of over ninety percent for all rural settlements for Caucasians, with the exception of two towns: Vale and Estacada. Vale has a white demographic of 82% and Estacada a white demographic of 85%. Both towns have a larger Hispanic-American population, and this accounts for the difference. Any ethnic information may prove vital at a later date in determining whether the rural-urban status or other sociological factors play a role in selecting funerary services.

**Qualitative Research**

My methodology for researching contemporary funeral services had both a qualitative and a quantitative component. The qualitative data consisted of interviews from funeral directors about the diversity of services available in Oregon. To this end, I interviewed funeral directors from River View Cemetery Funeral Home, Zeller Chapel of the Roses, and Mount Scott Funeral Home. I selected subjects with expertise in the topic who were receptive to participating in the interview process. I contacted potential interviewees by telephone and/or e-mail, and briefly introduced myself and my research. If they wished to participate, I arranged a date to conduct the interview in person, at their convenience, so as not to interfere with their job. I performed semi-structured conversational interviews based on the list of questions approved by the Human Subjects Review Committee.

**Qualitative Findings**

My qualitative findings show three trends: one, regional differences influence what choices are available to the urban and rural residents. Two, alternative funeral options are more accessible in
the urban settlement. Three, a higher percentage of urbanites choose alternative funeral options than their rural counterparts.

Regional differences influence the consumption of funeral options greatly. Demographic trends particularly reflect consumer choices, educational requirements for funeral service and gender differences in the funerary business. My interview responses indicate that the United States follows regional trends in choosing funerary options. The unanimous consensus from my interviewees concluded that the East Coast is more conservative, choosing more traditional rituals like visitation (with embalming) and burial (Westin, Marteeny, Hanson 2007). Only in the Northeast (mainly in New England) and Florida are alternative funeral customs more common. In the Deep South of the United States, burials are the norm and more residents purchase pre-need packages to pay for their funeral costs (Westin, Marteeny, and Hanson 2007). The Midwest follows the trend of the East Coast; indeed, one funeral director stated that cremation was currently making an introduction in the Midwest (Marteeny 2007).

On the West Coast the regional trends change dramatically. Over sixty percent of residents on the West Coast opt for cremation, and more commonly choose alternative funerary options as opposed to traditional burials (Westin, Marteeny, Hanson 2007). When I inquired about the pronounced difference, funeral directors either mentioned more education or cited personal preferences (Westin, Marteeny 2007). However, in Gary Laderman’s Rest in Peace: A Cultural History of Death and the Funeral Home in Twentieth-Century America, cremation statistics show that people who choose cremation are wealthier, have higher levels of education and progressive politics (2003). These same people support doctor-assisted suicide, have a variety of religious backgrounds, and are concerned about environmental sustainability (Laderman 2003). Laderman’s statistics, particularly the progressive politics and concerns about sustainability, seem quite congruent with my findings about cremation prevalence on the West Coast.
Another trend that influences funerary choices on a regional scale are the education and licensing requirements. Each state sets their own training requirements for licensing as a funeral director or service technician (Marteeny 2007). There are no federally recognized minimum benchmarks for funeral service education. As a result, each state selects their own criteria. Thus, the subsequent pool of funeral directors differs vastly in terms of education and experience across the United States. For example, the state of Oregon requires a two year associate’s degree and apprenticeship for the completion of funeral director training. In Ohio, a funeral director is required to have a Bachelor in funeral service education. Whereas in California, funeral director training consists of a year long apprenticeship; Colorado’s requirements are even less stringent and mostly involve registering with the state to pay the licensing fees (Marteeny 2007).

The nationwide array of different educational benchmarks creates a pool of unevenly trained professionals who subsequently service the populace with uneven expertise. The vast educational differences yield a varied service that consumers, depending on the region they live in and the corresponding requirements for funeral service education, might not benefit from or receive the best care possible (Marteeny 2007). Indeed, the vastly disparate requirements could reflect the motivation of funeral directors. In states where education requirements are more strenuous, the professionals who achieve the established standards show a strong commitment to serve the population through the funeral process. The states that have less severe requirements will have a larger group of individuals whose motivations are more diverse: profit, not knowing what else to do, a mere job to pay the bills – overall, less educational requirements could equal less commitment (Marteeny 2007). In conclusion, the higher standards do not imply that they are the right standards, but those who complete the work are demonstrating stronger commitment to the field of funeral service.
Another demographic trend is women in the funeral service industry. Traditionally and historically, men have dominated the funeral service scene as directors and technicians. Only occasionally would a woman be seen in the funeral home, but more often than not she was married to the male funeral director (Mayer 1996). In the contemporary funeral industry, the East Coast still has a majority of male funeral directors. The same trend is present in the Deep South and the Midwest. On the West Coast, however, more women are funeral directors and undertake leadership roles in the funeral business (Westin 2007). Men are still the gender most heavily represented, but the number of females active in the industry rises every year. The shifting trend of women joining this industry coincided with the women’s liberation in the 1970s (Laderman 2003). There are no studies that I can find about the effects of women funeral directors on the populace or why they are almost exclusively joining the industry on the West Coast. I can only speculate that the same elements that made cremation popular on the West Coast (wealth, high levels of education, and progressive politics) also ensures the increasing enrollment of female funeral directors on the West Coast.

Further Discussion

Examining national demographic trends sets up a foundation to examine what residents have available to them when they experience death. With the national trends established, research can be undertaken to examine the more localized differences within a region. I chose to examine differences between urban and rural funerary practices in the state of Oregon. From there, I can ask further questions about how these differences, if any are present, affect the grieving process and funerary choices of the consumer. Aside from the nationwide demographic trends, my research demonstrates two trends. These trends reflect the differences between rural and urban funeral customs. Namely, that different funeral options are available in urban settlements; higher percentages of urbanites go for funerary alternatives; and higher percentages of non-traditional
deaths in cities (like AIDS, homicide, suicide) and require different funeral needs (Canine 1996; Westin, Marteeny, Hanson 2007). Furthermore, more corporately owned funeral homes are present in urban areas and consequently affect funeral service (Marteeny 2007).

Because of the large number of people in small quarters and from diverse origins, urban dwellers are exposed to many different practices, and eventually attain a tolerance or an endorsement for those practices (Gmelch and Zenner 2001). As a result, more options are socially acceptable. A traditional funeral, like those common to the East Coast, Deep South and Midwest, includes a period of visitation (where mourners visit the dead and ascertain the reality of death), a funeral eulogy, and a procession to the grave plot located in the cemetery to inter the dead (Mayer 1996). My interviewees stated that these traditional funerals are less prevalent in urban areas in Oregon (Marteeny 2007).

Urban dwellers also have different funeral needs than their rural counterparts. Urban populations have a higher percentage of ethnically diverse residents: Muslim, Hindu, Buddhist, Jewish, the list goes on. Rural areas in Oregon predominantly identify as white (over 90% in the majority of rural settlements). The corollary of that fact is that Caucasians in the United States are generally Protestant. Therefore, rural funeral needs are homogeneous and the funerary options are less diverse. However, urban residents from different backgrounds have different funeral needs. For example, the Islam faith decrees the necessity of the body touching the soil when buried. In the United States, federal law states that the body must be enclosed in a box for public health reasons. Obviously, a conflict existed here: how does a Muslim obey the dictates of faith but be in accordance with U.S. law? One local cemetery in Portland resolved this problem by placing the body in the casket but removed the bottom slats of the coffin upon burial so that the body would touch the soil yet be enclosed by U.S. standards. Compromises like this example are subject to the decision and discretion of the funeral home involved (Westin, Marteeny, Hanson 2007). My
interviewees stated that many funeral homes in Portland would accommodate different funeral needs but the majority requested them in urban areas because a higher number of diverse individuals reside in urban settlements. In Portland, Lincoln Memorial Park and Funeral Home has a section for Buddhist burials; likewise, Finley-Sunset Hills Mortuary accommodates Muslim patrons (Marteeny 2007).

Another type of funeral needs stem from the type of death the decease experienced, and the subsequent grieving needs of the family and friends. In urban areas, residents experience higher rates of homicide, suicide, and AIDS. All of these types of death carry a social stigma and potentially complicate the grieving process for those remaining (Canine 1996). Some funeral homes provide brochures or refer survivors to support groups in the case of a specialized death. Whatever the response from the funeral home, it is clear that the higher rates of alternative types of death occur in urban areas because of the heterogeneous, large community found within and subsequently funeral directors in urban communities are presented with different funerary needs (Canine 1996).

Finally, urban funeral customs differ from rural ones because of the larger corporate funeral service presence (Westin, Marteeny, Hanson 2007). More rural settlements have a local privately owned outfit, whereas funeral corporations have been entrenched in urban areas for longer periods of time (Fulton 1967). According to my interviewee responses, the difference between corporate and private ownership is as follows: corporate funeral homes have to accommodate shareholders. Thus, they have considerably more paperwork for the deceased’s family to fill out, and have to follow corporate rules by the book. As a result, corporate funeral homes are a business first and treat death (and the subsequent needs) as a transaction (Westin, Marteeny, Hanson 2007).

Furthermore, corporate funeral homes offer standardized, “cookie cutter” services to all their clients, regardless of needs. Corporate funeral homes are also often owned by a company located in a different region but only offer the standardized services in all areas (Marteeny 2007).
The problem with this scenario is that a corporately owned funeral in Portland may receive operating instructions from Texas; however, what’s appropriate for Texas may not be effective in Oregon. Privately owned funeral homes have less paperwork for clients and operate to their own judgment and discretion. My interviewees all had positive statements to make about funeral homes, citing a personal touch that was lacking in corporate homes (Westin, Marteeny, Hanson 2007). Of the three interviewed, two are private, which is no surprise considering the statements made. The last one is corporately owned, but states it has operational freedom. Regardless of its corporate status, it agreed with my other interviewees.

Future Trends

I will move into the future trends of urban funerary customs. Two major trends will present themselves within the next twenty years. Indeed, some are already present in Portland. They are space, and the impact of new applications of existing or invented technology. Space for urban cemeteries will be an even bigger problem than it is now. On a local scale, the Willamette National cemetery, noted for housing the remains of Oregon veterans and their spouses, is running out of grave plots and expected to be full within ten years (Marteeny 2007). Abroad in England, the authorities of the densely crowded nation have authorized the re-use of graves, meaning that more than one individual will reside in one grave and will be stacked upon one another (Emling 2007). Cemeteries have gotten permission from surviving family members of the plots with related deceased to exhume the remains from grave plots in order to deepen the graves to house at least six more sets of remains, making a total of seven per plot (Emling 2007). One U.S. expert argues that “double-decker” grave plots would never occur in the U.S., but I disagree with that opinion. If double-decker graves are imported to the United States, it will arrive on the West Coast, as did the practice of green burials. Indeed, some graves in Willamette National are already double stacked, but in most of these cases the individuals involved were espoused before death. However, the space
issue won’t truly affect urban areas until the population pressure has increased accordingly. When space becomes a premium, perhaps mausoleums will be an alternative.

New applications of existing or invented technology are a common theme in any field, and the funeral industry is no exception. Indeed, the generally recognized practice of cremation was once an innovative application of existing technology. New applications continue to originate in urban areas, as that is the common trend found in areas with many diverse individuals living in one area (Gmelch and Zenner 2001). Currently, several new trends exist: the eternal reef, green burials, the LifeGem, and the Internet viewing room. Green burials¹ are a funerary alternative found mostly on the West Coast or in New England (Marteeny 2007). On an aside, even cremation has an abundance of new processes to handle the ashes: scattering them in a wilderness or park setting². The LifeGem is an extension of the tradition of mourning jewelry, creating diamonds from ashes³. Eternal reefs⁴ are another funerary alternative, similar to green burials in purpose.

It should be noted that cremation technology is available to many in Oregon, rural and urban alike. For those willing to travel, so are green burials. However, many rural settlements process their dead the traditional funeral custom and have less exposure to concepts and options such as LifeGems or eternal reefs. Urban dwellers have more contact with alternative lifestyles,

---

¹ Green burials are a recent phenomenon and connected to the strong interests in sustainability. When families opt for green burials, the deceased is wrapped in a shroud or placed in a plain pine box, to aid in quick decomposition. No embalming or other chemical processes are allowed in green burials. The idea is to leave behind the least impact when one dies, and many funeral homes offer natural park-like settings for green burials. If a family chooses not to have a headstone, they are instead given the GPS coordinates to where the body is located (Laderman 2003).

² Scattering ashes is technically illegal in some areas, but many funeral homes often look the other way and advise the family to be discreet (Westin, Marteeny, Hanson 2007).

³ Another trend in funeral technology is the LifeGem, a diamond made from the carbon of the deceased’s ashes. A spendy investment, it is a new development in the tradition of mourning jewelry (Barnes 1991).

⁴ Similar to green burials in its concern for sustainability, the eternal reef is concrete mixed with a deceased individual’s ashes and molded into an artificial marine reef. People who choose that option cited the personal relief of giving something back to the earth (Barnes 1991).
cultures and ideas, and therefore a higher percentage of urbanites choose alternative funeral customs (Marteeny, Westin 2007).

The eternal reef, the LifeGem, and green burials have already been explained. However, the Internet viewing room, from a funeral home in Ithaca, NY, allows distant family members a chance to look upon their dead relative or perform visitation via Internet. These new applications of technology in the funeral industry vary in popularity with consumers, but the fact remains that the technology presents an ever-widening array of choices in how to interact with death in a contemporary setting. The research on future trends in funerary practices implies that choosing alternative mediums to process death assigns a unique (and largely unexplored) quality to urban funerary rituals. The new mediums offer a different way to interact with death, in ways that have never occurred before and the advent of these practices begs the question of the long-term effects on grievers. Like James Deetz’s case study on mortuary seriation and the coinciding change in ontological worldview, the new mediums in which to process death may suggest a mirror to our contemporary lifestyles. What can be said with certainty is that the urban funerary practice is altered precisely because it is urban. The exact effect upon mourners is subject to further research.

Conclusions

In light of the evidence that different funeral options are available in urban areas, that higher percentages of the urban population choose alternative funerary practices, that urban dwellers have different funeral customs than rural residents, and that corporate funeral homes have a stronger presence in urban areas, it can be concluded that urban funerary practices are different from rural customs. But enumerating the differences is only part of this research. The second step is to find the meaning in differences, and establish how it affects the populations involved.

The conclusion is that funeral practices in urban areas are altered precisely because of the urban environment. A history of funeral customs and its subsequent shaping of the American
mournig process was provided earlier in the paper. The reactionary swing of the Romantic era that beautified and sanitized death (opposite of the focus on reality in the previous era of the Enlightenment), combined with the improved technology and increased reliance on funeral directors, creates an environment where death is a distant transaction to be handled by the experts: medical and funeral professionals (Canine 1996; Laderman 2003). The qualitative findings demonstrated demographic trends while the quantitative findings suggested a spatially significant pattern in funerary service consumption. Further questions are raised at this point: Is the urban funerary experience positively or negatively impacted by urbanism? Is an urban funeral meeting the needs of mourners? Does the degree of urbanism determine consumer choices or does some other unaccounted for quality influence that decision? All the research creates new questions and continues the conversation of the U.S. Funeral service.

Acknowledgements

I need to acknowledge several people who have helped me throughout the Ronald E. McNair experience. Many thanks to Dr. Michele Gamburd for her support, feedback and fantastic guidance. For Toeutu Faalaeva and Jolina Kwong, coordinators of the McNair Scholars Program, for their support and efforts on my behalf. To my fellow McNair Scholars, thank you the inspiration and the mutual good times. To Chris Westin Perkins of River View Cemetery Funeral Home, Dennis Marteeny of Zeller Chapel of the Roses, and Herb Hanson of Mount Scott Funeral Home, many thanks for consenting to the interviews and offering enthusiastic insight. And finally to friends and family, who listened as I wrestled with the evolving thesis.
Works Cited

Arvio, Raymond P.  

Barnes, Marian  

Canine, John D.  
1996 *The Psychological Aspects of Death and Death*. Appleton & Lange, Stamford, CT.

Deetz, James  

Emling, Shelley  

Fulton, Robert  
1967 *A compilation of studies of attitudes toward Death, Funerals, and Funeral Directors*. University Press, MN.

Gmelch, George and Walter Zenner  

Habenstein and Lamers  

Hanson, Herb  
2007 Interview at Mount Scott Funeral Home.

Irion, Paul  
1966 *The Funeral: Vestige or Value?* Abingdon Press, Nashville, TN.

Kastenbaum, Robert  

Keister, Douglas  

Kubler-Ross, Elisabeth  

Laderman, Gary  

Marteeny, Dennis  
2007 Interview at Zeller Chapel of the Roses.

Mayer, Robert G.  
1996 *Embalming: History, Theory & Practice*. Appleton & Lange, Stamford, CT.

Quigley, Christine  

Ragon, Michel  
Turner, Victor

Westin, Chris Perkins
2007  Interview at River View Cemetery Funeral Home.
Molding the History of a Maritime Empire: The role of the thirteenth-century mosaics of San Marco in reforming the Venetian past

HEATHER MCCAMBLY
ANNE MCCLANAN, FACULTY MENTOR

The mosaics of the Venetian Church of San Marco embody how this empire used imagery for political and ecclesiastical purposes. The church of San Marco is recognized as a force which drew the island fragments of primitive Venice into a unified city and empire. In indirect yet unmistakable ways this basilica mirrored the city’s increasing self-confidence and power. These images were not merely decoration, but an independent argument in the nexus of Venetian spiritual and political power meant for all to see.¹ San Marco as the chapel to the Doge and thus, all of Venice, was shaped “not so much by impersonal and largely unconscious trends and sentiments but by the conscious will of the ruling caste, whose representatives wanted it to be the visible symbol and the programmatic embodiment of their ideas.”² In short, we place stock in the images of San Marco and how they reflect societal trends, values, and changes because Venetians put stock in what images were constructed or changed in this structure. It is in the mosaics of the thirteenth century, after the conquest of Constantinople in 1204 that there is a metamorphosis of intent due to societal and political factors that will be the focus of this investigation. The mosaics of the thirteenth century represent a departure from previous traditions due to a changing political position; the imagery is altered to create a new layer of Venetian myth, which utilizes unique medieval concepts of history, time, and the will of God, in

order to recreate Venetian history with roots in early Christianity and an even deeper sacred and ancient past.

This paper will examine the thirteenth-century mosaics by analyzing a variety of factors in the visual environment and the iconography of the mosaics themselves. First, I will examine briefly the nature medieval visuality and the previous architectural and artistic tradition within San Marco, moving then to analysis of the mosaics of the Old Testament cycle, the methods of transfer, and the model from which they were made. Next, I will explore the mosaics of the Cappella Zen and the South Transept as they pertain to the legend of Saint Mark. Last, I will present the historical context of the imagery in thirteenth-century Venice as well as the history of imitation and appropriation at San Marco. Finally, I will examine as a part of the historical context the medieval concept of time and history within the thirteenth-century environment, how it continues with and departs from prior traditions, and what this illustrates about the mosaics and the use of time and historical memory.

The first aspect which must be considered in this discussion is the role of imagery in the medieval context, a theme which must be established to lend legitimacy to the type of analysis presented in this paper. This factor plays a pivotal role in understanding the use of art or imagery in this culture, and asserts that imagery affects the medieval beholder and communal memory in a deep and legitimate manner. Without this assertion the argument that this imagery was used to mold the Venetian identity has no foundation. The fact that imagery and visual historical evidence be taken into account in our attempt to understand the ideas and images of cultures that are not predominantly linguistically trained has the “ring of an obvious truth or methodological necessity.” In order to analyze any culture, medieval or otherwise, it is necessary to identify the “media of the culture in which we work,” just as we would approach our own

3 Margaret Miles, Image as Insight, (Boston: Beacon Press, 1985), 15.
news and entertainment media to understand the beliefs, attitudes, and means of shaping modern American culture, so too must we find the equivalent in medieval culture. It is necessary to isolate the modes and content of public communication and the exchange of verbal or visual ideas, depending on the culture. In thirteenth-century Venice, no single center of media and communication can compare as far as importance, legitimacy, or even sheer exposure as the Basilica of San Marco.

In largely illiterate cultures such as the one in question, visuality was not the only means of communication, thus, other means such as sermons, extraliturgical drama and other sources auditorily available to audiences are often considered in medieval studies. In general, the images available in Christian communities, as the permanent and constantly available messages may be considered evidence of the messages that were likely received by other, auditory means. Images are a significant piece of the discourse in medieval Christian communities, and are more profound than the evidence of theological texts and simultaneously more superficial. They are more superficial in the sense that they were more available to historical people in the course of their daily lives, and could not, for obvious reasons, be as complex as a written theological argument. Images are more profound not in their complexity, but in their importance at the center of the life of the whole community.

The essential importance of visual imagery and art in medieval thinking as a form of media and communication, the widest form in medieval culture, is evident and dominant throughout all of the Middle Ages. Despite its consistency, the nature of visuality also changes, although not in importance, throughout the medieval era. A major change between earlier and later medieval visuality and art affects the shape of the mosaics of San Marco in the thirteenth

---

4 Miles, 28.
5 Miles, 28.
6 Miles, 29.
century, as well as the type of viewing which would have been expected of the beholder. The early medieval visual experience can be described as received by an individual and focused on an instantaneous and powerful effect.\(^7\) In contrast, the visual experience in the thirteenth century and later is more clearly structured by physical and metaphysical ideas; the glance of earlier medieval beholders had shifted to a prolonged gaze and interactive experience.\(^8\) Art may have responded to this change, or more probably, helped to shape it by presenting more fragmented, “seductive,” complex, or enlarged visions. Such images were not viewed with doubt, but required faith that such images represented divine truths, these were no longer the striking and symbolic images that acted only as cues for pre-existing memories of the early Middle Ages. Instead the thirteenth-century viewer was being challenged with imagery, such as that within San Marco, that took time, effort, and study. Within these images were truths that could shape a communal memory, or even the perceived history of a nation.\(^9\)

What these two arguments assert concerning San Marco is that these mosaics must be considered as not only important and intentional indicators of the attitudes and desires in Venice at this time, but that they were noticed, understood, and important to the thirteenth-century viewers as well. In studying these mosaics it is safe to say that the images were as important as spoken or written language in creating this history and sense of foundation.\(^10\) This accessibility, the profound and widely viewed nature of the mosaics in the political and religious center of a growing Empire, did not escape the notice of either the viewer or the designer behind the images. When we consider these images we must do as Otto Demus suggested, and not view them as decoration which are indirectly important, but as vehicles for mass communication and

\(^8\) Hahn, 169.
\(^9\) Hahn, 188.
\(^10\) Constable, 7.
for historiographic alteration, as intentional narratives or references that the designer knew would be contemplated and considered as factual by the viewers within the basilica. There was a degree of understanding, between the designer and the viewer, that the images presented in this venue were significant, that the early Christian references, the use of the *Cotton Genesis* model, the visual parallels and physical intersections between the Old and New Testament narratives and even the contemporary Venetian elements would not have gone unnoticed.

In early art historical study of Venice, it had been considered a “no-man’s land” between the Byzantine tradition in the east and the Latin west.\(^\text{11}\) This quality at first seemed to historians an area of difficulty. However, these multiple references are now understood as the intent of the designers to draw from Roman Empires, east and west, in spinning a purely Venetian multilayered history.\(^\text{12}\) Through many mediums, ranging from political to visual, the Venetians have created a myth of origin and existence that draws carefully on sources with a heritage useful to the Venetian image.\(^\text{13}\) In the words of Gasparo Contarini, a sixteenth-century apologist of the Venetian Republic, “Venice, he that doth not see thee doth not esteem thee.”\(^\text{14}\) This is an interesting way to frame the study of Venice as a visual culture, one that addresses in a set of images how this state used visual messages to manipulate and shape the social imagination.\(^\text{15}\)

In order to analyze this particular imagery we must first recognize the context of the church as a whole in order to grasp how this imagery functioned as a part of San Marco. The first San Marco (it is the third San Marco which now stands) was built, according to records, 

\(^{15}\) Rosand, “Venetia Figurata,” 177.
under the Doge Giustiniano Particiaco using stones from Equilo and Torcello.\textsuperscript{16} This reuse was not for economic reasons, but to incorporate important remains of the past from the \textit{terra firma} into this new sacred and political building. This first building was constructed based on the church of the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem.\textsuperscript{17} The later addition from 1063, which is the shape known today, is based on the Apostoleion, or the Church of Holy Apostles in Constantinople.\textsuperscript{18} This was a reference not only to the prestige of Byzantium, but also that this was the same architectural form that housed Luke the Evangelist in Constantinople and John the Evangelist buried at Ephesus.\textsuperscript{19} The designers behind these architectural and artistic references were transferring widespread, historical and holy symbols from established centers of world devotion and power to the emerging power of Venice.

These examples of appropriation illustrate that from the foundation, visual references were made by copying foreign models to appropriate a sense of history and prestige that the new empire did not possess.\textsuperscript{20} Similar to the architecture, the mosaics of the earlier areas of the church are marked by a strong Byzantine influence. There were two main waves of mosaic installation, the first in the main chamber of the interior between the eleventh and twelfth centuries, and the second in the thirteenth century in the atrium of the basilica after the sack of Constantinople in 1204.\textsuperscript{21} It is impossible to describe this extensive earlier cycle within the space of this paper, but it is possible to recognize the main attributes that contrast the later mosaics of interest (figure 1 and 2). The emphasis on Venetian themes shows that although San Marco was decorated in a Byzantine visual style, it was never using strictly Byzantine themes or iconography. The first and most apparent aspect of the interior was the mass of gold tesserae

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{16} Ettore Vio, ed. \textit{The Basilica of St. Mark in Venice}. (New York: Riverside Book Company, 1999), 35.
\item \textsuperscript{17} Vio, 36.
\item \textsuperscript{18} James McGregor, \textit{Venice from the Ground Up}. (London: Belknap P, 2006), 33.
\item \textsuperscript{19} McGregor, 34.
\end{itemize}
use that created a stark and abstract setting for the scenes of saints, angels, and narratives. These figures possess a strikingly Byzantine style, with traditional drapery patterns and postures instead of, the figures are iconic in their relative isolation within the backgrounds. These earlier mosaics covered most, if not all, of the important New Testament stories such as the life and passion of Christ, a cycle of the life of Mary, images of the saints and, most unique to San Marco, the life and translation of St. Mark. Making the imagery a reference to contemporary Byzantine art, not a reproduction of their art. In contrast, after the turn of the century the mosaics present a stark departure in meaning and form to these iconic images. This shift is imperative to understanding these thirteenth-century mosaics as a result of a change in the Venetian desire to use visual appropriation in a different manner.

The mosaics of the atrium of San Marco represent a continuous narrative of the Old Testament that holds within it many political, religious and typological references connected to the Venetian state. In some portions of the mosaics such as the Joseph cycle that spans three of the seven available bays within the atrium, references beyond Old Testament narrative seem to be blaringly apparent. In other areas such as the Creation Cupola the references are more subtle and seem to be limited to its strict reliance on the ancient model or the proto-renaissance style. This style is indicative of the wealth of Byzantine and early Christian spolia flooding Venice and specifically San Marco from the sack of Constantinople, as well as the desire to identify with the apostolic age. Overall the style of these mosaics is very inconsistent making it difficult but also unneeded to discuss them in any specific order, each bay or cupola represents a very specific style and level of emancipation from the model. Despite varying levels of symbolism

---

23 Demus, The Mosaics of San Marco, 3.
24 Vio, 88.
throughout the mosaics connecting Venice to an ancient past, there is a consistent presence, in all the mosaics, of meaning beyond basic narrative which signals the thirteenth-century Venetian desire to connect its comparatively shallow past with the apostolic age, and even the era of the Old Testament.

Not only were the visual references within this Old Testament cycle used to connect Venice to an ancient past, but the very basis for the mosaics, the model itself, offered value in the attempt of the designers to suggest ancient and holy origins. The very structure of San Marco was based on meaningful and ancient models, here, there is a new model chosen for the mosaics of the atrium, which went beyond former Byzantine models in favor of a manuscript which was most likely the *Cotton Genesis*, an early Christian manuscript.\(^{26}\) However, the determination of this book as a source is complicated by the fact that this manuscript was badly burned in 1731.\(^{27}\) There are some remaining images available for investigation but all are charred, shrunked or otherwise damaged significantly (figure 3). There are also a few surviving copies of *Cotton Genesis* images done prior to the fire which provide insight into its original appearance (figure 4).\(^{28}\) The use of this model has complex implications which affect what the mosaic was meant to communicate within this civic and religious context. This is not the first use of a manuscript miniature as a model, as it has a long history dating to antiquity, yet its use on such a large scale highlights the importance and innovation of this program.\(^{29}\) The iconography and origin of the model implies a further depth of meaning in the mosaic, and how the references and deviations are used illustrate how something uniquely of thirteenth-century Venetian meaning was made from this early Christian manuscript.

\(^{26}\) Weitzmann, “Illustrations in the Manuscript of the Septuagint,” 105.
\(^{27}\) Lowden, 40.
\(^{28}\) Kitzinger, 101.
\(^{29}\) Weitzmann, “Illustrations in the Manuscript of the Septuagint,” 106.
The Cotton Genesis has been recognized as a possible source for the Genesis Cycle since J.J. Tikkanen’s findings over a century ago, yet the use of the specific manuscript as a model has been a source of controversy among scholars. J.J. Tikkanen originally postulated that it was a close relative of the Cotton Genesis that was the model, and this tentative thesis was solidified in the studies of Weitzmann, Kessler and Demus. One scholar, John Lowden, in his analysis of the Cotton Genesis, in context to other early Christian manuscripts, insisted that this manuscript was an exception, not a norm, for early manuscripts, which may support the identification.30 He goes on to insist that the San Marco mosaics from this model are revealing about thirteenth-century taste rather then early Christian.31 This assertion, which may at first cast doubt on the use of this manuscript, does not suggest that the Cotton Genesis wasn’t the model for the mosaics; rather it suggests an expression of the tendency to update or exaggerate images to fit modern idioms.32

Some scholars have indicated that Weitzmann’s analysis in affirmation of the use of the Cotton Genesis, may have assumed the relationship and based his analysis on a supposition and not the evidence available.33 Kurt Weitzmann and Herbert Kessler explored the issue of the Cotton Genesis and San Marco extensively by studying the various manuscripts and works descended from the Cotton Genesis model, along with remnants from Cotton Genesis. These scholars concluded that every discrepancy from the Cotton Genesis found in the mosaics can be explained through the natural processes of translating miniatures to monumental decoration, or by changes required for translation to a thirteenth-century paradigm for iconographic purposes.34 In fact, areas of anomalous iconography in the mosaic coincide directly with scenes which had been missing in the Cotton Genesis, meaning the mosaicist had to create the scene sans

30 Lowden, 51.
31 Lowden, 42.
32 Kitzinger, 109.
33 Williamson, 14.
34 Weitzmann, “Illustrations in the Manuscript of the Septuagint,” 19.
model.\textsuperscript{35} They assert that “the differences between the manuscript that has survived and the mosaics dissolve when considering the overwhelming similarity of the two.”\textsuperscript{36}

Ernst Kitzinger weighs into the debate by citing the worth of this manuscript as a possible reason for the variations; it was so valuable that it would have stayed out of chaotic areas such as the worksite, meaning mosaicists worked from sketches of the model, to cartoons, to mosaic.\textsuperscript{37} Deviations from the model may be cited, but these appear to have been made so that these early models would be more typological in nature, an important aspect in this study of the Creation Cupola and thirteenth-century mosaics. Due to the extensive damage done to the manuscript, it is difficult to ever say conclusively that there may not have been a model similar to the \textit{Cotton Genesis} which could have been used. However, one can speculate that it is implausible that there was a manuscript of such great worth and rarity as the \textit{Cotton Genesis}, as available and useful to the Venetians at the beginning of the thirteenth century.\textsuperscript{38}

Furthermore, the origin and trail of ownership of the \textit{Cotton Genesis} is a disputed point as well. Deborah Howard asserts that this manuscript was most likely made in Alexandria at the end of the conversion period in the fifth or the beginning of the sixth century.\textsuperscript{39} This origination in Alexandria stands out, as St. Mark was the first Bishop of Alexandria, and the home of his relics until the theft by Venice.\textsuperscript{40} A questionable inscription inside the fly-leaf of the manuscript has led to discussion about whether it was brought directly to Venice from Alexandria through active trade relations in Egypt, or if it was part of the spolia taken from Constantinople in 1204.\textsuperscript{41} Either origination has worth to the Venetian identity as a model for these mosaics, either as a link to Byzantium or St. Mark, and a connection to early Christianity in either case. Yet the

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{tabular}{l}
\textsuperscript{35} Weitzmann, “The Place of Byzantine Manuscript Illumination,” 20. \\
\textsuperscript{36} Weitzmann, “Illustrations in the Manuscript of the Septuagint,” 19. \\
\textsuperscript{37} Kitzinger, 108. \\
\textsuperscript{38} Demus, \textit{The Mosaics of San Marco}, v. 2, 141. \\
\textsuperscript{39} Lowden, 49 and Howard, 80. \\
\textsuperscript{40} Howard, 80. \\
\textsuperscript{41} Weitzmann, “Illustrations in the Manuscript of the Septuagint,” 6.
\end{tabular}
\end{footnotesize}
prevalent allusion to Egypt may be viewed as an affirmation of Egyptian origin, seen in all four domes of the north wing of the atrium. The prominence of Egyptian settings, specifically those of Joseph inside the atrium, further emphasize the land of St. Mark and Christian justification of temporal power, especially in regions of scarce resources. A further benefit to this imagery is that Venice prided itself on management of scarce resources, a theme in much of San Marco. Through the use of this model, from an eastern, early Christian tradition, Venice was reaching beyond contemporary Byzantine reference, and attempting to create a civic identity tied to this piece of early Christian past.

Key in understanding the concepts concerning the use of this model is the manner in which these images were transferred, translated, and chosen to become part of the dome mosaic, which illuminates the intent of the imagery. Weitzmann indicated ten principles of transmission from the model to monumental. Due to the depth of these principles it is only possible to present a summary, yet even this is helpful in understanding the process and importance of the scenes in the atrium. Six of the principles are in some way connected to the use of space and seem to go hand in hand: “alteration of format,” “condensations,” “conflations,” “compositional changes,” “omissions,” and “selectivity.” Although, omissions could be made for iconographic purposes, it was often an issue of space. The Cotton Genesis had around 500 original illustrations, while the mosaics originally presented 113 scenes from this manuscript, thus only scenes of utmost importance to the main stories had priority, as did those with symbolic meaning to the site such as ties to Egypt or other determining factors. These are attempts to utilize space, either by combining scenes to include all important imagery while

---

42 Howard, 103.
43 Howard, 81.
44 Howard, 103.
46 Weitzmann, The Place of Book Illumination in Byzantium, 18.
maintaining visual cohesiveness, or by rearranging parts of a composition to define and centralize the scene. Also, the scenes in the Cotton Genesis were flexible in height but were fixed in width, while the frieze-like mosaics had flexible width and fixed height. This combined with needs to economize free space and omit unneeded or difficult to fit details account for these principles.47

In contrast to the previous principles, the “additions” principle is not concerned with issues of space, and is much rarer. In very few instances were whole scenes added from outside the model.48 The two principles of “iconographic changes” and “stylistic changes” are very important to the art historical study of the San Marco mosaics. Other principles offer understanding of the basic transmission of a miniature image to a large scale, while these two principles highlight the updating of style for political purposes. These indicate that although the use of this model in the mosaics had iconographic benefits in itself, providing a sense of ancient connection, changes were also made to enhance the meaning of these images. The first blatant example of iconographic change is made in the scene of the Judgment of Adam and Eve, which has been put into a composition not developed until the Middle Byzantine period for scenes of the Last Judgment. This was the first of many drastic changes, as the designer became more accustomed to using and changing the model to fit thirteenth-century Venetian trends or political desires. Most of the changes made to the iconography, like this, were made to enhance the Venetian relevance, typological or similar elements in the mosaics.

The use of typology began in the time of the Cotton Genesis and was present in the miniatures, and the exaggeration of these themes, was fitting to San Marco’s use of historical connections that had begun prior to the thirteenth century. The final principle of change is that of the “process of transmission from one medium into another,” which summarizes Kitzinger’s

assertion above that a manuscript of this cost would have hardly been present on scaffolding.\footnote{Weitzmann, 108.}

Thus the transmission from miniature, to sketch, to wall by itself could cause a series of changes.\footnote{Weitzmann, “Illustrations in the Manuscript of the Septuagint,” 18.} Overall these principles serve to enhance our understanding of how a model such as the \emph{Cotton Genesis} could be used and offer a richer meaning because of the origin of the images, without absolute adherence to the images within the model. The use of the \emph{Cotton Genesis} offered worth as an Egyptian and early Christian manuscript, and was molded to not only fit the space but further enhance thirteenth-century Venetian needs, as in the inclusion of the Moses narrative, the Egyptian emphasis, and other such changes to better communicate the intended concept concerning Venetian destiny.

Previous to the thirteenth-century developments which affected the imagery at San Marco, and brought about the shift in imagery, the elasticity of Venetian culture can be seen in the transition to identifying St. Mark as patron saint. Formerly it was St. Theodore who was the patron saint of Venice, a Byzantine warrior saint.\footnote{Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 58.} It was neither chance nor the stolen relics of St Mark that began his reign as patron to Venice, but rather the traces he left behind during his possible ministry in the nearby city of Aquilea.\footnote{Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 55.} Venice lacked the important Roman origins shared by most other powerful Italian cities, and the \emph{furta sacra} of Mark’s relics was designed to compensate for this historical deficiency.\footnote{Dale, “Stolen Property,” 105.} This theft was similar to the sacking of Constantinople and the stolen relics of the true cross, various imperial spolia and possibly the \emph{Cotton Genesis}, all of which laid a Venetian claim to Constantinople’s cultural heritage. The ability to claim a connection to Mark was an ecclesiastical foundation, independent from that of Rome,
which could only be accomplished through a direct connection with the apostolic age. It was a status which Alexandria held due to St. Mark’s history, and which the Bishop of Aquilea vied for in order to claim both independence as well as jurisdiction over all of northeast Italy. Venice, after a time of struggle for power with Aquilea, asserted its victory through the acquisition of the relics as well as use of images, which were as powerful, if not more so, then written propaganda in this culture. These relics and images, as well as the creation of myth, turn this Egyptian apostle and founder of the Aquilean church into the most visible symbol of the Venetian church and state. Later, in the era of the Creation Cupola this story of translation to Venice changes to one of predestination, just as Byzantine reference is discarded in favor of early Christian, so is the claim to St. Mark’s legacy.

Both chronologically and in narrative order the first mosaic scene is the Creation Cupola. This is the earliest of the mosaics to be discussed in this paper, and in contrast to iconography in other areas of the atrium or in the narratives concerning St Mark, it appears to lack importance due to the absence of any substantial Venetian references in terms of the iconography. Yet, the importance of this dome, when studying the rest of the thirteenth century, stands in the fact that it is part of an evolution in thirteenth-century representations. The model itself, which will be discussed further, has significant meaning in the connections being forged between contemporary Venice, St Mark, and even the Old Testament, as a manuscript of the Old Testament, of early Christian creation, with ties to both Byzantium and to Alexandria, the home of St Mark. In the period of the installation of the Creation cupola there is a much stricter adherence to the model then in later mosaics where the model is used, yet often used with more liberty to make more clearly Venetian references. Even so, here in the dome most adherent to

---

55 Geary, 130.
the model there are clear changes made to the manuscript model in favor of images which invoked clear typological connection, and this unique Christian understanding of time and history. It is this deviation from the model in the first dome of the atrium which sets the stage for the manner in which time or history was used and understood in order to illuminate the changes made in later atrium mosaics as well as the narratives of St Mark elsewhere in the basilica which place the status and events of contemporary Venice in an ongoing Christian or biblical history. Just as events at the creation of the world could foreshadow later biblical and New Testament events, so too could events in the Old Testament foreshadow the fate and role of Venice in the thirteenth century.

The Creation dome (figure 5) covers the events from the Creation of the World to the Expulsion of Adam and Eve, or the first three chapters of Genesis.\(^57\) In three concentric strips, the frames of the miniatures were eliminated resulting in a continuous and often overlapping flow of scenes, which are horizontally separated by writing, a very rare configuration.\(^58\) The sequence begins around an ornamental disc in the middle of a gold ground and moves downwards. The first ring of mosaic is of the five scenes beginning with the *Spirit above the Water* to the *Creation of the Plants*. The second ring of eight scenes begins just under the first scene of the first ring, representing the *Creation of the Firmament* up to the *Introduction of Adam into Paradise*. The third frieze, with no less then twelve scenes, some being conflated or combined, begins with the *Naming of the Animals* and ends with the *Expulsion*, with the four cherubim in red and blue on all sides in the pendentives.\(^59\) Outside the entire dome runs an inscription which refers to the

---

58 Demus, "Venetian Mosaics and Their Byzantine Sources," 145.
cherubim in the pendentives that may represent the cherubim stationed outside of paradise to guard the Tree of Life, all four of which retain their original color scheme of red and blue.  

It is probable that the atrium program was planned all at once and not in the more improvisational nature of other earlier mosaics. There are also indications that this dome was made from the central medallion down the sides of the dome, with gold being laid in concentric circles in between figures and landscapes. Additionally, an aspect of departure from previous mosaics is in the arrangement of the scenes, the three friezes contrast to the normal treatment used since antiquity, a single circular sequence of images near the base of the dome. The detailed nature presents an overwhelming wealth of images; the most densely packed of all the domes in the atrium, which expands on many scenes that are often compressed in previous visual imagery. In these compact scenes the use of landscape, architecture, complex forms, layers, and modeling, or even purposefully archaic clumsiness, are much more prominent then in earlier mosaics, just as the array of colors in atrium mosaics had increased. This increase in color was possibly from an influx of materials from Constantinople, and from a desire to follow the narrative and complex nature of the early Christian model. There was an overall decorative wealth of shape and color, as seen in the *Creation of the Birds and Marine Creatures* (figure 6), which retained a rich use of gold without the previously dominating quality.

In the first scene of the cupola, the *Spirit above the Waters* (figure 7), the spirit is represented by the dove with spread wings. The dove, which is a symbol of the Holy Spirit, is out of place in this Old Testament scene. This is just the first of many Christian elements which

---

60 Demus, *The Mosaics of San Marco*, v. 2, 76.
64 Demus, *The Mosaics of San Marco*, v. 1, 169.
suggest the typological manner, in which the Bible in the Middle Ages was often interpreted, especially in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, as a living connection which could be fostered through a visual environment.\(^{67}\) The disc behind the dove has the form of an aureole, in three concentric circles that invokes the three circles of the dome, symbolic of the Trinity.\(^{68}\) The next scene of the \textit{Separation of Light from Darkness} (figure 8) introduces another Christian image, that of Christ-Logos as Creator (figure 9), with a golden halo overlapped by a silver cross holding a staff with a mounted cross.\(^{69}\) Light is represented in red and darkness in blue, important color imagery throughout the dome, which is a foreshadowing of the fall and redemption to come.\(^{70}\) The angel present at the separation is caste partly in darkness, actually changing colors to blue. This suggests that the battle between good and evil that began with the separation of the good and fallen angels began on the first day of Creation and was allowed by God for the creation of free will.\(^{71}\)

Within the discs of light and darkness we can make out three rings once again, a reference to the Trinity, and six rays coming out corresponding to the number of active days in creation.\(^{72}\) The color symbolism continues throughout the dome and represents its reflective nature, each ring predicting the others, the fall of Adam and Eve and the redemption of the New Testament. As an example of this predictive nature we see the \textit{Creation of the Plants}, the \textit{Admonition of Adam}, and the \textit{Expulsion} all lined up and seeming to point to one another.\(^{73}\) This shows how each image, although made from a model, was subtly changed and placed to suggest an interpretation popular in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. This interpretation is of

\(^{67}\) Giles Constable, \textit{Culture and Spirituality in Medieval Europe}, (Variorum, 1996), 51.

\(^{68}\) Demus, \textit{The Mosaics of San Marco}, v. 2, 77.

\(^{69}\) Weitzmann, \textit{The Mosaics of San Marco}, v. 2, 37.


\(^{71}\) Howell, 17.

\(^{72}\) Demus, \textit{The Mosaics of San Marco}, v. 2, 77.

\(^{73}\) Howell, 26.
antitypes in the Old Testament as points of proof that the Old Testament was made as a precursor to the New, and to assert the divine wisdom of God.74

Moving to the scene of the Creation of the Plants, we are given one of the best links in this image to its model, the Cotton Genesis which will be discussed below, through the surviving drawings of the Third Day of Creation. The connection between the two is clear the only changes are due to issues of space, and clarification.75 In addition to establishing similarity, these drawings provide a basis for exploring the changes made. Although iconographically similar, the format is drastically changed due to space limitations. These changes include a reduction of the number of trees in order to clarify the trees of most importance (the Trees of Life and Knowledge). The Tree of Knowledge is often shown in blue in the mosaics, an iconographic change to emphasize the color symbolism in the dome. In this scene we can also decipher a greater concern with reality in the mosaic than in the Cotton Genesis through striation lines in the garments of Christ that have changed to a natural rendering of folds. To an opposite effect, the mosaicists did not incorporate the colorful atmospheric setting which was part of the antique tradition of the Cotton Genesis, in favor of a Byzantine gold background, a method used to depict a sense of the divine. Until the Naming of the Animals (figure 10), a scene which is also representative of a search for Adam’s mate, we continue to see the use of a surreal and holy golden background, which afterwards changes to a more mundane vision of earthly foliage. This suggests that although the mosaicists used an identifiable model, they were also manipulating the images subtly away from the model and Byzantine reference in order to communicate ideals of typological reference.

---

75 Kitzinger, 101.
In the second ring of mosaic there is a dynamic scene of the *Creation of the Birds and Marine Creatures* in which the antique origin of the *Cotton Genesis* is evident. This specific emphasis may also suggest the interest of the Venetians in their marine surroundings. In the next scene of the *Forming of Adam* and the *Animation of Adam* (figures 11 and 12), a two-stage creation which has been connected to Roman tradition, has changed from the *Cotton Genesis* which used a four-stage depiction. This decrease may have been to enhance the meaning behind the most important scenes: the creation of his body and the gift of his soul or animation. One of the most important aspects of difference in the mosaic is introduced here, that of the enthroned creator, which was not an aspect of the original *Cotton Genesis*. This intentional addition of the creator enthroned is part of an emphasized them of a powerful and infallible God, this counteracts the theme in the “J text” of the Bible which represents the creator as unaware and out of control of his creation. The images in this dome and in much of the atrium assert the intent of God in biblical and historical events, the presence of the throne, and many other images in this dome, hints at this prophetic and infallible nature.

In the first scene of the third ring it is apparent that this creator has not lost his power to his creation as is indicated in the “J text” of the Bible. Instead, he has delegated it, as seen in the *Naming of the Animals*, where the Creator, now seated in his throne (not a part of the model), uses the speaking gesture of the right hand to encourage the man to prove his superiority by naming the animals. Adam gestures in the same right handed manner, by placing a hand on the lion, king of animals and sign of St. Mark. As discussed previously, this is the scene where the new setting begins, no longer the holy gold setting but a more realistic landscape, a transition to

---

77 Demus, *The Mosaics of San Marco*, v. 2, 111.
78 Howell, 23.
79 Howell, 38.
the fall from grace that would result from the creation of Eve. The animals here are more combined than in the *Cotton Genesis*, appearing almost as single two-headed beasts, a feature which may be used to highlight the difference of Adam, a single rational being without a mate. The separation of Adam’s mate may result in an effect similar to the separation of darkness from the light, the creation of evil.

As the fateful figure of Eve enters this story many deviations are made from the model to predict the evil to come. The scene of the *Creation of Eve* (figure 13) is in two parts, the *Taking of the Rib* and the *Forming of Eve*, the first occurrence of a two-scene frame. There are many complex elements to the iconography and symbolism of this and many scenes that cannot be explored in full depth. Some major changes may be investigated, including the inversion of the scene from the *Cotton Genesis*, where Adam appears to the left of the Creator in the scene, and the Creator is shown in profile, which is a sign of evil in medieval iconography. Furthermore, a rib from the left side, or evil side, is taken and a tree is seen sprouting from Adam’s wound. This is a common aspect of this scene and the suggestion that the perfection of paradise is tainted by the creation of Eve. The sleep of Adam, which seems to have antique origin in the sleep of Endymion, is suspect as well, as sleep in medieval thought was a sign of a suspension of rational thought in favor of sensual motivation. The looming blue tree of Knowledge is present in the forming of Eve, just as the Tree of Life was present in Adam’s formation, a sign of this separation of opposites, evil out of good. In the formation of Eve, the Creator is shown with his hand on her wrist and a finger pointing down to her pudendum, when in the formation of Adam he points to his head. This asserts Eve’s carnality, as does the omission of her animation, and

---

81 Howell, 29.
83 Howell, 32.
84 Howell, 33.
85 Howell, 33.
her eventual downfall due to her sin. This also signals that God had foreseen, even as he made her, that “Eve bore history within her womb” as postulated by St Augustine.86

After Eve’s creation in the Introduction of Adam and Eve (figure 14) there is a reversal of Adam’s position from the Naming of the Animals. He is now for the first time at the picture’s left, an ill omen.87 Also, in the touching of Eve’s shoulders similar to the touching of the Lion’s head, we see a connection with thirteenth-century palpable gestures, and concern for realism.88 As the imagery is investigated Lowden’s assertion becomes evident, that this dome is as much a reflection of the thirteenth century as it is the Cotton Genesis.89 In the scenes of the Temptation of Eve, Eve Plucking the Fruit and Giving It to Adam, and the Denial of Guilt (figure 15), there are many consistencies with the Cotton Genesis, including the use of the fig as the Tree of Knowledge. Yet, there are also major departures from the Cotton Genesis, including the use of the enthroned Creator and the omission of the serpent in the Denial of Guilt. These two changes seem to leave the blame on Eve and Eve alone, while reinforcing the consistent omniscience of the Creator.90

Again in the Giving of Fruit to Adam, Eve stands in the position of the Creator, but in profile signaling great evil.91

After the couple is aware of their nakedness and has been found by their Creator, in the Judgment of Adam and Eve (figure 16), there is a complete reconfiguration of the Cotton Genesis scene to a Last Judgment composition as discussed.92 In this scene, a reference is made beyond the judgment of these two people referring to the judgment of all humanity, a conflation of time and narrative to depict a typological reference. Finally, in the Expulsion (figure 17), the Tree of

86 Howell, 40.
87 Howell, 44.
89 John Lowden, "Concerning the Cotton Genesis and Other Illustrated Manuscripts of Genesis," Gesta 31.1 (1992), 42.
91 Howell, 48.
Life with the cross protruding from it stands behind the Creator in Paradise. This may be of specific importance due to recent acquisition of the true cross by Venice. Along with the tree are two red phoenixes, a reference to Christ and the red or light left behind the flaming sword of the cherubim directed to guard paradise. Adam and Eve are shown erect and gesturing with left hands towards their new land, Eve is the most emphatic, gesturing to Adam at this new world that the medieval viewers associated with her. She uses the same gestures as the Creator when he introduced Adam into Paradise. God pushes on their backs, down and to the picture’s left, out of the gates in a composition similar to a scene of the Damned entering the Mouth of Hell in medieval compositions.

Once the couple has entered the earthly realm, they face their punishments in the scene of the *Labors of Adam and Eve* (figure, 18). In this scene Adam meets his punishment of death and toil on the land, and Eve meets hers, child labor, submission and desire for her husband. Although Adam is shown in backbreaking labor, Eve is represented in a throne-like seat wearing a blue fillet and blue belt around her waist, daringly voluptuous compared to her prior mundane curves in paradise, her distaff like a scepter, the Queen of the earthly realm, a complete reworking from the model. Her majesty reminds the viewer of a queen to come: the Virgin Mary. This Mariological reference is similar to the references in medieval art, and in the book of Romans, of Christ as the new Adam. The woman who closed the door to paradise would, through her cursed womb, make way for the woman who could open that door again. Here ends the narrative of the Creation Dome with the most recognized, but not only, typological

---

93 Howell, 56.
94 Howell, 57.
95 Genesis, 3:16-19
96 Howell, 58.
97 Romans, 5:14.
98 Jensen, 44.
reference which highlights a uniquely Christian sense of time and history particularly rich in the setting of San Marco.

There is a great wealth of imagery in this dome, yet the selected images present the general picture of what this dome was meant to communicate. The use of the Cotton Genesis had meaning in itself, but the thirteenth-century popular theology concerning the origin of evil, typology, and the nature of Eve were incorporated to present not only a historical image, but also one of purpose within the visual context of San Marco. I argue that the deviations or exaggerations from the Cotton Genesis model such as that of the first days of creation and the origin of evil, the use of color symbolism, character placement, and other areas are used not just to imply the origin of evil as in Eve, but are also used as a typological theology and a unique Christian view of history and time. Despite a reliance on the analysis of this dome by Penny Howell, my main contention does not merely concern the issue of the representation of women and the intended message of the evil of Eve as a sign of the current misogyny. This use of imagery and typology is only begun in the exaggerations and references here in the Creation Cupola, and continue with growing intensity and reference to Venice as the Old Testament cycle is developed and adjusted throughout the thirteenth century.

These mosaics display how the story of Adam and Eve, and understanding of the Old Testament had evolved from the time of the early Christian model. No longer was it seen as simple narrative, but as a reference to the fall and the redemption to come, similar to the predestination of Mark’s relics.99 From the first day of creation, signs of evil make themselves known, as did signs of the reversal with the coming of Christ. These are anagogical forms and can be seen in nearly every scene of the Creation Cupola as in the Trees of Life and Knowledge, the use of Christ as Creator, the presence of the Cross, imperial imagery, Christological or

Mariological references. In the end these references are used to bear witness to the presence of God’s wisdom and master plan even when it appears to be in a disaster of sin.\textsuperscript{100} What was once narrative in the Jewish tradition, and to an extent in earlier Christian traditions, has now become proof of God’s plan. The fact that these images are not based in the Old Testament text is of little concern to the Venetian mosaicists, as the distinction between the eras of past, present or future were very thin.\textsuperscript{101} To change the order of history, either religious or civic, especially for a higher cause was seen as not only acceptable but God-willed, as seen in the evolution of typological imagery in this cupola, and further emphasized in later images in the atrium as well as the Cappella Zen.

This imitation and deviation in the images of the Creation brings up many preliminary and fascinating questions about what sort of connections can be drawn from this use of “topoi,” or imbuing of meaning in all things through typology. An interesting connection, which will be explored further, are the changes made in the imagery of the narrative of St Mark in the Cappella Zen in the 1260’s.\textsuperscript{102} Not only could St. Mark’s relics, as a living entity, will themselves to a new home, but the story was refashioned to visually assert the \textit{predestinatio} legend.\textsuperscript{103} This is reminiscent of the way the Genesis cycle used imagery to assert that the New Testament occurrences were destined from the beginning, weakening Jewish and all other claims to the scriptures. This refashioning put stock not only in the common belief of the living nature of relics, but in the malleability of history and the use of typology to explain a holy past.\textsuperscript{104} The simultaneous installations of these mosaics seem indicative of the heightened desire for historical connection in this period. They were creating a sense of a destined path to greatness and a

\textsuperscript{100} Jensen, 52.
\textsuperscript{101} Constable, 50.
\textsuperscript{103} Maria Georgopoulou, ”Late Medieval Crete and Venice: an Appropriation of Byzantine Heritage.” \textit{The Art Bulletin} 77.1 (1995), 479.
\textsuperscript{104} Dale, “Stolen Property,” 212.
usurpation of the role of both Constantinople and Rome in their ecclesiastical and political power and independence.

As we examine the Creation Cupola and its place within San Marco, it is tempting to dismiss this set of mosaics in comparison to the blatant rewriting of history seen elsewhere in the church. Yet in the story of creation, fall, and expulsion, we are reminded that Venice is using a concept of time that was already a part of the Christian historical view. Begun in early Christianity with the typological references of the Cotton Genesis, and exaggerated in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, the Bible and holy past were seen as alive and able to shift to ecclesiastical or cultural needs. The notion that holy history, from stories to relics, lived and chose their fate hundreds of years later, is one that is not unique to San Marco, nor is a careful management of history. Realignment of the past for civic or religious needs, which were often blurred, was a practice that through legend, prophecy and typology could be seen as God-willed events. Every aspect of imagery was used for propagandist purposes, as was the reference to early Christianity through the Cotton Genesis model; it abandoned Byzantine references, in favor of early Christian connections. Thus, a prominent shift has taken place in Venetian imagery in this period, from a desire to reference dominant political powers, to a desire to take ownership of their heritage. All facets, from the choice of the model to changes that enhanced the typological nature of the scenes, should be considered of relevance in understanding the desires and beliefs of the Venetians in the thirteenth century.

After the dense narrative of the Creation Cupola, and its use of thirteenth-century typological images, the images of the narrative of Cain and Abel are not only withdrawn from the riches of Paradise but withdrawn from the intense narrative and isolated on a gold ground. The narrative pace is allowed to slow in order to highlight the importance of the Election of
Abel.  

105 The narrative begins in the East Lunette of the South Bay, just below the Creation Cupola, and begins with the *Begetting of Cain* (figure 19), ending in the West Lunette of the South Bay with the *Curse of Cain* (figure 20). Just as in the Creation narrative there is a strong sense of doom to the narrative witnessed by the beholder, through the gestures and placement of Adam and Eve, and the scenes of the *Begetting of Cain* versus that of the *Birth of Abel* (figure 21), it is apparent even in infancy what the fate of these brothers will be.  

106 This narrative foreshadows its end of the disinheritance of the eldest son in favor of the younger brother, a theme in this Old Testament cycle, shown in the *Curse of Cain* (figure 22), and further in the *Murder of Abel*. This aspect of the Old Testament cycle in San Marco, along with the Egyptian, Chosen People, and wise and just rule themes are varyingly bold and subtle but ever present, and suggest Venice and her people as part of this living narrative of the people of God. The *Sacrifices of Cain and Abel* are Eucharistic in representation and again signify the Christian understanding of time as a series of divinely appointed events which provide antitypes to types to come.  

107 This concept of typology is further emphasized in the narrative of Cain and Abel by the inscription which has been altered from the biblical text, it reads “Christ accepts Abel and rejects Cain.”  

108 Thus this acceptance of the worthier, younger brother is not only an Old Testament standard or convention but one of the Apostolic era being embraced by Venice at this time.

Continued in the Abraham cupola, the theme of the inheritance of the younger son, in the choice to omit typically Christological stories such as the Sacrifice of Isaac, in favor of emphasis on Abraham’s rejection of the Jews and joining the Gentiles as well as the choice of Isaac over Ishmael. This mosaic set is located in the Second Cupola, in the west wing of the

---

105 Dale, "Inventing a Sacred Past," 95.
106 Howell, 76.
atrium, and has, like many of these mosaics, experienced extensive restoration. The narrative begins with the Lord speaking to Abraham, in a manner which echoes the visions of the first Joseph Cupola and even Mark in the Cappella Zen, referring to a destiny in the future which would forsake eldest sons, or eldest cities in favor of the worthier choice. Despite beginning the narrative with the prophecy of the birth of the destined and chosen son of Abraham, Ishmael became the first born. The cupola ends with the Circumcision of Ishmael, followed by the Circumcision of all Men, with no sign of the promised son to come. Separated from this anti-Hebraic narrative of Abraham and Ishmael, come the scenes of Isaac in the lunettes.

In the East Lunette the scenes of Abraham Meeting the Angels, and the Hospitality of Abraham are depicted, these along with the images of the Birth and Circumcision of Isaac (figure 23) from the West Lunette fulfill the prophecies of God from the Dome. This unique approach to the story of Abraham concludes this chapter of the narrative, leaving out the main Christological scene mentioned previously, a rare and noticeable omission in this era of Old Testament "vogue." Just as the unusual focus on the Joseph narrative must be seen as an intentional decision based on the current needs and desires of the Venetian state, so too must this unique approach to the story of Abraham and his sons be seen as intentional and important to understanding the overall meaning and tone within this cycle and general works within this unique creative period.

Similar to the foreshadowing of Cain and Abel’s fate, as well as the inscription in the narrative of Christ’s acceptance and rejection, this scene is begun with the promise to Abraham concerning his younger son. In fact, a total of fifteen Genesis scenes were skipped in order to

---

present his prophecy at the beginning of the narrative. After many skipped scenes which highlight further the birth of Isaac, an inscription again associates the chosen, younger son, not with God the Father but with Christ, it reads “Abraham stands for Christ, who, after repudiating the Hebrew people, joined the Gentiles and became one with them.” This passage parallels St Paul’s interpretation of the two sons of Abraham in Galatians 4:21-31, where Ishmael and Isaac are seen as an allegory for the Jews, who are slaves to the Old Law, and the Gentiles who have become the new people of promise, similar to those given throughout this cycle signaling the promise of God’s will to the younger or worthier son.

Furthermore, the fate of Cain and Ishmael are further signs of God’s justice, justice pr the separation of good from evil, is a theme not only of San Marco but of Venice as a whole. Even in the prominent presence of the story of Noah’s drunkenness and the son who left his father naked versus the son who covered his father is a possible parallel to the justice which Venice saw in herself. It is important to assert that it would be inappropriate to see this theme of justice as a separate theme or entity from that of the typological references to the New Testament and modern Venice, or Zwei-Bruder theology. In essence the themes and beliefs held or created in this period concerning the role of Venice in this line of Christian history is attached to the notion of justice and the passing of inheritance to a worthy recipient. Venice is usurping the role of Mark’s Alexandria and the sacred past held within that city, as Alexandria had fallen into the hands of the Saracens by this time and was no longer deserving of the honor of Mark’s legacy. Just as Cain was unworthy due to his poor sacrifices, Ishmael was unworthy based on the unfaithfulness of Abraham to God’s promise in his conception, Ham beholding his father’s

112 Weitzmann, “The Illustrations in the Manuscripts of the Septuagint,” 125.
113 Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 95.
115 Howell, 84.
nakedness, or the unrighteousness of Joseph’s brothers, so too was Alexandria unworthy due to Venice’s predestination to hold the sacred legacy of the Evangelist, but also due to its neglect of the Christian faith and theoretically of Mark himself.¹¹⁷

These themes are actively connecting the current state of Venetian power and political decisions with biblical and Old Testament models, a method which contributed legitimacy to the state of thirteenth-century Venice. By connecting the fate of Venice in the thirteenth century with not only early Christianity, but with model and patterns of the Old Testament, the Venetians draw on a particular medieval concept of typology. Typology, although derived from a certain way of interpreting biblical events, was also a way of viewing the will of God in history, rulers, kings and nations were set in place intentionally, by God, thus God left traces of nature and intention throughout historical and biblical narratives. Although the events of the Old Testament were not believed to has led to the events of contemporary Venice, they were seen as intention precursors, and signs of God’s nature, just as events of the Old Testament did not all lead directly to the crucifixion and resurrection of Christ, they were seen as reflections which could legitimize and strengthen the claim of Christianity to the heritage of the Old Testament.

In these mosaics, despite variation of style over time, there are consistent themes in the narratives of Cain, Abel, and Abraham of justice, God’s divine will and predestination, and the inheritance of the younger son, which are consistent to the vast narrative of Joseph as well as the mosaics of the Cappella Zen in the South Vestibule. In addition to these larger themes, the anti-Hebraic tone in the Abraham Cupola supplements the meaning behind these narratives, which is emphasized by the auxiliary images to the narrative in the pendentives supporting the cupola.¹¹⁸

These inscriptions of the prophets of Isaiah and Ezekiel characterize the Jews as rebellious and fallen people whom God is going to turn from in favor of a new people of the promise instead

¹¹⁷ Geary, 93.
of a people of the law.\textsuperscript{119} This model parallels the rising prominence of Venice, not only as a
gentile nation, but as a rising Christian power, literally overtaking the roles held previously by
Rome and Byzantium. These themes along with the Christological inscriptions indicate a sense
of God’s will and justice consistently throughout the mosaics, the foreshadowing of evil, and the
triumph of a worthier brother. They complement the new history being forged for Venice in the
\textit{predestinatio} mosaic of the Cappella Zen, which mirrors these mosaics of the Old Testament.\textsuperscript{120}
There is a visual connection being made between the power and actions of Venice in acquiring
the relics, conquering Constantinople and other territories, to the biblical tradition of the
predestined inheritance of a worthier son. Hence the importance of the ties to Alexandria,
Venice was not disregarding the role of Egypt but using the images and legacies of it to claim an
inheritance, similar in a way to those seen in the atrium mosaics.

Despite the unique approaches and qualities to the Venetian mythogenesis, or mythic
foundation, Venice is not alone in history or even in Medieval Italy in attempts to legitimize
current institutions of church or politics through carefully constructed visual images or historical
record.\textsuperscript{121} One example of a parallel to the Old Testament mosaics of San Marco and how they
tie into contemporary developments involving the Venetian state and the translation of Mark’s
relics may be seen in the early thirteenth-century fresco program of the crypt in Anagni
Cathedral near Rome.\textsuperscript{122} In Venice the Old Testament cycle connects in various ideological and
physical ways to the Cappella Zen or façade mosaics, but in Anagni there is a direct physical
parallel within the church between the translation cycle and Old Testament cycle as they run
parallel, one above another. There is a similar thematic juxtaposition being drawn here in San
Marco, in not only the transfer of inheritance from one brother to another but also the journey

\begin{footnotes}
\item[120] Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 96.
\item[121] Pincus, “Venice and the Two Romes,” 109.
\item[122] Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 96.
\end{footnotes}
of the Chosen People into Egypt with Joseph and back out to the Promised Land led by Moses.123

Within the thirteenth-century mosaics of San Marco, one inescapable aspect is the prominence of the theme of Egypt and the life and story of Joseph. Of the seven cupolas of the atrium, three focus on the life of Joseph (figures 24, 25, 26), two of which focus solely on the events in Egypt. Otto Demus, in his analysis of this era in thirteenth-century Venice after the Fourth Crusade, has discussed the status of Venice as one similar to “a man without a shadow,” meaning a state with no history, or at least compared to the rest of the medieval world.124 He proposes that Venice’s solution to this issue was to “fake one.”125 Here in the emphasis on the Joseph mosaics, as with all mosaics of the atrium, we see the employment visual imagery to create a new communal understanding, or memory, of the origins and purpose of the Venetian state, the potency of this visual method of affecting history and memory “cannot be overstated.”126 We are then led to question in what manner the atrium mosaics as a whole are used to manipulate the concept of Venetian history and self-imaging. Laying claim to a sacred past was a powerful way to legitimize current civic institutions, something that was no doubt intended within San Marco as a representative of both church and state in Venice.127 What the iconography of the Joseph cupolas, and more importantly the sheer over-representation of these scenes within an Old Testament setting, imply is that St. Mark was destined for both his mission into Egypt and martyrdom in Alexandria, as well as his return to Venice. Venice is in a sense a “Promised Land,” and thus a predestined world power religiously, and as the emphasis on wise-rule implies, a temporal power as well. The mosaics of the Cappella Zen assert the divine will

behind the presence of Mark in Venice, while the mosaics of the Joseph cycle not only further emphasize this destiny but also reaffirm the role of the Venetian state and people, as the “Chosen People” of Mark, further legitimizing the power and purpose of the state while also providing a model for and highlighting the effectiveness of the Doge.

These mosaics were put in place beginning in the third quarter of the thirteenth century, a time which Demus recognizes as the height of this Venetian “proto-renaissance,” or time of reviving archaic, classical, styles for purposes of suggesting a new history. The Joseph narrative occupies three of the six cupolas in the north wing of the atrium. These Old Testament mosaics of the atrium represent the most consistently sustained effort in the direction of connecting with the apostolic age, specifically with the history and memory of St. Mark. Each bay in the Joseph narrative is its own entity, each with separate parts of the narrative, but also very separate styles, including a twenty to thirty year gap between the installation of the first cupola and the second and third cupolas.

The first cupola represents the youth of Joseph through being taken up to Egypt, beginning with Joseph’s Dream and ending with his Lament. The second bay represents Joseph’s troubled life in Egypt, recording his early career in Egypt, which begins with Joseph Sold to Potiphar (figure 27), and culminating in the North Apse in Pharaoh Making Joseph Governor of Egypt. Finally, in the third bay his triumph in Egypt is depicted, beginning with Joseph Gathering Corn (figure 28), and ending with Joseph Having Simeon Bound, showing scenes of his wisdom, clairvoyance and justice to his brothers. He is shown in this cupola in his new role as a leader, second only to the Pharaoh; this cupola is followed by the Moses Cupola and the Exodus of the Chosen People from Egypt.

129 Demus, The Mosaics of San Marco, 94.
The state of preservation of the bays vary, the best preservation being the third cupola, which despite being dirty with loose tiles appears to be completely original in both style and iconography.\textsuperscript{131} In the first and second cupola, Demus asserts that although poor preservation has at times changed the originality of the style, the general iconography and content is trustworthy and is most important to the arguments concerning the intent of the mosaics within San Marco.\textsuperscript{132} Each narrative begins in the east axis, the first and second cupolas begin with white lines, and the third has no indicator of the beginning.\textsuperscript{133} The style and content varies, the color palettes change between each cupola, and the colors vary significantly as do the sizes of the patches of color. The central medallions vary in size and decoration between each cupola, the size of the figures, the use of gold, the use of inscription, and the quantity and nature of the architectural settings vary between all cupolas. We will discuss here examples of iconography and the changing nature of the content as they pertain to the overall intent of the mosaics as a set. Yet it is not necessary to analyze each scene or element of style, as much of the style change is connected not to changing ideals or changing artist groups or even designers, but a progression of style as the ability to translate miniature to monumental becomes more developed.\textsuperscript{134}

The mosaics of the Joseph cupola despite their variation do seem to be more “readable” than previous mosaics groups such as the Abraham cupola. The figures are larger, descriptive text is larger and more reduced, scenes are more clearly delineated, and overall there is a feeling of the instructive and moral value that Joseph narratives often held in the thirteenth century.\textsuperscript{135} The figures have taken on a much more classical and less awkwardly archaic appearance in comparison to the Abraham mosaics, with more lyrical movements and psychologically

\textsuperscript{131} Demus, The Mosaics of San Marco, v. 2, 165.
\textsuperscript{132} Demus, The Mosaics of San Marco, v.2, 155.
\textsuperscript{133} Demus, The Mosaics of San Marco, v.2, 166.
\textsuperscript{134} Demus, The Mosaics of San Marco, v. 2, 156.
\textsuperscript{135} Demus, “The Mosaics of San Marco,” v. 2, 156.
influenced compositions making it tempting to speculate a new artist or designer is at work in some or all of these bays, however, this speculation is unnecessary as these are more signs of the constant progression towards a more sober style from that of the Creation Cupola. This seems to be the last step in this progression as the designer emancipated the style of the mosaics from the style of the Cotton Genesis model towards tendencies of the period while using the general content and iconography of the Cotton Genesis. This continuity is supported in the mosaics of the prophets in the pendentives of the Abraham bay and those in the Joseph bays. 136

Scholars have focused on different aspects of the Joseph mosaics, although few appear to be contrary to one another. I will discuss here a few of the important theories and implications of these theories pertaining to the meaning and importance of the impressive status given Joseph in the atrium of San Marco. Thomas E.A. Dale has presented his rich analysis of the Joseph mosaics in his frequently cited article “Inventing a Sacred Past: Pictorial Narratives of St. Mark the Evangelist in Aquilea and Venice.” Another scholar which I will explore is Deborah Howard in her recent work “Venice and the East,” in which she highlights the importance of the Eastern world beyond Byzantium on not only San Marco but Venice as a whole. 137 Finally, I will discuss the thesis of Jennifer Williamson of Washington State University whose complex thesis synthesizes some of the hypotheses of Demus and Dale, as well as adding research which suggests additional themes in the Joseph mosaics.

Thomas E.A. Dale in his research on the narratives of St Mark in both Aquilea and Venice investigated how visual imagery, often together with other political, literary or historical chronicles, changed over time to suit the needs of either Aquilea or Venice concerning the legend of St. Mark. As mentioned previously, Dale concludes that in the shaping of narrative in

136 Demus, “The Mosaics of San Marco,” v. 2, 156.
137 Dale, Thomas A. “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 100.
this period the Old Testament mosaics play a significant role, especially those of the narrative of Joseph. These new pictorial narratives, including the predestinatio legend in the Cappella Zen, are forging closer links directly to the evangelist hedging out Aquilea and other factors which negate the divine connection between Venice and St Mark. 138 Dale focuses on three aspects: the theme of the inheritance of the younger son, the emphasis on the Egyptian Sojourn, and the role of Joseph as Chosen Ruler. These themes are part of the effort to advertise the possession of the Cotton Genesis, a manuscript from Mark’s Alexandria, but this alone cannot explain the shape of this program and specific emphasis on Joseph. 139 Venice is identifying itself as the “younger brother,” who will receive the transferred inheritance of the older, and the prominence of this type of narrative, emphasizes this.

The story of Joseph, like the predestinatio in the Cappella Zen and the Abraham Cupola, begins with a dream or vision by which Joseph learns of his destiny. 140 The story concludes not with the last Joseph Cupola, but with the story of Moses. The narrative of Moses is not included in the Cotton Genesis, but inserted in this cycle in order to strengthen the allusion to the history of the Chosen People by ending with the Exodus from Egypt to the Promised Land. This parallels how St Mark’s relics were destined for Egypt, only so they could be brought out to the “Promised Land” of Venice, to the home of the new “Chosen People.” 141 The Egyptian emphasis and importance on the inheritance of the younger son seem to be connected in intention, in order to highlight the importance of Egypt to St Mark and thus Venice. They also serve to emphasize the story of the Exodus of the Chosen People to the Promised Land, which draws attention to the transfer of this pattern in the translation of Mark’s power to a “younger brother,” or Venice, in the exodus of Mark to the land of the Venetians.

139 Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 95.
The last theme Dale discusses concerns the connection between Joseph and the temporal power of Venice, specifically that of the Doge. Since the fourth century, Joseph has been praised as a model of good government in the church, and beginning in the sixth century, during the reign of Theoderic, has been praised as a model due to his clairvoyance, wisdom, and providence. The focus on Joseph as a model to the Doge is furthered by the references to good leadership in this branch of the atrium through the depiction of the virtues Justice, Charity, and Hope, as well as the prophets and saints which will be discussed further in the research of Williamson. These three virtues are discussed in an inscription in the Cappella San Clemente, which is directed to the Doge, and are embodied throughout the space of the Joseph narrative.142

Beyond the discussion of the imagery and themes within the Joseph mosaics, there is the element of the placement of this specific narrative of the Chosen People. At the northwest corner of the atrium, there is an intersection of the Joseph cycle and the translation cycle of Mark’s relics. An interesting intersection in itself, yet at the point where these two meet there is a depiction of the Doge as custodian of Mark’s relics (figure 29). The imagery of the contemporary power of the Doge is connected with both the translation of Mark’s power from Egypt to Venice, as well as the depiction of the narrative of the Chosen People, an antitype to the Venetian destiny. The very power of the Doge, and thus Venice, comes from his possession of the relics and this sacred history of Mark, as is depicted again in the Porta di Sant’Alipio.143 The Porta di Sant’Alipio is located directly behind this portal, the narrative of the Chosen People, the just rule of Joseph, and the Exodus to the Promised Land, which seems to signify a prophecy of the foundation of Venice as the “Chosen People” of St Mark following the

143 Dale “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 98.
translation of his relics from Alexandria. This connection between the Doge, modern Venice, the Apostolic Age, and the Old Testament not only represents a theme of predestination, but a living connection with the present. This is a piece Biblical history living in modern Venice, as the cycle of the atrium connects with the predestinatio in the Cappella Zen, which is prefaced by the mosaics of the façade and the welcoming of Mark’s relics. The mission of Mark was foreshadowed by the patriarchs of the Old Testament, prophesied by Mark’s vision in the predestinatio, and fulfilled in the rededication of the city to Mark upon the arrival of his relics.

Venice in the thirteenth century was presenting a special place for herself within the scheme of salvation, a predestined power and people, which is more difficult to examine or solidly analyze then the previous quasi-legal twelfth-century proofs concerning Aquilea. The impetus for this shift in interpretation came from the conquest of Constantinople in 1204 and the subsequent occupation of the Eastern Empire until 1261. This divinely sanctioned destiny asserted by the pictorial narratives did not stand alone but was contemporary with the Venetian chronicles of Martino da Canal as well as the fragmentary chronicle of Marco from 1290, both of which redefined Venetian history, and include the legend of the predestinatio. These writings were meant, like the mosaics, to bolster Venetian pretensions to world power following its assumptions of control over portions of the Byzantine Empire. This was a ground-breaking time for Venetian historiography when the city’s recent past was being placed into a broader context of sacred history.

Deborah Howard’s interpretations may enrich the arguments of Dale concerning the importance of Egypt in these cycles. Howard notes that not only is the theme of Egypt

---

144 Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 98.
147 Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 100.
149 Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 100.
overrepresented, but other elements important to the typological symbolism typically present in Old Testament cycles such as the story of Isaac or that of Jacob are omitted. The importance of Egypt and the justification of temporal power are emphasized on the exterior of the north atrium as well, in the relief of Alexander the Great, founder of Alexandria and the ruler of an enormous empire, Alexander may be intended as an image of temporal power with specific reference to Alexandria. The legend of the death of Alexander, and the return of his body to its rightful resting place by divine powers is similar to that of Mark and fits well with this theme of typological representation. This offered an image of classical analogy for the fate of Mark’s relics as well as an image of the state, an image from the very location that the relics, which are the source of the Doge’s power. Howard goes on to discuss the importance of the model, the Cotton Genesis, and its Alexandrian origin which whether true or mythical give this set of images a poignant relevance. Some scholars, including Hugo Buchtal postulate that this book may have even been brought directly from Alexandria giving it further significance.

Overall, Howard sees the emphasis on Egypt as well as the Joseph narrative as directly connected to the temporal power of Venice and the Doge. The connection between Alexander, Joseph, and Mark made in San Marco would not have gone unnoticed by viewers, according to Howard, and this created a connection between the sacred power granted Venice by the relics of Mark, the tradition of the wise and just leadership of Joseph, and the destiny of Mark to come out of Egypt to reside with the new Chosen People. The importance and connection held between Egypt and the Doge were not merely through Mark’s relics, but also through the example of Joseph, both may be seen as powerful and influential states which must

---

151 Howard, 80.
152 Howard, 80.
153 Howard, 81.
154 Howard, 80.
155 Howard, 81.
mindfully manage scarce and inconsistent resources, an ability which the Doge’s success relied heavily on. Also, through the biblical inscriptions in the mosaics about Joseph’s power in Alexandria, a connection between Joseph and Mark is forged, as Mark inherited the role of Joseph, making Joseph a prototype of the first Alexandrian Bishop. This may arguably create a composite image for the Venetian Doge, between the wise and just temporal rule of Joseph and the holy leadership of St Mark.

Beyond representing images of a good ruler, these mosaics may also evoke a set of memories, either personal or retold, of this distant land and mythical origin of Venetian power. We see in these mosaics as noted by Demus, that the Cotton Genesis model is embellished to include more vivid settings and architectural backgrounds which create an Egyptian or foreign reality. There are numerous examples ranging from the colorful and airy pavilions in the scene of the Temptation by Potiphar’s Wife, or the exotic and eclectic skylines surrounding the enthroned Pharaoh beneath a cusped arch, or the pyramid-like granaries which were once cones in the Cotton Genesis. Even the inscriptions seem to be simplified to a point where even the barely literate could identify the foreign and Egyptian origin of these landscapes. Howard mentions a final twist to her discussion in the labeling of the Midianites bringing Joseph to Egypt as merchants linking the event to traders, commercial power, and in a sense to Venice.

The investigations of Jennifer Williamson focus again on the importance of Joseph as a model for the Doge, but also how auxiliary images such as Virtues, Saints, and Prophets emphasize these themes, and how the particular Doge, Doge Lorenzo Tiepolo, in power may

---

156 Howard, 80.
157 Howard, 81.
158 Howard, 81.
have imbued personal meaning into these mosaics.\textsuperscript{159} Williamson illuminates further the previous uses of Joseph in art, as a figure of a model leader, as seen on the throne of Maximian, or at times as a Christological figure.\textsuperscript{160} Previous to the mosaics of San Marco an example of a direct connection between a leader and Joseph can be seen in the Royal Monastery at Sopocani which connects their Prince directly to an image of Joseph.\textsuperscript{161} This connection is similar, according to Williamson, to the connection drawn in the Joseph mosaics to Doge Lorenzo Tiepolo and his role in the grain famine of 1268.

Aside from this specific connection made between Joseph and this particular Doge, the strongest emphasis remains on a general message of a wise and just example of temporal rule.\textsuperscript{162} Many elements echo the history of Venice in general, including the parallel between Joseph’s destiny to rule in his vision at the beginning of the cycle as it corresponds to the destiny of Venice to hold the sacred power of St Mark in his visions in the Cappella Zen. There is also an overrepresentation within the cycle of his just behavior and decisions including his binding of his brethren, where other examples of this narrative skip these scenes entirely.\textsuperscript{163} Also, the images concerning grain, an important concern to the Venetians, are not highlighted for its profit as Joseph sells the grain to the Egyptians, but instead focuses on his foresight and wise rule to have provided for his people, just as the Doge would have wished to be viewed by the Venetians.

In addition to the narrative of Joseph in these three bays, there are also auxiliary images of virtues, saints and prophets. The virtues represented are Justice in the first dome, Charity in the second, and Hope in the third. There is one virtue in each bay, isolated in the apex,

\textsuperscript{159} Williamson, 8.
\textsuperscript{160} Williamson, 25.
\textsuperscript{161} Williamson, 28.
\textsuperscript{162} Williamson, 33.
\textsuperscript{163} Williamson, 35.
highlighting these themes of leadership as they are declared to the Doge in the Cappella di San Clemente.\textsuperscript{164} The prophets in these domes serve to prefigure and witness the events of the New Testament, but also to highlight specific themes, there are four prophets in three of the bays of the North Atrium. In the pendentives of the Abraham cupola Ezekiel, Isaiah, Daniel, and Jeremiah speak of warning and wrath. In the pendentives of Joseph I the figures of Nathan, Habakkuk, Eli, and Samuel emphasize justice and just actions, and in the last set present in the Moses Cupola the prophets represent the future coming of Christ.\textsuperscript{165}

Due to the unique role of San Marco, as the private chapel of the Doge, it was here, after election the Doge, that he was crowned over the relics of St Mark. Hence, the iconographic schemes in this place highlight the role of the Doge and his connection to church devotion and to the people, done here in many ways through the Joseph mosaics. In the timeframe of these mosaics, efforts were being made to limit the power of the Doge who had previously been the \textit{Primus Venetorium}, or the most powerful man in Venice and by the end of the thirteenth century his power will have decreased to \textit{Primus inter Pares}, or first among leaders.\textsuperscript{166} In this time period it became a practice, beginning with Doge Jacopo Tiepolo in 1230, for the Doge to make specific pledges to the people after his election, including pledges concerning grain supply.\textsuperscript{167} In 1268, during the era of the second and third Joseph Cupolas, under the reign of Doge Lorenzo Tiepolo a great grain famine hit. After which further safeguards were put in place which ensured grain supply and Venetian dominance over the Adriatic and subjection of Lombardy.\textsuperscript{168} This began a war which Martin da Canal attributed and justified due to the callousness of the other

\textsuperscript{164} Williamson, 39.
\textsuperscript{165} Williamson, 41.
\textsuperscript{166} Williamson, 68.
\textsuperscript{167} Williamson, 73.
\textsuperscript{168} Williamson, 77-78.
states during the famine. 169 This was a catalyst of the Venetian terra firma campaigns, thus grain became associated with Venetian stability. This connects Venice further to Joseph, as he was the first literary and possibly historical figure to put provisionary policies for grain in place. 170 Joseph provided a model for just and wise rule, justification for leadership and foreign policy tactics of the Doge, and an ancient sanction for the power and leadership of Venice.

These various scholars highlight the manner in which this mosaic program was related simultaneously to the ancient past of the Old Testament, the apostolic age, and the recent past and present of the Venetian state. St Mark’s relics provided connections with a sacred past, and rights associated with that past. The Old Testament references to Egypt, temporal power, and the Chosen People acted in the Joseph narrative to strengthen those sacred rights. 171 This use of foreshadowing in the Old Testament events of the apostolic era and even of contemporary Venice was feasible and understandable by the beholder as the line between what was past, present or future did not have the same separate and definitive lines as in the modern era. This made interplay between them more active, Biblical history could continue through the “Chosen People” of Venice. 172 Just as Constantine had his relics of the True Cross, so too did the Doge of Venice hold his power in his relics of St Mark, making Joseph a symbol which bolstered the basis of the Venetian power and invented history. 173

The multiple themes of these mosaics including Egyptian emphasis, Venice as the “Promised Land” of St Mark, Joseph as a justification of temporal power, and the inheritance of the younger brother as it pertains to Venice’s inheritance of Mark’s relics, all tie Venice and the power of the Doge to ancient power both secular and religious. The existence and power of the

169 Williamson, 78.
170 Williamson, 79.
171 Constable, 25.
172 Constable, 171.
Republic was being portrayed as divinely willed in this period, and presenting the situations and power structures of Venice as mirroring those of the Old Testament, the apostolic age, and even through Alexander, of the classical period. Images could bind the past with the present, in a sense activating a cultural memory or understanding of a communal history which could bond ancient Christian, Old Testament, or even classical eras to that of the Venetian People.

In the last dome of the atrium mosaics the life of Moses is represented (figure 30), which completed this narrative of the Chosen People, and their existence and departure from Egypt. This dome remained largely intact until the late nineteenth century, when it was poorly restored, as was much of this cycle, when it was removed, cleaned, restored, and reapplied to the dome. The rich colors are much discolored by dirt, and much of the pink tesserae were lost in the process replaced by pink glazed white stone. This dome represents one of the strongest senses of a foreign and exotic eastern land, which is evoked through specifically Islamic architecture. The dome begins with *The Abandoning and Finding of Moses; Moses meets the Pharaoh*, and goes through the cycle of his life up to *The Miracles of the Manna and the Quails* (figure 31) and *The Miracle of Water from the Rock*. Interestingly, just as in the Abraham Cupola where the promise of Isaac was not fulfilled until the lunettes surrounding the dome, the Moses cupola is filled with the narrative of his time in Egypt while the lunette and apse above the north door contain the Crossing of the Red Sea and the miracles during the wandering of the Chosen People in the wilderness. The domes contain the narrative of the prophecy or God’s promise, and lunettes represented the fulfillment of that promise, thereby stressing the fulfillment of the prophecy by isolating the fulfillment in such a manner.

Otto Demus contends that this narrative is focused on the life of Moses and not the Exodus of the Chosen People. This issue is never denied outright by Dale, although he relies

---

174 Howard, 82.
175 Howard, 82.
heavily on the completion of the sojourn and Exodus of the Chosen People as an antitype or a model to the fate of the relics of St Mark.\textsuperscript{176} Demus considers the concept of a parallel between the fate of the Chosen People, into and out of Egypt, and the fate of St Mark as “going too far,” and suggests a more conservative viewing which would draw a general connection between the Egyptian emphases as the land of St Mark.\textsuperscript{177} Despite the lack of scholarly debate between Dale and Demus on what the purpose of this dome is, it is definite that the inclusion of this narrative was intentional, and was included despite the fact that the model for the atrium, the \textit{Cotton Genesis}, did not include the narrative of Moses. Thus, this was a specific completion of the mosaic cycle, chosen for the purposes of San Marco. Without the story of the Exodus of the Chosen People to the Promised Land, the parallel between Venice and the Hebrews, the ancient Chosen People of God would not have been complete. I intend to make it clear that certain iconographic references such as the themes of visions or predestination, as well as issues of visual connection as mentioned in the intersection of the translation, the Doge’s custodianship of the relics, and the plight of the Chosen People, make it possible to draw the conclusion that the atrium mosaics were in fact drawing an intentional parallel with the fate of St Mark.

The multiple narratives of St Mark act as a separate yet connected visual witness from the Old Testament mosaics of the atrium, to the shifting nature of self-imaging in this century. In indirect and unmistakable ways the basilica of San Marco mirrored the city’s increasing self-confidence and power, a process which can be specifically seen in the evolution of the Marcian legend within San Marco. The earliest mosaics through those of the twelfth century retell the Saint’s legend and acknowledge his ties to the mainland city of Aquilea and Egyptian Alexandria,

\textsuperscript{176} Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 96.
\textsuperscript{177} Demus, \textit{The Mosaics of San Marco}, v. 2, 98.
whereas the thirteenth-century mosaics in the church recount episodes in the Saint’s afterlife in a manner which cancels out all non-Venetian past.\textsuperscript{178}

Despite Venetian accounts which suggest the inadvertent landing of merchant ships in the harbors of Alexandria, due to the Divine will of God, in truth the theft of Mark’s relics was an intentional and political decision made due to the circumstances in the Adriatic region of the early ninth century.\textsuperscript{179} In 827, Venice was attempting to maintain a maximum amount of independence from Carolingian Italy, the reach of the Pope, and the Byzantine Empire, while maintaining good relationships with both. At that time Charlemagne and his son had failed to gain political and military control over Venice, but had not given up hope of ecclesiastical control. At the Synod of Mantua, in 827, a blow was struck to Venice in which the right to ecclesiastical authority was awarded to Aquilea, due to the historical tradition of St Mark’s mission to Aquilea and the sacred authority claimed because of this. Aquilea was at this time a province controlled by the Carolingians, thus putting Venice under the control of Charlemagne.

Venetian reaction to the ecclesiastical arguments used in support of the political decision ultimately resulted in the determination to steal the body of St Mark. The most effective way to neutralize the decision was in the acquisition of the Body of St Mark, this allowed superiority by giving Venice a church in possession, thus chosen, by St Mark, versus one simply founded by him in the apostolic age.\textsuperscript{180}

The role of relics within medieval communities was a unique and important one. To the medieval individual a relic was the host of sacred authority and had a life and will of its own.\textsuperscript{181} The relics of a saint could legitimize independent ecclesiastical authority, and the theft of relics was not considered theft, so much as the exercise of the divine and unquestionable intent of the

\textsuperscript{178} McGregor, 34.
\textsuperscript{179} Geary, 89.
\textsuperscript{180} Geary, 130.
\textsuperscript{181} Geary, 4.
saint. These relics could choose and affect their own fate as much or more then a living Saint could. What is of concern in this analysis of a medieval culture is not the actual history of the acquisition of St Mark’s relics, but the portrayed history of his relics, specifically through the mosaics in San Marco, and the evolution of this myth to match the status and desires of Venice as it developed as a world power.

The mosaics of the Cappella di San Clemente, the *translatio* (figure 32, 33, 34, and 35), from the eleventh century, recount the translation of Mark’s relics from Egypt to Venice after the mission and martyrdom of Mark. The Christian community of Alexandria had collected the relics after the martyrdom of Mark, and protected them until the city fell to the Saracens in 641, and the relics of Mark were once again in the hands of unbelievers. The account of the translation is recorded as follows from the *Acta Santorum*:

Through divine will the winds being favorable they did inadvertently what they would not have dared to do deliberately because of their respect for the Doge.

Whenever Venetians spent time in Alexandria it was their custom to offer daily prayers to St Mark… Because of this they were friendly with the priests who kept the shrine… the guardians of the shrine were distressed because they feared that the servants of the impious and evil prince of the Saracens would do to the shrine of St Mark what he had done to others…

The pious men of Venice offered to take the priests and the relics to a worthier Christian home where they could be revered properly, and they cleverly hid the relics under a hamper of pork to deter the Saracens from examining the contents and due to the will and favor of the Saint were greeted with glorious odors from the relics which filled the city. The Venetians were

---

182 Geary, 3.
183 McGregor, 43-44.
guided despite threats of storm and shipwreck quickly to Venice where the relics were greeted with great zeal and piety by the community.184

In these mosaics the evolution of the legend at this point is clear, it establishes the connection of sacred authority to Venice, as well as the piety of the Venetian people in the reception of his remains in contrast to the pagan environment from which they had been miraculously saved. This is a relationship between the will of St Mark and the holiness of the Venetian community which legitimizes the relic theft, and once again draws attention to the relationship between the Venetian sense of justice and the acquisition of the power of St Mark. This rendition of the translation is simple by medieval standards, a standard representation of the translation of a relic from an impious and undeserving environment to one worthier of the authority provided by the Saint. Despite exaggeration and representation of miraculous favor this narrative is relatively genuine to the course of events of the theft of the relics from Alexandria to Venice.185

In stark contrast to this quasi-historical narrative of the twelfth century are the narratives of St Mark from the second half of the thirteenth century, in the South Transept, and the Southwest Porch. Venice had reached a new pinnacle of political and economic power in the eastern Mediterranean at this time, thus they had outgrown the earlier legend of simple translation of the relics of St Mark. They were less interested now in the borrowed history of a local church, Venice revised its mythical history at this time to promote itself as a player on the world stage.186 The new pictorial narratives forge closer links with the evangelist, asserting Venice’s destiny as “Chosen People” of Mark, guardian of his relics, and a predestined nation set within a universal history of the God’s Chosen which reaches back to Creation. These new

184 McGregor, 47.
185 Geary, 88.
186 Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 100.
myths not only supplied divine sanction for Mark’s relics but more importantly for the exercise of power in his name, from the eleventh century on the relics came to justify both spiritual and temporal authority of the Doge.

Moving into the thirteenth century it is easy to see the contrast between the former, and more conservative mosaic of the *translatio* of Mark’s relics, in the *apparatio* mosaics of the mid-thirteenth century (figure 36, 37). The two *apparatio* panels, located in the South Transept, summarize the legend; the first, the *preghiera* or prayer, depicts the clergy and citizens in prayer, showing a remarkably detailed view of the church.187 The second panel, the *apparatio* or apparition, depicts the breaking of the column and the revelation of the lost relics.188 This is a scene not connected to Saracen Alexandria or the translation of his relics to Venice, but a legend taking place within San Marco itself. This mosaic seems to have survived only in a curtailed form, being cut on various parts of the architecture and even the figures.189 This legend is a testament to the continued legitimacy of the possession of Mark’s relics as well the piety and commitment of the Doge and Venetians to St Mark, highlighting the worthy nature of San Marco as home to this holy inheritance.190

The legend as written in the *Acta Sanctorum* asserts that after the burning of the earlier church of San Marco, and the construction of the new, the location of the relics died with the few individuals who knew where they were hidden.191 It is written in the *Acta Sanctorum*, that in 1094 after three days of fasting and prayer throughout all Venice “God heard their prayers and showed them the place, and suddenly a marble column split open and a chest containing his

---

190 McGregor, 56.
191 McGregor, 57.
body which had been hidden within burst forth for all to see.”\textsuperscript{192} This revelation was followed by many miracles, all testifying to the power of St Mark’s favor. In contrast to earlier myths, in the thirteenth century the Venetians assert the legitimacy of the continued possession of Mark’s relics, justifying the current actions of Venice in its growing colonial power and conquest over the ancient city of Constantinople. This miracle confirms that Mark still deemed the actions of Venice worthy of his protection and authority, as they conquered in the name of the evangelist, this myth legitimized Venice as the site of Mark’s living legacy.\textsuperscript{193}

In the most critical elaboration of the saint’s legend, in a narrative of the life of Saint Mark and most revealing about the thirteenth-century Venetian transformation, we see a narrative which firmly links the Saint with his final resting place, at the expense of all other ties to Aquilea, or previous Venetian ties to Byzantium or Rome. Located in what is now referred to as the Cappella Zen of San Marco, this area was once the South Vestibule of the church before the conversion in the early 16\textsuperscript{th} century to become the chapel of Cardinal Battista Zen.\textsuperscript{194} The purpose of this area is an important aspect when considering the intent of the thirteenth-century mosaics held within. It may seem now as if these mosaics are obscured in this chapel off the atrium, but when the thirteenth-century mosaics were installed this area was the south entrance to San Marco. This entrance faced the Piazetta, a highly trafficked main entrance, specifically used as a ceremonial entrance for important visitors to the city.\textsuperscript{195} Any mosaic placed in this area was not only widely seen but was of significant strategic importance. Aside from the façade mosaics these were the first images which created the visual experience of San Marco.

There are mosaics within the South Vestibule or Cappella Zen spanning many centuries prior to and after the thirteenth century. The earliest remaining mosaics are located in the apse—

\textsuperscript{192} McGregor, 57.  
\textsuperscript{193} Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 85.  
\textsuperscript{194} Demus, The Mosaics of San Marco, v. 1, 185.  
\textsuperscript{195} Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v. 1, 185.
like niche above the door that leads into the atrium. These mosaics depict angels flanking the
Virgin, although the Virgin is assumed to be a nineteenth-century replacement.\textsuperscript{196} The
inscription surrounding this conch has been restored, the words are probably original and
describe a contrast between Eve and the Virgin, which echoes the references in the Creation
narrative. This is a typical Byzantine apse program, framed by a western Mariological idea, a
combination which portrays a thoroughly Venetian tenor.\textsuperscript{197}

Both the earlier twelfth-century and later thirteenth-century mosaics have experienced
extensive and often poor restorations which have left them in poor disrepair, with uncertain
originality.\textsuperscript{198} The images which are of concern to this paper are the thirteenth-century mosaics
which are located in the barrel vault and depict the life of St Mark (figure 38). This thirteenth-
century addition leaves no trace of what decoration may have been in the vault previously. Prior
to the installation of this narrative, the vault would have been decorated, and some have
speculated that it was once a different cycle of the life of St. Mark which was altered to represent
a more modern understanding of the Marcian legend.\textsuperscript{199} This version of the history of St Mark,
his connection to Venice and the timing of its installation is very telling of the political climate
after the conquest of Constantinople. This history redefined not only the Marcian legend, but
the history and purpose of Venice itself in a way which nearly eliminated the importance of
Aquilca in Mark’s connection to Venice and replaced it with a divine predestination of the
destiny of Venice and her people.

When analyzing this set of mosaics we must first acknowledge the extensive damage and
restoration to this area of San Marco over the centuries and what this indicates about how these
can be viewed and how reliable the images depicted are. Demus outlines the process of

\textsuperscript{196} Demus, “The Mosaics of San Marco” v. 2, 40.
\textsuperscript{197} Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v. 2, 41.
\textsuperscript{198} Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v. 1, 186.
\textsuperscript{199} Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v. 1, 186.
restoration these mosaics have gone through in his extensive documentation on the subject. The most damage was done in the nineteenth century, including having survived multiple periods of being removed from the walls of the Cappella Zen and replaced later with extensive changes.\textsuperscript{200} Analysis of these processes has led Demus to assert that serious changes have been made to the style of these mosaics over the centuries and in many or even a majority of these mosaics the style of figures, faces, or whole scenes have been drastically changed. Despite the inconsistency with thirteenth-century style, it is possible to say, with certainty, that the iconographic and compositional scheme of the mosaics of the life of St. Mark are trust-worthy as representative of the original cycle of the life of St. Mark.\textsuperscript{201}

The mosaics of the life of St. Mark are found in two parts, one on each side of a mosaic in the center of the barrel vault, the center is occupied by an image of Christ Emmanuel surrounded by geometric and vegetal ornament.\textsuperscript{202} In each of the two halves of the barrel vault there are six scenes of the life of St. Mark arranged in two tiers. The cycle begins in the upper northeast corner of the vault and ends in the lower northwest corner. In the first set of the cycle, in the east half of the vault, in the upper tier there are the scenes of \textit{Mark Writing the Gospel}, \textit{Mark Presents the Gospel to Peter}, and \textit{Mark Baptizing in Aquilea}. In the lower tier are the scenes of \textit{Mark’s Dream Vision of the Venetian Lagoon} or the \textit{predestinatio} (figure 39), where a very specific inscription reads “While he was sailing across the area where the church of San Marco now stands, an angel announced that at a certain time after its death, his body would be interred here with great honor.”\textsuperscript{203} Also in the lower tier are the scenes \textit{Peter Consecrates Hermagoras}, and \textit{Mark heals a Demoniac}. In the west half of the vault, in the upper tier we find scenes of \textit{Mark Ordered by a Dream Vision to Go to Alexandria}, \textit{Mark’s Voyage to Alexandria}, and \textit{Mark Heals Anianus}. Finally, in

\textsuperscript{200} Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v. 1, 184
\textsuperscript{201} Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v.1, 185.
\textsuperscript{202} Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v.2, 185.
\textsuperscript{203} Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 97.
the lower tier we see the scenes of *Mark Strangled at the Altar, Mark Dragged and Killed*, and the *Burial of Mark*.\(^{204}\)

In the thirteenth-century images of the life of St Mark, there is a near omission of all Aquilean reference, the only remnant of Aquilea’s role in St Mark’s history is a scene of a generic baptism. Only elements that assert the importance of St Mark, such as his miracles, his connection to St Peter and his gospel authorship remain, all details that might allocate some of St Mark’s authority elsewhere are omitted. The most important aspect of this mosaic is the addition of the *predestinatio* scene to the legend of the evangelist. This is the first image of this element of the legend of St Mark, and it is installed near the time of the first known written documentation from Martino da Canal’s *Estoires* from 1265. The following is an excerpt which explains in full the contents of this narrative:

> There is a legend of many centuries duration handed down by the original inhabitants of the Lagoon of an incident which occurred during the travels of St Mark…. The evangelist found the surface of the sea covered with large waves and so he chose to travel though the marshes… In the quiet of the night a smiling angel appeared to him and said “Do you not know where you are? For much longer than you imagine this will be your resting place.” Mark misunderstood the angel’s words, thinking they warned of a shipwreck, but the angel continued, “be of good cheer you are not destined for an obscure death, but after long labors the Prince for whose honor you struggle will award you the crown of martyrdom. This place which is now so humble and bare will one day be more welcome to you than any other. Know one day a temple will be here where you bones, stolen away from

\(^{204}\) Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v.2, 186.
the barbarians will find perpetual rest. Through your intercession and your power
the piety and virtue of this nation will make it great.\textsuperscript{205}

This mosaic illustrates the scene showing a small open boat, tied to a mud bank, from
which Venice would grow. Mark sits with a saintly companion, as well as a figure that is awake
and without a nimbus serving as a witness to the miracle.\textsuperscript{206} The story told by this image is very
different from the translation narrative, there the aim was to establish Mark as an apostle and
show the miraculous and favorable circumstances of his translation from Egypt to Venice,
whereas, in the Cappella Zen the mosaic assigns the saint a new role as city founder. Through
Mark’s influence and power, coupled with the virtues of the people of the Lagoon, this mud
bank would become a great nation. This narrative not only transforms Mark from apostle to city
founder, but redefines the community and its political leadership as a pious and predestined
nation that, through spiritual dedication and the blessing of St Mark, was intended by God to
come to become a powerful Empire in the Christian world.

The story of St. Mark is continued on the façade in the story of the translation of his
relics, scenes that are a sort of “title page,” as Demus terms it, that show the close relationship
between the legend of the relics of St. Mark and the claim of the church as based on the
ownership of the relics.\textsuperscript{207} In contrast to these façade mosaics, the Life of St Mark inside the
Cappella Zen represents amplification, or a more complex commentary, in which the motif of
the relics and Venetian divine right to their possession occupied the second visual representation
seen by the viewer. This myth of predestination originated in the first half of the thirteenth
century, just decades prior to its installment in San Marco, an era which brings up compelling
questions about how this change in the legend of St Mark and his relationship to Venice

\textsuperscript{205} McGregor, 61.
\textsuperscript{206} McGregor, 61.
\textsuperscript{207} Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v.2, 187.
corresponds to aspects of Venetian culture in the thirteenth century, such as cultural
independence from Byzantium.\footnote{Debra Pincus, \textit{The Tombs of the Doges of Venice}, (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge UP, 2000), 12.} A time which Demus refers to as the “early Christian
renascence of thirteenth-century Venice,” after acquisition of so many Byzantine and Early
Christian relics, artists of Venice had ample opportunity to cultivate a talent for imitating an
Early Christian style which was conducive to the desire to connect Venice with an ancient
destiny as a “Chosen People” and part of a continuous Christian history.\footnote{Demus, “A Renascence of Early Christian Art,” 348.} There are many
examples of medieval translation of relics, and there are many instances of medieval copying but
none have the same attitude as seen here in Venice where they are so drastically shaping their
communal and historical identity, even “fak[ing] a past” which would legitimize both their
church and their temporal power.\footnote{Demus, “A Renascence of Early Christian Art,” 353.}

There is no longer reliance within these images on Mark’s history in Aquilea as first
Bishop, only a reference in order to establish location, nor is his prominence in Grado an
important part of the narrative.\footnote{Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v.2, 189.} This scene makes visual connections of a divine path which
led Mark past the Venetian Lagoon by boat, and includes important elements such as his
connection with the Gospel, St Peter, his miracles which mark him as holy, and his death in
Alexandria.\footnote{Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v.2, 187.} In this predestined resting place his relics would await their exodus to the land of
the Venetians, to the new “Chosen People”.\footnote{Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 90.} Venice is being shown as an heir to Alexandria
before Mark reached Egypt, something which is emphasized through the Egyptian Motif in the
north wing of the Atrium, and is continued in the later work of the Silver Paliotto in which all
Aquilean scenes are completely eliminated.\footnote{Demus, “Mosaics of San Marco” v.2, 188.} This progression of historical change is indicative
of how visual history is not shackled to documented history, but how independent pictorial
inventions can constitute independent arguments and proof to the viewer.\textsuperscript{215} According to many scholars this era of the thirteenth century was a time when all previous claims to the relics or legacy of Mark was eradicated, by claiming a divine destiny for Mark in Venice, thus making the power of Venice a predestined inheritance.\textsuperscript{216}

As witnessed by the atrium mosaics of this period, the designers behind these mosaics were reaching to a far more ancient past in their use of archaic style, an early Christian model, and even reoccurring themes of vision, destiny, and Egypt as the home of St. Mark.\textsuperscript{217} The use of contemporary themes from Byzantium was abandoned in favor of this renaissance of early Christian style and models, which coincides with the era of reshaping Venetian history as a narrative beginning in the early Christian era. Venice revisited its mythical history to promote itself as a player on the world stage as it pertains to their sacred history, just as they had asserted themselves in this century as a commercial and cultural power.

In this reinvention of the Marcian legend and its connections to Venice, there was an attempt to portray the Venetians as the “Chosen People” of Mark in many aspects of the thirteenth-century mosaics.\textsuperscript{218} This represents a new era on a continuum of change and reinvention of self-identity in Venice, which began at foundation, in which Venetians have elaborated images of the city’s distinctive origins and “special place” in history.\textsuperscript{219} This created not a single myth but a layered and changing identity which changed along with social or political needs.\textsuperscript{220} This was an opportune time for Venice to recreate its mythical origins due to the great change in the era of the thirteenth century, as Venice was transformed into an imperial power at

\textsuperscript{215} Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 105.
\textsuperscript{216} McGregor, 34.
\textsuperscript{217} Demus, “Renascence of Early Christian Art,” 96.
\textsuperscript{218} Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 85.
\textsuperscript{220} Grubb, “When Myths Lose Power,” 43
the expense of Byzantium. Over time, the importance of Mark’s blessing over the translation of his relics grew, and this culminated in the expansion to the representation of Mark’s pre-Venetian career in the Cappella Zen.

Aside from the aspects discussed concerning this appearance of the *predestinatio* legend and its importance in the thirteenth-century climate. There remain issues such as the importance of the Doge’s gain by asserting, as fact, Mark’s presence in Venice as a matter of God’s, not simply modern Venetian ambition, but ancient prophecy. These mosaics which show the divine revelation to Mark of his eternal rest in Venice also show a dream-vision of his destiny to go to Alexandria, where he would be martyred. He was meant to go on a mission to Egypt, yet he was also destined to be brought out of this pagan land to a new “Promised Land” in Venice. There is not only an ideological link between Mark and the Chosen People, but a physical connection within San Marco as well. There is a natural line between the Cappella Zen mosaics of the barrel vault where the Venetian people have been chosen by God, and the Old Testament narrative of the Chosen People in the atrium, in fact a narrative which received uncommon attention in San Marco. This imagery and its connection with the Old Testament narrative is not a legend which would have been easily dismissed but an argument placed in the most prominent location in all of Venice, an argument which augments the role of Venice from a successful and wealthy merchant republic to a nation, although lacking ancient historical roots, that was predestined to hold and usurp the role as God’s chosen nation and people.

This transformation from borrowing the sacred heritage of a local town, or the cultural tradition of a Christian Empire to laying a divine claim to the heritage and power relates to the power of both Venice and the Doge in many complex ways. This aspect brings attention to the

---

221 Georgopoulou, Maria. 479.
222 Dale, “Inventing a Sacred Past,” 89.
fact that all things the Venetians, and specifically the Venetian government, did were done in the name of St Mark and their power was thoroughly invested there. It was in Mark’s name that the Doge himself waged war and governed Venice.  

At this time in the thirteenth century the ducal presence at San Marco became more pronounced visually and legally, as the power of the Republic of Venice grew on the world stage, a change which called for an expansion of the visual legend of Venice within the Church, which was expressed in the atrium and in the predestinatio legend.  

As the prominence of San Marco grew as a center for politics, religion, and culture, so too did the history and theology change to suit the image the desired image of the Doge and Venice. What was happening in this era was not only a strengthening bond between the image of the Doge and San Marco, but a bond which committed to social memory the connections between St Mark, his relics, Venice, the Doge, and his divine right to rule. The era of the installation of the Life of St Mark was an era that is characterized by Debra Pincus not as one of many periods of mythogenesis, but as the defining period of mythogenesis when Venice departed from using the images and myths of other states and began creating their own. It was a time of transformation from the “favored daughter” of Byzantium to a world power in which these mosaics were used to mold a myth to appropriate a sacred and ancient past in an empire that was relatively young by medieval standards. In an era when a sacred past had the power to legitimate current civic institutions such as the Republic or even the seat of the Doge, it was imperative to hold these sacred relics, and in the thirteenth century, to make claim to the relics as

---

228 Pincus, "Venice and the Two Romes,” 104.
229 Georgopoulou, 491.
a sign of Venice as a destined Christian Empire, and part of a holy narrative which to the
timeless beholder was still alive.230

In analyzing the mosaics of the thirteenth century it is impossible to avoid the fact that
there is a shift in the content, style, and iconographical choices in this century as well as
consistent themes which are indicative of the changing political desires within the Venetian
Republic century. Thus, in order to accurately analyze this artistic shift it is necessary to also take
into account the general political situations surrounding the change that is visually present in San
Marco in this era. In the events of the twelfth century, including the rift with Byzantium in 1171,
the Peace of Venice in 1177, and shifting approaches to Venetian history, elements of thirteenth-
century politics and thought were set in motion. In a sense, this set the stage for the more drastic
events and changes witnessed in the chronicles, monuments and political action of the thirteenth
century.

Beginning in the twelfth but solidified in the thirteenth century this state was
transformed from a Merchant Republic to a Maritime Empire which was in control of three-
eighths of Byzantium, a “mother,” in a sense, to this republic and an empire which it had so long
emulated and drawn from culturally.231 Many aspects of the Venetian state were in transition in
this period from relationship with the Papacy, the role of the Doge within the commune,
ecological and political relationship with Byzantium and other world powers, and the shape of
the Venetian myth of origin. It is thus important to not only analyze the changing imagery within
San Marco but to look at how and why the self-image of Venice was changing in this period, as
well as how these visual narratives are mirrored in contemporary documents and chronicles.


As discussed previously, we place stock in the images of San Marco and how they reflect societal trends, values, and changes not simply because the images have been preserved but because Venetians also put stock in what images were constructed or changed. These were not merely reflections of events in the Mediterranean world but important demonstrations and documents in themselves which could be referred to as Venice molded its own contemporary and ancient history. The events of the eleventh century were significant, including the molding of the Venetian myth through the *Origo*, a historical chronicle, or the growth of the Venetian building and consolidation of her trading empire by establishing permanent Venetian colonies on the islands throughout the Aegean, it was the events of the thirteenth century that led to the new relationship with Venetian image, antiquity, and the Mediterranean world. For instance, the myths created in the *Origo* were further developed and monumentalized in the thirteenth century in a manner that confirmed the Venetian self-identity, and the colonies in the Aegean would serve as outposts for the more rapid expansion following the territorial gains made after the Fourth Crusade and the conquest of Constantinople of 1204. As Venice grew into an imperial power her ruling class continued to refine an already impressive civic image and her chroniclers would revise the historical record many times over, in order to reflect a growing desire to deepen Venetian roots to reflect a sense of destined greatness for the republic.

Another factor which affected the thirteenth-century climate took place in 1171, when the relationship which had nourished Venetian success was changed, which may have helped lead into this reevaluation of Venetian self-imaging. In 1171 the roots of Venetian government were shaken when Constantinople turned against its longtime ally in favor of Venetian enemies, mainly Genoa, Pisa, and Amalfi, by allowing them trading privileges. These privileges had once only been allotted to the Venetians, but the favor of the Emperor was revoked after he was

---

233 Fortini-Brown, *Venice and Antiquity*, 12.
angered by an insult from a group of Venetians mocking his dark skin. The Byzantine Emperor, offended due to this personal insult proceeded to lay blame on the Venetians for an attack on the Genoan settlement within the city and seized all Venetian residents of Constantinople as well as their possessions. After this mistreatment of Venetians, the relations deteriorated further between Constantinople and Venice as an envoy, including the Doge, was invited into a trap in Constantinople, resulting in a massacre and murder of the Doge. After these events of 1171-1172, the fight against the Byzantines, the loss of economic favor, and finally the murder of the Doge there was a rapid increase in the power of the commune within the government. This is pertinent to the understanding of the thirteenth century as it gives context to the rise of the commune in the thirteenth century as well as the lingering importance of the Doge, a sign of the Venetian people, despite waning power. Most importantly this marks the early signs of departure from the former Venetian attitude towards Byzantium which was characterized by subordination of other political goals in favor of maintaining the special relationship with Byzantium. This uneasiness may have manifested itself in the willingness of Venice to break this traditional tie to Byzantium in the events of 1204.

Another element which began in this time of turmoil and violence between Byzantium and Venice was the growing power of the commune at the expense of the Doge, and in a sense of the citizens of Venice as well. The commune was formed under Doge Pietro Polani (1130-1148), temporarily and was never disbanded; this formed a new sphere of power between the Doge and the people which would continually gain more power throughout the thirteenth century.

---

235 Madden, “Venice, the Papacy, and the Crusades before 1204,” 95.
century. This ruling class bordered on nobility, although it lacked the consistency due to the fluid nature of Venetian power as based on commercial success, not mere blood line. This great increase in power began after the 1171-1172 events after Doge Vitale Michiel II went against the will of the commune in his actions by traveling to Constantinople. The ensuing disasters made it possible for the commune to remove the Doge’s right to contradict the commune, as well as making it illegal to elect a Doge who would work against the expansion of the commune’s power.

After this point the Great Council held the power to appoint all the ministers of the government and also the representatives of the Council, thus becoming a self-perpetuating oligarchy. In this period increases are seen in offices such as that of the procurator as well as the formation of new governing counsels such as the Quarantia, or counsel of forty. Formerly the power of the Doge was invested in the people, or popular assembly and the barrier now between those changed the once unchallenged power of the Doge. The phrase to introduce the elected Doge in this period is significant, “Here is your Doge, if he please you.” Although this usurping of power did not mean the role of the Doge is downplayed in Venetian society, in fact as the governing power of the Doge decreased, the pomp and symbolism behind the ceremonies representing his power increased. Thus the imagery in San Marco, as a church of the Doge, gained potency as the image of the Doge as a symbol of Venice was bolstered even as the range of his power narrowed.

This study of the role of the Doge and increasing powers of councils or positions may seem obscure when studying the role of the mosaics of the thirteenth century, but the figures of

238 Madden, “Venice, the Papacy, and the Crusades before 1204,” 94.
239 Madden, “Venice, the Papacy, and the Crusades before 1204,” 95.
240 Hibbert, Biography of a City, 20.
241 Hibbert, Biography of a City, 20.
242 Madden, “Venice, the Papacy, and the Crusades before 1204,” 93.
243 Hibbert, Biography of a City, 20.
244 Fortini Brown, “Self-Definition of Venetian Republic,” 523.
the procurator and the Doge play enormous roles in the administration and meaning of San Marco. The importance of the Doge is embodied in this structure both directly and indirectly. The Doge is the protector of Mark’s relics and it is from the relics that he draws his power, the role of a wise and just ruler is emphasized in at least three of the domes. Although this power is waning it is of utmost symbolic importance as a reminder of the foundation of Venice on the premise of rule by the people through the figurehead of the Doge. In fact, the virtues presented by Joseph may be seen as a guide to the Doge, of the just and wise hand of the ruler as a provider and protector of his people, specifically in times of scarce resource. The concept of stability was of great importance to Venice and the figure of the Doge, even amongst power struggles, was maintained for the benefit of stability. Despite the fading reality of this principle, it had moral importance in the city, in fact the *predestinatio* legend in conjunction with the Old Testament mosaics based on early Christian models are attempts to visually deepen Venetian history thereby strengthening the claim to the predestined power of the republic, further legitimizing the role of the Doge.

As the power of the Doge dwindled, the importance of other offices increased significantly including that of the Procurator of San Marco. The earliest evidence for the existence of the Procurator comes from the twelfth century, but there is speculation that the office went back as far as the acquisition of Mark’s relics.245 Initially this post was a much narrower position which consisted of delegating the responsibilities of administering the church, a sort of vicar and caretaker of the church. However the responsibilities expanded as rents and tithes paid to the church led to substantial financial holdings.246 This progression was most acute in the first half of the thirteenth century, as the importance and number of the procurators grew

---


substantially and finally the Great Counsel took over the right to elect the procurator as well as choose the number which by 1269-1260 had gone from one to four since the beginning of the century.\textsuperscript{247} At this point the office of the procurator was of utmost importance and prestige, second only to the Doge, as witnessed by Andrea Dandolo’s position as procurator previous to his election as the Doge.

The eventual role of the procurator, in the thirteenth century, evolved into a financial and trust institution; they administered to the church, but also dealt in the administration of wills, inheritance, the fate of orphans, and many roles which embody the fine line in Venice between private and public institutions. This city was built of fluid wealth and status, on commercial success as a means for political might, to such an extent that public and private wealth were inseparable as the public good depended on the presence and fair administration of private wealth, a fact which is displayed by the evolution of the office of the procurator.\textsuperscript{248} This growth in the strength of the procurator, a position which drew its importance from San Marco, and thus the religious power drawn from St Mark, is important when considering the thirteenth-century mosaics as it illustrates the power housed within this sepulchral chapel. The procurator drew his power directly from St Mark, and as the power and even the designer behind the shape of the mosaics it is easy to understand why such a politician would wish to extend the legend of St Mark to match the growth of both Venice and the office of the procurator. This growing power of the procurator witnesses the importance of the legend and history of St Mark, as such, it illuminates how this unique Italian merchant republic came to fashion its history outside of the typical avenues of Roman foundation, relying instead on the history and destiny of its patron saint and the intangible will of God.

\textsuperscript{248} Mueller, “The Procurators of San Marco in Thirteenth and Fourteenth Centuries,” 220.
Further in the investigation of the late twelfth century and its effects on Venice are the events of 1177 and the Peace of Venice, an event which was of enormous importance for the increasingly self-confident Venetians as well as a cornerstone of the evolving myth of Venice. In this period Venice played a major role in the mediation between Frederick Barbarossa and Pope Alexander III. The Venetians under Doge Domenico Morisini were anxious to avoid unneeded conflict, but with the advent to the imperial throne in the West of the young, ambitious Frederick I of Hohenstaufen, nicknamed Barbarossa, the situation was transformed. Barbarossa announced his intention to restore imperial Rome to its former grandeur, and marched into Italy, reducing to submission Italian states which had defied him. Afraid of losing her coveted independence, Venice joined the fight at the defense of Rome and Pope Alexander III alone with the Greater Lombard League. The murder of the Doge in 1172 was a set back, and after the installation of Doge Sebastiano Ziani he immediately put his hand to repair the damage done in these foreign ventures. He made peace with Norman Sicily, as well as with the Byzantine Emperor, and when it came time to negotiate peace between Barbarossa and the Pope, Venice was selected to hold the momentous negotiations.

This serves to illustrate the twelfth-century Venetian relationship with the Papacy, which further attests to the changes in Venetian allegiances and identity in the thirteenth century. It is often assumed that Venice, with its strong connections to the Byzantine Empire had consistently poor relations with Rome, when in truth prior to 1204 the relations were very good between Venice and Rome, the Doge and the Pope. As described, in the conflict of 1177 between Pope Alexander III and Frederick Barbarossa, Venice came to the defense of the Pope resulting in the Peace of Venice. For obvious reasons this resulted in a very good standing with the

---

249 Madden, “Venice, the Papacy, and the Crusades before 1204,” xvii
250 Hibbert, Biography of a City, 23.
251 Hibbert, Biography of a City, 22.
Papacy. In conflicts concerning the lack of Venetian participation in the crusades Venice craftily defended her actions, pointing to the willing participation in the ban against trading with Islamic countries, resulting in a loss of a lucrative business relationship to Venice. Venice saw this as its own service to the crusades, and thus in 1187 had this restriction lifted allowing trade with Egypt in exchange for funds and manpower for the Fourth Crusade.  

The Fourth Crusade became the breaking point between Venice and Rome, although dealings were positive through the preparatory years up to 1201, they became strained as the Pope began to fear Doge Enrico Dandolo would take advantage of the arms and man power at his disposal. The elderly, blind Dandolo was not solely leading the Crusade but was working at the behest of the Pope and in conjunction with the French, led under Geoffrey Villehardouin. However, after time the Venetian Doge acquired significant power over the fate of the Crusade due to the substantial loan given the French, which they required in order to begin the campaign. With the financial status of the leaders to whom he had loaned the money, it was doubtful this large debt of 34,000 marks would be returned, or that the Venetians could hope that the booty from this Crusade would be able to make up such a debt, based on the financial failure of the Third Crusade. Doge Dandolo then proposed that the payment of the crusaders’ debt be deferred, if they helped him subdue Zara, a nearby city. Zara was engaged in one of its innumerable efforts to assert its independence from Venice and become a rival power to Venice. 

The region of Zara had come under the protection of Emeric of Hungary’s control, a fellow crusader, thus the Pope issued a warning to stay away from his lands, a warning the Venetians and their crusaders ignored. This decision crumbled the formerly benevolent relations

---

253 Madden, “Venice, the Papacy, and the Crusades before 1204,” 86.
254 Lane, Venice: a Maritime Republic, 37.
255 Lane, Venice: a Maritime Republic, 37.
between Venice and Rome. After a successful campaign in Zara, a second diversion of the Crusade from the Holy Land was agreed upon. The decision to divert to Constantinople was again clearly in accord with Venetian interests, it was decided to proceed to Constantinople and place on the Byzantine throne a claimant called “young Alexius,” the favor of the Western knights was won by promises by Alexius to bring Byzantium back into submission to the papacy, and even contribute funds and soldiers to the crusader cause. This only solidified the crisis with the Pope in Rome and was seen not as a choice to support the Crusade but a sign of Dandolo’s greed, at which point all Venetians were excommunicated by the Pope.

Aside from the issue of Papal relations, the events of 1204 and the implications for Venice were enormous, and in many ways underlie many if not most of the artistic and historiographic changes in the thirteenth century. When the Crusade set off in November 1202 from Venice, they were all bearing the emblem of St Mark under the flying banner of the apostle and patron saint. Both victories at Zara and Constantinople were won under the flag of Mark and were attributed to his favor upon Venetian actions. The victory at Constantinople was especially memorable as it is reportedly the actions of the Doge, under his banner of St Mark that turned the tides in both July 1203 and April 1204. The first assault set Alexius upon the throne, and the second led to the victory over the city.

After the Crusaders achieved their initial goal in July of 1203, it became apparent that Alexius' promises of payment were not going to be fulfilled, and after a time of waiting and sporadic violence the crusaders decided to take what they were owed in the beginning of 1204. In three days the booty collected amounted to 400,000 marks and 10,000 suits of armor as well

---

256 Madden, "Venice, the Papacy, and the Crusades before 1204," 94.
257 Lane, Venice: a Maritime Republic, 37.
258 Lane, Venice: a Maritime Republic, 38.
259 Madden, “Venice, Papacy, and the Crusades,” 94.
260 Hibbert, Biography of a City, 27.
261 Lane, Venice: a Maritime Republic, 41.
as sacred relics. The new imperial constitution allotted a council of twelve members, six Venetians and six barons, to elect an Eastern emperor; the position was offered and wisely refused by the aging Dandolo. The Venetians experienced a favorable outcome and once more experienced a special position with Byzantium, the Doge was free of allegiance or oath to the Emperor, Venice was assured all her spoils, and that all nations that stood against Venice would be banned from the Empire. Finally, Venice was awarded three-eights of Constantinople and was allowed to purchase the island of Crete, which was of considerable strategic importance. Venice acquired the fabulous wealth, rich artistic heritage, and relics they had for so long revered from Constantinople, and eventually the title for their Doge of “Lord of one quarter and a half of Byzantium.”

Although this is merely a brief glimpse of the developments which led to the political environment of the thirteenth century in which Venice achieved a “quantum leap” in power and wealth, it sets the scene for what the Venetian world had become in the time of the mosaics in question. Despite Venetian attempts to deepen it roots within history in the eleventh and twelfth century to suggest pre-Roman roots in histories such as the Origo, it was never a wholly separate entity from Byzantium throughout the years as it emulated the culture and appropriated the history of the Christian empire, or other provinces such as Aquilea. The conquest of Constantinople seems to have contributed many factors which changed the fabric of Venetian culture, such as the great wealth taken in spoils, the historical and sacred artifacts, enhanced power in the form of strengthened colonies as well as control over three eights of the Empire. Also of importance was the symbolic affirmation provided by Venetian control over the empire.

---

262 Lane, Venice: a Maritime Republic, 41.
263 Lane, Venice: a Maritime Republic, 42.
264 Lane, Venice: a Maritime Republic, 43.
whose images and institutions Venice had drawn on for political and historical legitimacy prior to the thirteenth century. As a result, the approach to Venice’s self-fashioning in texts and monuments changed to fit the new status as the conqueror of Byzantium, and a new world power.

It is interesting when examining this Venetian desire to refashion history to examine the overall benefit to Venice of controlling a great portion of Byzantium. After the great wealth the sack of Constantinople brought to Venice initially, the lordship over this once proud capital was not merely a wise financial decision for this new maritime empire. During the majority of the control over this territory Venetians were not making a substantial profit and Venetians were heavily burdened in their efforts to protect the city from other enemies.267 The population also declined from its height under the Comneni dynasty of 400,000 to approximately 40,000. Thus, in this time real estate prices plummeted while Venetians were faced with being sole protectors of the capital.268 This raises the question of what Venice was benefiting from this title if not wealth, especially in a Republic that was defined by commercial success. Venice valued holding the power and prestige associated with the less ancient but highly pious eastern capital that was the embodiment of an ancient Christian Empire, the land from which Venice had at times been ruled and even after independence the empire from which Venice drew its models and images of historical legitimacy. This republic was based on myths of being the oldest independent Italian state, and on principles of antiquity and freedom, both of which were further enhanced by fulfilling what was seen as the will of St Mark, as well as the supposed prophecy of Constantine

that Byzantium was destined to fall to Venice, and Venice was divinely intended to rise as the next Christian empire.269

This outline of the thirteenth-century state of affairs in Venice may be summed up in a few assertions. Most importantly, going into and throughout the thirteenth century, Venice was a growing commercial and maritime power. Throughout the century the commercial strength of Venice grew through the entire Mediterranean world and Venice solidified its positions by gaining monopolies on commodities such as salt or the establishment of Venice as the “staple” of the Adriatic where goods had to be brought, taxed and sold, as well as control over regions such as Dalmatia, Crete, and Apulia. Important in this century was the reassertion of control, as in the case of the revolt led by Zara in 1243 which led to defeat by Venice, of not only Zara but the Genoans and Pisans as well. Also consistent in Venice in the thirteenth century was the weakening power of the Doge in favor of a growing and strengthening ruling class, as well as the increase in the symbolic importance of the Doge as a representative of Venice. Yet even as power grew, connections weakened, Byzantium was no more, and the favor of the Papacy had been shattered. This increasingly influential nation was attempting to stand on its own, without any sanction from Byzantium or Rome, creating a need for a form of independent sanction. It is this need that I contend is filled by the myths and images of the thirteenth-century, myths that transformed the success of Venice into fulfillment of ancient prophecy and the will of God.

Another imperative aspect of thirteenth-century Venice is set less in governmental affairs, although it is inspired by them: the Venetian self-identity. Although Venice is not alone in attempts to redefine her past, Venetian historians and mythmakers were not faced with a simple redefinition of the past as in other Italian cities, but with building up an elaborate legend of Venice’s origins from a past which was shallower then most Italian cities. This aspect in

269 De Vivo, “Justifications of Venetian Power,” 159.
Venice was believed by the Venetians to be the key to the success of their city.\textsuperscript{270} It is reasonable to assume that the Venetians harbored this “obsession” with their past because the whole medieval world inherited this idea that the essence of a society’s present and its later greatness lay in stages of early development.\textsuperscript{271} In Venice, in chronicles as well as pictorial narratives of the thirteenth century, it would seem that in a uniquely Venetian way, its present or future greatness lies not only in the myth of its development but also in the myth of its pre-development or destiny to exist as a mighty, independent, Christian empire.

There are limited sources on Venetian history, as is noted by many scholars, yet what is known is that this city was not of Roman foundation and was not largely inhabited until after 568 when surrounding towns fled from Lombard invaders. For the next 150 years Venetia was a poor component of the Byzantine Empire, along with Ravenna, Rome and Naples.\textsuperscript{272} In contrast to the “real history” of Venice, by the eve of the thirteenth century many complex myths of origin had developed and overlapped, including myths of foundation by Attila the Hun in the fifth century as well as the myth of foundation by the Trojans in the fifth century BC.\textsuperscript{273} These myths were varied and exhibit “the method of adapting suggestions that avoid declarations that are too explicit which is characteristic for Venice in its ideological attitude.”\textsuperscript{274}

Before discussing the substantial evolution in Venetian chronicles or histories in the thirteenth century, it is important to explore the documents available prior to this period in order to highlight the similarities and differences that come in the thirteenth century. The earliest surviving Venetian chronicle is John the Deacon’s, from the early eleventh century, which

\textsuperscript{270} Patricia Fortini-Brown, \textit{Venice and Antiquity}, 24.
described the origin of the only major city in medieval Italy that could not boast a Roman foundation. For another three hundred years the Venetian sense of time would be dominated by the necessity to invent a civic past, this need was met through visual or monumental, as well as textual means, it is evidenced in chronicles and histories of the city and influenced the articulation of the urban environment. Already in the twelfth century, the nature and content of the Venetian chronicles was changing, as was the political climate just not with the same intensity as in the thirteenth century, and the austere and fairly accurate writings of John the Deacon from the eleventh century would not suffice. The *Origo*, also known as the *Chronicon Altinate* and the *Chronicon Gradense*, offered more richly articulated and satisfyingly detailed account of a primitive foundation of the city, predating both early Christian and Roman pasts. This appeared in its first redaction around 1081 and underwent at least two revisions by the twelfth century. This document is regarded as a faithful mirror of the current mentality of the Venetians of the period.

Three themes in the *Origo* are particularly revealing of a developing historical consciousness within the ruling elite which would culminate to its fullest in the thirteenth century. The first theme is the deepening of the Venetian roots to archaic times by its decent from Troy. The second theme involves the cultivation of Venice’s Christian roots, this text places the invasion of Aquilea a century earlier and claims that it was not the Longobards but Attila the Hun who had driven the Christian descendents of the original Trojan settlers from their homes in the cities of the *terra firma*. This specified the Venetians as specifically Christian refugees from the pagan invaders. Finally, these immigrants now have specific identities as the

276 Fortini-Brown, *Venice and Antiquity*, 12.
277 Fortini-Brown, *Venice and Antiquity*, 12.
Origo places emphasis on the lineage of the refugees. This is the first vivid sense in Venetian historiography that the city is defined as community as affluent, Christian men. 279

It is in the thirteenth century that the Venetian self-concept reached a critical phase of elaboration and the formation of civic identity takes place. The legend was refined and further adapted under Andrea Dandolo in the fourteenth century but all of the basic paradigms were complete in the thirteenth. 280 In this period Venice was entering its place in the Mediterranean world in the ranks of world powers, thus it seems logical that historiographical aspirations were heightened to match Venice’s new role as a colonial empire, to go beyond emulating and appropriating the myths of other cities or empires in favor of creating a legitimizing and uniquely Venetian one. The most blatant aspects of this period are the visual ones seen in the retrospective current in art and architecture of the period, the facet which is most explored here, but contemporary with these and of equal importance are the chronicle counterparts to these visual narratives.

This fabrication and reworking of the past found its most eloquent expression in the third quarter of the century in Martino da Canal’s Estoires de Venise written between 1265 and 1272, published in 1275. 281 The retrospective current in art that seems to be forging and imitating early Christian art in Venice at this time had been active for decades, although this tale is produced almost simultaneously with the mosaics of the Cappella Zen, and the second and third Joseph cupolas in San Marco. In the prologue to this chronicle Canal makes plain the intention of his work so that “All would know of the deeds of the Venetians, and who they were, and whence they had come, and who they are, and how they built the noble city that is

279 Fortini-Brown, Venice and Antiquity, 14.
281 Fortini-Brown, Venice and Antiquity, 24.
called Venice that is truly the most beautiful in the world.”282 Also significant is Canal’s use of French, the first history to be written in Italy which makes use of the *volgare*, a significant break in tradition.283 This was by no means the language of the common Venetian, it was actually the language used at the French court, but it ensured maximum accessibility among the literate upper class. This enriching of the historical record was a way of ennobling the civic past and justifying the entrepreneurial present.284 In this chronicle he incorporates both the foundational myths of Attila the Hun as well as the Trojan traditions which he refined and embellished into a single, elevated agenda.285 The humble past of Venice was forgotten in favor of an affluent beginning where the new inhabitants constructed great churches and monasteries of gold and precious materials.

The portion of Canal’s chronicle which most strikingly coincides with the art of San Marco, not only in its renaissance of early Christian art, but in the creation of a new aspect of Venetian history altogether: the legend of the *predestinatio*. This story made a concurrent debut in chronicle and mosaics, as well as in the sculpture of St Mark’s vision of the angel in the tympanum above the main entrance to the basilica of San Marco.286 This story confirmed not only ancient, free, or holy foundations, but that the city enjoyed a divinely sanctioned destiny from the time of Christ.287 Venice in these mosaics was going beyond connection to the apostolic age and claiming a model for their destiny into the antiquity of the Old Testament. These mosaics are used as testimony or proof to the events they portray, not just pictures to delight the senses, or to remind the beholder of a history already known and proven, but a proof in itself. This is illustrated as Canal instructs his readers “if some of you wish to verify that those

things that happened just as I told you, come to see the beautiful church of San Marco in Venice, and look at it right in front, because this story is written here just as I have told you.”

At the end of the thirteenth century, in 1292 another chronicler known as “Marco” began writing his own history of the city, and in it we can see how this myth was further developed as time went on, further disconnecting from Aquilean connection as well as firmly placing the date of foundation 454 years prior to Rome.

Venice was not alone; the thirteenth century was a time of heightened consciousness in all of Italy concerning civic origins. In Perugia Nicola and Giovanni Pisano completed works equivalent to encyclopedias in stone documenting her mythic beginnings in the Roman era as well as her pious Christian present. Similar instances can be seen in Genoa, Ravenna, Bologna, Brescia, and Turin, who all claimed mythical beginnings either as distinguished Roman cities or as originating prior to Rome by figures such as Janus or Tubal. Perhaps this is displayed most boldly in Milan, whose historians placed the foundation 932 prior to Rome, specifically Bonvesin de la Riva writing in 1288, who claimed the papacy should move from Rome to their own fair city. It is clear that Venetian self-fashioning is not singular among thirteenth-century Italian city-states, yet it remains unique to the Venetian state and was a major contribution to the consolidation of the Venetian civic identity.

Although the Venetians are not unique in their attempts at self-fashioning and historical manipulation, they are unique in their strong use of not simply apostolic connection, but of Old Testament connection, as well as the use of predestination concerning both the presence of St Mark and the conquest of Constantinople. Venice, as the state with the shallowest history among the Italian states was contending not only with refashioning or representing its ancient and

289 Fortini-Brown, Venice and Antiquity, 25.
290 Fortini-Brown, Venice and Antiquity, 25.
291 Fortini-Brown, Venice and Antiquity, 25.
legitimizing past, but creating it from scratch. Also unique to Venice was the importance of disentangling Venetian history and claims to power from the histories of Aquilea and Constantinople. These cities were once entities that Venice drew upon as it developed myths of origin and ecclesiastical authority. In the thirteenth century, events had led to a new priority in Venetian historiography; these emerged after the distancing of Venice from a good relationship with the Pope, the extinguishing of the former relationship with Byzantium in 1204, and its rising authority due to its maritime dominance and commercial wealth. All of these changes had given Venice a new sense of power and independence which required a distancing from former cultural dependencies as well as a stronger, more profound ancient Christian past which could justify the power of the Venetians in this era. They had defined themselves in this century not only as the predestined home of St Mark, but as the rightful and destined usurper of Byzantine power as predicted by Constantine, and as such the inheritor of the ancient Christian legacy of Byzantium.

When considering the shift in the thirteenth-century chronicles from former redactions of Venetian history, as well as the noted archaic style in art of the period it becomes apparent that behind all of these works there is a strong and irrefutable drive to deal with history through public art and writing. The manner of dealing with history, heritage, and the past in Venice is something which has concerned scholars and is a constant source of complexity in dealing with Venetian art. To the largest extremes this attempt in the thirteenth century to represent a more ancient historical foundation through art and monuments is expressed through the copying of ancient works which can be seen in several Byzantine relief sculptures, the copies of which are hard to distinguish from the original.292 This meticulous Venetian copying of early Christian works, including the use of the Cotton Genesis as a miniature model, the display of genuine ancient

spolia from Constantinople, themes of typology and prophecy in the Old Testament cycle, and even the reformulation of Venetian foundational history are all coming from a uniquely medieval concept of the past and the use of it in writing and art for political purposes.

The fact that Venice was creating its own ancient past is not new to the thirteenth century. Traces of this can be seen back to the theft of Mark’s relics, and very clearly in the chronicles, art, and histories of the eleventh and twelfth centuries, the issue at hand is how and why this self-fashioning changed courses in the thirteenth century. Also of importance is the worldview which would not only allow this sort of refashioning of history, but also call for it as the future of Venice as an empire became more imminent. Even in the eleventh-century chronicles of John the Deacon it is apparent that Venice had transformed itself from an outpost of the Byzantine Empire to a more independent republic. Yet, after the conquest of Constantinople and the events of 1177 it became clear that Venice no longer had to turn to Byzantine or Roman antecedents to appropriate a past which could legitimize it as an influential merchant republic, it could establish a history which was holier and more ancient then either.

The foundation on which medieval government is built required interplay with history, thus historiography played an important role in the politics of a medieval society which was consistently dependent on the past for current legitimacy. Not only the present institutions but the future success of the Empire was believed, in the Middle Ages, to be determined by its early development, and in the case of Venice, in times previous to its development through prophecy and typological references made in the art and chronicles. The identity of a republic, empire, or nation focused on the past as well as finding a legitimizing role, as did many

---

295 Brown, 146.
Italian city-states in this era, within the Greco-Roman world.\textsuperscript{296} The importance in investigating this medieval preoccupation with history as it affects Venice is that it exposes within the visual histories the underlying beliefs and techniques of expressing and dealing with the changing political standing during Venetian assent to world power.\textsuperscript{297}

Gabrielle Spiegel in her study of the \textit{Political Utility of Medieval Historiography}, discusses at length the medieval relationship with the past, a topic which speaks strongly to the subject of a changing attitude of Venice towards history as its political goals and abilities outgrew the previously constructed myths of foundation. Medieval social life was governed by historical precedent, but even more inherent is the manner in which it affected medieval government. In theory, medieval government originated in the divine will of God, and this idea of an “extra temporal” dimension of medieval politics was played out in the \textit{promissione} of the Doge, or even more pointedly, the manner in which the Doge’s power was explicitly bound to that of St Mark.\textsuperscript{298} This was displayed through the ceremony of the Doge when he was invested with the \textit{vexillum} of St Mark at the high altar of San Marco immediately above the Evangelist’s relics. In a general way, divine right to rule or to hold power, remained the foundation of political legitimacy throughout the medieval period, thus feeding the need for foundational legitimacy or “signs” of being a “Chosen People” or Empire.\textsuperscript{299} In this sense, there is a dichotomy between an obsession with the past as well as an ability to manipulate or draw typological conclusions from unrelated events from history. The belief that God created events of the past in order to signify the future simplified the need for a historical legitimacy by working within a typology drawn from the medieval and early Christian treatment of the Bible.

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{296} Brown, 146.
\item \textsuperscript{297} Spiegel, 314.
\item \textsuperscript{298} Spiegel, 315.
\item \textsuperscript{299} Spiegel, 315.
\end{itemize}
Within the medieval concept of time the practice of historiography was not merely a record of facts or events, but a manner in which the actuality of history could be created. This can be seen most clearly in sources which represent the past in a manner which links it to the present. The archaic style of the Venetian mosaics of the thirteenth century clearly works to connect the current position of Venice with both early Christian and pre-Christian historical models and histories. These archaic images do not represent an inability to innovate and create. In fact, the more accustomed the mosaicists got to translating the miniatures of the *Cotton Genesis* to a monumental form, the more innovative they became, and the more the program shifts from careful reproduction to a work of purely thirteenth-century style and motivations.

These imitations and appropriations display a compelling necessity to find in the past a means to explain and legitimize the deviations from their previous position as a privileged daughter of the ancient Christian empire of Byzantium, to a position as “Lord of Three-Eighths of Byzantium” and possessor of the valued relics of Constantinople alongside those of St Mark. After 1204 the Venetians could claim that the power invested in Constantine’s relics, as the True Cross and other ancient relics had been taken as spoils in the Fourth Crusade. The chronicler Marco, writing in 1290, found prophetic sanction for this idea, when Constantine set up his column, Marco affirms, he inscribed text on its base, foretelling the city’s fall to the Latins when the cross fell from its summit. The Venetians fulfilled this promise when they helped conquer Constantinople in 1204.

When considering these changes in Venetian political standing, and the attempt connect this with the artistic and historical changes at this time, it is necessary to recognize that beyond

---

301 Spiegel, 315.
the medieval fascination with history and foundational legends, the Middle Ages were characterized by both a historical and a typological mindset. In the Old Testament cycle and its use of an early Christian model it is plain that this typological mindset, as it pertains to the Bible and Old Testament events, was present during the era of the Cotton Genesis, but as seen in the Creation Cupola these tendencies were exaggerated as was popular in later medieval thinking. Individuals of the Middle Ages did not consider themselves separate from this concept of time experienced in typological analysis of the Bible, there was still a sense of time as a course of universal and salvational history which began at Creation and continued in thirteenth-century Venice, to one day be completed in the Second Coming. This explains the rich use of forgeries, historical legends, and myths in medieval political life. The legends created in Venetian chronicles and in the mosaics of San Marco illustrate the manner in which quasi-historical traditions can be shaped to present needs.

Unique to the San Marco mosaics are the visual allusions which tie the history of St Mark and the Venetians to Old Testament examples. Although many medieval governments made significant attempts to lay claim to Roman or early Christian history, often through the theft of relics, the references of San Marco that connect Venetian institutions to prophetic Christian myths and Old Testament models is a uniquely complex effort among foundational myths. This malleability of history within the medieval mindset, and ability to connect history no matter how ancient, was fruitful in the establishment of the Venetian identity. The past could be a vehicle for change, all that was needed was to recreate it in the image of the present and claim its authority for legitimization of current practices or institutions. The medieval chronicler, or

---

304 Goetz, 157.
305 Goetz, 165.
306 Spiegel, 316.
307 Brown, 154.
308 Spiegel, 316.
mosaicist, utilized a very fluid perspective with regard to past and present, shaping a vision of the past that could be manipulated and supply legitimacy to the present. The concept of the past in these mosaics was one deeply based in the Christian belief and sense of time, thus in representation of historical events typological comparisons were permissible. The sense that time belonged to God and could be changed and molded, made the lines between past, present and future blurred.

These forgeries of the Venetian past, of early Christian art, and the use of early Christian models are important to understanding the current in Venetian self-identity regardless of their deceitfulness. As Giles Constable asserts, works of this nature hold a “mirror to the period in which they were made.” With the mix of displayed forgeries and spolia from Constantinople it is possible to detect the desire of the era in what they were copying or using as emblems. Once, in the eleventh and twelfth centuries the models for Venetian art lay in Byzantium, an empire with which Venice enjoyed special privileges and was emulating in order to utilize their legacy and antiquity. Yet in this century, after the conquest of Constantinople and the overall growth of the Venetian empire through Crete, Dalmatia, Zara, and other holdings, emulation of Byzantium was left behind in favor of the pre-Christian and early Christian myths or copies present in San Marco. In this sense it is clear why Constable asserted that “forgeries or plagiarism follow rather then create the fashion of their time and can without paradox be considered among the most authentic products of their time.” He is insisting that this level of effort to imitate or even forge history or art is one of the clearest indicators of the political or ecclesiastical desires in a medieval state, and that they offer their own value as a historical source. Just like miracles (such as the apparatio), visions (such as those of St Mark, Joseph, or Abraham), and other works of

309 Goetz, 164.
310 Constable, 156.
311 Constable, 1.
312 Constable, 2.
social imagination, forgeries serve to justify profound social needs and reflected hopes of the people of the Middle Ages.\textsuperscript{313}

Many scholars have recognized the Republic of Venice as a very unique entity in its abandonment within self-fashioning in this era of both Byzantine and Roman origins.\textsuperscript{314} As discussed, Venice was not the only Italian city-state to create a fictitious past, yet it is the only one to set roots outside of the Roman Empire. At this time of refashioning, upon gaining status as a colonial empire, Venice represented herself as the first republic of the new era, destined to be the historical successor to pagan Rome, born into Christian liberty.\textsuperscript{315} It is unique and noticeable that Venice chose at this point to highlight the fact that it was not of Roman foundation in its legend of Trojan foundation, dispersal by Attila the Hun, and arrival in Venice, as a pious and wealthy people. Slowly, prior to the Fourth Crusade Venice had asserted itself as a separate entity from Byzantium as well, and in the end asserted superiority, David Rosand speculates that Venice aspired not to be a “New Rome” or “New Constantinople” but a “New Jerusalem” and a city beloved by God.\textsuperscript{316}

Once the purpose of these shifting historical images is established, it is necessary to ascertain that they were truly intended to inspire and represent this shift within the venue of San Marco. In this medieval context Constable asserts that “people lived in the past in a very real sense.”\textsuperscript{317} Due to this connection with the past the art, architecture and ceremony of an environment such as San Marco could create closeness, and at times an identity, with history. The typological function of historical events was so much a part of experiencing historical accounts that such blatant references would not have gone unnoticed, such as on the façade, the

\textsuperscript{313} Constable, 3.
\textsuperscript{315} Rosand, Myths of Venice, 6.
\textsuperscript{316} Rosand, Myths of Venice, 13.
\textsuperscript{317} Constable, 49.
Cappella Zen, which leads directly to the account of the Chosen People, the story of Abraham and his preference for the younger son as well as the Gentiles, or even the Creation Cupola with its clear early Christian references and typology. The line between myth and history, just like the line between past and present, in Venice was thin but through the use of documents and visual imagery the difference between myth and history could be obliterated, turning mythical past into historical fact by giving myth meaning in broad historical narratives.\textsuperscript{318} There was no sense that the events in the Joseph narrative, or in the story of the Chosen People directly led to the fate of Venice, but within this Christian view of time and typological reference the events of the past can create models which legitimize the events of the present or future. The old event foreshadows the new event, thus the past becomes a prophecy and the present becomes a “predeterminant.”\textsuperscript{319} In the predestinatio legend the rise of Venice is literally prophesied before the Evangelist, but in more subtle ways, which were part of this typological mindset, much of the atrium mosaics play this prophetic role as well, legitimizing the current role of Venice.

The shift in Venetian historiography and historical imagery may be summarized in the words of Patricia Fortini-Brown, in Venice “historiographical aspirations were heightened to match Venice’s new role as a colonial empire.”\textsuperscript{320} It is not surprising that this shift was expressed in art as well as historical writing, affecting the communal memory of Venetian foundation in the images at San Marco. Art was the strongest and most far reaching medium for influencing the opinions and memories of a medieval population or culture, especially in a site such as San Marco. As discussed throughout this paper, the site of San Marco was of enormous value culturally, religiously and politically. In fact, in psychological investigations it has been found that there are certain historical “memory sites” in which the memory of the entire nation or religious

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{318} De Vivo, 165.
\item \textsuperscript{319} Siegel, 321.
\item \textsuperscript{320} Fortini Brown, "Self Definition of the Venetian Republic," 514.
\end{itemize}
community is played out or represented, a place where the communal or cultural memory is molded, in San Marco this is done through visual imagery.\footnote{Jan Assmann, \textit{Religion and Cultural Memory}, (Stanford, California: Stanford UP, 2006), 15.} This means of artistic representation as a historical source in the Middle Ages is one whose potency cannot be overstated, images in this culture were “signposts specifically designed to guide the mind to higher truths.”\footnote{Lamia, 27.} It is clear that the worldview of medieval citizens would have been conducive to understanding the intentions of these typological and prophetic mosaics installed in San Marco, and that a visual method is one which was equal to or better than written narrative in creating historical truths within this Venetian self-fashioning. Once both the medieval understanding of history and the concept of imagery as an historical document are established it is possible to see these mosaics as works which express fundamental ideas concerning the nature of medieval political reality and its relation to the past. The past is utilized here to promote a new age of Venetian self-fashioning. This concept is asserted by Debra Pincus, who refers to this era as “the creative period of state celebration” in which there was a sense “of the fortunes of Venice under divine supervision tak[ing] visual form.”\footnote{Pincus, “Christian Relics and the Body Politic,” 48.} It is here, in the thirteenth century, as imitation of other empires or cities is abandoned, that the culmination of the mythogenesis of Venice is established through visual imagery.\footnote{Pincus, “Christian Relics and the Body Politic,” 50.}

The purpose of this study was to identify the purpose and impetus behind the shift which occurred in the imagery of the thirteenth-century mosaics within the ducal chapel of San Marco. The methods for reaching these conclusions were threefold, first, to identify the political and social factors which would lead to a new Venetian desire in self-fashioning. Second, to analyze the medieval understanding of concepts such as history, time, and imagery, that would make this shift not only possible but necessary. Third, to examine the iconography and cues
within the mosaics in order to identify the message intended and received concerning this reconfiguration of Venetian history. In the drastically altered political climate of thirteenth-century Venice it becomes clear why such changes would be necessary. Medieval Italy was a culture in which history and foundational myths acted as indicators of the present and future destiny of a people or nation. For Venice, a nation with growing success, and a noticeably shallow history, it became crucial to create a past and identity which justified the power gained by this republic in the thirteenth century. Venice had broken its once strong alliance with the Papacy, and was the power behind the overthrowing of the great Christian empire of Byzantium.

This shift produced a need for a more sacred and historically legitimate purpose for the Venetians, they had outgrown their previous foundational legends, and required a myth which could justify this newly powerful empire. This was an empire that was in control of the most ancient of empires and separated from the legitimizing blessing of the Papacy. Thus, Venice worked within medieval concepts of time and history, as a malleable tool of God’s power and will, to create a new understanding of Old Testament events as well as a new legend of St Mark. This legend, represented in the most important of Venetian venues, succeeded in legitimizing Venice long before the theft of Mark’s relics. In fact, this myth changed Venice into a nation founded by St Mark, and molded the _furta sacra_ of his relics from an urban theft into a fulfillment of ancient prophecy from the era of Christ and the apostles.

This unique approach to foundational myth separated Venice, as Rosand described it not as a New Rome or New Constantinople, but as more then both: a New Jerusalem. Not only was Venice a predestined nation, which would inherit the glory of both Romes by the blessing of God, but the imagery in San Marco takes these allusions a further step by tying the prophecy of St Mark, and the foundation of Venice to Old Testament models. This relationship was achieved through various complex uses of visual cues and physical connections within the basilica,
including the use of the early Christian *Cotton Genesis*. These cues were used to signal connections between the narratives of Venice and St Mark to the plight of the Chosen People from the creation of the world to the exodus from Egypt, which so closely mirrors the exodus of St Mark from Alexandria. The images of the atrium were prefaced by the new narrative of the life of St Mark, imagery which would have prepared the viewer to view the mosaics of the atrium in a specifically nationalistic manner. This may have ensured that visual parallels in the Old Testament would have been noticed and layered into the complex myth spun by Venice in this period. These visual allusions not only established a unique foundational myth but created a pre-foundational myth which utilized typological references. These references were used in this instance to signal the Venetian people as a new “Chosen People” of God, a nation whose importance went far beyond their physical foundation and became part of a continuing salvational and biblical history, in a manner which may be unparalleled in the medieval Italian world.
FIGURES

FIGURE 1, SOUTH DOME, VIEW FROM BELOW, ELEVENTH CENTURY, DEMUS

FIGURE 2, MAIN PORCH, SAINTS LUKE AND MARK, ELEVENTH CENTURY, DEMUS
FIGURE 3, INTRODUCTION OF ADAM AND EVE, WEITZMANN

FIGURE 4, THIRD DAY OF CREATION, OR THE CREATION OF THE PLANTS, WEITZMANN

FIGURE 5, CREATION CUPOLA, VIEW FROM BELOW, DEMUS
Figure 6, Creation of the Birds and Marine Creatures, Demus

Figure 7, Spirit Above the Waters, Demus

Figure 8, Separation of Light and Darkness, Demus
FIGURE 9, DETAIL OF CHRIST-LOGOS, FROM FORMING OF ADAM, DEMUS

FIGURE 10, NAMING OF THE ANIMALS, DEMUS

FIGURE 11, FORMATION OF ADAM, WEITZMANN
FIGURE 12, Animation of Adam, Weitzmann

FIGURE 13, Creation of Eve, Howell

FIGURE 14, Introduction of Adam and Eve, Howell
FIGURE 15, Denial of Guilt, Howell

FIGURE 16, Judgment of Adam and Eve, Demus

FIGURE 17, Expulsion of Adam and Eve, Demus
FIGURE 18, LABORS OF ADAM AND EVE, DEMUS

FIGURE 19, BEGETTING OF CAIN, DEMUS

FIGURE 20, CURSE OF CAIN, DEMUS

FIGURE 21, BIRTH OF ABEL, DEMUS
FIGURE 22, ABRAHAM CUPOLA, DEMUS

FIGURE 23, BIRTH AND CIRCUMCISION OF ISAAC, DEMUS

FIGURE 24, JOSEPH CUPOLA I, DEMUS
Figure 25, Joseph Cupola II, Demus

Figure 26, Joseph Cupola II, Demus

Figure 27, Joseph Sold to Potiphar, Demus
FIGURE 28, Joseph Gathering Corn, Demus

FIGURE 29, Reception of Mark’s Relics by the Doge, Demus

FIGURE 30, Moses Cupola, view from below, Demus

FIGURE 31, The Miracles of the Manna and the Quails, Demus
FIGURE 32, REMOVAL OF MARK’S BODY, DEMUS

FIGURE 33, TRANSPORTATION OF MARK’S RELICS, DEMUS

FIGURE 34, SHIP SAVED BY MARK, DEMUS
**Figure 35, Reception of Mark’s Relics, Demus**

**Figure 36, Prayers for the Discovery of the Body (Preghiera), Demus**

**Figure 37, Discovery of the Relics (Apparatio), Demus**
FIGURE 38, CAPPELLA ZEN, VIEW FROM BELOW, DEMUS

FIGURE 39, LEGEND OF MARK (PREDESTINATIO), DEMUS
Works Cited


Weitzmann, Kurt, and Herbert L. Kessler. The Illustrations in the Manuscripts of the 


Williamson, Jennifer J. The Joseph Cycle in the Atrium of San Marco, Venice. Washington UP, 
1996.
Progress on a photovoltaic cell design consisting of silicon nanowires and poly(3-hexylthiophene)

Lori Noice 1, Gary Goncher 1, Raj Solanki 1,2

1 Department of Physics, Portland State University, P.O. Box 751, Portland, OR 97206-0751
2 Department of Computer Science and Electrical Engineering, Oregon Graduate Institute, Beaverton, OR 97006-8921

Abstract
A bulk-heterojunction photovoltaic cell design made from silicon nanowires (SiNW) and poly(3-hexylthiophene) (P3HT) could provide the photon absorption and charge transport needed for a high efficiency hybrid PV cell. Since the mechanisms associated with the inorganic/organic semiconductor heterojunction are not yet well understood, the simple design of the proposed PV cell and tunable properties of both SiNW and P3HT affords experimental optimization opportunities.

Introduction
For decades, solar radiation has been a strong candidate for an ecologically friendly and globally sustainable energy source. Indeed, covering only 0.16 % of the Earth’s surface with commercially available 10 % efficiency PV cells would provide almost double the world’s collective energy needs [1]. Yet, despite a steady increase in PV power system installations (~36 % a year from 2000-20041), PV power remains unfamiliar to utilities companies and the general public alike due to high production costs [2]. At around $3 Watt/hour to produce, PV power is a cost effective energy solution for only the most remote locations2, and in order for PV power to become competitive with other renewable energy markets (e.g. hydroelectric or wind generated electricity), the production costs must be reduced by an order of magnitude [2,3].

The majority of the commercially available PV power systems are made from single crystalline silicon or amorphous silicon (c-Si and a-Si, respectively), with power conversion efficiencies (PCE) between 11 - 25 % [2]. About half of the total production cost involved with these systems is associated with the Si purification and production, which involves temperatures in excess of 1400 °C, vacuum systems, clean rooms, chlorinated compounds, and large amounts of water, energy, and feedstock waste [4,5]. Thin film PV cells utilizing CdTe (cadmium telluride) or CdSe offer similar efficiencies [2,6], however there are environmental concerns with production and disposal of PV cells containing heavy metals. The weight, appearance, and brittleness of inorganic PV cells have also contribute to the lack of PV power implementation through high shipping costs and limited architectural integration capabilities [3].

In response to the shortcomings of inorganic PV cells and aided by advancements in organic photoelectric materials for photodetectors, FETs, and LEDs, organic PV cells have become the object of intensive research in recent years. Organic thin film PV cells made from semiconducting polymers are light weight [7], low in toxicity, offer dramatic reductions in processing costs [3,8-12], tunable optical properties [7,13,14], as well as mechanical flexibility and durability [15]. However, the PCEs of organic PV cells are typically less than 2 % and no greater than 5 % [7,10-13,16-19]. The efficiencies of these PV cells are limited by the intrinsically low carrier concentrations and mobilities of polymers [15,19,20]. Many photoactive layer architectures have been devised to overcome these limitations by creating high surface area heterojunctions and alternate charge transport routes through the incorporation of nanostructures, including polymer/fullerene [9,10,15,21], polymer/metal oxide [21-24], and polymer/traditional semiconductor heterojunctions [3,10,21,24,25]. Most of these architectures rely on percolation pathways which present their own efficiency issues, namely, the presence of structural traps resulting in charge build up and the recombination of photogenerated charge carriers [10,21,24,26,27].

This paper reports on the progress of a hybrid inorganic/organic PV cell design which has the potential of providing affordable solar energy. The photoactive layer of the proposed PV cell would be a bulk heterojunction constructed of silicon nanowires (SiNWs) and poly(3-hexylthiophene) (P3HT). SiNWs could potentially be considerably cheaper to produce than either c-Si or a-Si while retaining the capacity for high degrees of crystallinity and purity. P3HT has been shown to absorb more of the optical spectrum than other polymer semiconductors [2,19,28-30,32,33] and has the highest reported mobility [15,29,31]. P3HT also offers the advantage of a variety of wet processing methods which are

---

1 Out of the twenty participating countries, 88 % of the installations were in Germany, Japan, and the United States [2]
2 e.g. Kenya has one of the few spontaneous PV power markets existing without government subsidies [2]
easily upgradeable to large scale production [19]. Both of these materials possess tunable optical and electronic properties and, working together, could potentially overcome some of the inadequacies and setbacks found in previous hybrid PV cell designs.

**SiNW/P3HT PV cell design**

Figure 1 shows the proposed architecture for the SiNW/P3HT PV cell. The SiNWs would be anchored to a substrate of c-Si with the n-type P3HT completely surrounding and slightly covering them to create an extended heterojunction throughout the photoactive layer and unbroken pathways to the electrodes of the cell. Like most semiconducting polymers, P3HT is p-type [19,24], therefore, the SiNWs would be doped n-type. The cathode would be a fine Au mesh placed on top of the P3HT, and the anode: a thin Al film deposited on the underside of the c-Si substrate. Figure 2 is the energy band diagram of the constituent materials of the SiNW/P3HT PV cell.

For this PV cell, both the SiNWs and the P3HT would act as absorbers and carrier transporters [36].

**Power conversion efficiency**

The PCE (\( \eta_{\text{power}} \)) of a PV cell is defined as the power produced by the PV cell divided by the radiant power incident on the cell. The power produced by the PV cell (\( P_{\text{out}} \)) is equal to the current at the maximum power point (\( I_{\text{MP}} \)) times the voltage at maximum power point (\( V_{\text{MP}} \)). This value corresponds to the short circuit current (\( I_{\text{SC}} \)) times the open circuit (\( V_{\text{OC}} \)) times a quality factor called the fill factor (FF) [19].

\[
\eta_{\text{power}} = \frac{P_{\text{out}}}{P_{\text{in}}} = \frac{I_{\text{MP}} \cdot V_{\text{MP}}}{P_{\text{in}}} = \frac{I_{\text{SC}} \cdot V_{\text{OC}} \cdot FF}{P_{\text{in}}} \quad (4)
\]

The relationship between these variables can be seen in the I-V curve of a PV cell. Figure 3 is a generic I-V curve of a hypothetical PV cell. The dashed line represents the functioning of the cell in the dark, where virtually no current would flow in the circuit until a forward bias greater than the open circuit voltage is applied and the contacts would begin to inject charge into the circuit. The dark line represents the cell functioning under illumination (current flows in the opposite direction than when in the dark). The maximum photogenerated current would be under short circuit conditions, and the maximum potential of the cell would be at open circuit [19,37].

![Figure 1: The Proposed SiNW/P3HT PV cell. The P3HT would completely coat the SiNWs creating an extended p-n junction throughout the photoactive layer. The cathode would be a Au grid and the anode would be an Al thin film. The nanowires would be anchored onto a more heavily doped substrate of n-type c-Si.](image1)

![Figure 2: The energy band diagram showing the HOMO and LUMO levels of the P3HT [18,19,28,30,32,33], the band gap of the Si [34], and the work functions of the two electrodes [35].](image2)

![Figure 3: A hypothetical I-V curve for a generic PV cell. The values of \( V_{\text{MP}} \) and \( I_{\text{MP}} \) are defined by the largest area rectangle that may fit under the I-V curve. The FF is the fraction of this area to the area contained within the values \( I_{\text{SC}} \) and \( V_{\text{OC}} \). (Adapted from [19]).](image3)
rectangle that may be placed under the I-V curve. This rectangle identifies the maximum power operational parameters of the cell $V_{MP}$ and $I_{MP}$, and its area is equal to $P_{o_t} = I_{MP} \cdot V_{MP}$. The FF would be the fraction of $P_{out}$ to $P_{ideal}$, and has a value between 0 and 1 [19,37].

$$FF = \frac{P_{out}}{P_{ideal}} = \frac{I_{MP} \cdot V_{MP}}{I_{SC} \cdot V_{OC}}$$

**Modeling a PV cell**

A PV cell may be modeled as a current source in parallel with a junction [16,19,31,37]. Figure 4a.) shows an idealized PV cell, where the current in the circuit ($I$) would be:

$$I = I_s e^{\frac{eV_{out}}{kT} - 1} - I_{ph}$$

The first term represents the dark current, where $I_s$ is the saturation current under reverse bias, $e$ is the electron charge, $V_{out}$ is the voltage across the external load, $k$ is the Boltzmann constant, $T$ is the temperature in K, and $I_{ph}$ is the illumination dependent current.

![Figure 4a. Equivalent circuit of a PV cell.](image)

For a high $V_{OC}$, the $R_{SH}$ should be as high as possible.

**Inorganic and organic semiconductors**

The efficiency of an inorganic/organic hybrid solar cell would be affected by the intrinsic differences in the ways the two types of semiconductors photogenerate and transport charges. A highly crystalline lattice of Si creates a well formed band energy structure which permeates the entire material. Incident photons absorbed by the Si lattice immediately generate charge carriers in the valence and conduction bands ($E_V$ and $E_C$, respectively). The photogenerated charge carriers are then pulled away from one another by the internal electric fields set up within the PV cell by the p-n junction and judicious choices of contacts [34]. Figure 5 is a schematic of a band structure material exhibiting the photoelectric effect. For inorganic semiconductors like Si, the energy difference between $E_V$ and $E_C$ (the band gap) is equal to both the optical energy gap ($E_{OG}$), which is the amount of energy that a photon must impart to the Si lattice to

$$I = I_s \left( 1 + \frac{R_S}{R_{SH}} \right) \frac{V_{out}}{R_{SH}} + I_{ph}$$

An ideality factor $n$, with a value between 1 and 2, has been introduced for the junction [16,37]. This may be rewritten as:

$$V_{OC} = \frac{nkT}{e} \ln \left( \frac{I_{SC}}{I_s} + 1 \right)$$

This factor accounts for tunneling and recombinations within the diode. A value of 1 represents a perfect diode, and 2 would indicated recombination processes are dominate [31].
excite charge carriers, and to the electrical energy gap ($E_{BG}$), which is the energy difference between the charge carriers.

Figure 5: The photoelectric effect in a semiconductor material such as Si. An incident photon excites an electron ($e^-$) from the valence band ($E_V$) to the conduction band ($E_C$), leaving behind a hole ($h^+$) in the $E_V$. Internal electric fields within the PV cell would then draw the two charged carriers away from one another towards their respective electrodes.

![Energy Diagram](image)

Figure 6a.) The poly(3-hexylthiophene) polymer unit. b.) A portion of the regioregular P3HT polymeric lattice (actual molecules would be over 150 units long) showing band-like energy states extending along the backbone of the thiophene chain. These band-like states are localized to individual molecular units [38,39].

These band-like energy states are associated with the $\pi$-bond, or the highest occupied molecular orbital (HOMO), and the $\pi^*$-bond, or the lowest occupied molecular orbital (LUMO) [38,39]. These states roughly correlate to the $E_V$ and the $E_C$ of an inorganic semiconductor, respectively [38], and dominate both the optical absorption and charge transport properties of the material [17].

Polymers do not form extended well-ordered crystal lattices due to their molecular size and the arrangements of their constituent atoms. Therefore, well-formed band energy states which permeate the entire material do not occur. Conjugated $\pi$-bonds, like those forming the thiophene backbone of P3HT, however, have a wide enough spatial energy distribution between the bonding and anti-bonding states ($\pi$ and $\pi^*$, respectively) to form localized band-like energy states in polymers (i.e. in molecules consisting of ~50 or more units) [37]. Figure 6 shows the P3HT molecular unit and illuminates the localized nature of the band-like $\pi$-$\pi^*$ bonds along the thiophene backbones within a P3HT lattice.

The energy difference between the HOMO and LUMO states may be regarded as the band gap of an inorganic semiconductor, yet a thin polymer film cannot be fully described by the band model [31,40]. While, like an inorganic semiconductors, the energy gap between the HOMO and LUMO states is equal to the $E_{OG}$, it is not equal to the $E_{BG}$ between charge carriers. This is due to the fact that charge carriers are not generated upon absorption of a photon by the polymer lattice. Instead, an excited but electrically neutral state, called an exciton, is created which requires additional energy ($E_B$) to separate into charge carriers [38,41]. This energy is gained form the offset of energy states at the heterojunction [41-46].

$$E_{BG} = E_{OG} + E_B$$

Figure 7 gives a band diagram for the p-n junction formed in an inorganic/organic PV cell. The exciton is formed by the absorption of a photon by the organic p-type polymer, and then diffuses to the heterojunction where it dissociates into charge carriers by the electric field created by the p-n junction. The h moves back into the HOMO state of the p-type polymer while the e is transferred to the $E_C$ of the n-type inorganic semiconductor [17,38,41]. Therefore, there are two different transport mechanisms taking place simultaneously within the polymer semiconductor: the transport of electrically neutral excitons to the p-n junction, and the transport of the charge carrier to the electrode.

---

4 Since the dielectric constant of polymers is low, and the electronic interaction between the molecules are weak (non-covalent bonding), the Coulombic potential well around the $e^-$ and $h^+$ conjugate pair is extended, while the carrier’s wave functions are restricted. This allows each carrier’s wave function to be inside the potential well of the other [41,48,49].
Immediately upon charge carrier generation, the carriers may recombine via the potential drop between the $E_C$ of the inorganic phase and the HOMO state of the organic phase or by Coulombic forces [38]. Although the forces driving recombination are partially those driving charge separation (i.e. band off-set energies and kinetic factors [31,41]), the rate of charge recombination are many orders of magnitude slower than the rate of charge separation [38,42].

Once the charge carriers have been generated at the p-n junction, the hole works its way back through the organic semiconductor to the cathode via both intra- and inter-band transport [14]. Figure 8 depicts how the charge carrier either drifts along one of the localized band-like state under the influence of the PV cells internal electric potential or “hops” to a neighboring band like state. The oxidation/reduction reaction of the inter-band transport may be described by the multiple trap and release model (MTR) (sometimes used to describe charge transport in a-Si) [37].

In the MTR model, the charge carrier forms a polaron with the localized band-like state by coupling with either phonons or lattice deformations induced by the presence of the carrier. The polarons are treated as defect states between the HOMO and LUMO bands; thus, the carriers move through the polymeric lattice by becoming repeatedly trapped/self-trapped by and then thermally released from the localized band-like states. This type of inter-band transport is only field dependent under relatively large electric fields$^5$. Figure 9 illuminates

---

$^5$ Electric fields on the order of $10^5$ V/cm$^2$ are sufficient to modify the Coulombic potentials near trapping levels enough to increase
the processes of photogenerated current in an organic semiconductor, from photon absorption to electricity, with the undesired heat-generating processes appearing in the third column.

For SiNW/P3HT PV cell, the photon absorption in the SiNWs would be affected by the nanowires’ morphology, band gaps, and the number of incident photons reaching them through the P3HT coating. The transportation of charge carriers in the SiNWs would be affected by their crystallinity, purity, morphology, and the band offset at the p-n junction.

With a band gap of 1.11 eV, Si can absorb over the entire visible spectrum, yet, since the optical absorption coefficient of Si decreases with crystallite size, the SiNWs would likely produce only one charge carrier pair per absorbed photon [51]. The band gaps of SiNWs are also dependent on the diameter as well as the orientation of the nanowires [27,52,53]. Under a diameter of approximately 2 nm, the band gaps of SiNWs may increase as much as 0.9 eV from that of bulk Si [51], and this affect is more pronounced in nanowires oriented in the [111] direction than the [110] direction [53]. Although deliberately increasing the band gaps of the SiNWs may not appear productive for photon harvesting, a bandgap of ~ 1.4 eV would still be sufficient to capture the entire visible spectrum [32] while providing some flexibility in tuning the band offset at the p-n junction. Figure 10 shows how the SiNW/P3HT PV cell could fail due to the disparity between the E\textsubscript{OG}s of the two materials if the band offset is not properly aligned.

PCE of the SiNW/P3HT PV cell

The PCE ($\eta_{power}$) of a hybrid PV cell is the sum of the PCEs of the constituent materials, where not only are the materials acting in tandem, but there functional properties are also dependent on one another so that many of these terms are interdependent.

$$\eta_{power} = \eta_{in} + \eta_{org}$$  \hspace{1cm} (7)

Many of the physical processes involved with the functioning of a hybrid PV cell are not yet fully understood, yet, once individually addressed, the efficiencies of each component of the cell may be experimentally optimized.

The PCE of SiNWs involves the efficiencies of photon absorption ($\eta_{in-abs}$) and charge carrier transport to the electrodes of the PV cell ($\eta_{in-trans}$) (Equation 8).

$$\eta_{power} = (\eta_{in-abs}) \cdot (\eta_{in-trans}) + (\eta_{org-abs}) \cdot (\eta_{org-trans})$$ \hspace{1cm} (8)

The PCE of SiNWs would be affected by the crystallinity, purity, morphology, and the band offset at the p-n junction.

Figure 9: The many stages of photogenerating current in organic semiconductors, with the potentially heat-generating losses in the third column. The additional steps, as compared to inorganic semiconductors, contribute to the lower efficiencies of organic PV cells. The adapted from [14].

Figure 10: The disparity in the E\textsubscript{OG}s between the SiNWs and the P3HT could result in a band offset which would not promote the transfer of charge carriers between the two semiconductors without an external bias.

Since the E\textsubscript{OG} of the P3HT is around 2.0 eV [1,19], it would be possible for the E\textsubscript{V} of the SiNW to be above the HOMO state of the P3HT, making the transfer of charge carriers between the two semiconductors energetically unfavorable without an external applied bias; charge carriers would build up on either side of the junction resulting in massive recombination losses. Indeed, due to the potentially
high level of crystallinity in SiNWs [54], the life spans and mobilities of the photogenerated charge carriers would be high, resulting in large recombination losses unless the internal electric potentials of the cell are sufficiently strong.

The use of SiNWs has additional advantages to bulk Si in that SiNWs have the potential for coherent and quantum transport of charge carriers, defects in one nanowire cannot directly affect the photo or electric properties of its neighbors, and the ability to modify the diameter, length and density of the nanowires allows control over the architecture of the p-n junction. Although the electron affinity of Si also scales with crystallite size [51], since the SiNWs would be anchored to a conducting substrate directly adjacent to the anode, the cell would not rely on percolation charge carrier transport, and this aspect of SiNWs would not be crucial to the functioning of the PV cell.

The PCE of the P3HT involves the photon absorption ($\eta_{\text{org-abs}}$), exciton dissociation ($\eta_{\text{org-diss}}$), and the transport of the charge carriers to the electrodes of the cell ($\eta_{\text{org-trans}}$) (Equation 8).

The factors influencing the photon absorption would be the $E_{\text{OG}}$, morphology, and the thickness of the P3HT layer. The $E_{\text{OGs}}$ of the P3AT thin films are heavily dependent on morphology, but are typically around 2.0 eV [18,19,28,30,32,33]6. This is a bit narrow compared to the optical spectrum and can lead to a low $I_{\text{SC}}$ [18,19,39,51] unless compensated for by either increasing the thickness of the film, incorporating lower $E_{\text{OG}}$ materials, or introducing light trapping geometries [19]. In the context of the SiNW/P3HT PV cell, however, the SiNWs would be the optimal absorbers, and attempting to increase the photon harvest of the P3HT would be non-productive. The optical absorption coefficients of organic semiconductors can be relatively high7, and in order to optimize the percentage of photons passing through the P3HT film to become incident on the SiNWs, the P3HT layer should be no more than 100 nm thick [17,36].

Some photons would be absorbed into the P3HT layer, and the factors affecting the exciton transport and dissociation would be the degree of crystallinity, purity, and morphology of the film, the extent of the depletion region [42], and the band offset at the p-n junction. Although it would be possible for excitons to dissociate at the depletion region formed at the junction between the P3HT and cell’s cathode, this would not, in general, be productive towards photogenerated current due to recombination losses resulting from poor minority carrier mobility back through the polymer to the p-n junction [42].

The diffusion lengths of P3HT vary from 1-10 nm [8,17,29,36], and since excitons may diffuse in any direction during their lifetime, there exists an optimal distance of approximately 20 nm between depletion regions such that the exciton may reach a p-n junction before decaying or becoming trapped. The extent of the depletion region would be controlled by the doping concentration of the SiNWs, and the mobility of the minority carriers on either side of the hybrid heterojunction [55]. Because inorganic semiconductors have significantly higher carrier mobilities than organic semiconductors, the size of the depletion region would be considerably smaller on the side of the P3HT than on the SiNW side. Ideally, the two semiconductors would have similar $E_{\text{OG}}$ with a large energy band offset at the p-n junction to insure exciton dissociation and attain as high a $I_{\text{SC}}$ as possible while maintaining a large $V_{\text{OC}}$ [32,36,39].

Charge carrier mobility in the P3HT would be affected by the degree of crystallinity [18,19,36,41], the morphology, and the purity [27,41] of the film. Due to the improved stacking of the molecules [18,31,32], regioregular P3HT would be preferable [56,57] with reported mobilities between ~10^-4 to 0.1 cm^2V^-1s^-1 [29,58]. The degree of crystallinity in P3HT thin films may be controlled with the processing conditions (e.g. type of solvent used, substrate [17], atmosphere [59,60], and annealing [15,61]. Collection of charges at the cathode has been shown to be improved by a rougher P3HT/metal surface morphology [15].

Trap densities must remain low to assure a high FF [19], yet organic semiconductors are notoriously susceptible to air and moisture [17,27,36,48]7. The FF factor may also be improved by balancing the mobilities of charge carriers on either side of the p-n junction so that a bottleneck does not form at the hybrid heterojunction which would result in recombination losses [36].

Experimental Details
The SiNW were grown by vapor-solid (VS) and vapor-liquid-solid (VLS) methods. For both methods, a quartz horizontal furnace with electronic flow meters was used. Both methods employed 10 %

---

6 The $E_{\text{OGs}}$ of P3ATs appear only slightly dependent on the chain length (i.e. varying by only ~ 0.2 eV between P3HT, P3OT, and P3DDT); in general, the longer the side chain, the larger the $E_{\text{OG}}$ and the lower the optical absorption coefficient [18].

7 The optical absorption coefficients of the semiconducting polymers used in organic PV cell are on the order of 10^5 cm^-1 [17,36].
\( \text{Si}_2\text{H}_6 \) in \( \text{Ar} \) and 100 ppm \( \text{PH}_3 \) in \( \text{Ar} \) at a ratio of \( \text{P} : \text{Si} \) on the order of \( 10^{-3} \), with a total reactor pressure of 2 Torr.

For the VS method, a glass substrate coated with a 200 nm thin film of indium tin oxide (ITO) was used to nucleate the nanowires on small crystallite sites. The SiNWs were grown on the ITO surface at 410 °C for 10-15 min.

The VLS method utilized a Au:Si eutectic. The nanowires were grown for 10-15 min at 440 °C on a substrate of a-Si which had been dip coated in 3-mercaptopropyl-trimethoxysilane (MPTMS) before being dipped in Au nanoparticles suspended in di-ionized water. All the SiNWs were treated with HF to remove some of the SiO\(_2\) prior to the application of the P3HT.

Due to the sensitivity of the P3HT to air and moisture, all procedures involving the P3HT were performed in a glove box under flowing \( \text{N}_2 \). The P3HT was purchased from Sigma Inc. as a semicrystalline powder and dissolved in xylene that had been bubbled with \( \text{N}_2 \) to remove oxygen. The P3HT was evaporated over the SiNWs at room temperature, however, a continuous thin film was not achieved. P3HT was also dropped onto a SiNW substrate and sandwiched with a top plate of ITO on glass; this also did not produce a continuous thin film.

**Results and Discussion**

The appearance of the SiNWs grown by VS method had a fuzzy camel color, whereas the SiNWs grown by the VLS method appeared fuzzy white. Although the low temperature processing should have helped prevent the diffusion of impurities, some from the Au from the eutectic apparently became incorporated into the bulk of the SiNWs, affecting their optical properties. Figure 11 shows a transmission electron microscopy (TEM) image of the VLS SiNWs. The nanowires grew in the [110] direction with no visible defects in the crystal lattice. They were 10-50 nm in diameter (depending on the size of the Au nanoparticles used) with an \( \approx 2 \) nm layer of SiO\(_2\) covering the nanowires.

Figure 12 shows a scanning electron microscopy (SEM) image of the VLS SiNWs. The nanowires had grown into a mat several micrometers thick, with the density decreasing towards the top of the mat. The nanowires were 10-15 \( \mu \text{m} \) in length.

![Figure 11](image1.png) Figure 11: A TEM image of the SiNW showing a well ordered crystalline lattice with a SiO\(_2\) coating \( \approx 2 \) nm thick.

![Figure 12](image2.png) Figure 12: An SEM image of the SiNW grown on a-Si substrate using VLS method. The average distance between nanowires increases as the wires grow away from substrate.

Time of flight secondary ion-mass spectroscopy (TOFSMS) gave the average P concentration for the bulk VLS SiNWs as \( 3.4 \times 10^{17} \) cm\(^{-3}\). Energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDXS) of individual nanowires gave the P concentration at \( 3 \times 10^{18} \) cm\(^{-3}\). Based on the estimated diffusion length of P in Si (assuming 450 °C for 30 min, this would be \( \approx 2 \times 10^4 \) nm), diffusion was unlikely to be the doping mechanism for either type of SiNWs. Although the
thermodynamic mechanisms involved are not clear, the PH$_3$ apparently decomposed alongside the Si$_3$H$_6$ during the VS growth of the nanowires, likewise, the P in the VLS SiNWs became incorporate during formation despite the lack of a Au:P eutectic. EDXS from the VS SiNWs show no detectable levels of In or Sn from the ITO substrate.

The use of xylene for the dissolution of P3HT has been shown to produce higher efficiencies in polymer based PV cells than the use of chlorobenzene or chloroform [32,62]. However, the P3HT did not dissolve completely in the xylene, and since evaporation under a controlled atmosphere has produced well ordered thin films with low concentrations of impurities [10,63], this method is worth pursuing with other solvents. High quality thin films of P3HT may also be achieved with spin coating or screen printing, but these also require good solubility [19,42]. Other, less practical, options for the P3HT deposition, such as electropolymerization, which produces films of considerably lower order [48], or evaporation [19] which would require a lower molecular weight than what is readily commercially available and may not penetrate between the SiNWs, were disregarded.

Once a thin film of P3HT is achieved, preliminary investigations would include determining the optical absorption coefficient and carrier mobility of the film since both qualities are heavily dependent on morphology. Cyclic voltometry may be used to determine the oxidation/reduction potentials, and by utilizing a reference “half” electrochemical analysis [38] along with the optical absorption edge (which provides the $E_{oc}$), the absolute HOMO and LUMO levels may be estimated [18,38]. The Fermi level of the P3HT would be a fitted parameter of the completed cell as the degree of electrical shielding would be unknown [32].

The assembled SiNW/P3HT PV cell’s I-V curve would give the $I_{sc}$, $V_{oc}$, and FF for the cell. UV-vis spectroscopy would be used to determine the absorption profile, electro-absorption for measuring the internal electric potentials, AC admittance to relate the performance of the cell to charge densities, and light induced electron-spin resonance to study the charge transport mechanisms [17]. Much of the optimizing parameters or the SiNW/P3HT PV cell would need to be empirically determined as the underlying physics of hybrid PV cells remains limited [32,41,64,65], as well as that of SiNW (e.g. electro-optical affects of quantum confinement [50,51,53,54] and pacification [22,34]) and P3HT (e.g. the mechanism of excitation diffusion [34]).

Choice of contacts also affects the function of the PV cell. Not only would a second depletion region be formed at the junction of both semiconductors with their respective contact, but any offset of the contacts’ work function with the HOMO level of the P3HT and the $E_C$ of the SiNWs would create additional electric potentials within the PV cell. Typically, a semiconductor adjacent to a metal forms a Schottky contact (i.e. voltage drops across the contact which would reduce the $V_{oc}$ of the PV cell) [19,42], however, if the Fermi level of the electrode matches the $E_C$ band of the inorganic semiconductor or the HOMO level of the organic semiconductor, an Ohmic contact may be established [31,66].

Some Au from the cathode of the SiNW/P3HT PV cell (as well as form the Au:Si eutectic in the VSL SiNWs) could diffuse into the P3HT over time, causing deep traps which, while they may facilitate charge generation and diffusion by providing “hopping” orbitals [38], would reduce the $R_{sh}$ of the cell and thereby reduce the $V_{oc}$. Also, at any organic/metal contact, interfacial dipoles can significantly change the apparent work function of the metal [67,68], which would directly affect the $V_{oc}$ of the PV cell [69]. Whether this would improve the energy level match at the organic/metal interface would need to be empirically determined, however it does introduce the option of additional coatings of another p-type polymer could be used to tune the Au cathode’s work function [19]. Another option for the cathode would be ITO, which also possesses a work function susceptible to tuning via coating with high work function p-type polymers, such as PDOT [36], or by plasma etching [70]. Because ITO is transparent, it would be possible to create a top contact over the entire surface of the P3HT and thereby increase the $I_{sc}$ of the cell. Polyethylene dioxythiophene (PDOT) and poly(styrene)sulfonic acid (PSS) doped PDOT, which have higher work functions than ITO [18,19,42], have been utilized as cathodes in organic PV cells [71] and presents additional options for optimizing the $V_{oc}$ of the SiNW/P3HT PV cell. Of course, the functionality of these polymers are also sensitive to morphology, solvents, and annealing [72]. A thin film of Al would be a prudent choice for the prototype SiNW/P3HT PV cell. Like Au, the Al work function may be tuned, but other low work function metals (e.g. Mg and Ca [39]) or polymers (e.g. PSS doped polyaniline (PANI)) [71] also exist.

Eventually, it would be desirable to replace the c-Si or ITO on glass as a SiNW substrates with a

---

9 Often, either the inorganic semiconductor is treated as a polymer with HOMO and LUMO levels and with loosely bound/widely dispersed excitons (Frenkel Werner-Mott model [36,49]) or the organic semiconductor is approximated using the band model [10,26,27].
more economical polymeric substrate which would reduce the weight while providing some mechanical flexibility and durability to the PV cell. An organic polymer substrate would, however, introduce the potential of an oxide species forming on the Al contact which would also alter the metal’s work function and the $V_{oc}$ of the cell [18,19]. ITO may be coated on flexible foils of poly(ethylene terephthalate) (PET) at ambient conditions [73] and there are several commercially available transparent flexible substrates: polyimide (Dupont Kapton), Tefzel, and Teflon [18]. The surface resistances and texture (i.e., PET, Kapton, and Tefzel are not flat) may require additional adhesive promoters [42].

One of the prominent advantages of the SiNW/P3HT PV cell’s design would be the ability to utilize the pre-existing wet processing techniques and high throughput manufacturing of polymer industries [17,19]. However, considerations of the SiNW/P3HT PV cell’s amortization should not be limited to production costs. Since the $V_{oc}$ of organic PV cells have shown sensitivity to environmental contamination, light intensity [74,75], and temperature [74-76], the use of P3HT introduces these concerns into the proposed hybrid PV cell. The P3HT would require permanent protection from air and moisture, and its sensitivity to annealing temperature of the cell continuing to chemically alter the polymer over time. Aid in addressing these disadvantages may be found in crossover research and development in the photodector markets, as well as the organic FET and LED technologies [36,38].

Conclusion

Research into hybrid PV cells may provide the long sought after success of solar energy to supplant fossil fuels as a sustainable and ubiquitous energy source. Although much of the device physics involved in hybrid PV cells are not well understood, the functioning of PV cells may be easily modeled, and the optimizing parameters addressed experimentally. The materials of the proposed SiNW/P3HT PV cell are high performance and possess tunable properties well suited for experimental optimization. SiNWs and P3HT are also the subjects of intensive study in multiple technologies, providing crossover research and development for the progress of the SiNW/P3HT PV cell.

Although a completed SiNW/P3HT PV cell has not yet been achieved due to the inability to form a thin film of P3HT, research into this design will continue.

Acknowledgements

This research was funded by the McNair Program at Portland State University. Special thanks to Keith James, Katherine Mazzio, and Kaitlyn VanSant for their many helpful comments.

References

The use of politeness strategies in email discussions about taboo topics

KATRINA PARIERA
SUSAN CONRAD, FACULTY MENTOR

Abstract

Computer-mediated communication, such as email, offers us a chance to understand how social relationships are built and maintained in an environment in which interlocutors not only lack the paralinguistic that are vital to face-to-face conversation, but are participating in a medium which has had little time to develop rules of conduct. According to Brown and Levinson (1987) people will use certain politeness strategies to enhance face between themselves and their interlocutors. These strategies will depend on the level of intimacy between the participants, and the seriousness of the situation. In this study I compare the politeness strategies used by 29 participants in a series of emails written to close friends and to strangers. I analyze five features of language in the emails and compare them across three taboos of high, medium and low seriousness. I then compare the findings with predictions based on Brown and Levinson’s framework. I conclude that the five language features examined all reflect different politeness strategies than would be used in person, and suggest that email itself is developing a unique set of politeness conventions.

Introduction

This study investigates how people employ certain politeness strategies when discussing taboo topics in the domain of email. The study examines the variation in politeness strategies used by native English speakers when communicating about taboo subjects with interlocutors of high and low levels of intimacy, in order to determine if the strategies conform to the speech-based politeness theory of Brown and Levinson in 1987.

Politeness is a term used to describe the “... rational, rule-governed, pragmatic aspect of speech that is rooted in the human need to maintain relationships and avoid conflicts” (Janney & Arndt, 2003). Because avoiding conflict is one of the goals of politeness, taboos are especially helpful for a study about politeness strategies. When communicating about a sensitive topic we often become more careful with our language, using politeness strategies to avoid social awkwardness. Looking at taboos gives us a framework within which
politeness strategies are abundant and carefully selected by the speaker or writer (in this study referred to collectively as the “agent”).

Taboos are subjects that a culture holds to be prohibited in speech. These are topics that constitute a risk, whether it be to propriety, superstition, or some other perceived danger. In American culture, taboos usually fall under the categories of death, health, bodily effluvia, money, physical features and politics (Allan and Burridge, 1991). Some taboos are almost entirely restricted in common language use, while others only limited in certain circumstances.

Email, which falls under the more broad category of computer-mediated communication (CMC), is also an important medium of language to study because it is a relatively new and unique form of communication. Users lack the use of prosody, kinesics and instant feedback which are normally a primary factor in face-to-face interaction. Users also have the opportunity to take more time in composing their message, and to rethink it in its entirety before sending it. While this is also the case with hand-written exchanges such as letters, email retains other features similar to face-to-face interaction: the ability to execute the exchange quickly (typing usually being much faster than writing by hand), the frequency of email exchanges, and the ability to send messages instantly.

Not only is email a unique form of communication, it is an increasingly common medium of language in both the occupational and personal lives of computer-oriented societies. Because the use of email is so new and widespread it offers a unique opportunity to study how humans have adapted to a new form of communication. As Al-Shalawi (2001) puts it, study of computer-mediated communication “can provide us with a crucial direction leading to the understanding of how the principles of social relationships are realized in a new form of language.”
In this paper I will provide some additional background on politeness, including the principles of Brown and Levinson’s theory, and discuss some of the work that has applied these principles to CMC. I will then discuss my methodology and results, followed by the implications of this study and some suggested areas for further research in politeness in emails.

Background

Although there have been a variety of approaches to analyzing politeness, the most widely used framework comes from the face-saving view, usually associated with Brown and Levinson’s 1987 book on politeness. This is probably the most widely used framework for analyzing the way people build and maintain social relationships during interaction, and it is the framework that will be applied to this study.

Politeness is often seen as a deviation from efficiency in conversation. That is, human beings are rational agents and will usually choose the most efficient means to an end. For example, we are less likely to reach for the mug that is the furthest from our reach unless our desire for that mug outweighs our desire for efficiency. In language, we often avoid the most efficient form. Rather than saying “Shut the door” we might say things like “Did you leave the door open?” or “Would you mind shutting the door please.” The study of politeness seeks to find the motive behind choosing a less straightforward course action in language. If efficiency is not the most important factor in choosing a form, then there must be a more important consideration. Brown and Levinson see this consideration as the negotiation of face.

Face, drawn from Erving Goffman’s early concept of face (1967), is the public image that each person wants to portray in a social setting. According to Brown and Levinson
there are two different types of face wants: negative face and positive face. Negative face is the want that one’s actions be unhindered by others while positive face is the want that one’s wants be pleasing to others.

According to Brown and Levinson the principle motivation behind politeness strategies is to avoid damaging both our own face and the face of the other person or people in the exchange. The desire to avoid face damage acts as a constraint in language, seen in our avoidance of the simplest and most straightforward option when we choose what we say. The assumption is that we are usually trying to avoid damaging face, by adjust our choice of words in order to protect the interlocutors from unease (Ungureanu, 2004). Exactly how we adjust our language depends on our perception of the circumstances of the exchange and of the role of the producer and recipient.

Brown and Levinson argue that our need to support each other’s face is most salient when taking part in a face threatening act (FTA). These are speech acts that inherently threaten the face wants of either the speaker or hearer. FTAs that threaten the negative face of the hearer include advice, requests, offers and compliments. FTAs that threaten the positive face of the hearer include disagreements, disapproval and contradictions.

A principal idea behind the face threatening act is that speakers will try to minimize the threat in order to maintain each other’s faces. One way to do this is to use negative politeness strategies or positive politeness strategies. These are redressive actions, defined by Brown and Levinson (1987) as those which “attempt to counteract the potential face damage of the FTA by doing it in such a way…that indicates clearly that no such face threat is intended or desired” (p. 70). Positive politeness strategies are used to enhance positive face; negative politeness strategies are used to enhance negative face. Positive politeness strategies include exaggerating interest, using in-group identity markers, avoiding disagreement, and
assert common ground. Negative politeness strategies include being reluctant, apologizing for the impingement and using passive voice. If the FTA is analyzed to be serious then a higher level of politeness strategy will be used.

Brown and Levinson claim that there are three factors that people assess when they choose the politeness strategy that will best counteract the FTA. These are power, social distance, and ranking of the imposition, the latter two of which were examined in this study. Social distance is defined in terms of similarity, frequency of interaction and intimacy. Ranking of imposition is defined by the degree to which the act interferes with face wants. All of these factors are relevant only to the point that the communicators believe that the assessment is shared.

It is important to keep in mind that both negative and positive face wants occur to some degree at the same time. These two wants create a paradox in which “both aspects of face must be projected simultaneously in any communication” (Scollon & Scollon, 1995). Speakers do not choose expression of absolute negative or positive politeness, but instead choose expressions which indicate different degrees of negative and positive politeness.

Although the Brown and Levinson framework has been applied to many studies on face-to-face interaction, few of these studies have attempted to address the use of politeness in computer-mediated communication (CMC). CMC is a term which encompasses any kind of communication that takes place between humans via computers. This term includes email, chat, video conferencing, blogs, etcetera and is almost always based in written text (Tanskanen, 1998). Because CMC is such a recent mainstream medium of communication in industrialized countries, little research has been done regarding social aspects of the online world. Tanskanen’s (1998) study examined politeness strategies used in a mailing list discussion group. This study found that many spoken language strategies were also found in
the discussion group, including the use of hedges, stance markers and third person pronouns.

A study by Hiltz & Turoff (1993) found that computer conferencing elicited a more homogeneous style of conversation than would be found in face-to-face communication. They also found that computer conferencing resulted in more arguments and insults, concluding that the concern for politeness was decreased in this type of communication; that participants in a computerized conference abandon the face-work that usually occurs in face-to-face conversations.

A 2001 study by Al-Shalawi found that Brown and Levinson’s theory could not adequately account for politeness strategies used by Saudi ESL students in emails mitigating disagreements. Al-Shalawi concluded that the dichotomous concept of face as either positive or negative was not supported by the interpretation of most of the politeness strategies in the study.

Of the little research that has been done on politeness in emails there is nothing about the discussion of taboos in emails. However, based on the framework from Brown and Levinson we can make predictions about how certain language features will be used. Five features (described in the methods section) are included in this study. They are euphemisms, dysphemisms, bald-on-record remarks, off-the-record remarks and stance markers. We will compare the results of the emails to the predictions made by the Brown and Levinson framework, to determine if the framework can be applied to email communication.

The expected results are displayed in Tables 1 and 2. Table 1 shows the predicted use of politeness strategies according to the level of the taboo. The greater the taboo, the more negative politeness strategies should be used. As the taboo decreases in seriousness, more
positive politeness strategies should be used. Table 2 shows the predicted use of politeness strategies according to intimacy. More negative politeness strategies are expected in the emails to the stranger, while more positive politeness strategies are expected in the emails to the close friend.

Table 1
Predicted Use of Politeness Strategies with Taboos
(arrow points toward increased use)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Homelessness</th>
<th>Old Age</th>
<th>Obesity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Off-the-Record Remarks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-committal Stance Markers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euphemisms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dysphemisms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bald-On-Record Remarks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2
Predicted Use of Politeness Strategies with Intimacy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Close Friend</th>
<th>Stranger</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Off-the-Record Remarks</td>
<td>Fewer</td>
<td>More</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-committal Stance Markers</td>
<td>Fewer</td>
<td>More</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euphemisms</td>
<td>Fewer</td>
<td>More</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Methods

Participants

The participants for this study consisted of 29 university students who voluntarily elected to take part in this project. Forty-nine people actually began the survey and 34 of them completed it. Five of the 34 the surveys were rejected because participants did not meet the criteria for the study.

Participants were controlled for age (all were between 21 and 29 years old) and language (all were native speakers of American English). Age was chosen as a control because politeness strategies may vary with different age groups. The language criteria was selected because I believed that the information being examined would relate to highly sensitive culturally shared knowledge. Language taboos and politeness strategies vary culture to culture and this particular study does not seek to examine differences between cultures.

Instrument

For the study a discourse completion test (DCT) was administered to the participants. The DCT is an instrument used to collect sociolinguistic data. A DCT uses a constructed environment to elicit certain parts of discourse and to use the findings to make predictions about natural language. In the analysis of spoken language this method has been criticized as being a somewhat ineffective tool, due to the vast differences between written and spoken language (Billmyer & Varghese, 2000). DCTs usually ask participants to write down what they think they would say in a certain scenario. It has been suggested that DCTs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dysphemisms</th>
<th>More</th>
<th>Fewer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bald-On-Record Remarks</td>
<td>More</td>
<td>Fewer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
fail “to elicit the full range of formulas found in spoken data,” and that the responses are “more limited in length and deficient in the level of elaboration and frequency of repetition typical of human spoken interaction” (Billmyer & Varghese, 2000, p. 518). While this is certainly a valid point in the case of using DCTs to analyze spoken language, the same problem does not necessarily occur in using DCTs to analyze written language since the gap between authentic written discourse and DCT elicited written discourse is likely not as great. For that reason, the use of email was a strong innovation in this study.

Despite criticisms, DCTs also have certain strengths. A DCT has the advantage of being able to record information about communication, rather than relying on retrospection or second hand accounts. It also allows more data to be collected in a short period of time. For example, in this study it would not have been feasible to simply wait for taboo topics to come up naturally in conversations. The use of a DCT for this study was particularly advantageous because it allowed people to complete the task in their usual environment and at their regular pace.

The DCT was designed to examine two variables: distance and risk. Distance was examined by having participants write to a close friend and a stranger. Risk was examined by giving pictures of three different taboos to write about. The pictures were chosen based on a pilot study in which participants wrote emails about 9 different pictures. The results of the study showed that three of the pictures consistently demonstrated high, medium and low levels of taboos. The three pictures selected included a homeless man sitting outside counting change in his hand, an obese woman applying make-up to her cheek, and an elderly woman sitting at a desk in front of a laptop. A fourth picture of a man with no salient taboo characteristics was given as a test picture and to make the experiment less transparent. This
picture was of a white man in his late thirties talking on a mobile phone. The results of the emails about the fourth picture were not analyzed in this study.

For the study, participants were directed to an online survey program, which prompted them to write brief emails describing the four different pictures to two different people (eight emails in total). The prompts contained information on the person the participant would be writing to and asked them to imagine that this person was also participating in the study and would be reading the emails that were sent to them. The first four scenarios asked the participants to imagine that they were writing emails to their closest friend. In the last four scenarios they were asked to imagine that they were writing to a stranger of the same age and native language. Participants were shown one picture at a time and had to write an email describing the person in the picture. Each email had to be completed before moving on to the next one.

Data Collection Procedures

Participants were recruited via an email sent to two mailing lists for undergraduate and graduate students in the English department at Portland State University, in the Northwest United States in the Summer of 2006. Two identical emails were sent out one week apart so that as many people could be recruited as possible. Since the program administering the DCT was completely confidential it is possible that the link was forwarded to people outside the English department, or even outside the university, and therefore is not controlled for education level or region. Data from the site used to administer the DCT suggests that it was in fact forwarded to participants outside of Oregon, though most participants were in the Portland area.

Data Analysis Procedures
When the DCTs had been collected they resulted in 174 emails, which were compiled and coded for five different language features: euphemisms, dysphemisms, bald-on-record remarks, off-the-record remarks and stance markers. These categories were selected from some of the features discussed by Brown and Levinson (1987) and by examining the results of the DCT, which showed that these features were used in abundance and with variation. How these language features were specifically defined is discussed in the results section below.

Results and Discussion

*Off-the-Record Remarks*

The first feature discussed here is the use of off-the-record remarks. These are defined by Brown and Levinson as statements with more than one potential intention, “so that the actor cannot be held to have committed himself to one particular intent” (1987). Off-the-record remarks include statements that are vague (“She is showing signs of aging”), metaphors (“This man’s cup, alas, is empty”), understatements (“This guy’s not doing well”), overgeneralizations (“I guess we’ve come a long way when people like this are using laptops”), and giving hints (“I wonder how it feels to be homeless”).

According to Brown and Levinson (1987) off-the-record remarks are used to satisfy negative face to a greater degree than using a negative politeness strategy. Because it is based on sidestepping the encounter, Brown and Levinson do not technically call off-the-record remarking a politeness strategy. For this study I will consider it a politeness strategy, since it is suggested that it is used to satisfy negative face, and since almost any language choice can be considered strategic. We would expect to see more off-the-record remarks used in the emails to strangers, since the distance between the two parties warrants a higher level of negative
politeness (though Brown and Levinson do not technically consider off-the-record remarking a politeness strategy).

The results show that people used more off-the-record remarks with close friends than with strangers, (see Figure 1). 65% of the total off-the-record remarks were directed at close friends. While this is only slightly more than half, it is still noteworthy because we would expect to find more off-the-record remarks with strangers than close friends.

**Stance Marking**

The second feature evaluated was stance marking, or how people indicated their level of certainty about the statement they were making. Stance markers were labeled as either zero stance, non-committal stance or emphatic stance. Zero stance was defined as a statement which lacked a hedge of any kind, for example “This is an obese woman.” Non-committal stance markers were counted as remarks which suggested any kind of doubt on
the part of the speaker. These included statements like “This appears to be a fat lady,” “This guy looks like he could be homeless,” and “This is possibly an old lady.” Emphatic-stance was defined as any statement in which the speaker asserted his/her certainty, such as “This is definitely a homeless dude!”.

Stance markers were only counted when they indicated stance for a statement about a taboo (this excludes phrases like “It looks like it might be cold outside”). The count also included stance marking in off-the-record remarks. “It appears that this guy is down on his luck” would count as one non-committal stance marker.

Emphatic-stance markers were rarely used in the emails. There were a total of three instances of emphatic stance marking, all which were used in emails to close friends. Zero-stance markers were the most common, which is to be expected since it is the unmarked form.

Because non-committal remarks remove the speaker from full responsibility for their claim we expect to see an abundance of them in these emails, as speakers attempt to be less offensive in describing the people in the photographs. In fact, we do find numerous non-committal remarks. There were 78 non-committal statements in all of the emails and 39% of all statements describing a taboo were non-committal. The number of people that used non-committal stance markers also suggests that the results were not skewed by a handful of people using the majority of non-committal stance markers (see Figure 2).
Frequency of use of non-committals ranked in order of taboo, with the picture of the homeless man eliciting the most non-committals, and the picture of the obese woman eliciting the fewest. This is consistent with the predictions in Table 1 that more negative politeness strategies will be used with higher-ranking taboos. The results, along with the those of the off-the-record remarks in which homelessness elicited the highest number of negative politeness strategies, suggests that there is indeed some consensus as to how serious these taboos are in American culture.

Figure 2 also shows that the use of non-committals occurred more frequently with close friends than with strangers. These results do not follow the predictions made by Brown and Levinson’s politeness theory, which predicts non-committal stance markers to be
used more with strangers than close friends. Like off-the-record remarks, this is not the case. Non-committals were used 39% more in emails to close friends than in emails to strangers.

The increased use of both non-committal stance markers and off-the-record markers with close friends could suggest several different things. One possibility is that we are using more negative politeness with our friends in emails because we are more concerned with maintaining those relationships than relationships with total strangers. In the case of this DCT participants were writing to people with anonymity in both directions. Not only would they have no relationship with these people, they would not have to deal with any embarrassment if they were to offend or surprise them.

Another possibility is that people are aware that it is difficult to convey attitude in emails. Since there are few ways to get across a friendly or sarcastic attitude in emails people may be opting for a more negative politeness strategies in order to avoid confusion.

**Bald-On-Record Remarks**

Another language feature which showed interesting results was the use of bald-on-record remarks. Brown and Levinson define these as statements done directly, and unambiguously. For this study bald-on-remarks were further defined as anything that could be taken as distasteful, shocking or impolite. Examples are “[This is] an old lady with one hell of a huge arm” and “This woman thinks that putting excessive makeup on will distract people from how chubby she is.”

Bald-on-record remarks were used more with close friends, than with strangers, which is to be expected according to the theory. In the emails to close friends about the obese woman, half of participants used a bald-on-record remark. Just under a third of participants used them in the emails to close friends about the homeless man and the elderly woman.
Although we might expect bald-on-record remarks to be used more with close friends, their presence contradicts the politeness strategies we have seen so far in these emails. People are using higher numbers of negative politeness strategies with their close friends, but also using a higher number of harsh statements with them. It is also surprising that bald-on-record remarks are used at all in the emails to strangers. We almost never expect bald-on-record remarks to be used face-to-face with a stranger, except in urgent situations. The presence of these remarks in the emails could be evidence that face-work is being dropped with strangers. Since there is anonymity the participants do not have to worry about building any rapport or dealing with any repercussions if they offend the person receiving the email.

**Euphemisms and Dysphemisms**

The last two features analyzed were euphemisms and dysphemisms, collectively referred to as x-phemisms. Euphemisms were defined as any word or phrase which tends to have a more positive way of expressing a taboo, than the neutral word for the topic. For example, *old* was considered a neutral word, while *older* was considered euphemistic. Other examples of words counted as euphemisms were *elderly*, *large*, *bigger* and *home-free*. Euphemistic phrases included “looks like my grandmother,” “this man could be a tortured artist” and “on the heavier side.”

Dysphemisms were counted as words which portray things in a more negative light than the neutral word. Examples of dysphemisms and dysphemistic phrases included *bum*, *fat*, *huge* and *old granny*. Some x-phemisms were counted which referred to taboos other than the three I have categorized so far, such as race (“whitey”). People also used x-phemisms to talk about the weight of the elderly woman and the age of the homeless man. All x-phemisms for a taboo were counted.
As would be expected in the case of discussing taboos, many euphemisms were used throughout all of the emails. The picture of the homeless man had the highest count of euphemism overall, followed by the elderly woman. This ranking is consistent with the predictions based on Brown and Levinson’s framework, and has been somewhat consistent throughout this study, suggesting that obesity is the lowest ranking taboo and homelessness the highest ranking taboo. This is also seen in the use of dysphemisms, which was fairly low in all emails except those to close friends about the obese woman. There were 19 dysphemisms or dysphemistic phrases in the emails to close friends about the obese woman, almost five times as many as any other topic.

**Other Features**

There were two other interesting points that I observed throughout this study, which were not coded or counted. These were the manner of spelling and the length of the emails.
There seemed to be a high level of spelling errors throughout both sets of emails. Some spelling errors were significant and frequent enough that it made emails difficult to understand. This is an interesting feature to consider when investigating how much effort we put into our language choices in order to achieve a certain intent. Although Brown and Levinson do not address written language features, such as spelling, it would be interesting to compare the amount of spelling errors in emails to close friends to the amount of errors in emails to strangers, and to see whether the difference could be explained by politeness.

I also observed that email length seemed to be individualized, rather than varying based on taboo or intimacy with the interlocutor. That is, individuals who wrote longer emails tended to do for every email they wrote. In terms of politeness it is plausible that a longer, more convoluted email would be a way to avoid seeming rude when describing a taboo because it would be less straightforward, and non-taboo characteristics of the person could be emphasized. While this feature was not counted, it did not seem to be the case that email length varied according risk or distance.

The results from this study suggest that people use more negative politeness strategies with their close friends than with the strangers, the reverse of what the Brown and Levinson framework predicted. In the case of bald-on-record remarks and dysphemisms the framework did correctly predict that some of the strategies would be used more with close friends, though the presence of these features at all in the emails to strangers was a surprise. Overall, the seriousness of the taboo also had a predictable affect on the use of politeness strategies, increasing the number of strategies as the seriousness of the taboo increased.

Conclusion
This study suggests that the Brown and Levinson framework for politeness does not accurately predict how politeness will be used in emails. Although some of the predictions were correct, most of the results were in contrast to what Brown and Levinson predict for face-to-face interaction. Instead, email is developing a unique set of politeness strategies, very different than those used in face-to-face communication.

Politeness strategies in emails appear to be developing in a way that includes high levels of negative politeness strategies amongst interlocutors of close intimacy, especially avoidance-based strategies such as off-the-record remarks and non-committal stance marking, while still retaining many positive politeness strategies. This is a strong paradox in which people are balancing negative and positive face with their intimate friends. This paradox does not seem to be as present when interacting with unfamiliar people. Instead, there is a decrease in negative politeness strategies when there is a decrease in intimacy, something we do not see in face-to-face interaction.

Limitations of this study, such as the small number of variables and language features, could provide a space for more conclusive research on politeness in CMC. It would also be helpful to examine data from a larger and more wide-ranging demographic, including speakers of other languages, and people with different proficiencies in their second language. Also, in order to understand more about how politeness is used in emails, the data quantified in this paper should be tested against more naturalistic data, meaning both naturally occurring data (emails that have actually been sent) and more naturalistic situations (emailing someone to ask for information or to apologize).

Furthermore, it would be interesting to look into the use of politeness strategies in other forms of CMC, such as text-messaging and video-conferencing. It would also be
helpful to do a study comparing how the same participants use politeness in CMC to face-to-face communication, using a duplicate discourse completion task in each scenario.

Miscommunication can be at the heart of so many conflicts. It is even more likely to occur in new modes of communication. Since so many people are using email on a regular basis the chances of miscommunication are even greater. For this reason it is important to continue to study all forms of communication, especially those that are as widely used and new to the mainstream as email. Understanding the nuances of how we communicate is not only helpful in avoiding misinterpretations, but can also reveal information about our social and personal values, and how we portray these to the people we communicate with.
References


Ethanol Induced Sign-tracking in Swiss Mice

Phoebe J. Smitasin  
Christopher Cunningham, Faculty Mentor

Abstract  
Rationale  It is thought that alcohol addiction is influenced by environmental cues. One way this relationship is built is through Pavlovian learning, in which the alcohol is repeatedly paired with an environmental cue. Sign-tracking is a type of behavior that exhibits a Pavlovian learned association.

Objectives  Our experiment studies induced sign-tracking using ethanol and a light visual cue (conditioned stimulus or CS).

Methods  In this study, one set of mice was given ethanol through intraperitoneal (IP) injections before being placed in an apparatus with a spatially isolated light visual cue. A control group was also placed in an apparatus with the light visual cue, but was not given ethanol IP injections until an hour after the trial (in the home cage). Following these conditioning trials, the mice were given a series of preference tests, where the visual cue was present (CS+) and both groups of mice received saline IP injections prior to the test.

Results  Throughout the conditioning trials, there was no distinction between groups for the time spent on the light side of the apparatus. However, when examining the nose poke counts per trial, the paired group poked more in the CS+ hole during preference test 2 compared to the CS- hole.

Conclusions  The paired group of mice did learn the association, and it can be argued that sign-tracking was observed because the mice showed a preference for the CS+ in the nose poke count of preference test 1.

Introduction  
It has been thought that alcoholism can be influenced by environmental cues. With alcoholics, cues such as the smell of alcohol or a bar sign are repeatedly paired with alcohol use (Pickering & Liljequist, 2003). It is thought that these cues are present before drug consumption, and they are present regardless of how the drug is administered (Uslaner, Acerbo, Jones, & Robinson, 2006). Over time these cues may become associated with the consumption of alcohol. For example the idea that when a person frequently drinks alcohol at a specific bar, that the next time that person is in that bar, he or she will want to drink.

One way that this relationship is created is through Pavlovian learning, through which alcohol is repeatedly paired with an environmental cue. Through this association, it is believed that the cue may acquire incentive salience (Uslaner et al., 2006). Incentive salience is the idea that an object can seem to stand out amongst other objects and becomes a kind of “motivational magnet”. This is thought to be gained through Pavlovian learning.

Sign-tracking is an observed behavior that can be used to study a Pavlovian learned association. Sign-tracking refers to the behavior of an animal that moves into close proximity to a cue or signal (Brooks, Tomie, & Zito, 1989). This behavior is a phenomenon where once an animal has learned the association between a cue and a drug, the animal will then approach the cue. Sign-tracking is a behavioral response that demonstrates that a cue can gain incentive salience (Uslaner et al., 2006). The phenomenon of sign-tracking was first reported by Brown & Jenkins in 1968.
What is interesting about sign-tracking is that there is no experimentally designed reason for the animal to approach the cue. There is no reward for approaching the cue, and approach to the cue is not required to receive the drug reward. Previous studies have shown that animals approach a cue even if moving towards the cue leads the animal farther away form the reward (Uslaner et al., 2006).

As mentioned above, the first sign-tracking study, then referred to as autoshaping, was performed in 1968 by Brown and Jenkins. In their study, pigeons were placed in an operant chamber with a response key and a food magazine. Throughout the trial, the key would illuminate for 8 seconds, and then the food magazine would be presented for 4 seconds. If the pigeon pecked at the key while illuminated, the food magazine would immediately be presented. However, key pecking was not necessary for the food to be presented (Brooks et al., 1989). What they found was that the pigeons began to peck at the illuminated key.

There have not been many successful studies that show sign-tracking using a drug reward. A study by Uslaner in 2006 exhibited cocaine induced sign-tracking to an illuminated lever. Sprague-Dawley rats were given intravenous infusions of cocaine when an illuminated lever was presented for 8 seconds in an operant chamber. The cocaine was administered regardless of the rat’s behavior. The number of approaches to the lever was observed and recorded. The rats in this experiment increased over trials in number of approaches to the lever when paired with cocaine.

A study done by Cunningham & Patel in 2007 showed ethanol induced sign-tracking in mice to a visual cue of a star located on the floor. In this experiment, mice were given IP injections of ethanol right before being placed in a box with the distinct star visual cue. On alternate days, the mice were given saline IP injections right before being placed in the box without the visual cue. After 6 trials, the mice were given two tests. Both tests had the visual cue present, but in one test the mice received ethanol IP injections, and in the other they received saline IP injections. This experiment was conducted on two different types of mice, NZB/B1NJ and DBA/2J. The mean activity and left time was recorded during each trial and test. Over 6 conditioning trials, NZB/B1NJ mice spent increasingly more time on the side of the floor with the star during ethanol trials. The DBA/2J mice did not show a preference for either side of the box during ethanol conditioning trials. The tests revealed that the NZB/B1NJ mice preferred the star side of the box when given either ethanol or saline IP injections. The DBA/2J mice only showed a preference for the star side of the box during the saline IP injection test.

Our experiment examines whether Swiss-Webster mice will exhibit sign-tracking when given IP injections of ethanol, which are then paired with a light visual cue. This experiment sets up an environment where the cue is present each time the mouse is exposed to ethanol. During conditioning trials when the visual cue is present, ethanol will be given regardless of the animal’s behavior. This study is similar to the one done by Cunningham & Patel in 2007, but uses a different type of visual cue. It also will look for sign-tracking behavior in a different strain of mice, Swiss mice. Swiss mice are capable of learning a conditioned place preference, based on previous studies (Risinger & Oakes 1996).
Cunningham & Patel (2007) observed sign-tracking through increasing amounts of time that the mice spent on the star side of the box, and therefore what we expect to see in our sign-tracking study is that the paired group of Swiss mice will spend more time in proximity to the visual light cue. What this would mean is that the paired group did learn the association between the drug and the cue. Because the paired group spent more time next to the cue, then it can be said that the paired group liked the ethanol experience. This behavior indicates its usefulness as a model of craving.

**Materials and methods**

**Subjects**
Forty-eight male Swiss Webster mice, 8 weeks of age, were separated into 12 squads of 4 mice (6 squads for each paired and unpaired experiment). Mice were housed 4 to a cage made of polycarbonate with cob bedding and were placed in a ventilated Thoren rack. The mice had continuous access to food and water. The animal room was on a 12-hr light-dark cycle (lights on at 0700). This experiment followed the National Institutes of Health (NIH) “Principles of Laboratory Animal Care.”

**Apparatus**
Individual squads were run in 4 rectangular conditioning boxes (30x15x15). The walls of the boxes were acrylic with mesh flooring and no lid. Six infrared emitter/detector pairs were mounted 2.2cm above the floor at 5cm intervals. These emitter/detector pairs were used to determine location (left vs. right side) and general activity. Time spent on each side of the box and infrared beam breaks were recorded by a computer. Each conditioning box was enclosed in an individual ventilated, light- and sound-attenuating chamber (Coulbourn Model E10-20), which was illuminated by a 10cm “Mini Moon Lite” (AmerTac Model Mo. 73060, 3 VDC). The “Mini Moon Lite” was attached to the back wall of the chamber with Velcro. The light from the “Mini Moon Lite” was diffused by 20-lb (75g/m^2) white paper (92 brightness) that was taped to the outside of the acrylic back wall of the conditioning box. A camera was attached to the ceiling of each chamber, and recorded the activity that took place in each conditioning box.

Each box had 2 nose poke holes located 1 inch from the floor on both the right and left wall. The visual cue was a light positioned in one of the two nose poke holes. The bulbs for the light cue were #47 6.3 volts, and received 5 volts during the experiment. In between squads, the inside walls and mesh flooring were wiped with a wet sponge to distribute animal odors.

**Procedure**
The experiment was broken into 3 different sessions: a pretest (day 1), conditioning trials (days 2-13), and preference tests (day 14). Each session consisted of the same procedure. One hour before the trials were to be run, the mice were brought down to room 721 and allowed to habituate to the room while in their home cages. Right before the trial, each mouse was weighed and given an intraperitoneal (IP) injection and immediately placed into the center of the conditioning apparatus. Each trial duration was 10min. After the trial the mice were removed and returned to the home cage. One hour after the last squad of mice returned to the home cage, each mouse was weighed and given an IP injection.

**Pretest**
During the pretest, each mouse was given an IP injection of saline before being placed in the apparatus. All of the mice were exposed to the light cue while in the apparatus. Half of the mice received the light in the right nose poke hole, and the other half received the light in the left nose poke hole. Each mouse was given a post IP injection of saline one hour later in the home cage.

**Conditioning**

The mice were divided into two groups, a paired group and an unpaired group. Within these groups, half of the mice received the light in the right nose poke hole during conditioning trials, and the other half received the light in the left nose poke hole. Conditioning trials consisted of alternating days when the light cue was present in the apparatus (CS+ day) and days when the light cue was not present in the apparatus (CS- days). On CS+ days, the paired group received an IP injection of ethanol before being placed in the apparatus, and the unpaired group received an IP injection of saline before entering the apparatus. Post IP injections given in the home cage on CS+ days were saline for the paired group, and ethanol for the unpaired group. The post IP injections of ethanol insured that each mouse received the same amount of ethanol per CS+ day. On CS- days, both the paired and unpaired groups received IP injections of saline before being placed in the apparatus and one hour later in the home cage. Six conditioning trials were conducted.

**Preference test**

Preference test 1 followed the same procedure as the pretest. All mice were exposed to the light cue while in the apparatus. Each mouse was given an IP injection of saline both before entering the apparatus and one hour after in the home cage. Preference test 2 was also the same procedure, however the “Mini Moon Lite” was not turned on during the test, and therefore the only illumination in the apparatus was due to the CS in the nose poke hole.

**Results**

**Pretest**

A one-way ANOVA was run on the activity data, with the single factor of group. A two-way ANOVA was run on the left time data, with the factors of group and conditioning subgroup. A repeated measures ANOVA was run on the nose poke data, with the within subjects factor of side (light, dark) and the between subjects factor of group. A p-value less than 0.05 was considered significant.

**Activity**- The average activity per trial for the pretest is shown in figure 1. The pretest showed that the activity for the paired and unpaired groups was similar.

**Left Time**- Shown in figure 2 is the mean time spent on the left side of the box per trial. The group of mice receiving the cue on the right side in the unpaired group spent slightly more time on the right side of the box \(F(1,45)=5.2, p=0.02\), most likely due to a sampling error.
A repeated measures ANOVA was run for the conditioning data. The within subjects factors were trial and trial type. The between subjects factor was group for the activity and percent time data. The between subjects factors for the left time data were group and conditioning subgroup. A repeated measures ANOVA was also run on the nose poke data. The within subjects factors were side (light, dark) and trial type. The between subjects factor was group. A p-value less than 0.05 was considered significant.

**Activity**- Figure 4 shows the average activity measured in counts per minute for each of the six conditioning trials. The activity for the paired CS+ group remained above that of the paired CS- and both of the unpaired groups throughout all of the conditioning trials $[F(1,40)=119.4, p=0.000]$. This shows that the animals were activated by the ethanol. Over time, the activity of each group decreased slightly, most likely due to habituation.

**Left Time**- The amount of time spent on the left side of the box is shown in figure 5. There is no distinction between the groups and conditions.

**Nose Pokes**- Figure 3 shows the average number of nose pokes made per trial by the paired and unpaired groups in the light and dark nose poke holes. Both groups nose poked slightly more in the hole with the light cue compared to the dark hole $[F(1,39)=5.1, p=0.000]$. The unpaired group also poked significantly more in the light hole than the paired group $[F(1,39)=5.1, p=0.030]$. 

Conditioning trials
Percent Time - Figure 6 shows the percent of time spent on the light side of the box. There was no significant difference between groups with respect to percent of time spent on the light side.

Nose Pokes - Figures 7 and 8 illustrate the average number of nose pokes per trial on conditioning trials 1 and 6, respectively. Both graphs show that there were more nose pokes on CS+ day compared to CS- days (for trial 1 [F(1,22)=4.4, p=0.047], for trial 6 [F(1,43)=13.1, p=0.001]). However, neither graph shows a significant difference between groups.

Preference tests
The statistics run on the preference tests were the same as were run on the pretest.

Test 1
Activity - Figure 9 shows the activity measurement for test 1. This shows a significant difference in groups with
respect to activity measured \[F(1,46)=6.7, p=0.013\]. The paired group has a higher activity count even though both groups received saline.

Left Time - The measure of left time is shown in figure 10. There was no significant difference between groups.

Test 2

Activity - Figure 12 shows the activity for test 2. There was no significant difference between groups.

Nose Pokes - The average number of nose pokes during test 1 is shown in figure 11. The paired group poked significantly more in the CS+ hole compared to the CS- hole \[F(1,42)=5.0, p=0.031\].

Left Time - The amount of time per minute spent on the left side of the box is shown in figure 13. There was no significant difference between groups.
Nose Pokes- Figure 14 shows the average number of nose pokes on the light and dark sides per group. There were significantly more nose pokes on the light side compared to the dark side \( [F(1,44)=5.2, p=0.028] \). Also, the paired group made significantly more pokes on the dark side than the unpaired group \( [F(1,44)=5.9, p=0.019] \).

Discussion
Although the Swiss mice did not show a preference for the light cue during the conditioning trials, they did learn the association and were able to exhibit sign-tracking during preference test 1.

When comparing the nose poke counts for conditioning trials 1 and 6 (see figures 7 and 8 respectively) we can see that there was no sign-tracking observed in the presence of ethanol. The ratio of light pokes to dark pokes is not changed significantly in either group. There is a decrease in the overall amount of nose pokes from conditioning trial 1 to conditioning trial 6, which is most likely due to habituation.

The preference for the light cue can be seen when comparing figures 3 and 11, which show the nose poke counts for the pretest and preference test 1, respectively. During the pretest, both groups poked more in the light cue holes. However during preference test 1, the paired group showed a clear preference for the nose poke hole with the light cue. The fact that the paired group shows a preference for the light cue after conditioning can be indicative of sign-tracking. The act of nose poking was not necessary to obtain the drug, and was not rewarded. Another interpretation of these results could be that the increase in nose pokes by the paired group on the light side is a reflection of their increased activity.

It is interesting that the amount of time spent on the light side of the box was not a good indication of sign-tracking in this experiment. In the previous experiment by Cunningham & Patel (2007), the NZB/B1NJ mice showed sign-tracking over the conditioning trials by increasing the amount of time spent on the star side of the floor. A reason that the animals in our experiment did not spend more time on either side of the box could be that the mice were too activated by the ethanol during conditioning. In Cunningham & Patel, the DBA/2J mice had a much
higher mean activity during the conditioning trials with ethanol, compared to the NZB/B1NJ mice. The DBA/2J mice did not show an increase in time spent on the star side during conditioning trials, however they did show a preference for the star side during the saline test. This shows that although the DBA/2J mice did not show sign-tracking, they did learn the association of the star cue and the ethanol. One could argue that the difference in activity was the reason that the DBA/2J mice could not show sign-tracking during the conditioning trials. The activity of the DBA/2J mice was much higher than the activity of the NZB/B1NJ mice.

This activity difference could apply to our experiment and explain why sign-tracking was not observed during the conditioning trials. The Swiss mice were very active during the ethanol trials. However, even during the saline preference tests in our experiment the mice did not spend a greater amount of time on the light side of the box. In Cunningham & Patel (2007), the DBA/2J mice did show a preference during the saline test. The fact that the Swiss mice did not spend more time on the light side of the box could mean that the mice did not learn the association well enough. Perhaps Swiss mice need more conditioning trials in order to make a stronger association and be able to show a preference for the cue during the conditioning and the preference sessions.

Acknowledgement Thank you to Chris L. Cunningham, Charlene Voorhees, Christina Gremel, and Peter Groblewski. This research was conducted in the Behavioral Neuroscience Department at Oregon Health Science University.

References


“Women and Resistance in the African Diaspora, with special focus on the Caribbean, Africa and USA”

CLARE WASHINGTON
KOFI AGORSAH, FACULTY MENTOR

INTRODUCTION

Resistance to the institution of slavery was very widespread, persistent, and to be found in almost every aspect of slave life (Beckles, 1989: 152). All groups of slaves, regardless of sex, color, or work had an anti-slavery mentality when it came to obeying their masters, and women were among leaders of resistance movements. Women’s leadership roles, however, have been minimized in writings about slave resistance.

As early as 1500, captive women become active participants in resistance to slavery. There are accounts of revolt during the middle passage. For example, an English slaver captain, John Newton, reports that ships that were under his command survived at least five revolts. One such revolt was aboard the "Thomas" in 1797. The women on board were released and let on deck to get exercise and eat. When they discovered that the armory was unlocked, they seized guns from this container and overpowered the crew. The men were then released and the ships eventually controlled by the captives. However, it should be noted that they were eventually recaptured because of their inability to navigate the seas (Beckles 1989: 155). Still this was an early indication of women’s unwillingness to accept their enslaved position.

to suggest the enormous contributions of women to the successes of many of the resistance events. Also, research revelations are being made about the negative impressions and images of enslaved women depicted in colonial writings (Mathis 2001, Beckles and Shephered 1996, Cooper 1994, Campbell 1986, Price 1996, Campbell 1987). Some of these new findings depict women as not only actively at the forefront of colonial military and political resistance operations but performed those activities in addition to their roles as the bearers of their individual original cultures. One group of special interest in the Caribbean consisted of the women of the “runaway” communities as in Jamaica and Suriname, where the rich heritage of the contributions of such women appear to continue to be significant. (Agorsah 1994, Craton 1992, Hart 1980, 1985, Zips 1999) The research done on the achievements of these communities, does not give much attention to the role and status of the women of those communities, except their role as house-wives and bearers of children.

For slaves, life was harsh and harsher still for slave women. Slave men, in Antigua, were the ones likely to hold non-agricultural and less arduous labor (Hector, 1996). Women had to take the full brunt. From age 14 or 15 every slave woman, like the men, were assigned a plot. The women were expected to produce no less than a man! Gender, differences in strength seemed to be of no account. Slave women bore the full weight of field work, while they were excluded from the factory and other skilled work. Slave women also had to compete with poor white women as hucksters. And naturally, (or perhaps, “un-naturally”) the law took the side of the poor white women against black slave women. So it was that black slave women could not sell sugar, cotton, rum, molasses or ginger without written permission. These were left, in the main, for poor white women. Of special note is how specific these white minority, and therefore, discriminatory laws were. They determined where black women could live and could not live, when they could be out of doors, and when they could not, who they could be seen with and whom they could not. Their sub-humanity was enforced
by law. But slave women were always the backbone of resistance in this and other Caribbean territories. Slave women filed more complaints in the courts than men. And slave women outnumbered men as offenders under Slave Laws. For example, in a Report on slaves in Guiana, the so-called protector of slaves in 1826 had this to say: "There is no question as far as has come within my reach of observation as to the difficulty of managing the women and they [the slave women] are irritating and insolent to a degree -- often instigated by the men -- to take advantage of the exemption from stripes and in town do little or nothing" (Hector, 1996).

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Running away from the harshness of the fields, the masters and the overseers is what I learned about slavery in junior high and high school history books. Neither my teachers, nor any of the books I read talked about or even mentioned other forms of resistance to slavery by both male and female slaves, other than running away. Acts of murder, though not common, were also committed by black women against their white oppressors. Women have also been found to figure prominently in such events as suicides and mass poisonings (Klein, 1986: 94). Another excellent text which is full of information, first person accounts, and resources is Barbara Bush’s book, *Slave Women in Caribbean Society 1650-1838*. It covers such topics as slave women in resistance, as transmitters of African culture, and their role in the labor force.

In Bush’s study, new revelations regarding the female slave in Caribbean society were uncovered, which included: the vital and significant contribution she (the slave woman) made to West Indian slave society; how she exhibited strength and independence which wasn’t previously accredited; how she struggled alongside her men-folk to live, maintain her dignity, to survive, and retain her integrity and culture; and her positive role in slave resistance.
Pero Gaglo Dagbovie notes in his article, “Black women, Carter G. Woodson, and the Association for the Study of Negro Life and History, 1915-1950”, that “Woodson himself lacked background for broad historical writing; he was almost contemptuous of emotion; he had limited human contacts and sympathies.” But several months after his death, W. E. B. Du Bois concluded this harsh criticism of the founder of the Association for the Study of Negro Life and History adding:

“he had no conception of the place of woman in creation.”

It is thought that Du Bois was criticizing Woodson for supposedly ignoring black women’s role in history. In 1991, almost four decades after Woodson’s death, historian Patricia Morton, in her book Disfigured Images: The Historical Assault on Afro-American Women (1991) elaborated on Du Bois's provocative comment. She argued that starting in the nineteenth century and well into the second half of the twentieth, many black male historians have contributed to White society’s most detrimental views, myths, and stereotypes of black womanhood. Though she notes that Woodson at times defended black womanhood, she stresses that the “Father of Negro History” largely omitted slave women and black female activists from his work. At the same time, she praises Woodson for challenging “conventional orthodoxies,” specifically for deconstructing some of the myths pertaining to black women.”

Woodson's views of black women may appear to have been at times ambiguous. But, overall they were quite progressive when compared to other black male scholars and historians of his time. While he did not publish monographs devoted to black women or fight actively and openly for women’s rights, he did publish several important articles in the 1930s which sought to reconstruct the prevailing negative images of black womanhood. He welcomed black women with open arms into a movement very dear to him. He also supported and celebrated their efforts at
legitimizing and popularizing the study of African American life and history. Black female teachers, club-women, librarians, amateur historians, and social activists played vital roles in the activities of the ASNLH (Association for the Study of Negro Life and History).

Verene Shephered notes in the Introduction of *Women in Caribbean History* (Shepherd, ed., 1999), that until the 1970s, Caribbean history books contained very little information about women. Some of the reasons, according to Shepherd, were 1). the main focus of the early historians was on issues relating to colonization, government, diplomacy, religion, trade and warfare. Men were more involved in these activities than women; 2). some historians did not think that women’s issues merited inclusion in history books, therefore they did not write about the history of women apart from those who were great leaders or were involved in ‘public’ life; 3). social history techniques had not yet become widely used in the writing of Caribbean history. Social history pays more attention to groups which are not of the elite class and to topics such as family and reproduction – not at first considered suitable or important topics for history textbooks; and 4). many historians opted to write what they regarded as ‘gender natural’ history, believing that this was a more objective way of writing history.

Shepherd goes on to say that the factors that contributed to a change in the subjects chosen for history included: the slow acceptance of the methods of social history; the influence of the international women’s movement with its attention to women’s rights; the emergence of ‘women’s history’ (‘women’s history’ challenged the claim that only men should be written about and writers of women’s history argued that our view of history would change if women were included in the historical accounts); the emergence of a group of demographic and social historians concerned with Caribbean women’s history; and the need to project a more positive image of Caribbean women, especially black women; because stereotypes and negative images of Caribbean women abounded in
the journals of Columbus, the books written by the early colonizers and settlers, travelers, missionaries and others who visited the Caribbean in that period.

The writers who have contributed much to overturning the negative images of Caribbean women and increasing our knowledge of the history of the Caribbean women include pioneers such as Elsa Goveia, Lucille Mathurin-Mair, Barry Higman and Kamu Brathwaite. More recently we have benefited from the books written by people like Rhoda Reddock, Hillary Beckles, Barbara, and Marietta Morrissey. But Shepherd cautions that the current research still does not reflect the historical experiences of all groups of women in the Caribbean (Shepherd, 1999).

PRESENT STUDY AND METHODOLOGY

This project is a work in progress on women in slave resistance (a topic originating from my previous class studies started first as a general reading to identify issues and references of interest to this topic. This current study will extend that general background work). I became interested in slave resistance, particularly female slave resistance after spending a quarter in Professor Agorsah’s Caribbean Female Slave Resistance seminar at Portland State University. In the course, I learned many things about slave resistance that I’d never heard of before. The most eye-opening information and material I found in the readings for the seminar, were those related to the many ways in which slaves (female and male) resisted the institution of slavery and harsh slave masters. Historical documentation such as missionary and baptismal record, deeds, colonial maps and military reports, “negro spiritual songs” ad festivities, oral histories or narratives, photographic images and other archival material will be the main sources. Documentaries depicting colonial plantation and resistance history will also be critically examined in order to identify issues relating to the role of women in those episodes and the interpretations given about those events. Interviews will be conducted among the older people of the selected communities who have preserved the traditions.
ASPECTS OF WOMEN RESISTANCE

The accounts of African American slavery in textbooks routinely conflate the story of male and female slaves into one history. Textbooks rarely enable students to grapple with the lives and challenges of women constrained by the institution of slavery. The collections of letters and autobiographies of slave women in the nineteenth century now available on the Internet open a window onto the lives of these women, and allow teachers and students to explore this history. One such resource is the quarterly online journal, History Now: American History Online.

Students too readily accept everything that they read in books as "the truth". Teachers often hear, "Well, I read it in the book. It must be true." or "It was on the news, in the newspaper, or in a magazine." I certainly wasn’t exposed to any of what I’ve learned since returning to higher education, when I was in junior high and high school. Unfortunately, too many students hear teachers say that if it's in the book, then it must be so. Much of what has been called history has been recorded by men of the dominant culture of that society. The men who write the text decided what should be recorded and what is important. There is little written about women, let alone minority women. A lot of students have deducted that since women and members of minority groups rarely appear in history texts, they contributed little to history.

Dr. Mary Pipher, a psychotherapist and New York Times best-selling author for her book, Reviving Ophelia: Saving the Selves of Adolescent Girls (1975), says that when girls and women read a history of Western civilization, they are essentially reading a record of men’s lives. Pipher quotes Dale Spender, author of Man Made Language (1980; 1985), “Women’s accomplishments are relegated
to the lost and found.” As girls study Western civilization, they become increasingly aware that *history* is the history of men. History is *His Story*, the story of *man-kind*. Pipher goes on to say,

> “I discovered this when I read H.G. Well’s *Outline of History* and Winston Churchill’s *History of the Western World*. Both are primarily histories of war and the distribution of property. Women’s lives were ignored except as they influenced the course of men’s lives. I remember, Pipher continues, wondering “where were the women during all these events?” My daughter made the same observation about her history text: “It’s so boring, just a bunch of kings and generals fighting each other. What were the women doing anyway?”

Girls move into a culture with a Constitution that gave *white* men, not all Americans, the right to vote, and that has yet to pass an equal rights amendment. They (girls) join a culture in which historical documents proclaim the rights of *man*. As the writer and poet, Tillie Olsen observed, “Women’s voices have been silenced through the ages, and the silencing continues in the present.” (Pipher, 1975: 40-41).

Pipher notes that by junior high, girls sense their lack of power, but usually they cannot say what they sense. “If I ask who writes most of the material they study at school, they know it’s men. If I ask who is more likely to be principal, they say a man. If I ask who has the most power, they say men. I encourage girls to think about these issues and bring me examples of discrimination.”

One girl noticed that the mountains in Colorado that were named for men had their last names. She brought in a map to point out Mount Adams, Mount Audubon, Babcock Peak, Mount Sneffels, and Mount Richtofen. The few natural features that are named for women are named with only the women’s *first* name, such as Mount Alice, Mount Emma, Mount Eva, Lake Emmaline, Lake Agnes, Maggie Gulch, and Mount Flora (1975: 41).

**WOMEN RESISTANCE LEADERS**
A lot of work has been done studying the lives of slaves and the slave system in the United States. From elementary school on through college we are taught the evils of slavery that took place right here in the Land of the Free. Slavery is a term most of us are familiar with. Most people are aware of the part America played in the business of buying and selling black people into forced labor, but the United Kingdom also had her part in this twisted scheme that yielded an enormous amount of money for certain people in the aristocracy and middleclass. Way back in the day England was well known for its ships and the advantages this gave her in terms of defending the seas and also transportation. The two main commercial activities that gave England its maritime advantage were sugar and slaves. Ships would leave Britain with cargo of cheap manufactured goods from Liverpool and Bristol and travel to West Africa where they would be exchanged for slaves. The slaves were then taken to the Caribbean where they were exchanged for sugar that was then brought back to Europe and sold for a very large profit. The huge monetary gain made sure people were not overly concerned with the humanitarian aspect of the slave trade or even the ethical issues. They were making money that enabled them to buy more ships and give Britain the advantage of being the world's most forceful naval power. Human men and women – slaves – were the sacrifices for all of this. The map below (Figure 1) shows major areas involved as recipients of enslaved Africans (in the Caribbean) in the 18th century.
Figure 1

NANNY OF JAMAICA AND OTHERS

Most historical accounts about slaves and slavery are written and taught mostly about the men slaves and how they resisted and rebelled against the harsh and terrible treatment they endured at the hand of their masters. Besides here in the United States, there were slaves and slavery in other places also—especially in the Caribbean. It is important to note that female slaves were also not willing to tolerate being enslaved, and also rebelled, resisted and ran away as the male slaves did—oftentimes, even more so. But there is little written about these more obscure women. This same concept has continued throughout history, and especially where the African American female’s role in history is concerned. There are a few historical accounts of such female personalities as Nanny of the Maroons. Almost every slave rebellion involved African spiritual practices, and leaders such as Queen Nanny, usually practiced Obeah and were able to instill confidence in their followers. Nanny was born in Africa, and was from the Ashanti tribe, but was brought to Jamaica as a slave. Nanny is known to the Maroons of today as “Granny Nanny”. The Ashanti tribe was one of the powerful tribes in West Africa. They were well trained in fighting battles, and their women were greatly respected. Their women also knew about fighting battles. When Nanny arrived in Jamaica, rebellion against slavery was going on. Rebel towns (the towns of run-away slaves) were all over the island. The Maroon villages were the strongest of these rebel towns, and were well organized and defended.

Soon after arriving in Jamaica, Nanny and her five brothers escaped from slavery. Her brothers were Cudjoe, the great Maroon leader, Accompong, Johnny, Cuffy and Quao. This Ashanti
family soon became leaders of the Maroons and of many other free Africans. Nanny and her brothers decided that a movement should be started to drive away the British. Cudjoe went to St. James and built a village. This village was called Cudjoe Town. Accompong went to St. Elizabeth. Accompong in St. Elizabeth is named after him. Nanny and Quao went to Portland to organize the free Africans there. There were, therefore, two main groups of Maroons. There were those in the west of the island called the Leeward Maroons. Those in the east were called the Windward Maroons. Under her protection, many would hide in 'Girls' Town' or 'Women's Town' in the John Crow Mountains. Nanny made a vow on Pumpkin Hill in 1737 to fight the British to death.

For her role in resistance movements and rebellions, Nanny deserves to be written and talked about in the historical context; however, other women in Caribbean and African countries contributed much to the freedom of their families and communities as well. Some of these women include: Queen Yaa Asantewa of Ghana; Queen Nzingha of Ndongo of Southwest Africa; Mary Thomas a.k.a. Queen Mary of St. Croix, Virgin Islands; and two others who fought alongside Queen Mary were Alexina Solo aka Queen Agnes and Susana Abramson aka Queen Matilda (nicknamed “Bottom-Belly) also of St. Croix, Virgin Islands; and Queen Coziah Harmon (she along with her three sisters, Clara, Ezba and Lala, were coal loaders).

YAA ASANTEWA AND OTHERS

There are some pages of history which testify that having realized with dismay that the Ashanti kings were generally filled with cowardice to militarily confront the British colonial administration in the Gold Coast that had detained their king, Nana Prempeh I in 1896, five years later, Queen Mother Yaa Asantewa took up arms and led an Ashanti army in the Gold Coast to fight the British troops in the last and most bloody battle of the 10 Anglo-Ashanti wars. She was later
captured and banished into exile in Seychelles where she died in 1923. Her most famous words to the Ashanti kings were, "If you the men of Ashanti will not go forward, then we will. We, the women will. I shall call upon you my fellow women. We will fight the white men. We will fight until the last of us falls in the battlefield." It is this war that entered in the annals of history as the last war in Africa ever led by a woman.

**QUEEN NZINGHA**

In 1624, Queen Nzingha of Ndongo of Southwest Africa led her people to take control of their territory. She was 42 years old at the time. For the next forty years, Nzingha led her people into battle against the Portuguese from the rocky slopes of Matamba. Her sisters were captured during a battle, but with the help of slaves in Luanda, they escaped from slavery. Later, her sister, Kifunji, died from battle wounds.

Nzingha led many battles and peace treaties, some with the Portuguese, some with the Dutch, but she never resisted against slavery and the ill treatment of her people. She never returned to the ruins of Kabasa, and many remember her as the Queen of Matamba, because she ruled from the Matamba Mountains and countryside, never from the Ndongo territory, despite her titles. When she died in 1663 at age 82, her sister, Mukambu, took over the seat of power as head of the Mbundu people. Mukambu had Nzingha laid to rest in her leopard skins and with her bow over her shoulder and arrows in her hand.

**QUEEN MARY THOMAS OF THE CARIBBEAN**

Queen Mary Thomas, and the two others who fought alongside her, Queen Agnes and Queen Matilda (nicknamed “Bottom-Belly) of St. Croix, Virgin Islands, were leaders of the
Agricultural laborers Revolt in October 1878, also known as Fireburn of 1878. There is a road in St. Croix named “Queen Mary Highway” to commemorate this lady.

The title of queen was bestowed on these women because they were selected by the workers on the plantations to preside over all ceremonies, rituals and celebrations. These women were held in the highest esteem and were well respected as leaders by their fellow workers.

Nearly all the estates along Centerline west of Kingshill were burned out. Near Christiansted, Anna's Hope and Work and Rest went up in smoke, but the town itself was left unharmed. Not only the men were the heroes to the laborers this time, the women too, played their part in the action. The most famous was Queen Mary. After all settled down the Queens were led away to prison in Denmark, but were eventually returned to St. Croix.

QUEEN COZIAH HARMON

Queen Coziah Harmon, and her three sisters, Clara, Ezba and Lala, were all coal loaders on St. Thomas. For all intents and purposes, the coal-carrier strike on St. Thomas in 1892, embodied the principle of nonviolent protest, a concept that was to become a central ingredient of the civil rights movement of the 1960s under the inspired leadership of the Rev. Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. (The Virgin Island Daily News, January 19, 2006).

THE LIVING AFRICAN-AMERICAN HISTORY

On July 27, 2006, I interviewed Ann Whiting, a direct descendant of Queen Coziah’s. Ann noted that at no time did Queen Coziah and her sisters want the coal strike to be of a violent nature. They were to accomplish the goals they set out by non-violent means only. She also noted (as does Eddie Donoghue, who wrote the play, “Queen Coziah”, notes), that it is considered ironic that
whereas Martin Luther King, Jr. drew many of his followers from black colleges, Queen Coziah and the participants in the coal-carrier strike had little or no formal education. Yet both groups had a disciplined commitment to nonviolent action and passive resistance.

Queen Coziah, was intuitively aware that given the size of the well-equipped Danish militia and fire corps arrayed against them, any collective violent action on the part of the strikers was doomed to culminate in bloodshed and a setback for their cause. Coziah was non-compromising in her approach. As she addressed the coal strikers gathered in the park ready to march on the three major ship-coaling companies with offices on Main Street, she emphasized the need for nonviolence. Violence, she insisted, would tarnish the moral justification for the strike.

ARONA PETERSEN

At this same interview with Ann Whiting about Queen Coziah, I learned of another famous Caribbean woman, and ancestor of Whiting’s – Arona Petersen (sometimes spelled ‘Peterson). Arona Petersen was an herbalist and culinary specialist from St. Thomas, who wrote many books, of those, the most well-known being *Herbs and Proverbs*. “My Aunt Ronie got me started on learning about our family’s history,” Whiting recalls. “Any questions I had, I went to Aunt Ronie, and she always gave me an answer. This was from the time I was 9-years old. And she understood why I was asking questions. She understood that when I had began reading the Old Testament of the Bible, and reading about who “beget” whom, I wanted to know how our “begets” began. She helped me understand our family’s history, and all of this has remained with me.”

It was important for Arona Petersen to keep the history and culture of their family ancestors and family in the forefront at all times. She wrote *The Food & Folklore of the Virgin Islands* (Romik, 1990) so that the regional flavor of Virgin Islands fare could be captured in her recipes, and the
idiomatic dialogues of island people are perfectly re-created as she spun old island tales and wisdom. It is some of these island tales that Ann Whiting fondly remembers hearing from her ‘Aunt Ronie’. St. Croix’s Top Hat Restaurant also serves some of the food with an adaptation from Arona Petersen's *The Food & Folklore of the Virgin Islands* book. And in 1991, Roberta Q. Knowles, who teaches English at the University of the Virgin Islands, St. Croix campus, and a contributor to *Caribbean Writer*, wrote the book, *Arona Petersen: Famous Virgin Islander*. During Black History Month in 2005, the St. Croix’s Carabana Ensemble Theater put on a play entitled, *Arona*, which was about the life and times of Arona Petersen. It is noted in the Summer 2005 issue of *Tidings*, a newsletter of Friends of Virgin Islands National Park, that the play was a smashing hit.

Ann whiting herself is contributing, and has contributed much in keeping her family’s history and culture alive, as she notes in the mini-biography she sent to me. “I am an amateur genealogist; I began when I read the “begat” in the bible, and wanted to do my own Begat. I have been documenting my family history for the better part of 40 years. My database consists of over 1200 names thru 8 major families. The branches extend to England, France, Germany, Norway, Denmark, China, Russia and India. I have not yet been able to document a specific place in Africa, though West Africa is looking like a good jumping off place. My mentors in this quest have been my God Father, J. Antonio Jarvis, a historian, photographer, author and educator; and my Cousin, Arona Saunders Petersen, a world traveler, chief, painter, poet, author, a walking textbook on Virgin Islands history and Caribbean culture.”

Ann Whiting shared a portion of her writing about her family’s history with me in the manuscript she’s been writing. She summarizes in her the mini-biography, “I am in the process of writing, what I wanted my grandchildren to know of their culture, but has taken on a life of it’s own, and may become a book. The title, *The Other Caribbean History*, it is my attempt to explain, not from
a scholastic but a common sense point of view, how the Caribbean was colonized, and its affect on the world, then and today. I am, however, being pulled or swayed by my first love, genealogy, to slant it that way or to merge history with genealogy, my problem now is how to be analytical about both.”

THE UNITED STATES

In the U.S. Harriett Tubman and Sojourner Truth are the most well known and have the most history written about them. A great woman of African descent is Sojourner Truth who was born as a slave in 1797 in the USA. One day she left her home with only 25 cents in her pockets to launch a massive campaign against slavery. Though she was physically assorted and mudslinged for merely exposing the brunt of slavery, Sojourner Truth could not be swayed an inch nor be stopped outright. In 1843, she began a 40-year crusade against slavery.

There is also Harriet Tubman who was born in 1820 on one of the slave breeding plantations in the USA. She first freed herself, then later her brothers and sisters who were also in the shackles of slavery and went on to establish a route called the ‘underground railroad’ through which she rescued many other Africans to find the road to freedom. Angry slave owners to offered $40,000 as a reward for Harriet’s capture. However this did not materialize.

Just as it is the Caribbean and in other countries, there were other heroines with little or no history written about them in the U.S. The list is long, but Ellen Smith Craft and Anna Kingsley are two of the many that I uncovered in my research.

ELLEN CRAFT SMITH

Ellen Smith Craft was born in 1826 in the town of Clinton, Georgia, and died in 1891. She was from the state of Georgia. On December 26, 1848, she pulled off a daring slave escape,
wherein she impersonated a slaveholder, and she and her husband, William Craft, walked off to freedom. Ellen Smith Craft is a Georgia woman whose life story reads like a Hollywood script of adventure and courage: an unlikely escape from the shackles of slavery followed by the selfless pursuit of justice despite continuing threats to her own safety and well-being.

ANNA KINGSLEY

Anna Kingsley was from Spanish Florida, and in March 1811, she became a landowner and slaveholder. Anna was the African wife of plantation owner Zephaniah Kingsley. At an early age, she survived the Middle Passage and dehumanizing slave markets to become the property of Kingsley. After manumission by her husband, Anna became a landowner and slaveholder. She raised her four children while managing a plantation that utilized African slave labor. She survived brutal changes in race policies and social attitudes brought by successive governments in Florida, but survival demanded difficult, often dangerous, choices. She was a woman of courage and determination. She is an example of the active role that people of color played in shaping their own destinies and our country’s history in an era of slavery, oppression, and prejudice.

THE CARIBBEAN: DOORWAY TO SLAVERY

The Caribbean was the doorway to slavery here in the United States, and it is important that we study the hardships that slaves suffered through in this area. Slaves regularly resisted their masters any way they could. Female slaves, in particular, had a very strong sense of independence and they regularly resisted slavery using both violent and nonviolent means, even though, like the male slaves, they were considered property. Caribbean slave women exhibited their strong character, independence and exceptional self worth through their opposition to their tasks performed in the fields on plantations. This resistance was expressed in many different rebellious
ways including not getting married, refusing to reproduce, and various forms of other physical resistance.

In the Caribbean, the system of slavery sought to degrade women and womanhood in such ways as to force aspects of their resistance to take on specific forms. Maternity and fertility was at the core for plantation survival, and so women’s resistance to these policies were all too common (Reddock, pg. 24). For this reason, slave owners were as fearful, suspicious and distrustful of women’s activities as rebels, as they were of men’s. Women were very visible participants to resistance movements.

There have been many myths, stereotypes, labels, and misleading images about slave women, including: they didn’t have valid roles in slave resistance (which has been proven to be untrue). Some of the most common myths and labels were that the slave woman was: “promiscuous harlot”, cruel, negligent as a mother, fickle as a wife, passive, downtrodden, had no moral codes, no single connection with the other sex, subservient, and a resigned slave who contributed little to the cause of slave resistance. Yet, as Moira Ferguson writes in *The History of Mary Prince*, women were very visible participants in resistance movements. Mary Prince ran away from her one master, Captain Ingham, although this proved to be unsuccessful. In the end, however, she eventually beat the system. She got her freedom, but she had to give up her husband for it (Ferguson, 1997). And new research by Edward Kamau Braithwaite (*The Development of Creole Society in Jamaica*, 1971), shows the contribution women made to slave cultural life. Also, cultural histories written by Eugene Genovese (*Roll Jordan Roll*) and others including Blassingame (1972), Rawick (1972-3), and Gutman (1976), have contributed to presenting the woman slave in more positive ways.

Female opposition to Caribbean slavery took on many different forms, both violent and nonviolent. Armed rebellions were the rarest form of resistance (Beckles, pg. 157). The more
ordinary day-to-day resistance was much more common and they were designed with two objectives in mind: First, actions designed to weaken the slave system and hasten its collapse; Second, actions designed to improve the efficiency of the system so as to extract greater benefits. Field women adopted the strategy of labor withdrawal, where they performed less productively than they otherwise could.

The greatest contribution women made for the resistance of slavery were individual battles for improved conditions and freedom, in addition to individual acts ranging from refusing to get married all the way to infanticide. Acts of infanticide were very frequent as both an act of resistance and an unwillingness to bring children into the world of slavery (Reddock, pg. 14). Slave women would just refuse to have children all together as an act of resistance. Another common anti-slavery action was running away. Those who not themselves take flight frequently assisted others in doing so.

PASSIVE AND NON-PASSIVE RESISTANCE

As has been noted, resistance to slavery and oppression was in several forms. Most notable, of course, was the aggressive resistance in the form of revolts and rebellions. But as discussed above, there were also passive resistance to slavery and oppression. Queen Coziah used non-violent, passive resistance in the Coal-Carriers Strike of 1892, in order to reach her goals for the workers. Ellen Smith Craft used passive resistance and non-violent means to free herself and her husband from enslavement; and Anna Kingsley, a free woman on the first day of March 1811, when white plantation owner Zephaniah Kingsley put his signature on a document that forever changed the life of a young African woman. The document was a manumission paper, which ensured her legal freedom. She then became a landowner and slaveholder herself.
The more violent rebellions, revolts and resistance movements weren’t just carried out by male slaves. Female slaves played a big role in some of these movements, too.

Tim Hector, in his article, *Women & Youths in Antigua - The Hidden Story*, points out some interesting facts about the status of women in Antigua. The articles talk about how her man contracted her to work for the planter, as if she were his property. Slavery had brought the woman to work, admittedly as chattel, but in her own capacity. Post-slavery, the man contracted his wife or woman to work for the same planter, as his property. The law forbade women to sign contracts in her own right. The personhood of the black women was assaulted and violated even though "freed" that same year of the Contract Act, namely, in 1834.

Women in Antigua retaliated and resisted. That resistance by women, often ignored by the men who write history is nonetheless one of the corner stones of our history. Men, both as historians or as men, glorify and sanctify women as "Mothers" to whom they swear undying love. But the same women, other than their mother presumably, they subordinate with a ruthlessness, exceeded only by that of the Planter (Hector, 1998).

How did Antiguan women resist? So as to eliminate any personal bias, as chauvinists might argue, let me quote an objective source. Louis Rothe, in a *Description of the Island of Antigua* wrote “on many estates the women had completely withdrawn their labour or worked only for a few days a week and they were unwilling to put their children to work in the fields. What a bold and heroic move in hard, very hard, indeed the hardest times!”

Men often see themselves as the motive force of history. But there clearly can be an argument here, that Antiguan women had done one of the most dramatic things in our history. They had, on several sugar estates, completely withdrawn from estate labour and prevented their children from engaging in plantation work. This is a good example of passive resistance.
It was mainly women who started the free villages in Antigua. They wanted to get away from the plantation "cottage," really the slave hut, and establish a home of their own in which they could raise their children, free from the dreaded plantation and planter control - in terms of manual labor and sexual labor. That “general capacity” in which women worked for the planter or his overseers involved sexual favors as well. Women dreaded it, and sought dignity, human dignity, in their own homes, however poor and without material comforts, but far from the dreaded plantation.

The more violent women resisters and rebellious leaders include: the Amazons of Dahomey, whom some have called a crack all-female troops. They were all females, who served also as royal bodyguards. They were also priestesses & wore crescent moon crowns; the Hausa had a number of warrior queens, notably Amina of Zau Zau; a woman named Bazao-Turunku led warriors and founded a town south of Zaria; and Nupe women warriors called Isadshi-Koseshi fought as fiercely as the men, opposing invasions of the Fulbe conquerors who raided the Nupe for cattle & slaves, especially women.

CONCLUSION AND FUTURE RESEARCH

These are the main questions addressed: Who were the major contributors in the selected resistance episodes in the selected areas? How did they relate to the events – politically, socially, militarily and economically? What exactly were their contribution and impact of those contributions?

I found that many of the more obscure female personalities in resistance movements have been overlooked and understudied by historians. Although research has been done of the achievements of many of the slave communities, not much attention has been given to the role and status of the women of those communities, except their role as housewives and bearers of children.
Further research needs to be done to fully examine the more important roles of the more obscure women that have simply been left out of history. In addition to examining these roles, the study will also examine similarities in personalities and strategies used by women among these communities as they headed toward the achievement of equality. Jamaica, Suriname and southern United States will be the initial geographical areas of focus. Women’s spirituality as vehicle as well as weapon and its impact on the resistance activities will also be investigated.

The results of this study should help to explain that although there were many horrors witnessed by the women of these resistance movements, there were a large number who made it and contributed substantially to the labor force on the plantations, especially on the Caribbean sugar plantations.

Although they exhibited so much rebelliousness to the slave system, the nineteenth century women actually exceeded male slaves when it came to work and value (Beckles, 1989: 32). Slave women were the dominant force behind production and labor reproduction. The hardships of slavery and the coinciding opposition to the system helped to mold the Caribbean woman into what she is today. Rhoda Reddock, puts it even better in an excerpt from Women, Labor and Politics in Trinidad and Tobago:

“Despite the treachery and inhumanity of the plantation experience it brought to the fore the potentials for production, self-sufficiency, rebellion, and the relentless quest for personal autonomy still present in Caribbean women today.” (Reddock, 1994: 11)

The list is endless. Probably due to a large extent because of their skin color and to a certain extent because of their gender, there are many other great "queens" or rather, women of African descent, who have unfairly been denied the utmost veneration and great honor they deserve. Among the many are those listed below in Table 1:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Female Personality</th>
<th>Location (U.S. or Other Country)</th>
<th>Major Contribution</th>
<th>Timeline (Year(s), etc.)</th>
<th>Other Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Queen Kahina</td>
<td>North Africa</td>
<td>Fought Arab incursion in North Africa</td>
<td>Died in 705 A.D.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hatshepsut, Tiye and Nefertari, Nefertiti</td>
<td>Kemet (Land of the Blacks)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Otherwise known as ancient Egypt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nandi</td>
<td>Queen of Zululand</td>
<td>overcame many obstacles to raise to a power in all Zululand</td>
<td>1778-1826</td>
<td>Mother of Shaka Zulu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empress Taytu Betul</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>led the conservative faction that resisted the modernists</td>
<td>1889-1913</td>
<td>she was a key player in the conflict over the Treaty of Wuchale with Italy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Church Terrell</td>
<td>Washington, DC</td>
<td>had been a leader in the fight to end Jim Crow segregation</td>
<td>1954</td>
<td>Born in 1863, during the Civil War, and died in 1954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ida B. Wells</td>
<td>Tennessee</td>
<td>went on to lead the American anti-lynching crusade</td>
<td>1892</td>
<td>born the daughter of slaves in Holly Springs, Mississippi, on July 16, 1862</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queen Mother Moore</td>
<td>Louisiana</td>
<td>demanded reparations</td>
<td>1950s</td>
<td>Grandfather lynched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisa Picquet</td>
<td>South Carolina; Buffalo, NY</td>
<td>Worked to free her mother (in Texas)</td>
<td>May 1860</td>
<td>As a baby, she and her mother were sold to a plantation owner in Georgia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1

The evidence needed to rescue slave women from the iniquity of oblivion is not only lost or hidden but often distorted by men. Inspired by the 'strong polemical articles' of women activists,
Barbara Bush, in her book, “Slave Women in Caribbean Society 1650-1838”, set out to analyze myths and ‘the fallacious assumptions upon which they were based’. Her book is a thesis converted to instruct the general reader about the misconceptions of historical information as it is written female slaves in the Caribbean.

REFERENCES:

Books:

Agorsah, E. Kofi

Beckles, Hilary and Shepherd, Verene

Beckles, Hilary

Bush, Barabara
1990 Slave women in Caribbean society 1650-1838, Kingston, Heinemann (Caribbean)

Campbell, Horace G.

Craton, Michael

Ellis, Patricia

Ferguson, Moira

Hart, Richard
1980  *Slaves Who Abolished Slavery: Blacks in Bondage, (Vol 1)*  Kingston, University of the West Indies.

Hart, Richard
1985  *Slaves Who Abolished Slavery: Blacks in Rebellion, (Vol 2)*  Kingston, University of the West Indies.

Klein, Herbert S.
1986  *African Slavery in Latin America and the Caribbean.*  Oxford University Press.
New York.

Mathis, R.

Mintz, Sidney
1996  Black women, Economic roles and Cultural traditions, *Caribbean Freedom: Economy and Society from emancipation to the present,*  Ed. Hilary Beckles and V. Shephered: 238-244

Momsen, Janet H.
1996  Gender roles in Caribbean agricultural labor, *Caribbean Freedom: Economy and Society from emancipation to the present,*  Ed. Hilary Beckles and V. Shephered: 216—224

Morton, Patricia

Pipher, Mary

Price, Richard

Reddock, Rhoda E.

Shephderd, Verene A.

Spender, Dale

Zips, Werner  


**Articles:**

Dagbovie, Pero Gaglo.  


**Web Sites:**


*Tidings*, a newsletter of Friends of Virgin Islands National Park.  Web Address:  http://www.friendsvinp.org/archive/05tdsummer.pdf


Influential Factors of Parental Substance and Alcohol Abuse on Children’s Academic Achievement

ANDREA WINTERS
VALERIE STEWART, FACULTY MENTOR

Abstract

There is much research to support the idea that parental involvement benefits a child’s educational performance. There is also strong evidence demonstrating that parental substance or alcohol abuse increases a child’s risk for behavioral problems that include drug and alcohol abuse, social-skill deficits, and low educational attainment. Very little current research has focused specifically on children of substance abusers who, against the odds, achieve academically. This study investigates the relationship between parental substance or alcohol abuse and children’s academic achievement. Data will be collected using a self-report survey from adult-children who self-identify as being a child of a past or present substance or alcohol abuser. This study hopes to identify strategies that were used by the subjects to surmount family dysfunction and which helped them to achieve academically. It is expected that these strategies could be used as interventions to help other students by encouraging their academic progress and achievement even amid dysfunctional, substance abusing family situations. Positive psychological theory and resilience theory concepts are used as a backdrop. Substance abuse, specifically alcohol abuse, is the most prevalent psychiatric disorder in the United States (Murray & Lopez, 1996), with an estimate in 1992 of 14 million adults who abused or were dependent upon alcohol (Grant et al., 1994). The problems of drug and alcohol addiction are worthy of attention as they create concomitant social, economic, and psychological consequences for everyone involved. For example, the collective effects of tobacco, alcohol, and drugs exact greater consequences on the welfare of the American people than any other single preventable factor (Mulvihill, 2005). The total costs ascribable to addiction are approximated at more than $400 billion every year, including health care costs, low worker productivity, and crime (McGinnis & Foege, 1999).

Substance and alcohol abuse can have deleterious effects not only on the individual user but on immediate family members as well, especially children. In 1992, approximately 10 million children under the age of 18 were living in homes with at least one parent classified by DSM-IV criteria as having a past-year diagnosis of alcohol abuse or dependence. The same study found an estimated 28 million children living in households with at least one parent who’d been dependent or abused alcohol at some time in their life.
Abuse of alcohol or drugs by one or both parents has been observed to create high levels of family dysfunction (Blackson, Tarter, Martin, & Moss, 1994). Children of alcoholics and substance abusers (COA’s and COSA’s, respectively) are typically exposed to disorganization in the home including negligent and/or abusive parenting, financial hardships, and possible social isolation in attempting to conceal the disease from family and friends. Parental substance and alcohol abuse threatens the achievement of the child’s full potential by exposing them to a stressful, chaotic, and often frightening home (Black, 1981, Fillmore, 1987). Though alcohol abuse and its effects have been prominent topics in research for decades, issues involving substance abuse other than alcohol have been given less attention. For this reason, few national studies exist that estimate the number of children living in homes with parents who abuse or are dependent upon substances other than alcohol.

Much of current psychological research has focused on the negative aspects and risks involved for children who grow up in a dysfunctional home plagued by drug and alcohol abuse. Though a causal relationship is difficult to establish, there is a substantial research base supporting a relationship between parental substance abuse and ensuing problems in offspring. These children are considered to be “at-risk” for many developmental problems including substance abuse, psychiatric problems, social-skill deficits, and educational attrition (Claydon, 1987; Potter-Efron, 1987; Kinney 1991; McGinnis & Foege, 1999).

A new trend in psychological research has emerged called positive psychology that emphasizes positive features of human behavior categorized as human strengths and virtues (Peterson & Seligman, 2004; Goleman, 1992). Positive psychologists have developed a classification system of virtues and character strengths in the way that the DSM has cataloged mental illness and problematic behavior. As this is a new field of psychology,
specific theories have yet to be articulated (Peterson & Seligman, 2004). The classification system identifies six virtues consisting of twenty-four measurable character strengths. The system is as follows:

1. **Wisdom and Knowledge**: creativity, curiosity, open-mindedness, love of learning, perspective
2. **Courage**: bravery, persistence, integrity, vitality
3. **Humanity**: love, kindness, social intelligence
4. **Justice**: citizenship, fairness, leadership
5. **Temperance**: forgiveness and mercy, humility and modesty, prudence, self-regulation
6. **Transcendence**: appreciation of beauty and excellence, gratitude, hope, humor, spirituality

(Peterson & Seligman, 2004)

This research changes the focus from that of maladaptation to positive adaptation. With respect to this study, positive psychologists would focus upon the children of substance or alcohol abusers who do not develop adverse outcomes. The child’s strengths, those that allowed them to “achieve more than the absence of distress and disorder” (Peterson & Seligman, 2004, p. 17), would also be highlighted.

Positive psychology and its classification system parallels psychological and sociological research on resilience. Though the definition of resiliency differs between theorists, generally resilient people are those who have adapted well psychologically despite a context that significantly threatens their development. In fact, according to a longitudinal study of at-risk youth performed by Benard (1997), when tracked to adulthood, 50% to 70% of the youth grew up to be successful, confident, competent, and caring individuals. Resilience is used in this paper in its most general form and adds attending college as a definition of successful adaptation.
One aspect of a successful adaptation for at-risk children who were raised in homes where one or more parents/guardians were drug abusers or alcoholics is attending college. In today’s society, those who hold a college degree still earn more than those who do not (Hecker, 1998) and are more employable (Bureau of Labor Statistics, 1999). A college degree is not only important on an individual level but also on a societal level as, “educational attainment, measured in terms of the highest degree or level of schooling attained by the adult population, is the international currency used to assess the strength of a country’s economy and its standard of living” (Ruppert, 2003, p. 7). Forging a path to obtain a college degree is an academic achievement, especially for those who have matured in an environment not necessarily conducive to this accomplishment. So, how did these children of alcoholics and drug addicts accomplish this feat?

Research indicates that when parents show an interest in their child’s education by getting involved, students adopt a mastery goal orientation to learning where they are more likely to seek challenging tasks, persist through academic challenges, and experience satisfaction in their homework (Gonzalez-DeHall, Willems, & Holbein, 2005). Unfortunately, a plausible reason for lack of parental involvement in a child’s education is parental substance or alcohol abuse. Concerned parents and educators alike may be interested in the question of where did this child’s commitment to education come from? What factors influenced their development of academic skills that led them to pursue a college degree? In this study, I have chosen to focus on the children of substance and alcohol abusing parents who have overcome family challenges to achieve in academics. This study will explore how parental substance and alcohol abuse affect children’s academic achievement. Working from the adult-child’s perspective, achievement will be operationalized as enrolling in and attending college. Responses to a self-report survey and
questionnaire will highlight family struggles that have been overcome in order to pursue academic achievement. It will also determine strategies used by the students to overcome family dysfunction in order to attend college. It is possible these strategies will help other students who find themselves in similar family situations who must implement special techniques to advance academically. The main hypothesis for this study is that adult-children’s academic achievement may have been fueled by a need to distance themselves from parents’ lifestyle or perhaps by fears of finding themselves in situations similar to that of their parents. It is also hypothesized that sources other than the parent(s)—whether a person, establishment, or the media—were major influences in helping to encourage the adult-children to achieve academically.

METHOD

Design

This was a descriptive, convenience sample whereby data was collected in-person using an anonymous self-report questionnaire that employed open and close-ended questions. The questionnaire gathered information about the respondent’s perspective of his/her family’s dysfunction, specific parental involvement in the respondent’s schooling, and what, if any, were the influences that led them to enroll in and attend college. Snowball sampling was also used by asking participants about their knowledge of other students who qualify for the study and asking for referrals.

Participants

Subjects were currently enrolled college students, 21 years of age or over, who identify as being a child of a past or present substance or alcohol abuser. The expected recruitment for this study is approximately twenty subjects.
**Procedure**

**Questionnaire Development**

Items for the questionnaire were developed based on themes found from research on the topics of parental substance abuse and its effects on children and parental involvement in education and its effects on children’s academic motivation. Actual items were designed by the researcher. A mixture of closed and open-ended questions was used to obtain the most information and experience from participants.

In order to access this population, flyers were posted about the research around Portland State University’s campus and Portland Community College’s Cascade campus. The researcher's contact information was placed on the flyers and it was assumed that participants fit the criteria for participation if they contacted the researcher. After initial contact was made, a meeting time and public meeting place were set up in order that the participant take the questionnaire.

**Data Collection from Questionnaire**

The researcher was available for all sessions so that during completion, the participant could ask questions about the items as needed. It was felt that participants would be more forthcoming if they completed the questionnaire themselves. In the presence of the participant, the researcher read over the completed survey so as to ask any questions of clarification pertinent to the participant’s responses. The answers of clarification were added to the corresponding items by the researcher.

**Data Processing**

Quantitative data were entered using Microsoft Excel software. Qualitative data were entered using Microsoft Word software.

**Data Analysis**
Once data had been entered, summary statistics were calculated using Microsoft Excel software. Descriptive statistics and qualitative themes were summarized in tables using Microsoft Word software.

RESULTS

There were a total of 18 participants in this study of whom 50% were male and 50% were female. 83% of participants were Caucasian, 11% were African-American, and 6% were multi-racial. The mean age of participants was 31 years with a S.D. of 7.0 years. Of the participants, 11% were of freshmen/sophomore academic year status, 72% were of junior/senior status, and 16% were graduate students. In accordance with Portland State University’s criteria for academic programs, 16% of participant’s majors were in the humanities, 6% were in business, 6% were in the physical sciences, 55% were in the social sciences, and 16% had majors that didn’t fit into any of these categories. The mean GPA of respondent’s was 3.41 with a S.D. of 0.43. Forty-four percent (44%) of participants did not experience any change in parenting before the age of 18, while 22% experienced one change in parenting before 18, and 33% experienced two or more changes in parenting before 18. A change in parenting was categorized as anything that related to a parent’s divorce, marriage, change of custody of the child, or move of the child into another adult’s care. Forty-four percent (44%) of participants had a parent/guardian who abused only alcohol, 11% had a parent/guardian who abused only one substance, and 44% of participants had a parent/guardian who abused more than one substance (this includes alcohol). Eleven percent (11%) of respondents were acutely exposed to a parent/guardian’s drug or alcohol abuse while 89% were chronically exposed to a parent/guardian’s drug or alcohol abuse. In accordance with the participant’s rating of the period of their lifetime in which their parent/guardian abused drugs or alcohol they were placed in the categories of “acute
exposure” or “chronic exposure.” A rating of “2” meant that their parent abused drugs or alcohol during 0-10 years of their lifetime and therefore, this rating was placed in the acute exposure category. A rating of “1” or “4” meant that their parent abused drugs or alcohol during their whole lifetime or for multiple years with breaks, respectively. These ratings were placed in the chronic exposure category (Please see Table 1 for participant demographics).

The mean ratings for all participants for items Q11-Q18 are shown in Table 2. As some participants did not answer all items, each sample size is given next to each item number. All items were rated on a 0-4 scale with “0” being a bad rating and “4” being a good rating, or the reverse, depending on the item number (Please see Table 2 for mean ratings). The average rating for item Q11b, the family’s amount of emotional abuse, is the highest rating of 3.6 with “4” being a poor rating. Item Q11c, the family’s amount of verbal abuse, is also a fairly high average rating of 3.0, again with “4” being a poor rating. Ratings overall on items Q15-Q18, parental involvement in participant’s primary education, are on the low side although not extremely.

Table 3 summarizes and compares the average ratings by participant groups. The researcher chose three different categories of items to compare as they held the most evenly distributed number of participants in each group. The categories were gender, parent’s drug of choice, and changes in parenting before 18 years of age. In the gender category, males and females had a large difference (≤ 0.8) on items Q13 (neglect), Q14 (financial problems), Q16 (parent-teacher conferences), and Q18 (monitored academic progress). As a group, females rated their experience as worse than that of males. For the category of parent’s drug of choice, all ratings were comparable. Participants from alcoholic parents did not rate their experience as any better or worse than that of participants from substance abusing parents. The category of changes in parenting before 18 only yielded one rating difference. On item
Q13 (neglect), participants that came from families that had one or more parenting changes before the age of 18 rated this item as worse than that of participants who came from a family where no change in parenting had occurred.

Again, note that tests for statistical significance were not performed for the mean difference due to group size limitations.

Frequent and infrequent themes represented in the qualitative data, along with their occurrence, and a quoted example are listed in Table 4. The researcher assessed the qualitative data to see if any matching themes were presented when comparing all the participant’s answers on each item. When a theme occurred 8 or more times in the participant’s responses, it was labeled as very frequent. When a theme occurred 4-7 times in participant responses, it was labeled as frequent. When a theme occurred less than four times, it was labeled as infrequent. For item Q19, the “parent’s reaction to the participant’s grades,” the following themes were established: Indifference (frequent occurrence), critical (frequent), anger, (infrequent), and positive/supportive (infrequent). For item Q20, obstacles that have been overcome to attend college, financial issues were a very frequent response, with lack of role model only second to that with a frequent occurrence. Also with frequent occurrences were, lack of self-esteem and drug/alcohol addiction as obstacles to attending college. The main influence that convinced the participants to attend college, item Q21, was a person other than their parents. This response occurred very frequently. Following that theme in frequency of response, was participants’ desire to distance themselves from their parent’s lifestyle. For the participants so far, college has been personally difficult overall (Q22; very frequent theme) but at the same time stimulating (very frequent theme). The last item in the qualitative data, Q23, a chance for the participant to list what they felt the survey lacked in addressing issues about attending college for a child of a substance or alcohol
abuser, a frequent theme was about family dysfunction as a hindrance to attending college. Inter-rater reliability was established by a second party, the mentor of this research, checking over the qualitative data to establish themes and then comparing them to those established by the researcher. It should be noted that no calculations were performed to establish the level of inter-rater agreement since there were too few respondents.

**DISCUSSION**

This study observed many relationships between parental substance and alcohol abuse with adult-children’s academic achievement. It was hypothesized that participants attended college as a means to distance themselves from their parent’s lifestyle and that they were encouraged by a source other than their parents to do so. Hypotheses were supported in this study by themes in the qualitative data. A very frequent theme listed in participant responses was encouragement from a person other than their parents as a main influence in participant’s decision to attend college. A desire to distance themselves from their parent’s lifestyle was also a frequent theme listed as a main influence.

An interesting observation made while performing the research was that despite the participant’s academic achievement in attending college, the development of their own drug or alcohol addiction was not exclusive and separate from attendance. They had apparently learned this coping style from their parents. This was asserted frequently by participants. Participants also emphasized “lack of a role model” as a frequent theme in obstacles that have been overcome to attend college. This echoed the aspect of resilience theory that highlights the need for at least one caring adult in a child’s life to help develop resiliency. Females more than males rated their parents as being neglectful in the family as well as in aspects of their schooling like attending parent-teacher conferences and monitored academic progress. It is interesting to ask why this was observed in the data. Despite the fact that
society is changing to a more egalitarian approach to gender (Harris & Firestone, 1998), the finding may relate to the context of learned gender roles in a society where women are usually taught to be submissive, perhaps not asking for parental attention as much as a boy and therefore, being more neglected (Horwitz & White, 1987). Or, perhaps female children’s needs and expectations are higher for emotional support from their parents.

These results should be interpreted in the context of both the strengths and limitations of a descriptive, convenience sample of small size. Future research is imperative to gaining more information about the relationship of parental substance abuse and resiliency by way of college academic attendance and achievement. This study is valuable for its description of what children face when trying to break the cycle of substance and alcohol abuse by increasing their earning potential with a college degree. The results of this study begin to define a framework for future studies with larger samples that will more rigorously test predictions from positive psychology and resilience theory.

Table 1: Demographics of Study Participants
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total participants</th>
<th>N=18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Male N=9</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Female N=9</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ethnicity</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Caucasian N=15</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- African-American N=2</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Multi-racial N=1</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- M=31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- SD=7.0 yrs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic Year</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Freshmen/Sophomore N=2</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Junior/Senior N=13</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Graduate N=3</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic Major</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Humanities N=3</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Business N=1</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Physical Sciences N=1</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Social Sciences N=10</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Other N=3</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GPA</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- M=3.41</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- SD=0.43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Experiences with parenting changes before 18</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- No change N=8</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 1 change N=4</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 2 or more changes N=6</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Experiences with parental substance or alcohol abuse</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Acute exposure N=2</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Chronic exposure N=16</td>
<td>89%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Type</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Alcohol only N=8</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 1 substance only N=2</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 1 or more substance N=8</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Mean ratings for Items Q11-Q18
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item #</th>
<th>Mean rating</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family history of dysfunction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11a (N=13)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Physical abuse</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11b (N=14)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Emotional abuse</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11c (N=15)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Verbal abuse</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q12 (N=18)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Communication</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q13 (N=17)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Neglect</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q14 (N=18)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Financial problems</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Parental history of involvement in child’s education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item #</th>
<th>Mean rating</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q15 (N=18)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-helping w/ homework</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q16 (N=18)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Parent/teacher conferences</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q17 (N=18)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-extracurricular activities</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q18 (N=18)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-monitored academic progress</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Ratings are based on a 0-4 scale
*For items Q11a-Q11c and Q13-Q14, a rating of 0=good and a rating of 4=bad
*For items Q12 and Q15-Q18, a rating of 0=bad and a rating of 4=good

Table 3: Cross Tabulations of Average Ratings by Participant Groups
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item #</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Parent’s drug of choice</th>
<th>Changes in parenting before 18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M (N=9)</td>
<td>F (N=9)</td>
<td>Alcohol (N=8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11a</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11b</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11c</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q12</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q13</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q14</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q15</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q16</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q17</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q18</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Ratings are based on a 0-4 scale
*For items Q11a-Q11c and Q13-Q14, a rating of 0=good and a rating of 4=bad
*For items Q12 and Q15-Q18, a rating of 0=bad and a rating of 4=good
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item # w/ Themes</th>
<th>Occurrence</th>
<th>Quoted Example of Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Q19 (Parent’s reaction to grades)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Indifference</td>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>“They only showed a moderate concern at best. I cannot remember either parent being very attentive toward my grades.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Critical</td>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>“Though I regularly brought home A’s, he (father) said I could do better.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Anger</td>
<td>infrequent</td>
<td>“My mother and stepfather were very angry if I didn’t get good grades. Sometimes they would try to ground me.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Positive/Supportive</td>
<td>infrequent</td>
<td>“My father and mother always told me I was smart and verbally rewarded me when I received good grades.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Q20 (Obstacles that have been overcome to attend college)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Financial issues</td>
<td>very frequent</td>
<td>“Financial, my parents didn’t support my choice to attend college and therefore did not support me financially.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lack of role model/family support</td>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>“My parents not knowing what college was like, but saying that I had to go and my having to figure out everything on my own.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lack of self-esteem</td>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>“Most importantly, I had to prove to myself that I could succeed on my own in my college career.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Drug/alcohol addiction</td>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>“I had to overcome my own drug addiction and learn how to properly take care of myself emotionally, physically, spiritually.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Q21 (The main influence that convinced participant to attend college)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Encouragement from a person other than their parents</td>
<td>very frequent</td>
<td>“My sister... encouraged me to pursue a degree mainly for financial reasons.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Wanted to distance themselves from parent’s lifestyle</td>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>“I didn’t want to be like my parents, struggling to survive.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Q 22** (So far, how has college been overall)

- **Personally difficult** very frequent
  "It has been a major struggle to cope with anxiety related to school. I have panic attacks when I feel overwhelmed with academic responsibility."

- **Stimulating; excels academically**
  very frequent
  "It has been life-changing. Personally, my self-image was forced to change to match my academic success and respect that I am given at school."

**Q23** (any other issues relevant to attending college that weren't addressed in survey)

- **Dysfunction of family as hindrance** frequent
  "People who are from an alcoholic family usually have to overcome a huge obstacle called self-esteem or self-confidence. The sooner this is addressed, the sooner they will be able to achieve in any type of academic barrier."

*Occurrence rating is as follows:
- Very frequent: 8 or more responses to theme
- Frequent: 4 or more responses to theme
- Infrequent: less than 4 responses to theme*
REFERENCES


Black, C. (1981). It will never happen to me. Denver: MAC.


