

City of Halsey Compensation Comparison Study

Submitted by:

Center for Public Service
Mark O. Hatfield School of Government
Portland State University

March 2022

Report Contact Information:

Eileen Casey White, Ed.D.
Senior Fellow, Center for Public Service
Hatfield School of Government
Portland State University
Phone: 503-559-8946
Email: weileen@pdx.edu

Sara Saltzberg
Director, Center for Public Service
Hatfield School of Government
Portland State University
Phone: 503-725-5153
Email: ssaltz@pdx.edu

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements 3

Background 4

Methodology 5

Summary Results 6

Adjusted Compensation 6

Paid Time Off..... 7

Health Insurance 8

Additional Compensation..... 8

Limited Job Matching Discussion 9

Assistant City Recorder9

City Administrator/ Recorder.....11

Lead Utility Worker/Plant Operator12

Librarian14

Part Time Municipal Clerk15

Utility Worker I17

Appendix 19

Detailed Adjusted Compensation Results A1

Acknowledgements

The CPS Team is very grateful to the City of Halsey Team:

- Hilary Norton, City Administrator

The City of Halsey and Portland State University's Center for Public Service would like to thank the staff members of participating jurisdictions who provided information and insights to ensure we had accurate information:

Jurisdictions	Main Information Contacts
Adair Village	Karla McGrath
Brownsville	S. Scott McDowell
Coburg	Anne Heath
Garibaldi	Lori Rieger and Juliet Hyams
Lyons	Micki Valentine
Oakland	Carolyn Shields
Scio	Ginger Allen
Yamhill	Kimberly Steele

The CPS Team included:

- Sara Saltzberg – Project Sponsor, Director, Center for Public Service
- Eileen Casey White, Ed.D. – Senior Fellow
- Bob Winthrop, MPA – Senior Fellow
- Sara Spiers, MPA – Research Assistant
- Zoie Brauser – Graduate Research Assistant
- Erica Fulton – Operations Manager

Background

In September 2021, the City of Halsey engaged Portland State University’s Center for Public Service (CPS) to conduct a comprehensive compensation study for the City of Halsey. CPS analyzed 6 job titles in 9 Oregon cities, including Halsey, and determined the compensation costs to include:

- Salary at the minimum, median, and maximum levels
- Employer payment for the employee’s contribution share of Public Employees Retirement System (PERS)
- Minimum and maximum employee health insurance contributions
- Paid time off (Vacation, holiday)
- Other non-discretionary compensation

Additional data were collected to ensure comparability among job titles, including:

- Minimum experience required
- Minimum education required
- Major job duties
- Organization charts

The jurisdictions included the following (population, miles from Halsey to the other jurisdictions, and number of job titles that were a potential match):

Table 1: Population and Location				
Jurisdiction	Population*	Miles from Halsey**	County	Jobs Matched
Halsey	945	n/a	Linn	n/a
Adair Village	1,325	27	Benton	5
Brownsville	1,730	7	Linn	6
Coburg	1,375	21	Lane	4
Garibaldi	830	119	Tillamook	3
Lyons	1,200	49	Linn	4
Oakland	965	80	Douglas	3
Scio	940	35	Linn	5
Yamhill	1,110	83	Yamhill	3

*PSU Population Research Center (Certified Estimates 2020)

**Car traveling miles from downtown Halsey

Methodology

In order to collect comparable compensation data (e.g., Salary Schedules, Job Descriptions, Collective Bargaining Agreements), the CPS team worked with City of Halsey representatives to identify jurisdictions that were comparable in size, geographic location, and/or held a common workforce pool as comparators. We contacted each jurisdiction through email, offering to share the final report to help incentivize participation. All representatives provided an initial response to the request for 11 data points, including:

1. Salary schedules as of July 1, 2021
2. Current job descriptions for each position (used to help match jobs and identify the minimum number of years of experience and education, and job duties)
3. Personnel policies that impact employee benefits
4. Collective bargaining agreements related to the positions
5. PERS "pick-up" contribution amount, i.e., does the employer pay the 6% employee contribution amount
6. Any other non-discretionary (i.e., no match required) employer contributions towards retirement or deferred compensation costs
7. Health insurance employee premium contributions (highest and lowest premium contribution per employee group). An employee group includes all employees who receive the same time off, retirement, and health insurance fringe benefits.
8. Paid time off (Vacation) accrual amounts at 5, 10, 15, and 20 years
9. Holiday hours per employee group
10. Total number of hours counted in a year for a position. In most cases, that is 2080 (40 hours per week x 52 weeks).
11. Any other premium pay, certification pay, or longevity pay not counted above that is provided to the targeted employee groups. This does not include pay for additional work such as shift differential and overtime.

After summarizing the responses in validation spreadsheets, we sent the data back out to the jurisdiction contacts for verification. Contacts provided additional details to ensure the most accurate data for each job title. In total, the CPS team engaged in 3 to 5 interactions per jurisdiction to gather and validate data. The job matching analysis is in the section below titled "Limited Job Matching Discussion."

The research team captured the information for analysis. Results of the job matching are listed in Table 2. Following the table are discussion summary results of adjusted compensation, Paid Time Off, health insurance, and PERS.

Table 2: Jobs Matched									
Standard Job Title	Adair Village	Brownsville	Coburg	Garibaldi	Lyons	Oakland	Scio	Yamhill	Job Titles Matched
Assistant City Recorder	1	1	1	1	1*	1	0	0	6*
City Administrator/Recorder	1	1	1	1	1	0	1	0	6
Lead Utility Worker/Plant Operator	1	1	1	0	0	0	1	1	5
Librarian (Part-time)	0	1	0	0	1	1	1	0	4
Municipal Clerk (Part-time)	1	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	3
Utility Worker I	1	1	1	1	0	1	1	1	7
	5	6	4	3	3	3	5	2	31

* The City Clerk in Lyons is a part-time position with no benefits. The duties matched but because of the compensation structure it was not included in the adjusted compensation tables in the appendix.

Summary Results: Adjusted compensation

Adjusted compensation includes two parts. The first part is base salary. The second part is the addition of the value of paid time off (PTO) and if available, the employer contribution for the employee share of pension, and the subtraction of the value of the employee contribution for health insurance. For this study, the CPS team used the minimum employee contribution value for an employee-only plan.

There were 6 job titles originally evaluated. Given the part-time structure of 2 job positions (Librarian and Municipal Clerk) these were not comparable with other jurisdictions. Table 3 summarizes the remaining 4 job titles. Halsey was lower (-15.7% to -2.7%) for 2 positions and higher (18.2% to 9.9%) for 2 positions for overall adjusted compensation at the median tenure level.

The CPS team included a discussion of matching factors for all 6 job titles in the section *Limited Job Description Discussion*. Table 3 summarizes the job titles listing the difference between the City of Halsey Job Title value of the median adjusted compensation and the average of the comparables.

Table 3: Summary Results	
Job Titles	% Difference from Average of Median of Comparable Jurisdictions
Assistant City Recorder	18.2%
City Administrator/Recorder	-15.7%
Lead Utility Worker/Plant Operator	-2.7%
Utility Worker I	9.9%

Summary Results: Paid Time Off (PTO)

With regard to paid time off (PTO), Halsey full-time employees receive 88 hours of holiday pay (prorated for part-time positions). The range for comparable jurisdictions is between 48 (Lyons) and 104 (Garibaldi) hours for holiday pay. Similar to Halsey, Adair Village and Scio employees get 88 hours of holiday vacation. Coburg and Oakland receive 80 hours. Brownsville’s positions receive 92 hours of holiday pay and Yamhill receives the second highest holiday pay at 96 hours.

Halsey’s vacation pay starts at 120 hours at 5 years (the comparison years of service for the minimum compensation level); 160 hours at 10 years; 200 hours at 15 years and 20 years. Three other jurisdictions (Adair Village, Brownsville, Yamhill) also start with 120 hours of vacation at 5 years. Garibaldi, Lyons, Oakland, and Scio start with the lowest vacation pay at 80 hours at 5 years. Yamhill matches Halsey as the highest vacation hours at 20 years with 200 hours of vacation pay. Most jurisdictions (Brownsville, Coburg, Garibaldi, Lyons, Oakland, Scio) have 160 hours of vacation at 20 years.

Table 4: PTO by Jurisdiction						
Jurisdiction	Employee Group*	Holiday hours	Vacation: 5 years	Vacation: 10 years	Vacation: 15 years	Vacation: 20 years
Halsey	Non-represented	88	120	160	200	200
	Non-represented (part-time)	44	40	60	60	60
Adair Village	Non-represented	88	120	144	168	192
Brownsville	Non-represented	92	120	160	160	160
Coburg	Non-represented	80	96	136	152	160
Garibaldi	AFSCME	104	80	120	160	160
	Non-represented					
Lyons	Non-represented	48	80	160	160	160
	Non-represented (Librarian)	30	46	92	92	92
	Non-represented (City Clerk)	0	0	0	0	0
Oakland	Non-represented	80	80	120	120	160
Scio	Non-represented	88	80	120	120	160
Yamhill	Non-represented	96	120	180	200	200

Summary Results: Health Insurance

All employee health insurance premium data used the employee-only plan (where available) as the point of comparison. The health insurance premium cost includes dental insurance and vision coverage. Halsey employees contribute to their health insurance. Adair Village, Garibaldi, Oakland, and Yamhill employees do not contribute their health insurance. Lyons non-represented employees' monthly premium health insurance contribution is \$74 and Brownsville employees contribute \$78, making it the jurisdiction with the highest employees' monthly contribution.

Table 5: Health Insurance*			
Jurisdiction	Employee Group	Maximum Family Insurance Cost (\$/mth)	Minimum Family Insurance Cost (\$/mth)
Halsey	Non-represented	20	20
Adair Village	Non-represented	0	0
Brownsville	Non-represented	78	78
Coburg	Non-represented	38	38
Garibaldi	AFSCME	0	0
Lyons	Non-represented	74	74
	Non-represented (Librarian)	74	74
	Non-represented (City Clerk)	n/a	n/a
Oakland	Non-represented	0	0
Scio	Non-represented	31	31
Yamhill	Non-represented	0	0

* Compensation studies following PECBA (Public Employees Collective Bargaining Agreement) guidelines require the use of employee + family healthcare plan costs in calculations. For the purposes of this study, employee-only costs were used due to varying coverage among jurisdictions. Currently, Oakland does not have any employees enrolled in the Family Employee Health Insurance plan, which would cost \$1,500 per month.

Summary Results: Additional Compensation

The CPS research team asked jurisdictions to respond (Yes/No) regarding whether the employer pays the 6% PERS pickup amount. Halsey and most comparable jurisdictions (Adair Village, Coburg, Garibaldi, Lyons, Oakland, Yamhill) pay the 6% PERS pickup. Brownsville is the only comparable that does not pay the 6% into the PERS system; instead they offer a 401 and a 457 plan. The 457 plan is for employees to fund only.

Limited Job Matching Discussion

1. Assistant City Recorder

The Assistant City Recorder for Halsey is a non-exempt, non-supervisory position. The City does not specify a minimum number of years' experience, but does require previous accounting, cash handling, and customer service experience. Applicants are required to have a high school diploma or GED certificate. Below is a short summary of duties from the job description:

“Performs highly responsible office work in support of City Administrator/City Recorder, requiring a high level of confidentiality. Proficient in clerical and administrative support services, and accounting and finance duties.”

The essential duties are broken down into four primary elements:

- 35% of the incumbent's time is dedicated to performing cash receipt functions, processing building permits, and assisting with planning;
- 35% of the time involves tasks with utility billing and setting up or closing utility accounts.
- 15% is dedicated to maintaining relationships with elected officials, citizens, the press, and employees as well as to answer the phone and provide customer service
- 15% is assigned to research, preparing grant applications, and providing information.

Among the eight comparable jurisdictions, six (Adair Village, Brownsville, Coburg, Garibaldi, Lyons, Oakland) matched the position. Because the tasks assigned to Halsey's Assistant City Recorder encompass a wide range of responsibilities, the comparator positions may not be complete matches. Each jurisdiction uses a different position/title to capture the task responsibilities. Adair Village assigns the tasks to the Financial Clerk; in Brownsville the Administrative Assistance: Finance is responsible for these duties. Coburg has a Utility Billing position, and Garibaldi assigns them to the Administrative Assistant II. Lyons has a City Clerks do the bulk of these tasks while Oakland has a Utility Billing Clerk. We compared the positions based on experience, education, FLSA exemption, supervision status, and other pertinent factors. The findings are described below.

- **Experience:** Halsey does not outline years of experience for the Assistant City Recorder, instead describing required experience in clerical skills and knowledge of accounting and grant writing. Similar to Halsey, Garibaldi does not state minimum experience requirements for their Administrative Assistant I position. The job description states a preference for 3 years of administrative or clerical work. Adair Village's Financial Clerk requires 3 years' experience in financial administration and experience in accrual, budget, audit and municipal experience along with 2 years of working with QuickBooks. Brownsville requires 3-5 years of professional municipal experience or a two-year college degree for the Administrative Assistant in Finance. Coburg requires applicants for the Utility Billing position to have 4 years of experience in clerical and stenographic work. Lyons and Yamhill require 2 years of experience for their City Clerk at 2 years. Lyons specifies 2 years in an administrative position. Oakland has the fewest years of

required experience with one year of work in general office practices in a public sector environment.

- **Education:** Due to the wide range of positions being used as comparators for the Assistant City Recorder, educational requirements will also vary. Halsey requires a high school diploma or GED certificate for this position. Similar to Halsey, Coburg, Garibaldi, Lyons and Oakland require a high school diploma or GED. Lyons requires additional education or training beyond a high school diploma, but does not specify the type of education or training. Adair Village and Brownsville require either education or experience. Adair Village requires a high school diploma and an associate's degree; however, experience may be used to substitute for education. Brownsville requires a two-year college degree or 3-5 years of municipal experience. Yamhill does not describe education requirements for their City Clerk. Coburg (Utility Billing) prefers a 2-year college degree, and Garibaldi prefers a college degree for the Administrative Assistant I.
- **FLSA Exemption:** All positions are non-exempt.
- **Supervision:** Halsey, Adair Village, Brownsville, and Coburg do not specify supervisory duties. In Garibaldi and Yamhill, the position does not have any supervisory responsibilities. In Lyons, the City Clerk position may exercise general supervision of city employees if the City Manager is absent.
- **Additional Notes:** The position in Halsey has a range of duties with time dedicated to four essential duties. The two major duties are both allotted 35% of the position's time include 1) performing cash receipting functions and processing building permits and 2) processing utility billing including opening and closing accounts. In combining duties, Garibaldi has created a similar position in Administrative Assistant II, which may also be assigned a limited number of duties that in other jurisdictions may be done by assistant recorder, planning commission clerk, payroll clerk, utility billing clerk, accounts receivable clerk, and or accounts payable clerk. The comparable jurisdictions match based on accounting duties and utility billing. The position in Lyons is the only comparable with supervisory duties. The position in Yamhill works across departments including Public Works, Municipal Court, and the Planning department. Garibaldi has the highest median adjusted compensation at \$5,189; Halsey has the second highest median adjusted compensation at \$4,564 and lowest median adjusted compensation is Oakland (\$2,842). Halsey's median adjusted compensation is 18.2% higher than the average of other jurisdictions.

Conclusion: Smaller jurisdictions often have to merge positions while others make certain positions part-time. The City Clerk in Lyons is a part-time position with no benefits. The duties matched with the Halsey position, but because of the compensation structure it was not included in the adjusted compensation tables in the appendix. With differences in types of additional responsibilities, experience, and education requirements, these matches give an approximate comparison to the Assistant City Recorder. However, the unique combination of essential functions and skill requirements make it difficult to provide clear matches with any similar-sized jurisdiction.

2. City Administrator/Recorder

The Halsey City Administrator/Recorder is an exempt position that directly supervises the Municipal Clerk, Assistant City Recorder, Librarian, and Lead Utilities Operator. The jurisdiction requires 3-5 years of personnel management experience and a bachelor's degree; 3-5 years of professional experience may substitute for education. Below is a short summary of duties from the job description:

“The City Administrator/Recorder (Administrator) plans, organizes, and directs the operations and activities of the City... ensures effective use of financial and human resources in the provision of City services to the public, advises and assists the City Council...”

Of the comparable jurisdictions, six (Adair Village, Brownsville, Coburg, Garibaldi, Lyons, Scio) matched the position. Similar to Halsey, Adair Village, Brownsville, and Coburg call the position City Administrator. The other three jurisdictions (Garibaldi, Lyons, Scio) call the position City Manager. Oakland and Yamhill do not have a City Administrative position; instead, they have Mayors and a separate City Recorder, so those positions were not included in the study. We compared the positions based on experience, education, FLSA exemption, supervision status, and other pertinent factors. The findings are described below:

- **Experience:** Halsey requires 3 years of personnel management experience along with leadership experience for their City Administrator. Similar to Halsey, Brownsville requires either education or experience, with 3-5 years of professional, municipal experience or a bachelor's degree. There is no mention of experience outside this substitution. Adair Village and Scio require 5 years of municipal supervisory experience. Garibaldi requires 4 years' experience in municipal budgeting and finance, labor relations and writing for their City Manager. Lyons requires 3-4 years of accounting experience or an accounting degree. Coburg does not describe any required experience in the employment agreement documents provided to CPS for this study.
- **Education:** Halsey and 5 other jurisdictions (Adair Village, Brownsville, Garibaldi, Lyons, Scio) require a bachelor's degree in public or business administration or related field. Halsey and Brownsville allows 3-5 years' experience to substitute for education. Lyons requires an accounting degree or 3-4 years of accounting experience. Coburg does not outline educational requirements in the employment agreement. Halsey as well as Adair Village and Scio prefer a master's degree.
- **FLSA Exemption:** Halsey's City Administrator and all other matched positions are exempt.
- **Supervision:** All positions have similar supervisory duties. Halsey's position has supervisory duties over all city employees, though some of the supervision may be delegated to other supervisory positions. Similar to Halsey, the positions in Brownsville, Coburg, Lyons, Garibaldi, and Scio are responsible for the direct supervision of all employees and may delegate some supervisory duties. The exceptions are in Coburg and Garibaldi. In Coburg the position does not appoint or remove the Municipal Judge, City Recorder, and Treasurer while in Garibaldi the

position does not supervise the City Attorney and Municipal Judge. The position in Adair Village directly supervises other supervisors, the Finance Officer, and Administrative Staff.

- **Additional Notes:** Given some of the jurisdictions are smaller in nature, the City Administrator position was often merged with other duties and responsibilities. In Halsey, the position has recorder, human resources, finance, community and economic development, elections, and purchasing agent responsibilities. Brownsville's position has similar additional varied duties including Recorder and Finance Director. The City Manager in Garibaldi also serves as the Recorder, Treasurer, Budget Officer, and Planning Secretary. Coburg negotiates the salary and is not generally on any public salary scale; CPS therefore records their minimum, median, and maximum base salaries at the same rate in the table. Adair Village has the highest median adjusted compensation at \$11,031, and Lyons is the lowest at \$4,161. Halsey is the second-lowest at \$6,708. Halsey's median adjusted compensation is 15.7% lower than the average of other jurisdictions.

Conclusion: The main differences across City Administrators are the additional tasks that are combined into the job description. Most jurisdictions, being smaller in size, add on additional responsibilities. There was some variation in additional tasks. However, based on primary duties, education, and experience requirements, all matches are comparable.

3. Lead Utility Worker/Plant Operator

The Lead Utility Worker/Plant Operator is a non-exempt, supervisory position. Experience and education requirements for the position are not listed in the job description. Certification requirements for this position include Wastewater Collection I, Wastewater Treatment I, Water Distribution I, and Cross Connection Testing or Inspection certifications. The following is a short summary of duties from the job description:

"Directs and performs a variety of routine, and complex operations, activities, and tasks to maintain city infrastructure and city-owned property, including buildings, streets, rights of way, water/wastewater facilities, storm water facilities, and parks."

Of the 8 comparable jurisdiction, 5 jurisdictions (Adair Village, Brownsville, Coburg, Scio, Yamhill) have positions that match the job description. Adair Village titles the position "Public Works Supervisor." Brownsville calls the position "Public Works Superintendent." Coburg assigns the supervisory duties to "Public Works Operator III." Scio assigns duties to the "Public Works Operations Director," and in Yamhill the comparable duties are assigned to the "Facilities Manager." We compared the positions based on experience, education, FLSA exemption, supervision status, and other pertinent factors. The findings are described below.

- **Experience:** Halsey does not list experience requirements in the job description. Adair Village requires at least one year in a supervisory position. Brownsville requires 3 years of supervisory responsibilities and 3-5 years of experience in municipal public works; however, education can

substitute for the 3-5 years of public works experience. Coburg does not state the number of years' experience required but does state 3 years of public works experience desired. Lyons also does not describe experience for the position. Scio requires 3 years of experience as a Public Works Operations Director or 5 years as an Assistant Public Works Operations Director. Managerial experience is also required. Yamhill requires 2 years, including experience in management and supervisor contracting. Coburg has the fewest years of required experience at one year in Public Works.

- **Education:** Halsey does not discuss educational requirements in the job description. Adair Village requires a high school diploma as well as two years of technical training. Brownsville requires a college degree or 3-5 years of experience in public works. Yamhill requires a high school diploma or GED. Scio requires an associate degree in Water and Wastewater Technology. Lyons and Coburg do not describe educational requirements for the position.

Halsey requires the following certification for the position:

- Wastewater Collection I
- Wastewater Treatment I
- Water Distribution I
- Cross Connection Testing or Inspection

Other jurisdictions also have certification requirements. Their requirements include:

- Water Treatment I (Brownsville, Scio)
 - Water Treatment II (Adair Village)
 - Water Distribution I (Adair Village, Coburg, Scio)
 - Water Distribution II (Brownsville)
 - Wastewater Collections I (Brownsville, Scio)
 - Wastewater Collections II (Coburg)
 - Wastewater Treatment I (Adair Village, Brownsville, Scio)
 - Wastewater Treatment II (Adair Village, Coburg)
 - Cross Connection Inspector (Brownsville)
 - Public Applicators License (Brownsville)
 - Flagging (Yamhill)
- **FLSA Exemption:** Halsey's position is a non-exempt position. Most other positions are also non-exempt. Brownsville is an exempt position.
 - **Supervision:** Halsey's position trains employees, assigns work, and assists with performance management and evaluations. The position in Adair Village directs and instructs Utility Workers and is responsible for scheduling, mentoring, coaching, and training. Brownsville's position schedules, directs, and coordinates staff. Lyons supervises subcontractors, contracted street workers, and inmate work crews. Coburg's Public Works Operator III may have direct supervisory responsibilities if required. Scio's position has direct supervision over one employee.

- **Additional Notes:** Different jurisdictions require different certifications and have a varying experience and education qualifications. These differences contribute to differences in pay. Brownsville has the highest median adjusted compensation at \$6,173; Halsey is the second lowest at \$5,367; and Scio is the lowest at \$4,897. Halsey’s median adjusted compensation is 2.7% lower than the average of other jurisdictions.

Conclusion: All matches are suitable.

4. Librarian

The Librarian in Halsey is a part-time, non-exempt position with supervision responsibility for volunteers. It requires 2 years of supervisory experience and either a Master’s of Library Science or 4 years of professional experience that included a direct working relationship with a library board. The following is a short summary of duties from the job description:

“Plan, direct, and oversee the delivery of library services within the City. Supervise library volunteers in the performance of their duties. Attend related meetings and training. Communicate with public in matters pertaining to library functions. Assure Library functions smoothly on a day-to-day basis.”

Halsey is unique among smaller jurisdictions in that they pay prorated benefits to all part-time positions (i.e., Librarian, Municipal Clerk). Other comparator jurisdictions that have part-time positions do not pay benefits. The summary of benefits for each jurisdiction and position is provided in the Appendix.

Four comparable jurisdictions (Brownsville, Lyons, Oakland, Scio) have positions that match the job description, but the benefits vary. Similar to Halsey, Brownsville and Lyons call this position “Librarian;” and in Oakland the potential matched position is titled “Library Clerk.” Scio calls the position “Library Services Manager.” The Halsey Librarian is a part-time position with benefits. Oakland has a Librarian position but it is part-time with no benefits. We compared the positions based on experience, education, FLSA exemption, supervision status, and other pertinent factors. The findings are described below.

- **Experience:** In Halsey, experience is substituted for education. The position requires four years of professional experience, including working with a library board or a Master’s of Library Science degree. In addition, the position requires 2 years of supervisory experience. Similar to Halsey, the position in Brownsville may substitute experience for education; the position requires either 3-5 years of library experience or a 4-year college degree. Lyons and Oakland do not describe specific years of experience; instead each jurisdiction describes needed skills and experience. In Lyons, knowledge of library collection classification and the equipment and facilities needed within a library system are required. In Oakland the position requires experience in grant writing and maintaining relationships with a library board and citizens. Scio does not describe years of experience.

- **Education:** Halsey requires a Master’s of Library Science degree or four years of professional experience including working with a library board. Similar to Halsey, the position in Brownsville may use education as experience; the position requires either a 4-year college degree or 3-5 years of library experience. Oakland requires a high school diploma or GED with a preference for supplemental educational training in management and coordination of personnel. Lyons does not describe educational requirements. Scio requires an associate’s degree in Library Science or related field.
- **FLSA Exemption:** Like Halsey, all matching positions are non-exempt.
- **Supervision:** Halsey’s position trains, schedules, and supervises all volunteers. Similarly, all comparable positions (Brownsville, Lyons, Oakland, Scio) supervise volunteers. In addition, Lyons supervises other library staff.
- **Additional Notes:** All positions have similar education requirements. The variations in required experience may explain differences in pay. The table below represents the hourly rates for each position, recognizing that the two full time positions (Brownsville and Lyons) are actually salaried. Because of the mix of hourly and salary positions we did not create a table for this position in the appendix.

Jurisdiction	Hours per week	Lowest hourly	Highest hourly	Benefits
Halsey	20	\$12.10	\$15.95	Yes
Brownsville	40	\$17.00	\$21.33	Yes
Lyons	40	\$23.23	\$23.69	Yes
Oakland	15	\$12.00	\$13.91	No
Scio	40	\$19.92	\$19.95	Yes

Conclusion: The Halsey position is part-time with benefits. Other positions, full-time and part-time, are comparable in duties but vary in compensation structure.

5. Municipal Clerk (part-time)

The Halsey position is a part-time, non-exempt position with no supervision responsibilities. The position does not list years’ experience or minimum required education; instead it lists types of experience including customer service and computer skills. A high school diploma or GED is preferred. The following is a short summary of duties from the job description:

“Provide exemplary customer service, handle problems and complaints ... high level of confidentiality and the ability to work independently.”

The essential functions of the position are broken down into 4 primary responsibilities:

- 25% is dedicated to customer service and assisting the public in person and by phone;
- 25% is dedicated to accounts payable functions such as filing, organizing, and indexing;
- 25% is spent preparing council packets and minutes; and
- 25% is to provide general clerical support such as sorting and distributing mail, lien searches, notarization, and ordering/stocking supplies.

Halsey’s Municipal Clerk, although part-time, receives prorated benefits like the Librarian position does. None of the other comparator jurisdictions provide benefits for their part-time positions.

Of the comparable jurisdictions, 3 jurisdictions (Brownsville, Garibaldi, Scio) have comparable positions. Brownsville has similar duties with its “Assistant Clerk.” The “Administrative Assistant I” position in Garibaldi has similar duties to Halsey’s “Assistant City Recorder.” Scio assigns similar duties with its “Administrative Assistant.” We compared the positions based on experience, education, FLSA exemption, supervision status, and other pertinent factors. The findings are described below.

- **Experience:** Length of experience varies across all jurisdictions. Halsey does not state required years of experience; it focuses on the types of skills and experiences required for the position such as computer knowledge and customer service skills. Brownsville requires 3-5 years of professional, municipal experience. However, it does allow education to substitute for experience. Garibaldi requires three years’ administrative or clerical work. Scio requires either 4 years of office practice experience or an associate’s degree in business administration.
- **Education:** Halsey does not list required education experience. There is a preference for a high school diploma or GED. Brownsville and Scio require a 2-year college degree, or experience can be substituted for education. Garibaldi requires a high school diploma or GED with a preference for a college degree
- **FLSA Exemption:** Like Halsey, all positions are non-exempt.
- **Supervision:** Halsey and all other comparables do not have supervisory responsibilities.
- **Additional Notes:** All positions have similar education requirements. The variations in required experience and supervision responsibilities may explain differences in pay. The table below represents the hourly rates for each position, recognizing Garibaldi has a full time, salaried position. Because of the mix of hourly and salary positions we did not create a table for this position in the appendix.

Jurisdiction	Hours per week	Lowest hourly	Highest hourly	Benefits
Halsey	20	\$10.97	\$14.42	Yes
Brownsville	20	\$15.53	\$19.40	No
Garibaldi	40	\$20.31	\$23.56	Yes
Scio	40	\$23.65	\$23.65	Yes

Conclusion: The position in Halsey is a part-time position with prorated benefits. Most jurisdictions that had a comparable position, had the position at full-time. Due to the difference in FTE and benefits, the matches are not included in the presentation tables.

6. Utility Worker I

Halsey's Utility Worker I is a non-exempt position with no supervisory responsibilities. There are no experience or education requirements. Applicants should, however, possess or obtain certifications in Wastewater Collection I, Wastewater Treatment I, and Water Distribution I. The following is a short summary of duties from the job description:

"Performs routine maintenance and operations of city-owned property, buildings, streets, water/wastewater facilities, storm water facilities, and parks. Performs all duties in accordance with City policies and procedures to assure safe, effective, and efficient services."

The position is divided into 5 essential tasks:

- 30% of time is dedicated to assisting or performing cleaning, installation, repair, and maintenance of water meters, fire hydrants, and other equipment.
- 20% is focused on assisting or performing cleaning, maintenance, and repair of streets, alleys, and rights of way
- 20% is dedicated to maintenance of parks and other city property
- 15% is allotted to water and wastewater utilities
- 15% is dedicated to operating and repairing vehicles and equipment

Most jurisdictions (Adair Village, Brownsville, Coburg, Garibaldi, Oakland, Scio, Yamhill) have positions that were generally comparable to the Halsey job description. Adair Village, Coburg, and Yamhill call the position "Utility Worker I;" Garibaldi has a "Utility Worker II" with similar responsibilities. Brownsville titles it "Public Works Operator." Scio assigns the tasks to "Maintenance Worker."

- **Experience:** Halsey, Brownsville, and Coburg do not describe minimum experience. Adair Village, Garibaldi, and Scio require 2 years' experience. The position in Yamhill requires 1 year of experience. Coburg prefers 2 years of public works or public utility experience.
- **Education:** Halsey and Coburg do not outline minimum education requirements. Most comparable positions (Adair Village, Brownsville, Garibaldi, Scio, Yamhill) require a high school diploma or GED.

Halsey requires specific certification for position. The certifications include Wastewater Collection I, Wastewater Treatment I, and Water Distribution I. The certification requirements for other jurisdictions include:

- Water Distribution I (Coburg, Garibaldi, Scio)
- Water Treatment I (Garibaldi, Scio)

- Wastewater Collection I (Scio)
 - Wastewater Collection II (Adair Village, Garibaldi)
 - Wastewater Treatment I (Scio)
 - Wastewater Treatment II (Adair Village)
 - Wastewater Treatment III (Garibaldi)
- **FLSA Exemption:** Halsey's position and all other comparable positions are non-exempt.
 - **Supervision:** Halsey's position and all comparable positions do not have supervisory duties.
 - **Additional Notes:** Garibaldi (Utility Worker II) has the highest median adjusted compensation at \$5,189 and Oakland has the lowest at \$2,482. Halsey is fourth highest at \$4,167. Halsey's median adjusted compensation is 9.9% higher than the average of other jurisdictions.

Conclusion: All jurisdictions hold up and are solid matches.

Appendix

Detailed Adjusted Compensation Results & Police Officer Premium Summaries..... A1

Assistant City Recorder..... A1

City Administrator/Recorder A2

Lead Utility Worker/Plant Operator A3

Utility Worker I A4

Position Name: Assistant City Recorder		Adjustments									Adjusted Comp. W/ PTO		
Jurisdiction	Jurisdiction Job Title	Base Salary			PERS & Insurance		Vacation & Holiday (PTO)			Min	Median	Max	
		Min	Median	Max	PERS	EE Ins.	Min	Median	Max				
Adair Village	Financial Clerk	\$ 2,748	\$ 3,105	\$ 3,507	Y	\$ -	10.0%	11.2%	13.5%	\$ 3,187	\$ 3,638	\$ 4,189	
Brownsville	Administrative Assistant Finance	2,825	3,157	3,528	N	(78)	10.2%	12.1%	12.1%	3,035	3,462	3,877	
Coburg	Utility Billing/ Administrative Assistant	3,188	3,621	4,123	Y	(38)	8.5%	10.4%	11.5%	3,610	4,175	4,808	
Garibaldi	Administrative Assistant II	4,126	4,444	4,786	Y	-	8.8%	10.8%	12.7%	4,739	5,189	5,681	
Lyons	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a				
Oakland	Utility Billing Clerk	2,283	2,458	2,646	Y	-	7.7%	9.6%	11.5%	2,596	2,842	3,110	
Scio	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a				
Yamhill	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a				
	Average	3,034	3,357	3,718		(23)	9.0%	10.8%	12.3%	3,433	3,861	4,333	
	Median	2,825	3,157	3,528		-	8.8%	10.8%	12.1%	3,187	3,638	4,189	
Halsey	Assistant City Recorder	\$ 3,354	\$ 3,887	\$ 4,466	Y	\$ (20)	10.0%	11.9%	13.8%	\$ 3,871	\$ 4,564	\$ 5,332	
	% Difference from Average	10.6%	15.8%	20.1%			10.6%	10.3%	12.9%	12.7%	18.2%	23.1%	
	% Difference from Median	18.7%	23.1%	26.6%			13.0%	10.7%	14.3%	21.4%	25.5%	27.3%	

Note: n/a = no match. PTO = Paid Time Off, Vacation plus Holiday. Levels are at min level 5 years, median 10 years & max 20 years. The column indicating the PERS is whether or not the employer "Picks Up" the employees' 6% contribution. That is, is the employer paying 6% into a separate fund that is there for the exclusive benefit of the employee. Compensation studies following PECBA (Public Employees Collective Bargaining Agreement) guidelines require the use of employee+family healthcare plan costs in calculations. For the purposes of this study, employee-only costs were used due to varying coverage among jurisdictions. Currently, Oakland does not have any employees enrolled in the Family Employee Health Insurance plan, which would cost \$1,500 per month.

Position Name: City Administrator/ Recorder		Adjustments									Adjusted Comp. W/ PTO		
Jurisdiction	Jurisdiction Job Title	Base Salary			PERS & Insurance		Vacation & Holiday (PTO)			Min	Median	Max	
		Min	Median	Max	PERS	EE Ins.	Min	Median	Max				
Adair Village	City Administrator	\$ 9,416	\$ 9,416	\$ 9,416	Y	\$ -	10.0%	11.2%	13.5%	\$ 10,923	\$ 11,031	\$ 11,248	
Brownsville	City Administrator	5,787	6,468	7,227	N	(78)	10.2%	12.1%	12.1%	6,299	7,173	8,025	
Coburg	City Administrator	7,998	7,998	7,998	Y	(38)	8.5%	10.4%	11.5%	9,116	9,270	9,362	
Garibaldi	City Administrator	6,875	6,875	6,875	Y	-	8.8%	10.8%	12.7%	7,896	8,028	8,160	
Lyons	City Manager	3,642	3,678	3,714	Y	(74)	5.3%	9.1%	9.1%	3,979	4,161	4,203	
Oakland	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a				
Scio	City Manager	7,368	7,368	7,368	N	(31)	8.1%	10.0%	11.9%	7,932	8,074	8,215	
Yamhill	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a				
	Average	6,848	6,967	7,100		(37)	8.5%	10.6%	11.8%	7,691	7,956	8,202	
	Median	7,122	7,122	7,298		(35)	8.7%	10.6%	12.0%	7,914	8,051	8,188	
Halsey	City Administrator	\$ 4,922	\$ 5,705	\$ 6,487	Y	\$ (20)	10.0%	11.9%	13.8%	\$ 5,690	\$ 6,708	\$ 7,754	
	% Difference from Average	-28.1%	-18.1%	-8.6%			18.0%	12.6%	17.2%	-26.0%	-15.7%	-5.5%	
	% Difference from Median	-30.9%	-19.9%	-11.1%			15.6%	12.7%	15.2%	-28.1%	-16.7%	-5.3%	

Note: n/a = no match. PTO = Paid Time Off, Vacation plus Holiday. Levels are at Min level 5 years, Median 10 years & Max 20 years. The column indicating the PERS is whether or not the employer "Picks Up" the employees' 6% contribution. That is, is the employer paying 6% into a separate fund that is there for the exclusive benefit of the employee. Compensation studies following PECBA (Public Employees Collective Bargaining Agreement) guidelines require the use of employee+family healthcare plan costs in calculations. For the purposes of this study, employee-only costs were used due to varying coverage among jurisdictions. Currently, Oakland does not have any employees enrolled in the Family Employee Health Insurance plan, which would cost \$1,500 per month.

Position Name: Lead Utility Worker/ Plant Operator		Base Salary			Adjustments					Adjusted Comp. W/ PTO			
Jurisdiction	Jurisdiction Job Title	Base Salary			PERS & Insurance		Vacation & Holiday (PTO)			Adjusted Comp. W/ PTO			
		Min	Median	Max	PERS	EE Ins.	Min	Median	Max	Min	Median	Max	
Adair Village	Public Works Supervisor	\$ 4,287	\$ 4,844	\$ 5,471	Y	\$ -	10.0%	11.2%	13.5%	\$ 4,972	\$ 5,675	\$ 6,536	
Brownsville	Public Works Superintendent	4,989	5,575	6,230	N	(78)	10.2%	12.1%	12.1%	5,419	6,173	6,907	
Coburg	Public Works Operator III	4,115	4,680	5,323	Y	(38)	8.5%	10.4%	11.5%	4,672	5,409	6,218	
Garibaldi	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a				
Lyons	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a				
Oakland	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a				
Scio	Public Works Operation Director	4,481	4,481	4,481	N	(31)	8.1%	10.0%	11.9%	4,811	4,897	4,983	
Yamhill	City Clerk	4,542	4,542	4,542	Y	-	10.4%	13.3%	14.2%	5,286	5,418	5,461	
	Average	4,483	4,825	5,209		(30)	9.4%	11.4%	12.7%	5,032	5,514	6,021	
	Median	4,481	4,680	5,323		(31)	10.0%	11.2%	12.1%	4,972	5,418	6,218	
Halsey	Utility Lead	\$ 3,939	\$ 4,568	\$ 5,496	Y	\$ (20)	10.0%	11.9%	13.8%	\$ 4,549	\$ 5,367	\$ 6,567	
		% Difference from Average	-12.1%	-5.3%	5.5%			6.1%	4.7%	9.4%	-9.6%	-2.7%	9.1%
		% Difference from Median	-12.1%	-2.4%	3.2%			0.0%	6.9%	14.3%	-8.5%	-0.9%	5.6%

Note: n/a = no match. PTO = Paid Time Off, Vacation plus Holiday. Levels are at Min level 5 years, Median 10 years & Max 20 years. The column indicating the PERS is whether or not the employer "Picks Up" the employees' 6% contribution. That is, is the employer paying 6% into a separate fund that is there for the exclusive benefit of the employee. Compensation studies following PECBA (Public Employees Collective Bargaining Agreement) guidelines require the use of employee+family healthcare plan costs in calculations. For the purposes of this study, employee-only costs were used due to varying coverage among jurisdictions. Currently, Oakland does not have any employees enrolled in the Family Employee Health Insurance plan, which would cost \$1,500 per month.

Position Name: Utility Worker I		Adjustments									Adjusted Comp. W/ PTO		
Jurisdiction	Jurisdiction Job Title	Base Salary			PERS & Insurance		Vacation & Holiday (PTO)			Min	Median	Max	
		Min	Median	Max	PERS	EE Ins.	Min	Median	Max				
Adair Village	Utility Worker I	\$ 2,211	\$ 2,498	\$ 2,821	Y	\$ -	10.0%	11.2%	13.5%	\$ 2,564	\$ 2,927	\$ 3,371	
Brownsville	Public Works Operator	2,910	3,252	3,634	N	(78)	10.2%	12.1%	12.1%	3,129	3,568	3,997	
Coburg	Public Works Operator I	3,219	3,661	4,164	Y	(38)	8.5%	10.4%	11.5%	3,646	4,222	4,855	
Garibaldi	Utility Worker II	4,126	4,444	4,786	Y	-	8.8%	10.8%	12.7%	4,739	5,189	5,681	
Lyons	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a				
Oakland	Public Works Utility Worker I	1,993	2,147	2,311	Y	-	7.7%	9.6%	11.5%	2,266	2,482	2,716	
Scio	Maintenance Worker	4,063	4,063	4,063	N	(31)	8.1%	10.0%	11.9%	4,360	4,438	4,516	
Yamhill	Utility Worker I	3,120	3,120	3,120	Y	-	10.4%	13.3%	14.2%	3,631	3,721	3,751	
	Average	3,092	3,312	3,557		(21)	9.1%	11.0%	12.5%	3,476	3,792	4,127	
	Median	3,120	3,252	3,634		-	8.8%	10.8%	12.1%	3,631	3,721	3,997	
Halsey	Utility Worker I	\$ 3,064	\$ 3,551	\$ 4,038	Y	\$ (20)	10.0%	11.9%	13.8%	\$ 3,534	\$ 4,167	\$ 4,819	
	% Difference from Average	-0.9%	7.2%	13.5%			10.0%	8.0%	10.8%	1.7%	9.9%	16.8%	
	% Difference from Median	-1.8%	9.2%	11.1%			13.0%	10.7%	14.3%	-2.7%	12.0%	20.6%	

Note: n/a = no match. PTO = Paid Time Off either Flexible Earned Time or Vacation plus Holiday. Levels are at Min level 5 years, Median 10 years & Max 20 years. The column indicating the PERS is whether or not the employer "Picks Up" the employees' 6% contribution. That is, is the employer paying 6% into a separate fund that is there for the exclusive benefit of the employee. Compensation studies following PECBA (Public Employees Collective Bargaining Agreement) guidelines require the use of employee+family healthcare plan costs in calculations. For the purposes of this study, employee-only costs were used due to varying coverage among jurisdictions. Currently, Oakland does not have any employees enrolled in the Family Employee Health Insurance plan, which would cost \$1,500 per month.