
Xiuling Ma*
(School of Management, Lanzhou University, 730000, Lanzhou)

[Abstract] China is an emerging nation in promoting government performance evaluation, and thus various government performance evaluation systems are in the stage of constant adjustment and improvement. As government’s work reports have a high authority and continuity, they play a guiding role in the practical work of government performance evaluation for a long run, and they are a kind of rather modulated mode for China’s performance evaluation of government. Although interpretations to a single government work report are of a too considerable quantity to mention one by one, the studies of comparison and analysis from a more comprehensive nationwide view are relatively few. This paper collects and classifies the government work reports of the State Council and of 31 provincial government, municipalities and autonomous regions, which have been announced by Chinese government on the internet since 2006. Through a comprehensive comparison and analysis of the key indicators of government performance evaluation such as the GDP growth, fiscal revenue, unemployment rate, per-capita disposable income of urban and rural residents, energy consumption per 10,000 RMB GDP etc., the paper finds that the statistics and propaganda of GDP in China are not as scientific and reasonable as we have expected; slight changes were found in some provinces where “financial revenue” has been changed into “financial expenditure”; although the Rate of Town registered unemployment caused much dispute, but it did reflect the relative employment condition; the per-capita disposable income of urban residents and that of rural residents show big differences in the government work report, which indicates that the gap between urban and rural areas will exist for a long time and will continue to expand; because the statistics of GDP itself is not so scientifically designed, it also leads to some deviation in the calculation of energy consumption per 10,000 RMB GDP. Consequently, it is of high urgency and need to strengthen the scientific, standardized, institutionalized and legalization construction of the government performance evaluation in China, and to establish a performance evaluation system which corresponds to the actual condition not only of central government but for local governments as well. Meanwhile, it is also of importance to timely track and

* Xiuling Ma is an associate professor at School of Management, Lanzhou University, Lanzhou, Gansu, P.R.C, 730000. Her current research focuses on Performance Evaluation of Government, Civil service performance evaluation, civil service system. She earned her PhD degree from the Wuhan University in 2008.

summarize the theoretical and practical achievements in the field of domestic and overseas government performance evaluations so as to promote the development of practice by ways of theoretical innovation. The indicators proposed in this paper have their limitations, and thus other indicators, especially some unique indicators from local government work reports, will be the focus for further research.

[Key words]: Government Performance Evaluation, Government Work Report, State Council, Provincial Government

In *Deepening the Reform of Administrative Management System*, published by the Second Plenary Session of the 17th Central Committee of the C.P.C., it is definitely pointed out: “Implement the system of government performance management and administration accountability, establish scientific and rational index system of government performance evaluation and evaluation mechanism.” Our country is an emerging nation in promoting government performance evaluation, and various government performance evaluation systems are in the stage of constant adjustment and improvement. To a certain extent, the government work report can be regarded as a published government’s “self performance evaluation”, and thus it has a high authority and continuity, although it is a rather stereotyped arrangement for China’s government performance evaluation in an exploring stage. As interpretations to a single government work report are of a too considerable quantity to mention one by one, this paper collects and classifies the government work reports of the State Council and of 31 provincial governments, municipalities and autonomous regions, which have been announced by Chinese government on the internet. From these reports, we conduct a comprehensive comparison and analysis of the index systems for government performance evaluation, hoping that it will be beneficial to the performance evaluation of Chinese government.

**I. The analysis of the core indexes**

The government work reports of recent years generally consist of three parts: firstly it is the “work reviews of the past year”; secondly, it is the “work tasks of the present year”; and finally it is the “self-construction of the government”. Some provinces have more parts, but basically they all include the three parts mentioned above in regard to their substantial structure. In the second part, after explaining the basic ideas and main tasks by government, it will normally put forward a set of goals clearly, which is “the main expected goals for national economy and social development”. These goals are composed of indexes such as GDP growth, financial revenue growth and unemployment rate, etc., usually not exceeding 10 goals in all. These goals will undoubtedly be given primary importance and priorities among all the works of the government. From the point view of performance evaluation, they can be considered as the core index system for government performance. Among these indexes, the GDP, the financial revenue and the unemployment rate are the weighty core indexes. See Fig. 1.

**Fig. 1: The main expected goals of economy and social development of State**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appellation</th>
<th>Content (index system and expected data)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>State council / Local</td>
<td>GDP grows by about 8%, and further optimize the economy structure; More than 9 million urban employments will be created, the registered unemployment rate in cities and towns should be controlled within 4.6%; The income of urban and rural residents stably increase; CPI grows by about 4%; The condition of international payments continues to improve.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beijing</td>
<td>Strive to achieve a 9% growth in GDP; The registered unemployment rate in cities and towns should be controlled within 4.6%; The real income of urban and rural residents grows by more than 6%; CPI growth rate should be controlled within 3%; The financial revenue of local government grows more than 10%; Consumption per 10, 000 RMB of GDP and water consumption decrease by 4% and 5% respectively, the emissions of COD and SO2 decrease by 2% and 3% respectively; the proportion of secondary standard (air quality) days in urban areas reach to 71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shanxi</td>
<td>GDP grows by about 8%; Investment in fixed assets of the whole society increase by 24%; The total volume of retail sales for social consumables increase by 15%; CPI growth rate should be controlled within 4%; Total revenue in fiscal and the general budgetary revenue increase by 8% respectively; Disposable per-capita income of urban residents and the net per-capita income of rural residents increase by 9% respectively. These goals are the guidelines of the development, but they can also be adjusted according to the situation. The binding indexes are: the comprehensive consumption per 10, 000 RMB GDP decreases by 5.6%; the emissions of COD and SO2 decrease by 3.6% and 2.6% respectively; 400,000 new urban</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Guangdong | The main expected goal of the economy and social development of the whole province | GDP grows by about 8.5%；
GDP per-capita grows by 7.5%, and keep GDP per-capita in each city of Peal River Delta area grows hand in hand with the growth of GDP；
Energy consumption of per unit GNP decreases by 3.7%, the emissions of SO2 and COD decrease by 3.6% and 2.6% respectively；
Investment in fixed assets of the whole society increase by 16%；
Total volume of import and export increases to some extent；
The total volume of retail sales for social consumables increase by 14%；
CPI growth rate should be controlled within 4%；
The general budgetary revenue of local government increases by 6%；
The registered unemployment rate in cities and towns should be controlled within 4 %；
The natural growth rate of population should be controlled within 8.5%；
Disposable per-capita income of urban residents increases by 9%；
The per-capita net income of rural residents increases 7%。 |
| Sichuan | The main expected goal of the economy and social development | GDP of the whole province grows by 9%， and accomplish 72% of the main target tasks of post-disaster reconstruction。
The general budgetary revenue of local government increases by 10%；
More than 620,000 urban employments will be created, and the registered unemployment rate in cities and towns should be controlled within 4.5 %；
Disposable per-capita income of urban residents increases by 10%, and the per-capita net income of rural residents increases by 8% or more；
CPI growth rate should be controlled within 5%；
The natural growth rate of population should be controlled within 8.5%。 |

1. The index of GDP
At present, not a few disputes on the “all for GDP theory” exist in our country, but to
a nation where “development is the first priority” and where “problems will be solved in the process of development”, the situation of attaching great importance to GDP will continue for a long time. The GDP index has been represented by “the GDP growth” in this paper. Through the analysis of “the GDP growth” of the country and of each province, municipality and autonomous region in 2009, we found that: the target of the GDP growth rate proposed by our country is 8%. But in local governments, only that of Shanxi and of Guizhou provinces take the same rate as their target. The targets of other provinces, municipalities and autonomous regions are all higher than 8%. As is known to us, the provincial government work report is normally released in January or February each year, but the government work report of State Council is released in March. It seems conservative for the government work report of state council which is released afterward, and to some extent it also reflects the disunity between the central authority and local governments from a side view. (See Fig. 2)

**Fig. 2: The targets of “the GDP growth rate” of the country and of provinces, municipalities and autonomous regions in 2009**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The GDP growth rate</th>
<th>8%</th>
<th>9%</th>
<th>10%</th>
<th>11%</th>
<th>12%</th>
<th>13%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The country, or provinces, municipalities and autonomous regions</td>
<td>The country, Shanxi, Guizhou, Guangdong (8.5%)</td>
<td>Beijing, Hopei, Zhejiang, Yunnan, Hainan, Shanghai, Sichuan, Xinjiang, Qinghai</td>
<td>Henan, Shandong, Jiangsu, Hubei, Ningxia, Gansu, Anhui, Hunan, Fujian, Tibet</td>
<td>Heilongjiang, Liaoning, Jiangxi, Guangxi</td>
<td>Tianjin, Chongqing, Jilin</td>
<td>Shaanxi, Inner Mongolia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As the most important core index, some disputes on the statistics of GDP have arisen in recent years. For example, “In the first half year of 2009, the growth of GDP exceeds by 7.1% over the same period of the last year at the national level. But according to the data of different regions, only 5 provinces’ GDP growth rates were lower than the national rate, one was equal to it and one has not passed the final check. The data showed that 24 provinces’ growth rates were all higher than the national one. Among those provinces, 15 provinces’ rates exceeded the level of 10%. It was 10% higher than the national data after adding all the data from different regions”. [1] The target GDP growth rates of all provinces and cities showed by the government work report were equal to or greater than 8% (the national rate) in 2006. The actual growth rates of GDP of local government were all beyond 10.7% (the actual GDP growth rate of the nation). The lowest rate was 11.4%, Gansu, and the highest rate was 26.5%, Inner Mongolia; In 2007, the national target was still 8%, but the GDP growth rate of
each local government was all above 9%. Actually, the national GDP growth rate was 11.4%, and in the local regions, the lowest and the highest were respectively 11.7%, Guizhou, and 20%, Inner Mongolia; In 2008, the national target was 8%, and the minimum local target was 9%. However, in fact, the national GDP growth rate was 9%, and for each province, the lowest and the highest were respectively 9%, Beijing and 17.5%, Inner Mongolia. For this, the principal of the National Bureau of Statistics explained that: “GDP has been attached too much attention and it cannot afford the heavy burden any more. Many reasons can be quoted to explain why there were differences between the GDP calculated by the National Bureau of Statistics and the GDP summarized by each local government such as institutional reasons, technical reasons, duplicate and systematic reasons.”

In the standpoint of the provincial government work report, at the beginning of this year, most anticipative targets of local regions all surpassed the national target. It was inevitable that there would be differences existing between the GDP calculated by the nation and the GDP summarized by local governments as long as the work was finished according to the criteria. The national GDP growth rate could not reflect the average level of the whole nation, but in the local propaganda, we usually could see reports like “the local growth rate exceeds the national average level”. For example, the recent report of Beijing Daily said that: “According to the first three quarters’ economy operation of Beijing, released by Municipal Bureau of Statistics and National Bureau of Statistics Survey Office in Beijing, obviously, the increasing speed (9.5%) was higher than the national level (7.7%).” It was unscientific to say that “the local GDP growth rates exceed the national level” which is reflected from the government work report by the fact that the local GDP growth rates inevitably exceed the national level. However, the local governments still preferred such statement as “the local GDP growth rates surpass the national level”. Under the condition that provincial GDP could not be uniformly calculated by our nation, the approach of comparing the national GDP growth rate to the local GDP growth rate is worth discussing.

2. The index of financial revenue

Financial revenue is the second important target showed by the government work report. And on the expression of this target, different concepts has been adopted by each provincial government, see Fig. 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Financial revenue</th>
<th>Financial revenue of local area</th>
<th>General budgetary revenue of local area</th>
<th>Financial expenditure of local area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provinces, municipalities and autonomous regions</td>
<td>Tianjin, Hopei, Shanxi, Anhui, Jiangxi</td>
<td>Beijing, Inner Mongolia, Jilin, Shanghai</td>
<td>Liaoning, Shanxi, Heilongjiang, Jiangsu, Henan</td>
<td>Yunnan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It can be observed from the fig.3 that there is no direct connection between the selection of different concepts and the economy development level. After studying the former government work reports, we can find that each province continues to keep adopting different concepts of the financial revenue. It is worthwhile to note that Yunnan province did not propose a financial revenue target in its government work report in 2009, but it used the description of “financial expenditure increases by 10%” as a substitution. It would be a tactful statement to propose such a target when the province was under the pressure of the increasing financial revenue. The practical situation of Yunnan province in 2009 was that “with the steady recovery of economy, it realized that the tax revenue was increasing month by month. The decline in local accumulated financial revenue of our province (Yunnan province) was being reduced month by month. It would realize a first positive growth in June which would reverse the situation of sustained negative growth since this year. According to the statistics, the local financial revenue of our province was 33.22 billion RMB in the first half of the year, increasing by 3.2% as compared with the same period of last year, completing 50.1% of the early budget of this year.” [4] But the condition of financial expenditure of the province was that: "the financial expenditure was 69.12 billion RMB in the first half of the year, increasing 35.5% as compared with the same period of last year, completing 42.7% of the early budget of the year. The expenditure schedule increased 3.6% as compared with the same period of last year.” [5] It can be known by analyzing these figures that though the local finance was in a very difficult situation, its financial expenditure growth was further beyond the target “10%”. The target of the financial expenditure growth was thus attainable. But taking an achievable index as target may demonstrate a “helpless behavior” of the local government in the financial crisis background.

3. The index of unemployment rate

Disputes also exist in the using of the registered unemployment rate in cities and towns throughout the country. There is an appeal--using “investigated unemployment rate” to replace “registered unemployment rate in cities and towns” in academic circles. But from the standpoint of the local ranking of the registered unemployment rate in cities and towns, it basically reflected the employment condition of each province. From the registered unemployment rate in cities and towns, forecasted by the local government work reports from 2006 to 2009, we know that the targets of the
Middle-west and the Northeast regions were higher than the national one, see Fig.4:

**Fig. 4: The predicted areas where the registered unemployment rate in cities and towns would be higher than national target from 2006 to 2009**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Areas</th>
<th>Nations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Jilin (5%) Sichuan (5%) Shaanxi (5%) Heilongjiang (5%) Liaoning (5%)</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Sichuan (5%) Liaoning (5%)</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Sichuan (5%) Shaanxi (4.6%) Heilongjiang (4.6%)</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Hunan (4.8%)</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The unemployment indexes exceeded the national targets reflecting the employment difficulties in the Mid-west regions, especially in the West and Northeast regions. Thus, the indexes forecasted by the government work report were thus higher, and it also required that the local practical condition must be considered in making evaluation standard for the performance evaluation in the future. One of the problems of the current government performance evaluation system was the “the subject of the assessment was single”. However, various difficulties should be considered according to special conditions of local regions in making standards. “The subject of the assessment was single” probably should not be regarded as a grave fault in the government performance evaluation here, and the outside blame to the government also seemed to be a little bit impractical.

II. The analysis of other indexes

1. The growth of the disposable per-capita income of urban residents and that of rural residents

The income gap between urban and rural residents in China is expanding in recent years. In 2008, the ratio of the income gap expanded from 3.33:1 to 3.36:1 as compared with last year, and the absolute disparity exceeded 10,000 RMB for the first time. In fact, the disparity has been reflected in the government work reports. The provincial government work reports from 2006 to 2009 have pointed out that, according to the forecast, the growth data of the disposable per-capita income of most of urban residents was greater than or equal to that of rural residents, and that only a few formers’ growth data were lower than the latter, which was only restricted to a province or for a single year, and thus was negligible. But if urban growth data differs one point or a few points to that of rural resident annually, the long-term accumulative “compounding effect” would make the income gap between the urban and rural residents further expand inevitably. This objective expanding of the gap also made the setting of the two indexes’ existence a kind of “helplessness”. The nation always hopes that the disparity between cities and towns will stop expanding, but there are systematic contradictions existing in narrowing the gap. Although the per-capita net income of rural residents grows every year, the gap between cities and towns is still
expanding. The effect of narrowing the gap by the local government is limited. Using “gap rate” rather than respective growth rate to evaluate is only a suggestion, which is very difficult to carry out.

2. Consumption per 10,000 yuan of GDP

“11th Five-Year” Plan of Chinese government requested that the consumption per 10,000 RMB of GDP decrease by 20% in the end of the term, namely a decrease by 4.4% every year. In recent years’ government work report of state council, the standard was about 4% in 2006. But in the 3 years after 2007, we didn’t observe the new concrete request of this index. Obviously, it was a choice under the situation where the actual result of energy conservation was far from perfect. However, in the report of energy consumption of per unit GDP announced by the national and local government every year, the local energy consumption of per unit GDP was generally lower than the national corresponding figures: the decline of the nation was 1.33% in 2006, and local areas which were below this figure were only Hainan (1.17%), Ningxia (1.01%) and Xinjiang (1.06%); And the decline of the nation was 3.27% in 2007, and local areas which were below this figure were only Guangdong (3.15%), Hainan (0.8%), Qinghai (2.2%) and Xinjiang (3.08%). This may be caused by the disunity of the GDP statistical standards which was mentioned above. In the statistics of 2008, this deviation has been corrected, and the number of provinces with lower than the national level has increased.

Because of the tremendous stress of reducing energy consumption, in the government work report of the state council, the settings of annual indexes even did not appear. But the “institutional” disunity of GDP statistics also caused that the energy consumption index of GDP statistics was faced with a certain deviation and discomfiture.

III. Summary

The existing researches on the indexes of government performance evaluation generally emphasize on the study of the system and the whole, adopting a series of mathematical methods and management methods to design questionnaires and to construct the index system. For example, (Xing Ni, Qin Yu, 2009) they comprehensively employed BSC, KPI and rhombohedrons columnar model of performance, and got an integrated model through analyzing the characteristics of multiple designing model index, and then refined an index system template of local government performance evaluation which combined value orientation and index system closely; (Mingke Shen, 2009) according to the target module and its practice of our service-oriented government, he proposed the basic frame and methods of constructing the service-oriented government performance evaluation system, (Hongbo Hou; Yajun Guo 2009) he analyzed the main theoretical basis of performance evaluation of the two public managements (Target Management and New Public Management), and designed a series of basic links of the government performance evaluation system of public management: the analysis of evaluation system, target location, the construction of index system, evaluation of scores. It was
scientific and rigorous of the design of these index systems. But it still could not be promoted throughout the country in the practical work nowadays. In the actual performance evaluation, the traditional core indexes like GDP, financial revenue, etc. still play a decisive role. The Whole Performance Evaluation Of The Local Government Of Guangdong which was released to public by the research team of Public Management faculty of South China University of Technology showed that for the whole performance, the better the economy is, the higher the performance will be, still.

The reason why this article studied government performance evaluation work through government work reports of the state council and the local government is that the core indexes of government work reports are universal. Although disputes still exist, there is no denying that the important indexes mentioned by the government work reports will lead the actual work of performance evaluation for a long time. The indexes analyzed in this article are somewhat unscientific for the statistics and propaganda of GDP; under the financial pressure, the “financial revenue” index has been changed to “financial expenditure”. Obviously, we should pay attention to these subtle dynamic changes in our relevant researches in the future; Although there are lots of disputes in using the index of registered urban unemployment rate, it did reflect the fundamental state of employment, and the targets established by the government are also relatively “practical and realistic” figures; The growth of disposable per-capita income of urban residents and that of rural residents have showed “congenital” disparity in the government work reports, and the difficulty of narrowing the gap between the urban and rural areas also indicates that this gap will exist for a long time and will continue to expand; To some extent, because of the statistics of GDP itself is not scientific, it also reflects in the consumption per 10, 000 RMB of GDP in several years and months.

The indexes studied in this paper are still limited, and they are mainly some universal indexes. Other indexes especially some local specialized indexes from government work reports will be the direction for further research.

[1] The half-year total of regional GDP surpass the national data by 14000 billion RMB, New Beijing Daily (Xin jian bao), [N], 12 August 2008.
[3] For the first three quarters, Beijing’s GDP has increased by 9.5%. Beijing Daily [N], 23 October 2009.
[5] Ibid.
[6] The urban-rural income gap has surpassed 10 000 RMB for the first time, the central committee of CPC plans to increase cereal’s price. Global News [N], 16 January 2009.